Draft Minutes
T10 FCP-3 Ad Hoc Work Group
13 September 2005 - 9 AM to 1 PM
Vancouver BC

The FCP-3 Ad Hoc Work Group of INCITS Technical Committee T10 met at Vancouver BC on 13 September 2005, hosted by PMC Sierra. Attendance was 10 people from 8 companies and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T10 reflector at T10@T10.org.

1 Opening remarks and introductions

Chairperson Dave Peterson opened the meeting Tuesday, 13 September 2005 at 9:01 AM. He thanked our host company, PMC Sierra.

2 Approval of Agenda

The agenda was presented.

It was moved by Dave Peterson and seconded by Erich Oetting to accept the agenda for this meeting as presented. Approved unanimously.

3 Review of Minutes   T10/05-282r0

It was moved by Bob Nixon and seconded by Paul Suhler to accept T10/05-282r0 as the minutes of the FCP-3 ad hoc meeting on 12 July 2005. Approved unanimously.

4 Review of Old Action Items

AI 25   FCP-3 Chairperson to forward the email on SRR Reason Code discrepancy to the T10 distribution and ask for direction from implementers.
(Opened 12 July 2005) (CLOSED by T10 reflector email 6 September 2005)

5 Old Business

5.1 Email: FC-4 Reject Reason Code Explanation Discrepancy

A T10 reflector email thread on this topic began on September 6 2005: The Reason Code Explanation for Invalid OX_ID - RX_ID combination on SRR is specified as 03h. Most people present said their products implemented 17h (the only exception allowed both 17h and 03h). There was some reason for this in the history of the standard.

Agreed that the Reason Code Explanation for Invalid OX_ID - RX_ID combination on SRR shall be 17h. This was captured as new letter ballot comment LATE-007.

5.2 FCP-3 Letter Ballot Comment Resolution   T10/05-173r4

5.2.1 LATE-007

Accept. See 5.1.

5.2.2 IBM-053

Accept. Revised wording was agreed: Reference clearing effect rather than the target object that is affected.

5.2.3 IBM-057

Accept. Revised wording was agreed: Reference clearing effect rather than the target object that is affected.

5.2.4 IBM-062

Accept. Revised wording was agreed: Reference clearing effect rather than the target object that is affected.

5.2.5 IBM-143

Accept. The statement was recast as a generic "It is required..." rather than identifying to what the requirment applies. The requirement itself was clarified.

5.2.6 IBM-144

Accept. The statement was recast as a generic requirement to eliminate incorrect use of "target" and "initiator".

5.2.7 IBM-145

Accept. The statement was recast as a generic "It is required..." rather than identifying to what the requirment applies. The requirement itself was clarified.

5.2.8 IBM-156

Accept. Use Initiator FCP_Port and Target FCP_Port, which although not quite as accurate as the commenter's recommendation, is more consistent with the rest of the section.

5.2.9 HPQ-112

Reject. The wording is very old, and changing it may invalidate working and interoperable implementations.

5.2.10 HPQ-121

Accept.

5.2.11 HPQ-122

Accept. Several other instances of the issue were also changed in the same way.

5.2.12 HPQ-162

Accept. The wording was extended to cover both ACK1 and ACK0 behavior.

5.2.13 HPQ-191

Accept.

5.2.14 HPQ-88

Accept. The statement was changed to an observation ("is") rather than a permission ("may be").

5.2.15 HPQ-89

Accept. The statement was changed to an observation ("is") rather than a permission ("may be"). The list of additional sense codes was changed to a reference to SAM-3. The requirement for ABORT TASK was removed since there are no tasks left to abort. A similar fix was made for CLEAR TASK SET.

5.2.16 HPQ-90

Accept. The statement was changed to an observation ("is") rather than a permission ("may be").

5.2.17 HPQ-91

Accept. The sentence discussing contingent allegiance was removed.

5.2.18 HPQ-94

Accept. The description was changed to a reference to SAM-3.

5.2.19 HPQ-82

Deferred to FCP-4.

5.2.20 LATE-008

Accept. See 6.1.

5.2.21 LATE-009

Reject. See 6.2.

6 New Business

6.1 Email: Disconnect Reconnect Mode Page parameter rounding

Private email from George Penokie to Rob Elliott cc Dave Peterson July 28 re an issue in SAS that applies to FCP-3 also: FCP-3 allows the device server to round down the maximum burst size parameter "as defined in SPC-3". SPC-3 does not allow this parameter to be rounded.

Agreed that the sentence allowing rounding will be deleted. This was captured as new letter ballot comment LATE-008.

6.2 Email: Bridge detection of FCP_DL error

Reflector email July 28 2005 from Ralph Weber suggests using HARDWARE ERROR rather than ABORTED COMMAND sense key for FCP_DL error. This was justified as more appropriate for bridge devices

Agreed the requested change was not desirable because not all sources of the sense key are bridges and the error does not otherwise imply hardware.   This was captured as new letter ballot comment LATE-009.

6.3 Email: Various FCP-3 issues

Email from Rob Elliott to Dave Peterson March 21 2005 identified several issues: All were reviewed and accounted for to Rob's acquiescence if not complete satisfaction.

6.4 Forwarding FCP-3

It was moved by Dave Peterson and seconded by Bob Nixon to recommend to T10 to accept T10 document 05-173r5 as the resolution to all letter ballot comments against FCP-3 revision 03, and to forward FCP-3 Revision 04 as expressed in T10 document fcp3r04 to INCITS for further processing.   Approved unanimously.

ACTION: Bob Nixon to recommend to T10 to accept T10 document 05-173r5 as the resolution to all letter ballot comments against FCP-3 revision 03, and to forward FCP-3 Revision 04 as expressed in T10 document fcp3r04 to INCITS for further processing.

7 Review of Action Items

AI 26   Bob Nixon to recommend to T10 to accept T10 document 05-173r5 as the resolution to all letter ballot comments against FCP-3 revision 03, and to forward FCP-3 Revision 04 as expressed in T10 document fcp3r04 to INCITS for further processing.
(Opened 13 September 2005)

AI 26   Next AI

8 Meeting Schedule

Request 1 hour at the T11 Plenary Week 7-11 November 2005 in Austin TX.

9 Adjournment

It was moved by Dave Peterson and seconded by Paul Suhler to adjourn. Approved unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:40 AM on 13 September 2005.

10 Actions on Proposals at This Meeting

Document Title	Number	Disposition
FCP-3 Letter Ballot Comment Status	T10/05-173	Closed by forwarding to INCITS. Last version is T10/05-173r5.
FCP-3 Draft Standard	T10/fcp3	Closed by forwarding to INCITS. Last version is fcp3r04.

11 Attendance

Representative	Rep Status	Organization
Bob Nixon	P	Emulex
Michael Banther	V	Hewlett Packard
Rob Elliott	P	Hewlett Packard
George O. Penokie	P	IBM
David Peterson	P	McDATA
Paul Entzel	P	Quantum
Paul Suhler	A	Quantum
Gerald Houlder	P	Seagate
William Martin	P	Sierra Logic
Erich Oetting	A#	Sun Microsystems