



D.W. (Bill) Spence

Project Engineer
Advanced Systems Division
Data Systems Group

PO Box 2909 • MS 2091 • Austin Texas 78769 • 512 250 6627

MEMORANDUM

19 Jan 1988

TO: John Lohmeyer, Chairman X3T9.2

FROM: Bill Spence, Texas Instruments

SUBJECT: Drawing the Line on SCSI-2

Rev 0 started out as follows:

"How to bring SCSI-2 into the barn on a reasonable schedule is a concern of all of us. The general principle has to be that we clean up things already in the Standard and needing clean-up (to the extent that the need for clean-up is discovered before the standard is forwarded), that we finish up things we are already deeply into and are committed to, and that we finally somewhere, sometime draw the line on new things. The problem is to decide where to draw the line, and to decide what things are clean-up and what things are new." It might be added that in our present mode, we are not converging on a cut-off. The predictable total debate time of proposals ahead has not shrunk to any major degree since last summer.

The proposals which followed got a lively discussion and were modified and augmented in San Jose, 1/6. The end result seemed to get very broad, if not quite unanimous, approval. The following is my distillation of what was seemingly agreed upon.

Each of certain proposals already received by the committee and each new proposal brought before it is to be subject to a screening process to assign it, via one of two Entry Paths, to SCSI-2, or to assign it to SCSI-3. The sponsor may accept SCSI-3 at submission or may claim entry to SCSI-2 by one of the two Entry Paths, but for SCSI-2 he must get additional validation according to the procedures below.

125
Entry Path A--proposals which clean up the standard as it exists--correct errors, close holes, provide clarification or just better wording, etc. Also, proposals which the committee has requested on specific subjects. In most cases, it probably will be obvious and non-controversial if a proposal belongs in Path A, but the decision as to whether it is so admitted rests with the Editor of the relevant section, or with the Chairman in the case of cross-sectional proposals. The committee will not spend floor time debating whether or not something is clean-up. If the proposal is not admitted via Entry Path A, it automatically is in line to be considered via Entry Path B, if the sponsor desires. Preferably the decisions re Path A will be made by the editors off-line and early on, so that proposals admitted via Path A can go directly into the Action Queue for floor presentation, discussion, and action as appropriate.

Entry Path B--proposals not admitted via Entry Path A but which the sponsor believes should be considered for SCSI-2. As a priority matter, the Chairman will schedule time for the acceptance or rejection of applicants via Entry Path B. The sponsor will be given 5 minutes for a presentation not of the proposal in depth but an outline and his justification for getting it into SCSI-2. Then with a minimum of debate (preferably none), the Chairman will either poll the membership or will decide that a consensus is obvious and announce it. If the result is favorable, the proposal goes into the Action Queue for floor presentation, discussion and action. If the result is negative, the proposal is automatically assigned to be considered in SCSI-3.

Proposals assigned to be considered in SCSI-3 get little or no floor time or editor's time until the committee finds itself caught up on SCSI-2 work, which should start to happen by August, but may not.

To meet the needs of people interested in a SCSI-3 proposal, Dal proposes the organization of a SSWG--Specific-Subject Working Group--for each one, if a leader therefor can be found. SSWG membership would be open and voluntary, and the members would correspond, converse and/or meet outside the main channel of the committee.

I urge on the committee that this or some procedural change is necessary to get the SCSI-2 standard published. The ferment in our field is so great that the flow of proposals has not abated from the time SCSI-2 was taken up. If every proposal automatically makes its way to the floor for extended discussion, we simply have no way to draw the line on SCSI-2.

If the committee approves this proposal, as is or in modified form, it still won't work unless the membership is willing to be governed by it and the Chairman is willing to support it. It would be facilitated by having a SCSI Level column added to the Document Register. The column would be blank until the the screening process had been applied and the proposal assigned to a level.

Rushing in where angels fear to tread, I offer the following lists classifying the existing proposals. All proposals with numbers lower than those listed have already been established in the Action Queue or otherwise disposed of. These classifications were generally accepted at the San Jose Working Group meeting; obviously the Plenary can change them if necessary. Although I give lists for Entry Path A and Entry Path B, it seems to me that henceforth once a proposal is admitted to SCSI-2 by appropriate action, it no longer is significant via which Entry Path.

PROPOSALS ASSIGNED TO SCSI-2 AND THE ACTION QUEUE VIA ENTRY PATH A

Doc No	Ent Dt	Doc Dt	Author	Description	Lvl	Resolution
87-199		120187	Spence	SDTR Msg Clarified	2	Nearly approved 12/8.
87-202		120787	Davies	Max Burst Size	2	
87-204		120787	Liu	Mode Select Commnt	2	
87-205		120487	Semenak	Req Sense Residue	2	
87-207		120787	Harms	Cable B Pins	2	
87-209		120787	Anderson	Write Same	2	Chosen over 87-208 ?
87-212		122387	Spence	More SDTR Msg	2	
87-213		122387	Spence	Msg Parity Error	2	To 89-9 ?
87-214		122387	Spence	Target Msg Response	2	To 88-9
88-1		010688	Stal	Update Block Mods	2	
88-2		010688	Stal	Search Cmd Mods	2	
88-3		010488	McGrath	Scn 5 Questions	2	
88-4		010788	Johansson	Grown Defect List	2	
88-5				SSWG Rprt	2	
88-6			Spence	Read Log SSWG Rprt	2	
88-9		010888	Anderson	Target Msg Response	2	

PROPOSALS ASSIGNED TO SCSI-2 AND THE ACTION QUEUE VIA ENTRY PATH B

Doc No	Ent Dt	Doc Dt	Author	Description	Lvl	Resolution
87-195r2		010888	Schuessler	Text for Fast SCSI	2	
87-216		010688	Schuessler	Timing Parameters	2	Relevant to 87-195r2

PROPOSALS ASSIGNED TO SCSI-3

Doc No	Ent Dt	Doc Dt	Author	Description	Lvl	Resolution
87-186		102487	Spence	SEND DIAGNOSTIC Pgs	3	
87-203		120687	Floryance	Load Skip Mask Cmd	3	
87-217		120587	McIntyre	Scatter/Gather Cmds	3	Tied to 87-203

PROPOSALS NEEDING ASSIGNMENT

Doc No	Ent Dt	Doc Dt	Author	Description	Lvl	Resolution
87-192r1		110387	Kellogg	Add'l Info re Busy		
87-206		120487	Harms	>8 Devices on Bus		
88-7		010788	Boulay	Rel Addr Bit		
88-8				Set Thrshld/Rd Usag		Scn 8.1.7-8, SCSI-2r0