Unresolved comments

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
1	Rob Elliott	E				Please provide PDF bookmarks	
2	Rob Elliott	E				Please number PDF pages to match printed page numbers	
3	Paul Aloisi	E	Points of Contact			John Lohmeyer's email should be lohmeyer@t10.org.	
4	Paul Aloisi	E	Points of Contact			The Vice chair is normally listed: T10 Vice-Chair, George O. Penokie, LSI IBM/Tivoli, 3605 Highway 52 N. MS 2C6, Rochester, MN 55901, Tel: 1-507-253-5208, Fax: 1-507-253-2880, Email: gop@us.ibm.com	
5	Paul Aloisi	E	Forward	viii		the committee list and the group list, not enough space is left between columns and the names run into the numbers.	
6	Peter Johansson	E	1.1	1	8	Change "aforementioned standard" to plural.	
7	Rob Elliott	E	2.1	3	24	Remove ISO/IEC 9899:1999, Programming Languages—C, since there is no C code in this standard	
8	Paul Aloisi	E	2.2	3	30	SAM-2 should be listed as an approved standards	
9	Peter Johansson	T	2.2	3	30	SAM-2 is an approved standard; delete the citation from 2.2 and add the correct citation to 2.1. Make corresponding changes, as necessary, throughout the draft.	
10	Rob Elliott	E	3.1	5		Add "may not" with the same meaning as "may" to make it clear that it does not mean "shall not"	
11	Peter Johansson	E	3.1.2	5 - 8		Add the definitions for "global node ID" and "local node ID". Draft standard IEEE P1394.1 is suggested as a source for the definitions.	
12	Rob Elliott	E	3.1.1.4	5	15	"The recipient of a reserved object shall ignore its value." This rule is acceptable, but does differ from other SCSI standards which "may check" reserved fields. Is the WG sure this is the intention?	
13	Peter Johansson	T	3.1.2.9	6	11	Although there are two ways to obtain a login ID, there is only one kind of login ID. Change "Either kind of login ID" to "A login ID".	
14	Peter Johansson	E	3.1.3	8	20	The abbreviations DVCR and MPEG are not used in the standard (informative annexes are not considered part of the standard) and should be deleted.	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
15	Rob Elliott	E	3.2.4	11	10 - 12	Remove "The conditions and actions of the state machine transitions are formally defined by C code, as specified by ISO/IEC 9899:1990 [B13]." I don't see any C code in this standard formally describing any transitions. There is text describing each transition which apparently serves as the only definition. Occasionally the transition descriptions in the figures contains &&, II, and == symbols, but they are not really C code.	
16	Peter Johansson	E	4.5	17	2	Redundant "a" in the last sentence of paragraph.	
17	Paul Aloisi	E	4.7	17	24	(I.e the I is under the (	
18	Peter Johansson	T	4.8	19	12	Only one isochronous subaction is permitted per channel during an isochronous period; "subactions" should be singular.	
19	Peter Johansson	E	4.8	20	8	Delete "this".	
20	Paul Aloisi	E	4.8	20	18	transfer, the T is over the R	
21	Paul Aloisi	E	5.1	23	3	t is over the h in the in the middle of the line	
22	Peter Johansson	E	5.1.1	23	13	Provide the missing cross-reference; I believe the correct reference is 9.1.1.	
23	Peter Johansson	E	5.1.2	26	Figure 16	The two isochronous bits in the figure should not be shown blue nor underlined; this appears to be an artifact of a prior change to the draft.	
24	Paul Aloisi	E	5.1.2	26	19	T is over the h in the in the middle of the line	
25	Rob Elliott	E	5.1.3.1	29	23	Remove "(see [B1])" - these references are not used consistently; only 3 "[Bxx]"references exist	
26	Peter Johansson	T	5.1.3.1	30	28 - 29	What is intended by the last sentence of the paragraph? If the *update* bit in a subsequent login request is one, should the most significant 16 bits of the *login_response* field contain a node handle or a local node ID?	
27	Peter Johansson	E	5.1.3.2	32	15	Add the phrase "or net update" to the informative note.	
28	Paul Aloisi	E	5.1.3.3	32	23	o is over the f in of	
29	Peter Johansson	T	5.1.3.4	34	6	Add the phrase "or net update" to the first sentence.	
30	Paul Aloisi	E	5.1.3.6	36	11	s is on the e in set	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
31	Peter Johansson	E	5.3	42	2	Grammatical correction; change "the logical unit fetch agent transitioned to the dead state" to "the logical unit fetch agent entered the dead state". There is a second occurrence of the error in the same paragraph.	
32	Peter Johansson	T	5.3.1	42	21	Change "shall store all or part of the status block shown in Figure 32" to "shall store a status block in either of the formats shown in Figure 32 and Figure 33".	
33	Peter Johansson	T	5.3.1	44	8	Change "the first 20 bytes of the ORB" to "the first 20 bytes of a single buffer descriptor ORB or the first 32 bytes of a dual buffer descriptor ORB".	
34	Peter Johansson	T	5.3.3	45	4	Change "shall store all or part of the status block shown in Figure 32" to "shall store a status block in either of the formats shown in Figure 32 and Figure 33".	
35	Paul Aloisi	E	6	46	1	The major sections should not have text directly under them, sections should have subtitles for the introduction of the section. This is for all sections not just 6, I believe it is called a hanging clause.	
36	Paul Aloisi	E	6	47	8	a is over the l in all	
37	Peter Johansson	E	6	47	9 - 12	Readers may be able to parse the last sentence of the paragraph more easily if "either *ack_complete* or *ack_pending* subsequently followed by *resp_complete* should be returned" is changed to "either *ack_complete* (or *ack_pending* subsequently followed by *resp_complete*) should be returned".	
38	Paul Aloisi	E	6	47	10	I is over the g in ignore	
39	Peter Johansson	E	6.1	47	24	Change "matches that" to "matches the node ID".	
40	Paul Aloisi	E	6.5	51	3	t is over the h in this	
41	Paul Aloisi	E	6.5.7	55	11	t is over the o in to	
42	Peter Johansson	E	6.5.7	57	27	Grammatical correction; change "the agent shall transition to the ACTIVE state" to "the agent shall enter the ACTIVE state".	
43	Peter Johansson	E	7	59	Figure 44	A gray shaded area present in the figure in the Word source manuscript is absent in the PDF prepared for Letter Ballot. Ask the ANSI editor to take care that the figure is accurately reproduced in the final published standard.	
44	Rob Elliott	E	7.3.5	64	5	Delete "[B5]" from the NOTE. This is the only time "[B5]" is used alongside a 1212-2001 reference.	
45	Rob Elliott	T	7.7	65	Footnote 4	"These entries may not be omitted altogether …" should be "… shall not …"	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
46	Peter Johansson	T	7.7.8	68	21	Change "offset 20_{16}" to "offset 40_{16}". The smaller value is leftover from SBP-2.	
47	Paul Aloisi	E	7.7.12	70	13	t is over the h in than	
48	Peter Johansson	T	7.7.12	70	16	Since SBP-3 proposes to standardize a bus-dependent key value, 31_{16}, for the Plug_Control_Register entry, diligence should be exercised to ascertain that this value is, in fact, not yet in use.	
49	Paul Aloisi	E	7.7.14	71	Figure 65	The x is blue and underlined, this appears to be a mark up that was not accepted	
50	Rob Elliott	E	7.7.14	71	Figure 65	The ex*tended_status* bit (x) is blue underlined.	
51	Peter Johansson	E	7.7.14	71	Figure 65	The ex*tended_status* bit in the figure should not be shown blue nor underlined; this appears to be an artifact of a prior change to the draft.	
52	Paul Aloisi	E	7.7.14	71	17	A sentence starts with f, I think it should be If	
53	Peter Johansson	T	8.1	73	15	Change "a target" to "a target's logical units".	
54	Peter Johansson	E	8.2.1	74	7	Change "transaction" to "request".	
55	Peter Johansson	T	8.2.2	75	37 - 38	Modify the last sentence of the paragraph to read "Lastly the target assigns a unique *task_set_ID* to this task set, stores it in the *task_set_descriptor* and returns a create task set response as specified in 5.1.3.3"	
56	Peter Johansson	E	8.3.4	77 - 78		The distinction between a suspect node handle descriptor (i.e., one for which remote timeout is unknown and the relationship between global node ID and EUI-64 has not been reconfirmed) and a totally unusable node handle descriptor (i.e., one whose global node ID is $FFFF_{16}$) is not at all clear. This clause should be extensively revised for the sake of clarity.	
57	Paul Aloisi	E	8.5	79	14	eceived should be received	
58	Paul Aloisi	E	9.1	81	11	o over the f in of	
59	Peter Johansson	E	9.1.1	82	3 6 - 11	Grammatical correction; change "the fetch agent to transition to the ACTIVE state" to "the fetch agent to enter the ACTIVE state". Similar grammatical problems in the paragraph below Figure 68.	
60	Peter Johansson	E	9.1.1	82	6	Grammatical correction; change "the fetch agent transitions to the active state" to "the fetch agent enters the active state".	
61	Peter Johansson	E	9.1.3	83	7 - 8	Grammatical correction; change "the fetch agent to transition to the ACTIVE state" to "the fetch agent to enter the ACTIVE state".	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
62	Peter Johansson	E	9.1.3	83	12	The minor performance improvement results from the elimination of the fetch of the ORB pointer---not the fetch of the ORB itself.	
63	Peter Johansson	E	9.1.4	83	20	Delete the spurious "the" before "either".	
64	Peter Johansson	E	9.1.4	83	34	Provide the missing cross-reference; I believe the correct reference is 5.3.1.	
65	Paul Aloisi	E	9.1.4	84	11	wite should be write	
66	Peter Johansson	T	9.2	85	18	The configuration ROM Revision entry describes target properties, not logical unit properties. Replace "A logical unit …" with "A target …".	
67	Peter Johansson	E	9.2	86 - 88		Correct grammatical errors throughout this clause; "transition" is not a verb and should be replaced with an appropriate verb, such as "enter".	
68	Paul Aloisi	E	9.2	87	20	h this state, I thinks should be "In this state"	
69	Peter Johansson	E	9.2	88	16 24	Delete the erroneous underscore at the end of *previous_ORB* (two occurrences).	
70	Peter Johansson	E	9.2	88	32	Change "exceeds the target's busy retry limit" to "persists beyond the target's busy retry limit".	
71	Peter Johansson	E	9.2	88	37	Delete "is a unique state that"; it adds no useful information.	
72	Peter Johansson	T	9.5	90	39	An extended status block may be larger than 32 bytes; revise the *status_FIFO* requirements to reflect this.	
73	Peter Johansson	E	10.2	93	28 - 29	Delete the last sentence of this paragraph; the same information is repeated in the paragraph that follows.	
74	Rob Elliott	T	10.4.3	96	24	"Support for logical unit reset is a target option." Why not make it mandatory and comply with SAM-3 here?	
75	Rob Elliott	T	10.4.4	97	17 - 18	"The initiator shall not reuse..." should be "The initiators shall not reuse...." since this applies to all initiators, not just the one that sent the TARGET RESET.	
76	Rob Elliott	T	10.5	98		Delete: TERMINATE TASK from the table, as it is not defined in SAM-2 (and later this standard says it is not supported)	
77	Peter Johansson	T	10.5	98		The unlabeled table at the top the page should be updated to reflect the fact that there are no behavioral differences between primary and secondary task sets. Secondary task sets do not survive bus resets or net updates that affect their associated primary tasks set.	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
78	Peter Johansson	T	10.5	99	15	The "target" at the end of the last sentence in the paragraph should be "fetch agent".	
79	Paul Aloisi	E	11	101	27	o is on top of the r, should be or?	
80	Peter Johansson	T	B.1	107	11	CDBs may be encapsulated in either single or dual buffer descriptor command block ORBs; revise the text to mention dual buffer descriptor ORBs.	
81	Rob Elliott	T	B.1	107	Figure B-2	Change "flag (0)" to "obsolete"; the flag bit was made obsolete in SAM-2.	
82	Rob Elliott	E	B.1	107	20	Reword "SBP-3 supports SAM-2 contingent allegiance." to "this standard does not support ACA." Despite their names, ACA and CA are not related (CA relates to autosense). Not supporting ACA is unrelated to supporting CA.	
83	Rob Elliott	E	B.1	107	21	Delete "*flag* and"; the *flag* bit was made obsolete in SAM-2.	
84	Peter Johansson	T	B.2	108 - 110		A mapping for descriptor-based sense data (specified by SPC-3) should be added; an sfmt value of two could be used to differentiate the new format from the current fixed format. Also, a method for mapping SCSI sense data of more than 18 bytes to an extended status block should be added. Note that this requires SPC-3 to be added to the references and bibliography.	
85	Rob Elliott	T	B.2	109		Delete: 22h COMMAND TERMINATED. This status code was made obsolete in SAM-3.	
86	Rob Elliott	E	B.2	109	23 - 24	"The contents of the CDB-dependent field are device-type or command dependent and are defined within SPC-2 or the appropriate standard for the command." Call this the "command-specific information" field to match the name in SPC-2/3.	
87	Rob Elliott	E	B.2	109	10 - 12	Change the "*sense_code* and *sense_qualifier*" field names to "*asc*" and "*ascq*" or "*additional_sense_code*" and "*additional_sense_qualifier*" to better match the SPC-2/3 names.	
88	Rob Elliott	E	B.2	109	25 - 28	*fru* field paragraph: Tie this to the "field replaceable unit code" field defined by SPC-3 rather than reword the paragraph defining it.	
89	Rob Elliott	E	B.2	110	1 - 4	*sense_key*-dependent field: Tie this to the "sense key specific" field in SPC-2/3.	
90	Paul Aloisi	E	B.2	110	2	bt I think should be bit	
91	Peter Johansson	T	D	115	10	Here and throughout the document, references to the AV/C Digital Interface Command Set General Specification should be updated to cite version 4.1, December 11, 2001.	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
92	Peter Johansson	E	F.1 F.1.1	123 124	11 2 - 5	Illustrate, in figure F-1, the new node options fields defined by IEEE Std 1394a-2000 and add their description to the first paragraph of F.1.1.	
93	Peter Johansson	E	G.2	129	38	Grammatical correction; change "the fetch agent transitions to the ACTIVE state" to "the fetch agent enters the ACTIVE state".	
94	Peter Johansson	E	H	131 - 137		The terminology (taken from an earlier revision of SAM-2) should be updated in accordance with INCITS 366-2003.	
95	Peter Johansson	T	H.3.1 H.3.2	132	5 26	Add the [Command reference number] argument to the definitions of Send SCSI Command and SCSI Command Received.	
96	Rob Elliott	E	H.5	135	29	Delete "SCSI-2" from "SCSI-2 contingent allegiance". CA was fully defined in SAM-2, so the SCSI-2 reference can be removed. (SAM-3 drops CA in favor of autosense)	
97	Rob Elliott	T	H.5	135	31	Delete "… or COMMAND TERMINATED". That status was made obsolete in SAM-2.	
98	Peter Johansson	T	H.10	136	18 - 19	Delete the TERMINATE TASK and add the WAKEUP task management functions to the table.	
99	Rob Elliott	E	H.9	136	14	Change "control mode page" to "Control mode page"	
100	Rob Elliott	E	H.10	136		Delete "SCSI-2". CA is fully defined in SAM-2; no need to reference an obsolete standard.	
101	Rob Elliott	T	H.10	136		Logical Unit Reset: Optional SAM-2 made LOGICAL UNIT RESET mandatory, not optional. This standard should do the same.	
102	Rob Elliott	T	H.10	136		Delete TERMINATE TASK: Not supported. It's obsolete in SAM-2, so there is no need to reference it here.	
103	Rob Elliott	E	H.10	136		Reword "SBP-3 supports only contingent allegiance" to "SBP-3 does not support ACA". Although named similarly, CA and ACA are not either/or. By supporting autosense, this standard does NOT support CA either.	
104	Peter Johansson	E	J	143	11	Include instructions to the ANSI editor that if, at the time SBP-3 is prepared for publication, IEEE P1394.1 is an approved standard that references throughout SBP-3 should be adjusted accordingly. Otherwise, the most recent draft of IEEE P1394.1, identified by version and the date, should be referenced.	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

ID	Balloter	Type	Clause	Page	Line	Comment / remedy	Resolution
105	Peter Johansson	E	J	143	12 - 13	Include instructions to the ANSI editor that if, at the time SBP-3 is prepared for publication, IEEE P1394.3 is an approved standard that references throughout SBP-3 should be adjusted accordingly. Otherwise, the most recent draft of IEEE P1394.3, identified by version and the date, should be referenced.	
106	Rob Elliott	E	J	143		Remove [B13] ISO/IEC 9899:1990, Programming Languages—C, since there is no C code in this standard.	

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical

Resolved technical comments

Resolved editorial comments

Type: E: Editorial T: Technical