Accredited Standards Committee*

InterNational Committee for Information Technology Standards (INCITS)

Doc. No.: T10/04-365r0

Date: November 11, 2004 Reply to: John Lohmeyer

To: T10 Membership

From: Mark Evans and John Lohmeyer

Subject: SAT Working Group -- November 9th, 2004

Austin, TX

Agenda

- 1. Opening Remarks
- 2. Approval of Agenda
- 3. Attendance and Membership
- 4. Old Business
 - 4.1 SAT INQUIRY contents (04-218r5) [Elliott]
 - 4.2 ATA Command Pass-Through (04-262r6) [Stevens]
- 5. New Business
 - 5.1 SAT remaining work items (04-391r0) [Sheffield]
- 6. Review of SAT Working Draft (SAT-r01)
- 7. Review of Recommendations
- 8. Meeting Schedule
- 9. Adjournment

Results of Meeting

1. Opening Remarks

John Lohmeyer called the meeting to order at 9:00 AM Tuesday, November 9th, 2004. He thanked Dexter Anderson of Crossroads Systems, Inc. for hosting the meeting. As usual, the people present introduced themselves.

Bob Sheffield requested that all reflector traffic having to do with SCSI to ATA translation have the letters "SAT" at the beginning of the title (e.g., "SAT: pass-through comments"). John Lohmeyer requested that all proposals for the SAT project have the letters "SAT" at the beginning of the title (e.g., "SAT, pass-through commands").

2. Approval of Agenda

Item 5.1, SAT remaining work items (04-391r0) [Sheffield] was added to the agenda.

The draft agenda was approved as modified.

No additional items were added or revised during the course of the meeting.

3. Attendance and Membership

Attendance at working group meetings does not count toward minimum attendance requirements for T10 membership. Working group meetings are open to any person or organization directly and materially affected by T10's scope of work. The following people attended the meeting:

Name					S	Organization
Mr.	. Dexter Anderson				 Р	Crossroads Systems, Inc.
Mr.	r. Kevin Marks				Ρ	Dell, Inc.
Mr.	Mr. Kenneth Hirata				Α	Emulex
Mr.	r. Ralph O. Weber				Р	ENDL Texas
Mr.	r. Mike Fitzpatrick				P	Fujitsu
Mr.	Mr. Wayne Bellamy				V	Hewlett Packard Co.
Mr.	Mr. Sam Sawyer				A#	Hitachi Global Storage Technologies
Mr.	Mr. Robert Sheffield				P	Intel Corp.
Mr. David Hawks					P	Iomega Corp.
Mr.	Mr. Steve Johnson				V	LSI Logic Corp.
Mr.	Mr. John Lohmeyer				P	LSI Logic Corp.
Mr. Martin Czekalski					Α	Maxtor Corp.
Mr. Mark Evans					P	Maxtor Corp.
Mr. Jeff Mastro					Α	Microsoft Corp.
Mr.	Mr. Mark Overby				V	Nvidia Corp.
Mr. Craig W. Carlson					A	QLogic Corp.
Mr. Greg Elkins					V	QLogic Corp.
Mr. William Martin					V	Sierra Logic
Mr. Curtis Stevens					P	Western Digital
Mr. Rich Ramos					V	Xyratex
20 People Present						
Sta	tus Key:	A,A# AV L	- - -	Principal Alternate Advisory Member Liaison Visitor		

4. Old Business

4.1 SAT INQUIRY contents (04-218r5) [Elliott]

In Rob Elliott's absence, Wayne Bellamy reviewed revision 5 of this proposal about data that is returned for an INQUIRY command.

There was much discussion revisiting the topic of how the identification information provided by ATA devices that don't provide a WWID could be described in a way that is globally unique. Comments were made that: T13 most probably would not be open to changing requirements because of device implementations and other customer requests; the IETF would not be amenable for a ".ata" prefix; SATA devices (particularly hard drives) should be moving to WWID making this less of a requirement. Wayne said that he would explore using a vendor specific identifier type.

Wayne agreed to make a new revision of his proposal including input from the working group.

4.2 ATA Command Pass-Through (04-262r2) [Stevens]

Curtis Stevens reviewed revision 6 of his proposal to define new SCSI CDBs for issuing ATA commands and sense information to report completion status.

Curtis agreed to make a new revision of his proposal including input from this working group and the CAP working group.

5. New Business

5.1 SAT remaining work items (04-391r0) [Sheffield]

Bob Sheffield reviewed revision 0 of his proposal attempting to identify all of working items remaining for the SAT project including the owner of the item and the status of the item. Minor corrections were made to the document based on input from the working group. Bob agreed to change this to be a comprehensive work items list, including work that has been completed.

Bob agreed to make a new revision of his proposal including input from this working group and maintain this document until the project is complete.

6. Review of SAT Working Draft (SAT-r01)

Bob Sheffield continued the review of revision 01 of the draft standard.

There was much discussion about what should be described in the document. Bob requested a straw pole for guidance to the editor. His question was, does this group prefer to:

- a) allow the editor flexibility in descriptions in the document based on the variety of the possible implementations (i.e., describe allowed behavior); or,
- b) restrict the editor to descriptions in the standard based on specific, deterministic behavior (i.e., describe absolute behavior).

The vote was 11 for (a) and 3 for (b).

There was further discussion that the document could be separated such that the primary focus would be translation for SATA devices used in SAS systems. Other implementations may be described in separate subclauses, referencing the SATA/SAS descriptions where possible to avoid redundancy.

Bob reported that he would try to have a new revision of the draft before the next teleconference.

7. Review of Recommendations

Mark Evans noted that the working group made the following recommendation to the T10 plenary:

none

8. Meeting Schedule

SAT Working Group meetings are scheduled for:

The afternoon of Thursday, December 16, 2004 commencing at 1:00 PM ending Friday, December 17, 2004 at 12:00 PM in Las Vegas, NV at the Tropicana Hotel (800-643-4000), hosted by Hitachi GST Corporation.

Tuesday, January 18, 2005 commencing at 9:00 AM ending 12:00 PM in Las Vegas, NV at the Tropicana Hotel (800-643-4000), hosted by Hitachi GST Corporation.

Teleconference calls are scheduled for:

December 2, 2004 with details to be announced by Bob Sheffield on the T10 reflector.

Other calls may be announced on the T10 reflector as needed.

9. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:15 PM on Tuesday, November 9th, 2004.