

T10/07-239r0: Minutes
SCSI Media Changer (SMC) Working Group
for May 7, 2007, 2:27 PM - 7:00 PM PDT

1. Introductions **Group**

Rod Wideman called the meeting to order at 2:27 PM PDT. He thanked Microsoft for hosting the meeting. Kevin Butt is serving as the secretary of this meeting.

2. Approval of the Agenda **Rod Wideman**

Rod Wideman presented the agenda (07-xxx). Paul Suhler made a motion to accept the agenda. Noud Snelder seconded the motion. The group passed the motion unanimously.

3. Attendance and Membership **Rod Wideman**

Rod Wideman reviewed the T10 attendance rules with the group and directed prospective new members to John Lohmeyer. The attendance report appears below.

SMC-3 Working Group Attendance Report - May 2007

Name	S	Organization
Mr. Noud Snelder	V	BDT
Mr. Kevin Marks	P	Dell, Inc.
Mr. Curtis Ballard	V	Hewlett Packard Co.
Mr. Kevin Butt	A	IBM Corp.
Mr. Robert Payne	P	Iomega Corp.
Mr. Geoffrey Barton	V	Overland Storage
Mr. Paul Entzel	P	Quantum Corp.
Dr. Paul Suhler	A	Quantum Corp.
Mr. Rod Wideman	V	Quantum Corp.
Mr. Roger Cummings	P	Symantec
Mr. Anders Liverud	AV	Tandberg Storage

11 People Present

Status Key: P - Principal
A,A# - Alternate
AV - Advisory Member
E - Emeritus
L - Liaison
V - Visitor

4. INCITS Patent Policy **Rod Wideman**

Rod pointed to T10 website.

5. Approval of Previous Minutes **Group**

Kevin Butt asked for any problems with the minutes of the March meeting (07-132r0) and April (07-

181r0) meeting. Curtis Ballard pointed out a few typos and corrections were made. Curtis made a motion to approve the minutes as modified. Paul Suhler seconded. Voting was unanimous.

6. Review of Action Items

Kevin Butt

Kevin Butt reviewed the outstanding action items, and the status of each item was reported as listed below:

06-002 [Michael Banther] Reporting of virtual libraries / partitioning to host.

Carry-Over

06-020 [Robert Payne] Define a philosophy for Write Exclusive Persistent Reservations in SMC.

Carry-Over

06-044 [Roger Cummings] Solicit additional vendor-specific sense codes from library vendors per June discussion item 4.4.

Carry-Over

06-063 [Halvard Eriksen] Investigate use of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, INITIALIZING COMMAND REQUIRED error code.

Carry-Over

06-066 [Noud Snelder] Incorporate 06-452r1 into the next revision of SMC-3.

Closed. In SMC-3r5

07-003 [HP] Create a proposal to define the usage of the “Cleaning Requested” and “Cleaning Failure” error codes.

Carry-Over

07-004 [Kevin Butt] Create a proposal for the “Medium Magazine” error codes.

Carry-Over

07-006 [Rod Wideman] Define a new ASC/ASCQ for “Logical Unit Not Ready – Robotics Disabled”.

Carry-Over

07-012 [Michael Banther] Create and post 06-420r1 (r0 revised as per discussion at the February 21, 2007 conference call).

Carry-Over

07-013 [Kevin Butt] Kevin will send a note to the ISV’s pointing them to “Working List for ISV feedback (SMC/SSC/ADC/SPC) (05-315r4)” if they desire status.

Complete.

07-015 [Noud Snelder] to incorporate SMC-3: Element Statistics log page for SMC (06-394r3) (06-394r2 as revised) into SMC-3.

Complete. SMC-3r6

07-016 [Kevin Marks] Revise and post SMC-3: Diagnostics Data log page, 06-395r4 (06-395r3 as revised).

Carry-Over

- 07-017 [Group] Make sure the all the functionality of Read Element Status is covered by the Report Element Information command (06-272) and the Report Volume Information command and examine if an informative annex to map the RES command onto these is appropriate. [Reminder to do as final step]

Carry-Over

- 07-018 [Kevin Butt] agreed to revise and post SMC-3: RES - Incomplete descriptors (07-035r0)

Complete

- 07-019 [Noud Snelder] has an action to incorporate SMC-3: RES - Incomplete descriptors 07-035r1 into SMC-3

Complete. SMC-3r6

- 07-021 [Noud Snelder] to incorporate SMC-3 Support column in mode page codes and sub-page codes table (06-456r3) into SMC-3.

Complete SMC-3r6

- 07-023 [Noud Snelder] to incorporate SMC-3 Medium transport element subclause correction (07-024r0) into SMC-3

Complete SMC-3r6

- 07-024 [Curtis Ballard] revise and post SMC-3, Report Element Information (06-272r3) (06-272r2 as revised)

Complete

- 07-025 [Noud Snelder] revise and post SMC-3 Add PREVENT ALLOW MEDIA REMOVAL command (06-442r2) as 06-442r3

Complete.

- 07-026 [Kevin Butt] send an email describing the concern with “who” regarding PREVENT ALLOW MEDIA REMOVAL command (06-442r1)

Complete

7. Old Business

Group

- 7.1 SMC-3 Add PREVENT ALLOW MEDIA REMOVAL command (06-442r3) Noud Snelder

Last meeting this was requested to allow time from Rod Wideman and Kevin Butt to have their companies review and to see all the changes incorporated. Kevin reported that his company is OK with these changes. His heartburn was really tied to the drive side behavior (i.e. SSC) not library. Rod stated he is OK with it.

Noud Snelder moved that 06-442r3 as modified (06-442r4) be approved for inclusion into SMC-3. Robert Payne seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

- 7.2 SMC-3 Command table and INQUIRY clean-up (06-477r1) Michael Banther
Defer

- 7.3 SMC-3 New Additional Sense Codes Usage (07-018r0) Rod Wideman

Rod went over this proposal as it is the first time this is covered. Rod stated he is working on another proposal for several new ASC/ASCQs as a result of a survey of vendor-specific ASC/ASCQs currently in use. This is not that proposal. This proposal is to describe the working to be added that is related to each of the listed ASC/ASCQs. A version of these paragraphs was included in 06-110, but were moved to here to allow changes and moving on these.

Noud questioned the use of the INFORMATION field as stated in section 6.1. The suggestion was to make the use of the INFORMATION field is a common way for SMC and have a mode clause for that usage.

Curtis has heard that several vendors would like to be able to use element disable on a slot that can be configured as an IE slot or as a storage slot so a configuration does not change. Rod told Curtis to write your own proposal.

AI: Rod Wideman to revise and post SMC-3 New Additional Sense Codes Usage (07-018r0) as 07-018r1.

- 7.4 SMC-3 Clarification of reporting drive prevented media removal (07-015r1) Curtis Ballard

Curtis discussed this and agreed to modify it to synch up with Nouds 06-442r3 and to put the reasons into a lettered list.

Curtis Ballard Revise and post SMC-3 Clarification of reporting drive prevented media removal (07-015r1)

- 7.5 SMC-3 Processed commands during not ready state (07-060r1) Noud Snelder

Discussion centered around how do we define what is “ready”. Maybe should be what is “not ready”.

There was a lot of argument about which commands shall be processed in the not ready state.

Several edits were made.

Noud Snelder Revise and post SMC-3 Processed commands during not ready state (07-060r1)

- 7.6 SMC-3: Clarifying Addresses and Volumes (07-122r0) Roger Cummings

Roger started by pointing out that this action was originally assigned to Greg Wheelless and he had done his best to review minutes and determine what the intent was. This is what he came up with. If this doesn't meet expectations then we should mark this as overcome by events and move on.

Roger made changes. Roger Cummings made a motion to include SMC-3: Clarifying Addresses and Volumes (07-122r0) as modified into SMC-3. Curtis Ballard seconded the motion. The voting was unanimous.

AI: [Roger Cummings] Revise and post SMC-3: Clarifying Addresses and Volumes (07-122r0)

AI: [Noud Snelder] Incorporate SMC-3: Clarifying Addresses and Volumes (07-122r1) into SMC-3

- 7.7 Working List for ISV feedback (SMC/SSC/ADC/SPC) (05-315r3) Kevin Butt

Defer

- 7.8 SMC-3: Diagnostics Data log page (06-395r4) Kevin Marks

This was accidently posted as 06-394r4.

Rod had a hey-day correcting grammar.

Kevin Marks made a motion to incorporate 06-395r4 as modified into SMC-3.

Noud Snelder invoked the two week rule.

[Kevin Marks] Revise and post SMC-3: Diagnostics Data log page (06-395r4)

- 7.9 SMC-3 Error codes overview (06-397r2) Noud Snelder

- 7.10 SMC-3, Report Element Information (06-272r3) Curtis Ballard

- 7.11 SMC-3 TapeAlert Enhancements (06-420r0) Michael Banther

Defer

8. New Business Group

- 8.1 SMC-3, Position to element command clarification (07-199r0) Noud Snelder

- 8.2 SMC-3, Additional sense codes for incompatible destination element (07-222r0) Noud Snelder

- 8.3 Question about Read Attribute and Service Action 4 for SMC Noud Snelder

Proposal 99-148r7 included service action 4 for SMC devices to be included in SMC-2. It does not appear to be included in SMC-3. The question is do we want to do this?

Procedural question. If this proposal was approved do we need to put it in?

9. Next Meeting Requirements Rod Wideman

Telecon on Wed, June 13 8:00 AM PDT - 10:00 AM PDT. HP will host.

Request same meeting time for July meeting Cycle.

10. Review New and Outstanding Action Items Kevin Butt

Kevin Butt reviewed the following items with the meeting:

06-002 [Michael Banther] Reporting of virtual libraries / partitioning to host.

06-020 [Robert Payne] Define a philosophy for Write Exclusive Persistent Reservations in SMC.

06-044 [Roger Cummings] Solicit additional vendor-specific sense codes from library vendors per June discussion item 4.4.

- 06-063 [Halvard Eriksen] Investigate use of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, INITIALIZING COMMAND REQUIRED error code.
- 07-003 [HP] Create a proposal to define the usage of the “Cleaning Requested” and “Cleaning Failure” error codes.
- 07-004 [Kevin Butt] Create a proposal for the “Medium Magazine” error codes.
- 07-006 [Rod Wideman] Define a new ASC/ASCQ for “Logical Unit Not Ready – Robotics Disabled”.
- 07-012 [Michael Banther] Create and post 06-420r1 (r0 revised as per discussion at the February 21, 2007 conference call).
- 07-016 [Kevin Marks] Revise and post SMC-3: Diagnostics Data log page, 06-395r4 (06-395r3 as revised).
- 07-017 [Group] Make sure the all the functionality of Read Element Status is covered by the Report Element Information command (06-272) and the Report Volume Information command and examine if an informative annex to map the RES command onto these is appropriate. [Reminder to do as final step]
- 07-027 [Rod Wideman] Revise and post SMC-3 New Additional Sense Codes Usage (07-018r0) as 07-018r1.
- 07-028 [Curtis Ballard] Revise and post SMC-3 Clarification of reporting drive prevented media removal (07-015r1)
- 07-029 [Noud Snelder] Revise and post SMC-3 Processed commands during not ready state (07-060r1)
- 07-030 [Roger Cummings] Revise and post SMC-3: Clarifying Addresses and Volumes (07-122r0)
- 07-031 [Noud Snelder] Incorporate SMC-3: Clarifying Addresses and Volumes (07-122r1) into SMC-3
- 07-032 [Noud Snelder] Revise and post SMC-3 Add PREVENT ALLOW MEDIA REMOVAL command (06-442r3)
- 07-033 [Noud Snelder] Incorporate SMC-3 Add PREVENT ALLOW MEDIA REMOVAL command (06-442r4) into SMC-3.
- 07-034 [Kevin Marks] Revise and post SMC-3: Diagnostics Data log page (06-395r4)
- 07-035 [Rod Wideman] Have Michael check the procedure for what to do regarding 99-148r7 which was approved in the May 2000 plenary but did not get put into SMC-2. Does it need to be incorporate it into SMC-3?

11. Adjournment

Group

Rod Wideman made a motion for adjournment. Paul Suhler seconded the motion. The group passed the motion unanimously. Rod Wideman adjourned the group at 7:08PM PDT.