Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	1	E	C	6a	1		All the red text has to be changed to black.
HP	1	E	C	6a	2	Points of Contact page	Company: Tivoli Email: gpenokie@tivoli.com; Should be IBM and gop@us.ibm.com.
HP	2	E	C	6a	2	Points of Contact page	INCITS Secretariat missing bold and underline; Highlight: Make bold & underline
HP	3	E	C	6a	2	Points of Contact page	Document Distribution missing bold and underline; Highlight: Make bold & underline
IBM Penokie	2	E	C	6a	2	Points of Contact:	The T10 vice-chair address information is not correct. It should be: George O. Penokie, IBM, 3605 Highway 52 N, MS: 2C6, Rochester, MN, Tel: (507) 253-5208, Fax: (507) 253-2880, Email: gop@us.ibm.com
ENDL	1	E	C	6a	3		Remove Revision History in dpANS
IBM Penokie	3	E	C	6a	3	Revision Information	The revision information has to be removed before going to letter ballot.
ADIC	2	E	C	6a	5	para 2	"which is" s/b "that is"
HP	4	E	C	6a	5	NCITS.***200x	should be INCITS
Quantum	2	E	C	6a	5	last sentence of last paragraph	automation drive interface physical and transport documents; Replace text with "the Automation Drive Interface - Transport Protocol standard"
HP	5	E	C	6a	6	2002	Should be 2003
ADIC	3	E	C	6a	11	para above ed. Note	"At the time of it approved…" s/b "At the time it approved…"
ADIC	4	E	R		11	last para	"which developed" s/b "that developed"
HP	7	E	C	6a	11	NCITS.***:	Should be INCITS
IBM Penokie	4	E	C	6a	11	Foreword, 1st paragraph	There is no need to indicate the number of the standard as it is listed in the normative references section so delete << (T10/1157-D) >>
IBM Penokie	5	E	C	6a	11	Foreword,Last paragraph	The name of the T10 committee should be << SCSI Storage Interfaces >> as it is no longer the << Lower Level Interfaces >>.
ENDL	2	E	C	6a	12	, Introduction	Lately, I have started adding the annexes to the list in the Introduction.
IBM Penokie	6	E	C	6a	12	Introduction	The statement << The Automation/Drive Interface - Commands (ADC) standard is divided into six clauses: >> should be << This standard is divided into the following clauses: >>.
IBM Penokie	7	E	C	6a	12	Introduction	The statement << implementation of the Automation Drive Interface - Commands (ADC) standard >> should be << implementation of this standard >>.
STK	1	E	C	6a	12	INTRODUCTION	Remove the word "type" from sentences starting "Clause 4, 5 and 6.
STK	2	E	C	6a	12	INTRODUCTION, last sentence.	"annexes" should be "annex", or remove the entire sentence if the annex is removed.
HP	8	E	C	6a	13	1 Scope a)	a should be an
HP	9	E	C	6a	13	Figure 1 - General document structure of SCSI	Delete Common Access Method
HP	10	E	R		13	Extensions?	This is just another command set for a certain type of LU, not extensions to anything
HP	11	E	C	6a	13	class?	?
HP	12	E	C	6a	13	class?	?

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	13	E	C	6a	13	Letter list, item c)	The draft standard defines more than command for management. Change 'commands' to 'commands and parameters'
IBM Penokie	8	E	C	6a	13	Global	Replace all references to << Automation Drive Interface - Commands (ADC) standard >> with << this standard >> in all clauses starting with the 2nd paragraph in clause 1.
IBM Penokie	9	E	C	6a	13	1 Scope, Item a in a.b.c list	The statement << command response data; >> should be << command response data (see SCSI Primary Command - 3); >>.
STK	3	E	P	6a	13	Clause 1, first paragraph	Replace first sentence with "This standard defines the model, command set and parameters for SCSI automation drive interface devices."
STK	4	E	R		13	Clause 1, second paragraph	Replace sentence with "The objectives of the Automantion/Drive Interface Commands standard are:"
HP	14	E	C	6a	14	Standards	I recommend deleting the list of standards, which is doomed to be immediately out of date.
HP	15	E	C	6a	14	Interconnects list	ADP no longer exists
HP	16	E	C	6a	14	2nd paragraph	Typo at end of sentence. Delete 'Physical Interconnects:'
IBM Penokie	10	E	C	6a	14	1 Scope	The entire list of standards after the statement << At the time this standard was generated, examples of the SCSI general structure included: Physical Interconnects: >> including that statement should be deleted. It is not relevant and impossible to keep accurate.
Quantum	3	E	C	6a	14	2nd paragraph	Extraneous "Physical Interconnects:"; Remove
Quantum	4	E	C	6a	14	Under Interconnects	ADP line; Remove
Quantum	5	T	R		14	whole page	This list does not match SPC-3; Update list to SPC-3 level
STK	5	E	C	6a	14	clause 1, second sentence on page.	Remove "Pysical Interconnects:"
HP	19	E	R		15	Architecture Model	SAM-3 missing
ENDL	3	E	C	6a	16	2.2 Approved references	The ISO number for SPC-2 is 14776-452.
ENDL	4	E	C	6a	16	2.2 Approved references	add ISO/IEC 14776-115, SCSI Parallel Interface – 5. Probably can remove the SPI-3 and SPI-4 references.
ENDL	5	E	C	6a	16	2.2 Approved references	The ISO number for FC-FS is 14165-251.
ENDL	6	E	C	6a	16	2.2 Approved references	add ISO/IEC 14165-122, Fibre Channel Arbitrated Loop - 2
ENDL	7	E	C	6a	16	2.3 References under development	The ISO number for SPC-3 is 14776-453.
ENDL	8	E	C	6a	16	2.3 References under development	FCP-2 is an approved standard.
IBM Penokie	11	E	C	6a	16	2.2 Approved references	The statement << ISO/IEC 14776-114, SCSI Parallel Interface - 4 >> should be replaced with << ISO/IEC 14766-115, SCSI Parallel Interface - 5 >> and moved to the references under development section. This is because SPI-4 was removed from ISO balloting.
IBM Penokie	12	E	C	6a	16	2.2 Approved references	Change this << T11/1331-D, >> to << NICITS 373-2003 >> as it has been published. You should check if it has an ISO number yet.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	13	E	R		16	2.2 Approved references	Unless there is some good reason multiple versions of the same standard should not be listed. For example the references list should only have SAM-3, SPC-3, MMC-3, SPI-5, and SSC-2. Also all references to other standards within this standard should reference the one version in the reverence list.
Quantum	6	E	C	6a	16	2.3, list	FCP-2 is released; Move FCP-2 to section 2.2
ADIC	5	E	C	6a	17	3.1.11	"executes" s/b "processes"
ENDL	9	E	C	6a	17	3.1.1 accessible state	The last sentence should be a separate glossary entry.
ENDL	10	E	C	6a	17	3.1.2, 3.1.8, 3.1.11, 3.1.18, 3.1.29, 3.1.30, 3.1.31, 3.1.32, and 3.1.38	in the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard [s/b] in SAM-2. [9 times]. Alternatively, 4.2.2 must spell out SAM-2.
ENDL	11	E	C	6a	17	3.1.4	Delete the definition for ACA. The only use is in the task set and the reference to SAM-2 in that glossary entry is sufficient to cover the usage.
ENDL	12	E	C	6a	17	3.1	Add a glossary entry for 'bridging'.
ENDL	13	E	C	6a	17	3.1.13 indication	Why is 'indication' defined but not the other three steps (i.e., 'request', 'response', and 'confirmation')? Why does the only use of 'indication' in the working draft (in note 1) not match the glossary definition? Perhaps the better part of valor would be to remove the glossary entry.
ENDL	14	E	C	6a	17	3.1.14 I_T nexus, 3.1.15 I_T_L nexus, 3.1.16 I_T_L_Q nexus	Add references to SAM-2.
ENDL	15	E	C	6a	17	3.1.16 I_T_L_Q nexus	queue tag [s/b] task tag [twice]
HP	20	E	C	6a	17	3.1.1 accessible state	Replace 'would respond to' with 'is capable of responding'
HP	21	E	C	6a	17	3.1.3 asynchronous event notification	Delete this, as it is not used in this document, and is obsolete in SCSI architecture
HP	22	E	R		17	3.1.8 contingent allegiance	Add (CA) before
HP	23	E	R		17	3.1.9 data transfer device:	Add (DTD) before
HP	24	E	C	6a	17	3.1.9 data transfer device	After “a removable medium command set” add “(e.g., SSC-2 or MMC-4)”
HP	25	E	C	6a	17	3.1.2 application client	Add . after standard
HP	26	E	P	6a	17	3.1.16 I_T_L_Q nexus	Delete “This relationship replaces the prior I_T nexus or I_T_L nexus.” That is a parallel SCSI-ism.
HP	27	E	P	6a	17	3.1.15 I_T_L nexus	Delete “This relationship replaces the prior I_T nexus.” That is a parallel SCSI-ism.
HP	28	E	C	6a	17	3.1.10 data transfer element	This term is not used anywhere. Delete/
HP	29	E	C	6a	17	3.1.13 indication:	This term is not used anywhere (with this meaning). Delete
HP	30	E	C	6a	17	3.1.1 accessible state	Check use of “non-accessible state” vs “not accessible”
HP	31	E	C	6a	17	3.1.6 bridging manager:	Add “See 4.2.2.1.” at end.
HP	32	E	C	6a	17	3.1.5 automation application client	Add “See 4.2.1.” at end
HP	33	E	C	6a	17	3.1.17 local SMC device server:	Add “See 4.2.2.1.” at end.
IBM Penokie	14	E	P	6a	17	3.1.1 accessible state:	The statement << If the device server would respond to a command with a status of CHECK CONDITION and sense key of NOT READY, then it is in the non-accessible state. >> should be deleted as it is important but should not be in the definition it should be in the model.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	15	E	P	6a	17	3.1.2 application client:	The statement << An object that is the source of SCSI commands. Further definition of an application client is found in the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard >> should be << An object that is the source of SCSI commands (see SCSI Architecture Model-3).
IBM Penokie	16	E	C	6a	17	3.1.3 asynchronous event notification:	AEN no longer exists in SAM-3 so if you are really want it you will have to reference SAM-2. But I would recommend deleting it from this standard.
IBM Penokie	17	E	P	6a	17	3.1.4 auto-contingent allegiance:	The statement << See the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of auto-contingent allegiance. >> should be << (see SCSI Architecture Model-3). >>
IBM Penokie	18	E	C	6a	17	3.1.8 contingent allegiance:	The statement << status. A detailed definition of contingent allegiance may be found in the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard. >> should be << status (see SCSI Architecture Model-2).
IBM Penokie	19	E	R		17	3.1.8 contingent allegiance:	Contingent allegiance is no longer in SAM-3 so unless it is really needed for ADC then I would delete it from ADC.
IBM Penokie	20	E	P	6a	17	3.1.9 data transfer device:	The term << volume >> is not defined. It needs to be.
IBM Penokie	21	E	C	6a	17	3.1.15 I_T_L nexus:	The statement << This relationship replaces the prior I_T nexus. >> should be << This relationship extends the prior I_T nexus. >>
IBM Penokie	22	E	C	6a	17	3.1.16 I_T_L_Q nexus:	The statement << This relationship replaces the prior I_T nexus or I_T_L nexus. >> should be << This relationship extends the prior I_T nexus or I_T_L nexus. >>
Quantum	7	E	R		17	3.1	No definition for ADT; Add definition
Quantum	8	E	C	6a	17	3.1.2	Missing period
Quantum	9	E	C	6a	17	3.1.6	Add reference to 4.2.2
Quantum	10	E	C	6a	17	3.1.11	The term "indication" is not used anywhere in this standard; Remove this definition
Quantum	11	E	C	6a	17	3.1.17	Add reference to 4.2.2
ADIC	6	E	C	6a	18	3.1.27	"which receives" s/b "that receives"
ENDL	16	E	C	6a	18	3.1.20, 3.1.21	in SCSI Architecture Model-2 [s/b reworded to be consistent with 3.1.2] [twice]
ENDL	17	E	R		18	3.1.23 object	Remove this glossary entry because, based on other proposed changes, it is not used and because it is an obsolete term.
ENDL	18	E	R		18	3.1.24 port	I am not aware of a recognized definition for 'SCSI bus segment'. Add a glossary entry or the existing text with wording that is defined across all SCSI.
ENDL	19	E	R		18	3.1.25 primary	This glossary entry raises more questions than it answers. Should the term being defined be 'primary interface'? Is there such a thing as 'secondary interface'? If yes, why is the 'secondary interface' so insignificant as to be unworthy of a glossary entry?
ENDL	20	E	C	6a	18	3.1.26 queue	Remove this glossary entry because, based on other proposed changes, it is not used except in glossary entries that reference SAM-2.
ENDL	21	E	C	6a	18	3.1.35 task	Add reference to SAM-2.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	34	E			18	3.1.33 service delivery port:	Delete. Obsolete in SCSI architecture. Use SCSI target port instead.
HP	35	E	C	6a	18	3.1.28 removable medium commands	3.1.28 removable medium commands (RMC) device server make the definition for removable medium commands (RMC) stand alone. Then define RMC device server separately if needed (I think it can dropped) removable medium commands (RMC):A generic term for a command set supporting removable media (e.g., SSC-2 or MMC-4).
HP	36	E	C	6a	18	3.1.34 target	Delete the target definition - use target port or target device everytwhere
HP	37	E	P	6c	18	3.1.25 primary	The main command and data interface is too generic. Change to primary port primary target port
IBM Penokie	23	E	C	6a	18	3.1.18 logical unit:	The statement << An externally addressable entity within a SCSI target device. See the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of a logical unit. >> should be << A SCSI target device object, containing a device server and task manager, that implements a device model and manages tasks to process SCSI commands sent by an application client. See SCSI Architecture Model-3). >>.
IBM Penokie	24	E	R		18	3.1.20 logical unit reset:	Change << SCSI Architecture Model-2. >> to << SCSI Architecture Model-3. >>
IBM Penokie	25	E	R		18	3.1.21 logical unit reset event:	Change << SCSI Architecture Model-2. >> to << SCSI Architecture Model-3. >>
IBM Penokie	26	E	R		18	3.1.24 port:	The statement << A single attachment to a SCSI bus segment from a SCSI device. >> should be << A SCSI device resident object that connects the application client, device server or task manager to the service delivery subsystem through which requests and responses are routed. >>.
IBM Penokie	27	E	P	6a	18	3.1.28 removable medium commands (RMC) device server:	The statement << system, e.g., an SSC (SCSI stream commands) device. >> should be << system (e.g., a SCSI Stream Commands -2 device). >> .
IBM Penokie	28	E	C	6a	18	3.1.29 SCSI initiator device:	The statement << device. See the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of a SCSI initiator device. >> should be << device (see the SCSI Architecture Model-3). >>.
IBM Penokie	29	E	C	6a	18	3.1.30 SCSI initiator port:	The statement << routed. See the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of a SCSI initiator port. >> should be << routed (see the SCSI Architecture Model-3). >>.
IBM Penokie	30	E	C	6a	18	3.1.31 SCSI target device:	The statement << processing. See the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of a SCSI target device. >> should be << processing (see the SCSI Architecture Model-3). >>.
IBM Penokie	31	E	C	6a	18	3.1.32 SCSI target port:	The statement << routed. See the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of a SCSI target port. >> should be << routed (see the SCSI Architecture Model-3). >>.
Quantum	12	E	P	6c	18	3.1.25	The term "primary" is only used in reference to a port. We could probably use a definition for "primary port".

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Quantum	13	E	C	6a	18	3.1.27	Add reference to 4.2.2
Quantum	14	E	R		18	3.1.28	Add reference to 4.2.2
ADIC	7	E	R		19	3.1.36	"executes" s/b "processes"
ENDL	22	E	C	6a	19	3.1.36 task manager	Remove this glossary entry because it is not used except in glossary entries that reference SAM-2.
ENDL	23	E	C	6a	19	3.1.37 task management function	Replace this glossary entry with: task management request: A request that a task management function be performed, see SAM-2. [Fix the SAM-2 reference to match the one in 3.1.2.]
ENDL	24	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Remove the following abbreviations because they are not used in the body of the standard: CRC, DTE, DUT, and ISI.
ENDL	25	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Add FC-AL-2 Fibre Channel Arbitrated Loop (see clause 2); FC-FS Fibre Channel Framing and Signaling (see clause 2)
ENDL	26	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	add Gb/sec. Gigabytes per second
ENDL	27	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	to support table 12 add Rsvd Reserved
HP	6	E	C	6a	19	3.2	Some symbols and abbreviations incorrect
HP	38	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Check font on the greater than or equal to sign. In PDF it displays as an S with a mark above it. If unused, just delete it.
HP	39	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Check font on ª approximately symbol. If unused, just delete it.
HP	40	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Check font in £ or LE less than or equal to symbol. If unused, just delete it.
HP	41	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Check font in ¼ or NE not equal symbol. If unused, just delete it.
HP	42	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Delete “CRC Cyclic Redundancy Check” - it is not used
HP	43	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Add MAM Media Auxiliary Memory which is used several times
HP	44	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Delete the unused “ISI Intersymbol interference”
HP	45	E	R		19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	For each acronym that has a definition, add a cross reference to 3.1.xx
HP	46	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Delete: SCSI-2 Small Computer System Interface-2
HP	47	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Delete:DUT Device under test
HP	48	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Delete unused “DTE Data transfer element”
IBM Penokie	32	E	R		19	3.1.36 task manager:	The term << executes >> should be << processes >>.
IBM Penokie	33	E	R		19	3.1.38 task set:	The statement << contingent allegiance and >> should be deleted as SAM-3 not longer defines CA.
IBM Penokie	34	E	C	6a	19	3.1.38 task set:	The statement << rules. See the SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of a task set. >> should be << rules (see the SCSI Architecture Model-3). >>.
IBM Penokie	35	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	The << not equal >>and the << less than or equal to >> symbols did not translate into the pdf correctly. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	36	E	C	6c	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Global - All cases of the term << DTD >> should be << DTD device >> or everything should be changed to << DT device >>. This comment overrides all my other comments that suggest << device >> should be << DTD device >> if the << DT device >> is selected. I prefer everything be changed to DT device.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	37	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	The SCSI-2 (Small Computer System Interface-2) and SCSI-3 (Small Computer System Interface-3) terms should be deleted from this standard and only SCSI should be used.
IBM Penokie	38	E	C	6a	19	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	Should only reference one version of each standard unless there is a good reason to do otherwise.
Quantum	15	E	C	6a	19	SMC-2	SCSI Medium Changer Commands-2 should be SCSI Media Changer Commands-2
STK	6	E	C	6a	19	clause 3.2	Symbols for "not equal", "less than or equal" and "greater than or equal" are incorrect.
STK	7	E	C	6a	19	clause 3.2	Delete symbols that are not used in document. (i.e., "<").
STK	8	E	C	6a	19	clause 3.2	Remove abbreviations that are not used in document. (CA, CRC, DUT, ILI, ISI, SAM-2)
STK	9	E	C	6a	19	clause 3.2	Definition for SMC-2 should be "SCSI Media Changer Commands - 2".
STK	10	E	C	6a	19	clause 3.2	SSC and SSC-2 are "Stream Commands", not "Streaming Commands".
ENDL	28	E	C	6a	20	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	add SPI-5 SCSI Parallel Interface -5 (see clause 2)
ENDL	29	E	C	6a	20	3.2 Symbols and abbreviations	add VPD Vital Product Data (see SPC-3)
HP	50	E	C	6a	20	3.3.5 may not	change indicates to indicate
HP	51	E	C	6a	20	3.3.6 obsolete	Remove space after obsolete
Quantum	16	E	C	6a	21	Paragraph beginning "Decimal numbers…"	Needs a space before the second sentence.
ADIC	8	E	C	6a	22	4.1 para 2	"a automation" s/b "an automation"
ADIC	9	E	R		22	4.2.1 para 1	"which processes" s/b "that processes"
ADIC	10	E	R		22	4.2.1 para 2	"which controls" s/b "that controls"
ADIC	11	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 para 1	"will contain" s/b "contains"
ADIC	12	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 para 1	"will typically receive" s/b "typically receives'
ADIC	13	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 para 2	"will typically contain" s/b "typically contains'
ADIC	14	E	C	6a	22	4.1 para 1	"specification" (2x) s/b "standard"
ENDL	30	E	P	6a	22	4.1, entire subclause	This subclause contains nothing except statements the boil down to little more than 'an automation device is an automation device'. Replace this entire subclause with: 'This standard defines a command set that allows interactions between media changer devices and the removable media devices to which they transfer elements of media. Interactions initiated by both the removable media device and the media changer device are defined. (P) 'The commands in this standard assume the handling of data in a sequential manner by the underlying SCSI transport protocol. However, this does not limit the usage of this command set to a specific SCSI transport protocol.'
ENDL	31	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1	Great care is taken to describe the device types found at ADT ports and DTD ports. However the device type found at an Automation Primary Port is never mentioned. Is this where the Line Printer device appears?
HP	52	E	C	6a	22	4.1 Overview	Change a to an sequence number: 2

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	53	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview	Change “will” to shall, should, or may, or perhaps usually/typically.Change contain to contains if appropriate.
HP	54	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 ADI overview	Delete will and change contain to contains
HP	55	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 ADI overview	In “automation application client” (see 3.1.5). Remove the quotes and the 3.1.5 reference
HP	57	E	R		22	4.2.1 ADI overview	Change application client to initiator port
HP	58	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 ADI overview	Use an a)b)c) list
HP	60	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 ADI overview	Replace “will” with a better term
HP	61	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 ADI overview	data transfer devices. An acronym was just introduced for this term. It should be used almost everywhere or not at all.
HP	63	E	P	6c	22	4.2.1ADI overview	Change primary ports to primary target ports
HP	65	E	C	6a	22	4.1, 1st paragraph, 1st sentence	The sentence mixes abstraction levels. ADC may specify the behaviour of a logical unit, but ADI is an interface; it relates an application client to a device server. Change 'automation drive interface' to 'automation drive interface - commands'
HP	56	T	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview	The parenthetic (automation) implies it’s a synonym for media changer. I’d like to see the term “automation” defined better. Describe why isn’t this just another set of features in the media changer command set (SMC-2).
HP	59	T	C	6c	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview	Need more of a definition for “Data Transfer Device”. Is the “removable medium device used for data transfer, such as a tape drive” mentioned in the previous sentence?
HP	62	T	R		22	4.2.1 ADI overview	Change “Automation/Drive Interface - Transport Protocol (ADT) port.” to “...target port”. Or better clarify that it can be both a target port and an initiator port. This sentence only refers to its target port role. Another sentence should describe its initiator port role more directly.
IBM Penokie	39	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 1st paragraph	The statement << transfer, such as a tape drive. In >> should be << transfer (e.g., a tape drive). In >>.
IBM Penokie	40	E	C	6a	22	Global	(Technical) The term << will >> is not a key word and should in most cases be replaced with << shall >>. All will's next to be removed from this standard.
IBM Penokie	41	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 1st paragraph	The statement << server, such as a SCSI Stream Command (SSC) device server, >> should be << server (e.g., a SSC-2 device server), >>.
IBM Penokie	42	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 1st paragraph	The statement << which processes tasks >> should be << that processes tasks >>.
IBM Penokie	43	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 1st paragraph	The statement << primary ports, e.g., Parallel SCSI or Fibre Channel.>> should be << primary ports (e.g., SPI-5 or Fibre Channel). >>.
IBM Penokie	44	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 1st paragraph	The statement << device server will typically receive >> should be << device server normally receives >>.
IBM Penokie	45	E	C	6c	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 1st paragraph	The term << Automation/Drive Interface - Transport Protocol (ADT) port. >> needs to be defined in the definitions list.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	46	E	P	6a	22	Global	All the acronyms are already defined in section 3 so there is no need to repeat them over and over. So either remove all the acronyms and use the full text or remove the full text and use the acronyms. Do not do both.
IBM Penokie	47	E	C	6c	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 2nd paragraph	The term << automation device >> is not defined. This needs to be fixed. Note the term is used elsewhere and any fix needs to be made consistent throughout the standard.
IBM Penokie	48	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 2nd paragraph	It's not clear it the will in the statement << device will typically contain an SMC >> should be a << shall >> or a << should >> but it shall not be a << will >>.
IBM Penokie	49	E	R		22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 2nd paragraph	The statement << server which controls >> should be << server that controls >>.
IBM Penokie	50	E	P	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 2nd paragraph	The statement << controller needs to perform >> should be << controller shall perform >>.
IBM Penokie	51	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 2nd paragraph	The statement << following tasks: >> should be << following operations >> or << following functions >> tasks are very specific things in SCSI.
IBM Penokie	52	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 1st bullet	The statement << parameters, such as SCSI Port ID, Fibre Channel Port_Name, and Autoload mode. >> should be << parameters (e.g., SCSI Port ID, Fibre Channel Port_Name, Autoload mode). >>
IBM Penokie	53	E	C	6a	22	Global	There should be no bulletted lists in this standard. That is not a convention used in SCSI standards. All bulleted lists should be changed to a,b,c lists or 1,2,3 lists in the proper format. (i.e., semicolons after each list item and a 'and' or 'or' on the second to the last item in the list.
IBM Penokie	54	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, 2nd bullet	The statement << ports, e.g., Parallel SCSI or Fibre Channel. >> should be << ports (e.g., SPI-5 or Fibre Channel); >>.
IBM Penokie	55	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, Paragraph above figure 2	The quoted text << 'automation application client' >> should have the quotes removed.
Microsoft	1	Q	C	6a	22	Section 4.2.1 (fourth bullet)	1. In Section 4.2.1 (fourth bullet) it says: "The automation controller needs to perform the task of causing the data transfer device to unload or load media, even if its RMC device server is reserved by an application client" - what happens if a backup is taking place? Basically, what are the conditions under which this is allowed to happen (my guess is transient errors).
Microsoft	8	Q	C	6a	22	general	8. [in General] How does the automation application client communicate with the automation device? Is there a standard interface or is just using CDBs?
Quantum	17	E	R		22	4.1, 1st paragraph	I don't understand what this paragraph is trying to say, but I also don't see anything in this paragraph the we couldn't live without. Maybe we should lose it.
Quantum	18	E	C	6a	22	4.1, 2nd paragraph	This paragraph was covered in the forward and does not really need to be repeated. Remove the paragraph
Quantum	19	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence	Replace "will" with "should"

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Quantum	20	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 1st paragraph, 3rd sentence	Replace "are received" with "may be transported"
Quantum	21	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 1st paragraph, 3rd sentence	Place e.g. clause in parenthesis
Quantum	22	E	P	6a	22	4.2.1, 1st paragraph, 4th sentence	Replace "will typically receive" with "typically receives"
Quantum	23	E	P	6a	22	4.2.1, 2nd paragraph, 1st sentence	Replace "will typically contain" with "typically contains"
Quantum	24	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence	Remove the phrase "and in the process of performing a write or read operation,"
Quantum	25	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence	Replace "needs to" with "may"
Quantum	26	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 1st bullet	Replace "such as SCSI Port…" with "(e.g. SCSI Port…)"
Quantum	27	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 2nd bullet	Place e.g. clause in parenthesis
Quantum	28	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, bullet list	Change bullet list to use letter list
Quantum	29	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 1st paragraph after list, 2nd sentence	Remove quotes from "automation application client"
Quantum	30	E	C	6a	22	4.2.1, 1st paragraph after list, 3rd sentence	Change "the SMC device server" to "device servers within the automation device". Remove the phrase "performed by means".
Seagate	1	E	R		22	4.1 para. 1	Tautology: "The SCSI automation drive interface class specifies the behavior of a logical unit that is primarily an automation drive interface device." Change to "The SCSI automation drive interface class specifies the behavior of a logical unit that is implemented in a removable medium device (such as a tape drive) to permit control over the device by an automation device."
HP	66	E	C	6a	23	4.2.2 Device server interaction	Fix hanging paragraph. Since there is a 4.2.2.1, there cannot be text at the 4.2.2 level. Perhaps move the text into a new 4.2.2.1 Device server interaction overview section.
HP	67	E	C	6a	23	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview	Move “Figure 2 shows a hardware view of the relationship between the automation device and the data transfer devices, with the automation drive interface in use.” above the figure.
HP	71	E	C	6c	23	4.2.2 Device server interaction	Sort the RMC, ADC, and SMC rules in some manner. Either list RMC then ADC then SMC, or list DTD primary port rules first and ADT port rules second.
HP	72	E	R		23	Figure 2 - Automation and DTD relationship Target Port	Highlight
HP	73	E	R		23	Figure 2 - Automation and DTD relationship Initiator Port	Highlight
HP	74	E	R		23	Figure 2 - Automation and DTD relationship	Place a “Data Transfer Device” label on each box
HP	75	E	R		23	Figure 2 - Automation and DTD relationship	DTD Primary Port(s) Show more than one port to agree with the (s)
HP	76	E	P	6a	23	4.2.2 Device server interaction	After “illustrates a data transfer device” add “and an automation device” with its automation application client and remote SMC device server
HP	68	Q	C	6c	23	Figure 2 - Automation and DTD relationship	What does the “Automation Device” cover? Is it the box on the bottom, or a bigger box not shown?

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	69	T	R		23	Figure 2 - Automation and DTD relationship	Add the automation application client, since it was just discussed in the text.
HP	70	T	A		23	4.2.2 Device server interaction	Add rules for where the SMC Device Server (if present) is accessible.
IBM Penokie	56	E	C	6c	23	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, Figure 2	The term << DTD Primary Port >> needs to be defined in the definitions section.
IBM Penokie	57	E	C	6c	23	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, Figure 2	The term << Automation Primary Port >> needs to be defined in the definitions section.
IBM Penokie	58	E	C	6a	23	4.2.1 Automation drive interface overview, Last paragraph	This paragraph << Figure 2 shows a hardware view of the relationship between the automation device and the data transfer devices, with the automation drive interface in use. >> should be before the figure not after the figure.
IBM Penokie	59	E	C	6a	23	Global	Some figures << illustrate >> and other << show >> either is OK but only one should be used consistently throughout the standard.
IBM Penokie	60	E	C	6a	23	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 1st paragraph	The statement << and the various device servers it has: an RMC device server, an ADC device server, and an optional SMC device server (see 4.2.2.1). >> should be << with an RMC device server, an ADC device server, and an optional SMC device server (see 4.2.2.1). >>
IBM Penokie	61	E	C	6a	23	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 1st paragraph	In several places the statement << logical unit on the xxx port. >> should be changed to << logical unit through the xxx port >>. Logical units are not on ports but rather are accessed through ports. If that is not your model then you have a major architectural problem.
Microsoft	2	Q	P	6a	23	section 4.2.2	2. In section 4.2.2: It is unclear to me how reservations work here. The spec says "ADC device server does not support reservations. The ADC device server avoids reservation conflicts with other device servers since reservations held against one device server do not affect other device servers. This approach allows the automation application client to interact with the DTD via the ADC device server without a conflict due to reservations on other device servers." What I don't understand is that if the RMC device server has a reservation on a DTD port, what happens when the automation application client tries to reserve the same DTD port via the ADC device server? It almost appears from this statement that both the reservations will work. Is that acceptable?
Microsoft	3	Q	C	6a	23	section 4.2.2	3. In Section 4.2.2 the spec says: "The ADC mode pages can override behavior of the RMC device server for operations, eg. the loading and unloading of media" - how does this work if a backup is already in progress, or if one is just been initiated?
Quantum	31	E	C	6a	23	Paragraph after figure 2	This paragraph introduces the figure yet follows it. Move in front of the figure
Quantum	32	E	P	6a	23	Paragraph after figure 2	Wording is unclear. Suggested wording "Figure 2 shows an example of a hardware view of the relationship between the automation device and the data transfer devices using ADT transport protocol interfaces.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Quantum	33	E	R		23	Section 4.2.2	Section 4.2.2 talks about various aspects of device server interactions. It would be helpful to break it into subclauses. Paragraphs 2 - 7 could be something like "command iteration". Paragraph 8 could be "sense data masking". Paragraph 9 could be "Tape Alert".
Quantum	34	E	A		23	Section 4.2.2	We jumped directly into talking about the interaction of the device servers within the DTD without first giving an overview of all of the devices servers and application clients that may be found there. Add some text to describe all of the objects within the DTD that will be discussed in this standard.
Quantum	35	E	R		23	4.2.2, 1st paragraph, 1st sentence	Add "(ADT)" following the phrase "data transfer device".
Quantum	36	E	C	6b	23	4.2.2, 1st paragraph, last sentence	No mention is made of the fact that the RMC device server is only accessible on the DTD primary port(s) if enabled in the ADC Logical Unit descriptor. Add some clarification.
ADIC	15	E	P	6a	24	para 4	"which corresponds" s/b "that corresponds"
ADIC	16	E	R		24	para 6	"which also" s/b "that also"
ADIC	17	E	C	6a	24	para 3	"can affect";"can override" s/b "may affect";"may override"
ENDL	32	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2, p 4 after fig 3, s 3	Regarding: 'The ADC device server shall issue a NOT READY TO READY TRANSITION Unit Attention ...'. The concept of issuing a unit attention is nonsense unless the function is accomplished using Asynchronous Event Reporting (AER). Since AER is optional in ADT and since AER is obsolete in SAM-3, there would be no way that an ADC device can be required to 'issue' a unit attention condition. Therefore '...issue ... unit attention...' should be '...establish ... unit attention condition...'
ENDL	33	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2, p 5 after fig 3, s 2 & s 3	Unit Attentions [s/b] Unit attention conditions [twice, N.B. capitalization correction]
ENDL	34	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2, p 5 after fig 3, s 2	issued [s/b] established
ENDL	35	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2, last p on pg, s 2 & s 4	issue appropriate Unit Attentions s/b establish appropriate unit attention conditions [twice]
HP	77	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction	Change “does not” to “shall not” or “may not’ or “need not” depending on the intent
HP	78	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction	Don’t capitalize Unit Attentions.
HP	80	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction	Don’t capitalize Unit Attention. Phrase as ADC device server shall create a unit attention condition with an additional sense code of NOT READY TO READY TRANSITION
HP	79	T	C	6a	24	Figure 3 - Device server model	Remote/Local not discussed until 4.2.2.1.1. Need to introduce in the text above this figure
HP	81	T	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction	Clarify “based on”
IBM Penokie	62	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 3rd paragraph	The statement << PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL commands issued to the RMC>> should be << PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL commands (see SPC-3) issued to the RMC>>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	63	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 4th paragraph (Global)	(Technical) The term << can >> shall not be used in a standard. It needs to be replaced with may, should, or shall or reworded in some fashion to eliminate it. In this paragraph it looks like << may >> in both cases.
IBM Penokie	64	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 4th paragraph	The statement << operations, e.g. the loading and unloading of media (see 6.2.2.3.1). >> should be << operations (e.g., the loading and unloading of media) (see 6.2.2.3.1). >>
IBM Penokie	65	E	P	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 5th paragraph	The statement << A TEST UNIT READY issued to >> should be << A TEST UNIT READY command (see SPC-3) issued to >>
IBM Penokie	66	E	R		24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 5th paragraph	The statement << The ADC device server shall issue a NOT READY >> should be << In response to a TEST UNIT READY command the ADC device server shall issue a NOT READY >>
IBM Penokie	67	E	R		24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 5th paragraph	The statement << device, which corresponds >> should be << device, that corresponds >>.
IBM Penokie	68	E	R		24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 5th paragraph (Global)	All field names should be in small caps which is not the case in the << DAcc >> field name in this paragraph. This needs to be fixed throughout the standard.
IBM Penokie	69	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 6th paragraph	The statement << device, such as pressing an eject button on the DTD, or a power on of the DTD. >> should be << device (e.g., pressing an eject button on the DTD, or a power on of the DTD). >>
IBM Penokie	70	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 6th paragraph	The statement << server (such as changes to mode parameters that only are supported by one device server). >> should be << << server (e.g., changes to mode parameters that only are supported by one device server). >>
IBM Penokie	71	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 7th paragraph	The statement << A LOAD UNLOAD command issued to >> should be << A LOAD UNLOAD command (see SSC-2) issued to >>
IBM Penokie	72	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 7th paragraph	The statement << and performed by >> carries no meaningful information and should be deleted.
IBM Penokie	73	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 7th paragraph	The statement << as well.>> carries no meaningful information and should be deleted.
IBM Penokie	74	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 7th paragraph	The statement << and performed by >> carries no meaningful information and should be deleted.
IBM Penokie	75	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 7th paragraph	The statement << medium, which also affects the ADC device server. >> should be << medium and the ADC device server. >>.
IBM Penokie	76	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 7th paragraph	The statement << as well.>> carries no meaningful information and should be deleted.
Quantum	37	E	R		24	1st paragraph after figure 3	This statement says that reservations are not supported, but 4.2.9 implies that they are, they are just ignored at times. Add clarification.
Quantum	38	E	C	6a	24	3rd paragraph after figure 3	Change "can" to "may"
Quantum	39	E	C	6a	24	4th paragraph after figure 3	Change " issue a NOT READY TO READY TRANSITION Unit Attention" to "establish a unit attention condition with an addition sense code value of NOT READY TO READY TRANSITION"

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Quantum	40	E	C	6a	24	5th paragraph after figure 3, 2nd sentence	Change "Unit Attentions shall be issued..." to "Unit attention conditions shall be established..."
Quantum	41	E	C	6a	24	5th paragraph after figure 3, 3rd sentence	Change "Unit Attentions shall…" to "Unit Attention conditions shall…". Replace "such as" with "e.g."
Quantum	42	E	C	6a	24	6th paragraph after figure 3, 1st sentence	Change "A LOAD UNLOAD command issued to and performed by the ADC device server affects the readiness state of the RMC device server." to "A LOAD UNLOAD command processed by the ADC device server may affect the readiness state of the RMC device server."
Quantum	43	E	C	6a	24	6th paragraph after figure 3, 2nd sentence	Change "This shall cause the RMC device server to issue appropriate Unit Attentions as well" to "If it does, the RMC device server shall establish appropriate unit attention conditions"
Quantum	44	E	C	6a	24	6th paragraph after figure 3, 3rd sentence	Change "A LOAD UNLOAD command issued to and performed by the RMC device server affects the readiness of the removable medium, which also affects the ADC device server." to "A LOAD UNLOAD command processed by the RMC device server may affect the readiness state of the ADC device server."
Quantum	45	E	C	6a	24	6th paragraph after figure 3, 4th sentence	Change "This shall cause the ADC device server to issue appropriate Unit Attentions as well" to "If it does, the ADC device server shall establish appropriate unit attention conditions"
Seagate	2	E	C	6c	24	4.2.2 Fig. 3	Dashed and solid lines are difficult to distinguish lines. Change dash style? Or, split this into two figures, one for bridging, one without.
Seagate	3	E	C	6a	24	4.2.2 3rd para. After Fig. 3, second sentence	Awkward wording: "...server for operations, e.g. ..."; s/b "...server, e.g. ..."
Seagate	4	E	R		24	4.2.2 4th para. after Fig. 3, 3rd sentence	Unit Attentions are "reported", not "issued"; s/b "...server shall report a ..."
Seagate	5	E	P	6a	24	4.2.2 4th para. after Fig. 3, 3rd sentence	DAcc reference not clear. Suggest ".. readiness of the removable medium in the data transfer device. This corresponds to a value of 1 in the DAcc bit in the VHF data (see 6.1.2.1)."
ADIC	18	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 para 2	"which resides" s/b "that resides"
ADIC	19	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 para 1	"which originated" s/b "that originated"
ADIC	20	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 para 2	"executed" s/b "processed"
ADIC	21	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 para 2	"will receive" s/b "receives"
ADIC	22	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 las para	"can be used" s/b "may be used"
ENDL	36	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2, 1st p on pg, s 1	What does it mean for sense data to be 'masked'? The cross reference is too far away from the critical term. Move '(see 4.2.5)' to immediately following the word 'masked'.
ENDL	37	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2, 2nd p on pg, s 1	There are several English definitions for 'present' (e.g., to make a gift of) none of which are appropriate to a standard. 'present them in' should be 'return them to application clients'.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
ENDL	38	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2, 2nd p on pg, s 2 & s 3	flag [s/b] TapeAlert flag [or] flags [s/b] TapeAlert flags [4 times]
ENDL	39	E	P	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1, p 1, s 2	When this operation is enabled via the ENABLE field of the SMC Logical Unit descriptor (see clause 6.2.2.3.2), the data transfer and automation devices shall contain the objects shown in figure 3, including the optional bridging manager and local SMC device server. [s/b] When this operation is enabled via the ENABLE field of the SMC Logical Unit descriptor (see clause 6.2.2.3.2), the data transfer and automation devices shall contain the bridging manager and local SMC device server objects shown in figure 3. [Otherwise, a SCSI lawyer could argue that figure 3 applies only when the operation is enabled.]
ENDL	40	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2, p 1, s 3	task management functions [s/b] task management requests [for consistency with other clauses]
HP	82	E	C	6a	25	5.2.2.1 ADI Bridging	ADI is used here for the first time, but the acronym has never been introduced.
HP	83	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation	Add ; to each row. Add and or or on the second-to-last row. Add a period on the last row
HP	84	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction	Change (see clause n.n) to (see n.n) everywhere
HP	89	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction	Delete interface
HP	85	T	R		25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation	“Because the remote SMC device server lacks information about the initiator port which originated a request, it cannot implement the full set of commands.” Why don’t you pass that information over ADT and avoid this restriction?
HP	86	T	R		25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation	Access Controls and Alias commands also require initiator identifier knowledge. Asymmetric access (target port groups) and Extended Copy may also present problems
HP	87	T	C	6b	25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation	How does the local SMC device server handle INQUIRY VPD data requesting page 83h - namely the relative target port identifier and target port identifier/name (association = 1). Are they provided with respect to the local device server in the DTD or the remote device server in the automation device? Which protocol identifier field gets filled in? If the primary interface is iSCSI, the INQUIRY data is going to have to change length.
HP	88	T	R		25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation	How does the local SMC device server handle INQUIRY for page 83h with association = 2 (target device)? Does it report about the DTD or the automation device
IBM Penokie	77	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 8th paragraph	The statement << The ADC command NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE provides a >> should be << The NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command (see x.x.x) provides a >>.
IBM Penokie	78	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2 Device server interaction, 8th paragraph	The statement << This cooperative interaction between the device servers facilitates better error handling. >> contains no information useful to a standard. A standard should not justify the reason for a requirement.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	79	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction, 1st paragraph	The statement << may optionally >> is redundant and should be just << may >>.
IBM Penokie	80	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction, 1st paragraph	In the statement <<When this operation is >> what is the << this >> referring to? I assume it's ADI bridging and therefore should be << When ADI bridging is >>
IBM Penokie	81	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction, 1st paragraph	The statement << server (called the 'local SMC device server'), >> should be << server (i.e., the local SMC device server). >>
IBM Penokie	82	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction, 1st paragraph	The statement << server (called the "remote SMC device server"). >> should be << server (i.e., the remote SMC device server). >>
IBM Penokie	83	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction, 2nd paragraph	The statement << server will receive >> should be << server receives >>.
IBM Penokie	84	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction, 2nd paragraph	The statement << transfer device, called the "bridging manager." >> should be << transfer device (i.e., the bridging manager)> >>.
IBM Penokie	85	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1 ADI bridging introduction, 3rd paragraph	The statement << This can be used, for example, in low-cost automation devices that do not have separate primary interface ports. >> should be << This may be used in low-cost automation devices that do not have separate primary interface ports. >>
IBM Penokie	86	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation, 1st paragraph	The statement << initiator port which originated >> should be << initiator port that originated
IBM Penokie	87	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation, 1st paragraph	The statement << it cannot implement the full >> should be << it is not able to implement the full >>.
IBM Penokie	88	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation, 2nd paragraph	The statement << shall be executed by the >> should be << shall be processed by the >>.
IBM Penokie	89	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation, item list	The RESERVE(6), RESERVE(10), RELEASE(6), and RELEASE(10) are no longer defined in SPC-3 so listing them required SPC-2 be listed in the references. If they stay then the (see SPC-2) needs to be after item a and b and the (see spc-3) needs to be after the other list items.
Microsoft	4	Q	C	6a	25	section 4.2.2.1.2	4. In section 4.2.2.1.2: "The local SMC device server shall not support element reservations in the RESERVE(6), RELEASE(6), RESERVE(10), and RELEASE(10) commands. It shall not support the ELEMENT_SCOPE in the PERSISTENT RESERVE IN and PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT commands." - what's being reserved then?
Quantum	46	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1	This heading should be up one level at 4.2.3
Quantum	47	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence	Change "operation" to "feature". Remove "optional" from "…including the optional bridging manager...".
Quantum	48	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1, 2nd paragraph, 1st sentence	Change "will receive" to "receives".
Quantum	49	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.1, 2nd paragraph, 1st sentence	Replace "operations or to provide information" with "tasks".
Seagate	6	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2 first Para. on page, 2nd sentence.	Unclear wording. "...was configured to mask sense data changes..." s/b "was masking sense data changes..."

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Seagate	8	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 1st Para, 2nd sentence	Unclear explanation about remote SMC device server not having initiator port information. "Because the transport protocol connecting the bridging manager and the remote SMC device server may not carry information about which initiator port originated a request, the remote SMC device server cannot implement the full set of commands. Thus, the local SMC device server shall service commands and task management functions that require knowledge of the originating initiator port."
Seagate	9	E	C	6a	25	4.2.2.1.2 1st Para,last sentence	"Is the correct terminology "bridge" or "gateway"? This came up in FC-FS at 8/2003 T11." Determine preferred terminology.
ADIC	23	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 para 1	"data or status from" s/b "data or status received from"
ADIC	24	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 para 4	"When the… would…" awkward <no suggestion>
ENDL	41	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2, list entry b) @ top of pg, s 1 & s 2	UNIT ATTENTION conditions [s/b] unit attention conditions [and] UNIT ATTENTION condition [s/b] unit attention condition
ENDL	42	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2, list entry b) @ top of pg, s 2	[delete] from it [since it conveys no information that is not already obvious]
ENDL	43	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2, list entry c) @ top of pg, s 1	Rephrase 'primary interface' to match a label in figure 3.
ENDL	44	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4, p 1, s 2 & p 2, s 1	inquiry data [s/b] standard INQUIRY data [twice]
ENDL	45	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4, p 2, s 2	invoke ... command ... on [s/b] send ... command ... to
ENDL	46	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4, p 3, s 1	invoke NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE [s/b] send a NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command
ENDL	47	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4, p 3, s 2	invoke [s/b] send
HP	90	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.12 Device server interactions	End each list item with ; End item b with ; and
HP	91	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation	Change initiators to “initiator ports”
HP	93	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3 Bridging manager operation	After “descriptor” add of the ADC Device Configuration mode page
HP	94	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3 Bridging manager operation	Add “corresponding” before local. Multiple SMC/ADC pairs should be supported.
HP	95	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status	Change inquiry to INQUIRY (at least one other time on this page too)
HP	96	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status	CACHE should be smallcaps (several times)
HP	98	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device interface	Change primary interface to primary port (or primary target port)
HP	92	T	P	6b	26	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation	“The remote SMC device server shall not report any protocol-specific mode pages.” This can only be true when accessing it over ADT, assuming ADT doesn’t define any such pages. Over the primary port, it might have to. Note there could also be protocol-specific log pages.
HP	97	T	C	6b	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status	This seems risky; there needs to be a very explicit list of exactly what is subject to caching and what is not. The automation application client then knows exactly when to send the command, and the local SMC device server knows what exactly to cache.
IBM Penokie	90	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation, 2nd a.b.c list	The statement << a reservation condition >> should be << reservation rules (see SPC-2); >>
IBM Penokie	91	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation, 2nd a.b.c list	This list does not have the correct format. There should be a semicolon at the end of each item and an '; and' on the 2nd to the last list item.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	92	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.2 Local SMC device server operation, 2nd a.b.c. list	The use of contingent allegiance requires SAM-2 to be in the references list. Also a reference to SAM-2 should be placed after the statement << contingent allegiance >>.
IBM Penokie	93	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3 Bridging manager operation, 1st paragraph	The statement << REPORT LUNS command >> should be << REPORT LUNS command (see SPC-3) >>.
IBM Penokie	94	E	P	6b	26	4.2.2.1.3 Bridging manager operation, 2nd paragraph (global)	The term << ready status >> is not defined and not used in other SCSI standards. There either needs to be defined in the definitions section or changed to state << NOT READY sense key >>. So in the statement here would read << This shall have no effect on the cached NOT READY sense keys, as described in 4.2.2.1.4. >>.
IBM Penokie	95	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3 Bridging manager operation, 2nd paragraph	The statement << cached ready status, as described in 4.2.2.1.4. >> should be << cached ready status (see 4.2.2.1.4). >>
IBM Penokie	96	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3 Bridging manager operation, 3rd paragraph	The statement << threaded fashion, i.e., not issue more than one request at a time to the remote SMC device server. >> should be << threaded fashion (i.e., not issue more than one request at a time to the remote SMC device server). >>
IBM Penokie	97	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3 Bridging manager operation, 3rd paragraph	The statement << Moreover, if execution of a single request >> should be << Processing of >>.
IBM Penokie	98	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 1st paragraph	The statement << In some implementations >> should be deleted as it contains no useful information.
IBM Penokie	99	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 1st paragraph	The term << quickly >> should be deleted as it cannot be quantified as to how quick is quick.
IBM Penokie	100	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 1st paragraph	The statement << server. For instance, it may save the inquiry data from the remote SMC device server and return it to any initiator port that requests it. >> should be << server (e.g., it may save the inquiry data from the remote SMC device server and return it to any initiator port that requests it). >>
IBM Penokie	101	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 2nd paragraph	The << CACHE >> in CACHE field should be in small caps in two places.
IBM Penokie	102	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 2nd paragraph	(Technical) The following sentence is bad English and doesn't make any sense. << When the CACHE field is set to one, caching is enabled and the automation application client shall invoke the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command (see 5.2) on the ADC device server when events occur that may change data cached by the local SMC device server. >>. I'm not sure what it is supposed to be saying but it needs to be fixed.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	103	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 2nd paragraph	The statement << When the local SMC device server becomes aware of a possible change in the cached data, it shall discontinue using the cached data until it has been refreshed. >> should be << When the local SMC device server detects a possible change in the cached data, it shall discontinue using the cached data until the cached data has been updated. >>
IBM Penokie	104	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 2nd paragraph	The statement << It shall issue the necessary refresh commands to the bridging manager before issuing any commands that it may have received from a DTD primary port and queued. >> should be << The SMC device server shall issue any commands required to update the cache to the bridging manager before issuing any commands that it may have received from a DTD primary port and queued. >>
IBM Penokie	105	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 3rd paragraph	The statement << application client need not invoke NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE for purposes >> should be << application client is not required to invoke NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command for purposes >>
IBM Penokie	106	E	P	6b	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 4th paragraph	The statement <<Ready status indicates>> should be << A cached NOT READY sense key indicates >>
IBM Penokie	107	E	P	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 4th paragraph	The statement << When the remote >> should be << If the remote >>.
IBM Penokie	108	E	R		26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 4th paragraph	The statement << NOT READY, the remote SMC device >> should be << NOT READY, then the remote SMC device >>
IBM Penokie	109	E	P	6b	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 4th paragraph	The statement << ready status >> should be << NOT READY sense keys >>
IBM Penokie	110	E	P	6b	26	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 4th paragraph	The statement << If the ready status indicates not accessible, the local>> should be << If there are any cached NOT READY sense keys then the SMC device server is not accessible and the local >>
Quantum	50	E	C	6a	26	last sentence before 4.2.2.1.3	It is unclear why this requirement is included. Elaborate on why the remote SMC device server can not report protocol specific mode pages.
Quantum	51	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3, 2nd paragraph, 1st sentence	Replace "any device service responses" with "a response from the Remote SMC device server"
Quantum	52	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3, 2nd paragraph, 1st sentence	It is unclear why this requirement is included. Elaborate on why these UAs are discarded.
Quantum	53	E	R	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3, 3rd paragraph, 1st sentence	It is unclear why this requirement is included. Elaborate on why the bridging manager is must be single threaded
Quantum	54	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.3, 3rd paragraph, 1st sentence	Replace "For this reason, queued requests…" with "Requests…"
Quantum	55	E	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4, 1st paragraph[h, 1 sentence	Replace "In some implementations the…" with "The…"

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Seagate	10	T	C	6a	26	4.2.2.1.4, 3rd Para.	If caching disabled, need to specify that ADC can ignore CACHE bit. Change first sentence to: "If caching is disabled, then the ADC device server shall ignore the bridging status byte in the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command. Thus, the automation application client need not invoke the command for purposes of indicating changes in cached data."
ADIC	25	E	R		27	4.2.3 next to last	MAM not spelled out; first use, needs expansion
ADIC	26	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 para 7	"can relinquish" s/b "shall relinquish"
HP	99	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states	After “data” add “in the DTD Status log page”
HP	100	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states	Delete “at a minimum.”
HP	101	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states	Change reported to supported
HP	102	E	C	6c	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, Table 1 - Load sequence nominal states	Add a column header “Field in the VHFD log parameter of the DTD Status log page” over all the bits
HP	103	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, Table 1 - Load sequence nominal states	Left justify “Load Sequence State” to match the entries below
HP	18	Q	C	6b	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states	Are the bit states and sequence guaranteed? I'm not sure of the value of recording so many different states with many being transitory and of very short duration. Is there guidance for automation vendors as to which states to look out for? Is it worth differentiating transitory states from static states?
HP	104	Q	C	6c	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states	What does “nominal” mean? This usage doesn’t seem to match its usual definition
IBM Penokie	111	E	R		27	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 4th paragraph	The statement << accessible, including TEST UNIT READY. >> should be << accessed. >>.
IBM Penokie	112	E	C	6a	27	4.2.2.1.4 Caching SMC data and status, 4th paragraph	The statement << It shall set the Sense Key >> should be << The SMC device server shall set the sense key >>.
IBM Penokie	113	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 1st paragraph	The statement << Very High Frequency data during load >> should be << very high frequency data log parameter during load >>.
IBM Penokie	114	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 1st paragraph	The statement << operations (see clause 6.1.2.1). >> should be << operations (see 6.1.2.1). >> .
IBM Penokie	115	E	P	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 1st paragraph	The statement << Automation devices rely on this information to coordinate handling of the media into the DTD, as well as to provide activity status back to users of the system. >> should be << This information allows automation devices to coordinate handling of the media into the DTD and to provide activity status back to the application client. >>
IBM Penokie	116	E	C	6c	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states	The names of the log parameters should not be capitalized. For example Very High Frequency should be very high frequency data parameter. This is a global change
IBM Penokie	117	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 2nd paragraph	The statement << at a minimum. >> should be deleted as it adds no useful information.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	118	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 2nd paragraph	The statement << reported to accurately reflect the states actually used by >> should be << reported to reflect the states used by >>
IBM Penokie	119	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 3nd preadapt	The statement << the recovery requested (RRQST) field in the Very High Frequency data shall be set to one and the in transition (INXTN) field shall be set to zero. >> should be << the RRQST bit in the very high frequency data log parameter shall be set to one and the INXTN bit shall be set to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	120	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 3rd paragraph	The statement << Very High Frequency data shall be >> should be << very high frequency data log parameter shall be >>.
IBM Penokie	121	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 4th paragraph	The statement << When the in transition (INXTN) field is set to zero, the DTD requires an external stimulus (such as a command or physical translation of media) to attempt to reach another state. >> should be << When the INXTN bit is set to zero, the DTD requires an external stimulus (e.g., a command or physical translation of media) before transitioning to another state. >>
IBM Penokie	122	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 6th paragraph	The statement << state, such as a 'push' of the media by the automation. >> should be << state, (e.g., as a push of the media by the automation). >>. Also the term << push >> is not defined. That needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	123	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 7th paragraph	The statement << Load state (c) represents detection and acknowledgement by the DTD of media presence, and that the DTD is now able to assume control of the media and that automation can relinquish control of robotic access. This state may be reflected after a media 'push' by the automation for example. An additional external stimulus is required to leave this state, such as a 'load' command from the automation. >> should be << Load state (c) represents detection and acknowledgement by the DTD of media presence, and that the DTD may now assume control of the media and that automation should relinquish control of robotic access (e.g., this state may be reflected after a media push by the automation). An additional external stimulus is required to leave this state (e.g., a load command from the automation). >>
IBM Penokie	124	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 8th paragraph	The statement << of the DTD. It is used while seating the media. >> should be << of the DTD (e.g., to seat the media). >>.
IBM Penokie	125	E	C	6a	27	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 9th paragraph	The statement << leave this state, such as a 'thread' command from the automation. >> should be << leave this state (e.g., a thread command from the automation. >>. Also there is not definition of what a << thread >> is. This needs to be fixed.
Quantum	56	E	C	6a	27	Section 4.2.3	This clause should be broken into at least 2 subclauses (load and unload) and maybe more.
Quantum	57	E	C	6a	27	1st paragraph after Table 1	Remove "at a minimum"

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Quantum	58	E	C	6a	27	3rd paragraph after Table 1	This paragraph does not really place any requirements on the device server. The paragraph would be stronger if reworded, for instance "The DTD shall set the in transition (INXTN) field to zero when an external stimulus (e.g. a command or physical translation of media) is required to attempt to reach another state."
Quantum	59	E	P	6a	27	load state ©	Replace "such as a "load" command from the automation" with "(e.g. a LOAD UNLOAD command from the automation application client.)"
Quantum	60	E	P	6a	27	Load state (e)	Replace "such as a "thread" command from the automation" with "(e.g. a LOAD UNLOAD command from the automation application client.)"
Seagate	11	E	C	6c	27	4.2.3	Incorrect usage of "media", since there's only one in the DTD. Change to "medium"
STK	11	E	R		27	Table 1	Move information following this table, such as "load state (a) represents ..." inside the table.
ADIC	27	E	R		28	para 6	"which is " s/b "that is"
HP	105	E	C	6a	28	Table 3 - Unload sequence nominal states	Left justify “Unload Sequence State” to match entries below
IBM Penokie	126	E	C	6a	28	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 11th paragraph	The statement << leave this state, such as a command from the automation. >> should be << leave this state (e.g., a command from the automation). >> .
IBM Penokie	127	E	C	6a	28	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 13th paragraph	The statement << operation, e.g., the DTD being in the SCSI READY state. >> should be << operation (e.g., the DTD being in the SCSI READY state). >>
IBM Penokie	128	E	P	6a	28	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, Table 2 line 3	The statement << After 'push' by automation >> should be << After push by automation >>.
IBM Penokie	129	E	C	6a	28	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 1st paragraph above table 3	The statement << Very High Frequency data during unload >> should be << very high frequency data log parameter during unload >>.
IBM Penokie	130	E	P	6a	28	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 1st paragraph above table 3	The statement << Automation devices rely on this information to coordinate handling of the media from the DTD, as well as to provide activity status back to users of the system. >> should be << Automation devices use this information to coordinate handling of the media from the DTD and to provide activity status back to application clients. >>
IBM Penokie	131	E	C	6a	28	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 1st paragraph after table 3	The statement << at a minimum. >> should be deleted as it adds no useful information.
IBM Penokie	132	E	C	6a	28	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 1st paragraph after table 3	The statement << reported to accurately reflect the states actually used by >> should be << reported to reflect the states used by >>
Quantum	61	E	P	6a	28	Load state (g)	Replace "such as a command from the automation" with "(e.g. and LOAD UNLOAD command from the automation application client)"
Quantum	62	E	C	6a	28	Load state (i) sentence	Place e.g. clause in parenthesis
Quantum	64	E	C	6c	28	2nd paragraph after Table 2	The numbers in parentheses at the end of the sentences are confusing. This might be more readable as a numbered list
Quantum	65	E	C	6a	28	1st sentence after Table 3	Remove phrase "at a minimum"

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Quantum	63	T	C	6c	28	Load state (i) sentence	I thought we wanted to include FMR and cleaning tapes in this state. If so, then we need more text here to make that clear.
STK	12	E	R		28	Table 3	Move information following this table, such as "unload state (a) reflects ..." inside the table.
ADIC	28	E	R		29	para 1	reference to RRqst, InXtn needed; add clause link
ADIC	29	E	C	6a	29	para 10	"could use" (2x) s/b "may use"
HP	107	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states	Delete “To”
HP	108	E	R		29	4.2.4 Error reporting, Table 4 - Error conditions and sense keys	Change initiator to initiator port
HP	109	E	C	6a	29	4.2.4 Error reporting	Change initiator to application client
HP	110	E	C	6a	29	4.2.4 Error reporting	Change “following conditions” with conditions listed in table 4
HP	111	E	C	6a	29	Table 4 - Error conditions and sense keys	Left justify “Sense Key” or center all the entries below
HP	112	E	C	6a	29	Table 4 - Error Conditions and Sense Keys	Lowercase “Conditions and Sense Keys”
IBM Penokie	133	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 2nd preadapt under table 3	The statement << the recovery requested (RRQST) field in the Very High Frequency data shall be set to one and the in transition (INXTN) field shall be set to zero. >> should be << the RRQST bit in the very high frequency data log parameter shall be set to one and the INXTN bit shall be set to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	134	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, Almost all paragraphs under table 3	The term << reflects >> should be change to << represents >> which is the term used in other similar statements in this section.
IBM Penokie	135	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 6th paragraph after table 3	The statement << unseated, as well as the state during the eject operation. >> should be << unseated and the DTD state during the eject operation. >>
IBM Penokie	136	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 7th paragraph under table 3	The statement << An external stimulus, such as a request to eject or load, is needed to leave this state. >> should be << An additional external stimulus is required to leave this state (e.g., a request to eject or load). >>.
IBM Penokie	137	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 8th paragraph under table 3	The statement << An external stimulus, such as a request to eject or load, is needed to leave this state. >> should be << An additional external stimulus is required to leave this state (e.g., a request to eject or load). >>.
IBM Penokie	138	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, 9th paragraph under table e3	The statement << unloaded and ejected and the DTD is still able >> should be << unloaded, ejected, and the DTD is still able >> .
IBM Penokie	139	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3 Load and unload nominal states, Last paragraph	The statement << As an example, an 'unload to hold point' sequence could use states (a), (b), (c) and (e), or alternatively (a), (b), (c), (d), and (f). An 'unload to eject' sequence could use states (a), (b), (c), (d), and (h). >> should be << As an example, an unload to hold point sequence should use states (a), (b), (c) and (e), or alternatively states (a), (b), (c), (d), and (f). An unload to eject sequence should use states (a), (b), (c), (d), and (h). >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	140	E	C	6a	29	4.2.4 Error reporting	The statement << CHECK CONDITION status. The appropriate sense key and additional sense code should be set. >> should be << CHECK CONDITION status with the appropriate sense key and additional sense code. >>
IBM Penokie	141	E	C	6a	29	4.2.4 Error reporting	The statement << Table 4 illustrates >> should be << Table 4 lists >>
IBM Penokie	142	E	C	6a	29	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 1st paragraph	The statement << If an initiator is testing the status >> should be << If an application client is testing the status >>.
Microsoft	5	Q	C	6a	29	section 4.2.5	5. In section 4.2.5 :Why is sense data masking an optional feature? Wouldn't not forcing its implementation cause some unnecessary failures to backups?
Quantum	66	E	C	6a	29	section 4.2.4	What is the value of this section? It is no different than normal behavior.
Quantum	67	E	C	6a	29	4.2.5, 1st paragraph, last sentence	Replace this sentence with "If an application client is testing the status of the RMC device, it may see an initial failure even though the loading eventually succeeds and the MOVE MEDIUM command to the SMC device returns GOOD status."
Seagate	12	E	C	6a	29	4.2.3	"to hold point" needs an article. Two occurences, in descriptions of states e and f. Change to "to the hold point"
Seagate	13	E	C	6a	29	4.2.5 1st para. 2nd sentence	DTD implements masking, but RMC device server reports status. Change "...testing the status of the device, ..." to "...testing the status of the RMC device server, ..."
ADIC	30	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 para 3	"which requires" s/b "that requires"
ADIC	31	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 para 1	"reset" (2x) s/b "set"
ADIC	32	E	C	6a	30	last para	"shall not reset the…" s/b (all three occurrances) "shall not set the state flags….to zero."
ADIC	33	E	P	6a	30	para 1	"will be able" s/b "should be able"
ENDL	48	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5, 1st p on pg, s 1	device's status is masked [s/b] device's true status is not reported to the application client [without this change the definition is recursive] [also, with the definition clarified, the 'i.e. ...' example is not necessary and should be deleted]
ENDL	49	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5, 1st p on pg, s 1	failure of the backup [s/b] user application failure [true backup is an important user application, but is it the only one?]
HP	113	E	C	6a	30	paragraph 2	statuses should be status
HP	114	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking	Use an a)b)c) list
HP	116	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface	Change Tape Alert to TapeAlert (or vice versa)
HP	115	T	R		30	4.2.5 Sense data masking	Add cross reference to where SM_TOV is defined. It's mentioned as vendor specific at the end of this section - is that all? It seems like it should have a more formal home.
IBM Penokie	143	E	R		30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 2nd paragraph	The statement << loads - i.e., failures are not reported - the >> should be << loads (i.e., failures are not reported) the >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	144	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 2nd paragraph	The statement << automation device will be able to retry the load without causing >> should be << automation device may retry the load without causing >>
IBM Penokie	145	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 2nd paragraph	The statement << This behavior is termed 'sense data masking' and its implementation is optional. >> should be << This behavior is termed sense data masking. >>
IBM Penokie	146	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 3rd paragraph	The statement << While in masking mode, the data >> should be << If sense data masking is enabled, the data >>.
IBM Penokie	147	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 3rd paragraph	(Technical) In the statement << These values are vendor-specific.>> it is not clear what value are VS. I certainly hope you are not expecting vendor-specific statuses and sense data. If so you have a major problem that needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	148	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 4th paragraph	The statement << If the data transfer device implements sense data masking, then when it begins loading a medium it shall enter masking mode. The device shall exit masking mode when any of the following events occur: >> should be << If implemented, the data transfer device shall enable sense data masking when it begins loading a medium. The data transfer device shall disable sense data masking after any of the following occur:>>.
IBM Penokie	149	T	C	6b	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 2nd Item	(Technical) The is no definition or description of what a <<SM_TOV (SENSE MASKING TIMEOUT VALUE) >> is or does. This needs to be fixed or removed.
IBM Penokie	150	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 3rd list item	The statement << LDFAIL field set to one >> should be << LDFAIL bit set to one >>.
IBM Penokie	151	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, Bulleted list	There should be no bulleted lists in this standard. That is not a convention used in SCSI standards. All bulleted lists should be changed to a,b,c lists or 1,2,3 lists in the proper format. (i.e., semicolons after each list item and a 'and' or 'or' on the second to the last item in the list.
IBM Penokie	152	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 2nd to last paragraph	The statement << shall remain in masking mode and the SM_TOV >> should be << shall not disable the sense data masking and the SM_TOV >> .
IBM Penokie	153	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, 2nd to last paragraph	The statement << then the data transfer device shall exit masking mode. >> should be << then the data transfer device shall disable the sense data masking. >>.
IBM Penokie	154	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Sense data masking, Last paragraph	The statement <<is vendor-specific, and is not described by this standard.>> is redundant. It is either vendor-specific or not described by this standard but it cannot be both. Pick one.
IBM Penokie	155	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 2nd paragraph	The statement << state flags are not affected by port logins. >> should be << state flags are not affected port events (e.g., port logins). >>
IBM Penokie	156	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 3rd paragraph	The statement << As such, >> carries no meaningful information and should be deleted.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	157	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 3rd paragraph	The statement <<as desired.>> carries no meaningful information and should be deleted.
IBM Penokie	158	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 4th paragraph	The statement << ADC device server sets the TapeAlert Flags Changed (TAFC) field in the VHF data. >> should be << ADC device server sets the TAFC bit to one in the VHF data. >>
IBM Penokie	159	E	P	6a	30	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 5th paragraph	The statement << shall not reset the state flags >> should be << shall not clear the state flags >> to be consistent with other text in this section.
Quantum	68	E	P	6a	30	1st paragraph	Replace the phrase "the automation device will be able to retry the load without causing an unnecessary failure of the backup" with "the automation device may be able to retry the load operation while the DTD reports the load operation is still in progress to application clients that poll it".
Quantum	69	E	C	6a	30	2nd paragraph	Replace "statuses" with "status"
Quantum	70	E	R	6a	30	2nd paragraph	Replace "These values are vendor-specific" with "The status and sense data used are vendor-specific".
Quantum	72	E	C	6a	30	bullet list	Use lettered list instead.
Quantum	73	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6, 1st paragraph, last sentence	Replace "whenever a state flag changes value" with "whenever a TapeAlert flags changes value"
Quantum	71	T	P	6a	30	3rd paragraph	Replace "If the data transfer device implements sense data masking, " with "If sense data masking is enabled in the data transfer device,".
Quantum	74	T	C	6a	30	4.2.6, 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence	Replace "application client" with "initiator port".
Seagate	14	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 1st Para. on page	DTD implements masking, but RMC device server reports status. Change "If the data transfer device's status is masked..." to "If the RMC device server's status is masked..."
Seagate	15	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 2nd Para. on page	DTD implements masking, but RMC device server reports status. Change "the data transfer device shall report" to "the RMC device server shall report"
Seagate	16	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5 Bullet item 3	DTD implements masking, but ADC device server executes NOTIFY DTD. Change "The data transfer device receives ..." to "The ADC device server receives ..."
Seagate	17	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5	Need to clarify action after exiting masking mode. Add new para. before the last one in 4.2.2: "After exiting masking mode, the RMC device server shall report SCSI statuses and sense data consistent with successful or unsuccessful completion of loading, as appropriate."
Seagate	18	E	C	6a	30	4.2.6 last Para. on page	Typo. Change "independent" to "independently"
STK	13	E	C	6a	30	clause 4.2.5, first sentence on page	" - i.e., ... -" should be "(i.e., ...)".
STK	14	E	C	6a	30	4.2.5, second paragraph on page, first sentence.	Change "statuses" to "status".
ADIC	34	E	C	6a	31	before table 5	"reset" s/b "set state flags to zero"
ADIC	35	E	C	6a	31	table 5	title "reset", field "reset" ?
ADIC	36	E	C	6a	31	para 1	"will be" s/b "shall be"

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
ENDL	50	E	C	6c	31	4.2.6, table 5	The table title should include '(part 1 of 2)'. The line at the bottom of the first page should be a double line. The title on the second page should include '(part 2 of 2)'. The top line at the top of the second page should be a double line. The column headings should be repeated at the top of the second page.
HP	117	E	C	6a	31	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface	In “5.l” delete the l.
HP	118	E	C	6a	31	Table 5 - Additional TapeAlert state flag reset conditions	Center all the entries under Flag
HP	119	E	C	6a	31	Table 5 - Additional TapeAlert state flag reset conditions	Left justify Name
HP	120	E	C	6a	31	Table 5 - Additional TapeAlert state flag reset conditions	Left justify Additional reset condition
HP	49	I	R		31	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface	TapeAlert flags. I found many of the flag names insufficiently specific, e.g. "media", "media life", "no removal". There are many other examples. If we want ISV's to take TA flags seriously, then the flags will need to be specific and drive consistent ISV actions for all drive types. I'm not sure if this list comes from the SCSI spec or whether it is ADI specific.
IBM Penokie	160	E	C	6a	31	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 6th paragraph	The statement << state flags will be reported as new states following the power cycle as conditions warrant. >> should be << state flags shall be reported as new states following the power cycle. >>.
IBM Penokie	161	E	C	6a	31	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 6th paragraph	The statement << events that reset state flags are described in table 5.l >> should be << events that clear state flags are described in table 5. >>.
IBM Penokie	162	E	C	6c	31	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, Table 5 (Global)	Any table that extends across more that one page needs the << (x of x) >> notation at the end of the title. This easily done in Frame.
Quantum	75	E	C	6a	31	1st sentence on the page	Replace "will" with "shall". Remove the extra character after the last sentence in the paragraph.
ADIC	37	E	C	6a	32	4.2.8 para 1	"which modify" s/b "that modify"
ADIC	38	E	C	6a	32	below table	"reset" s/b "set to zero"
ADIC	39	E	C	6a	32	para 2	"reset" s/b "set to zero"
ADIC	40	E	C	6a	32	para 1	"will vary" s/b "varies"
ADIC	41	E	C	6a	32	para 2	"specification" s/b "standard"
HP	123	E	C	6c	32	Table 5 - Additional TapeAlert state flag reset conditions	Add (part 1) and (part 2) to the table headers since it is broken onto two pages
HP	124	E	C	6a	32	4.2.6 TapeAlert application client interface	Change specification to standard
HP	126	E	C	6a	32	4.2.8 Enabling and disabling DTD primary ports	To “ADC device specific mode page” fix capitalization and add cross reference
HP	122	Q	R		32	4.2.7 Medium Auxiliary Memory attributes	What is the point of this limitation?
HP	125	T	C	6a	32	4.2.7 Medium Auxiliary Memory attributes	Add a cross reference to SPC-3 and the READ ATTRIBUTE and/or WRITE ATTRIBUTE command names somewhere in this section
IBM Penokie	163	E	P	6a	32	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 2nd to last paragraph	The statement << Many of the state flags are reset at the start of next >> should be << Many of the state flags are cleared at the start of next >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	164	E	C	6a	32	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 2nd to last paragraph	The statement << Starting with no media present, this is defined to be coincident with entering the next load state upon transition from load state (a) (see table 1). >> Make no sense and needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	165	E	C	6a	32	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 2nd to last paragraph	The statement <<The next load state entered will vary by DTD. >> should be << The next load state entered varies by DTD. >> .
IBM Penokie	166	E	C	6a	32	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, 2nd to last paragraph	The statement << unload hold point (unload state (e) or (f) in table 3), >> should be << unload hold point (i.e., unload state (e) or (f) in table 3), >>
IBM Penokie	167	E	P	6a	32	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, Last paragraph	The statement << Other state flags are reset following resolution through >> should be << Other state flags are cleared following resolution through >>.
IBM Penokie	168	E	C	6a	32	4.2.6 Tape Alert application client interface, Last paragraph	The statement << Service resolution may involve support from the manufacturer or manual intervention by the user, and is beyond the scope of this specification. >> should be << Service resolution is beyond the scope of this specification. >>
IBM Penokie	169	E	C	6a	32	4.2.7 Medium Auxiliary Memory attributes	The statement << If the library needs to modify one >> should be << If the library is required to modify one >> .
IBM Penokie	170	E	C	6a	32	Global	The term << library >> is not defined. This term needs to be defined, removed, or replaced with a term that is defined in all places it is used.
IBM Penokie	171	E	C	6a	32	4.2.8 Enabling and disabling DTD primary ports, 1st paragraph	The statement << enabled via MODE SELECT commands >> should be << enabled via MODE SELECT commands (see SPC-3) >>
Microsoft	6	Q	C	6a	32	section 4.2.8	6. In section 4.2.8: What is the need to log out all logged-in ports if an enabled DTD primary port is disabled? How are the ports related to the primary port?
Quantum	76	E	C	6c	32	Table 5	This table needs a header on each page
Quantum	77	T	C	6a	32	4.2.8, 1st paragraph	Change "allows" to "may allow" or "shall allow"
Seagate	19	E	C	6a	32	4.2.6 1st Para. after Table 5	Noun needs article; Change "...the start of next media load." to "...the start of the next media load."
Seagate	20	E	C	6a	32	4.2.8	Mode page name is not correct; Change "device specific mode page" to "device configuration mode page" and add cross reference to clause with ADC device configuration mode page,"
ADIC	42	E	P	6a	33	para 2	"When an…, if…" s/b "If the transport…, and an enabled port is"
ADIC	43	E	R		33	4.2.9	"which" (3x) s/b "that" (strike "must" also)
ADIC	44	E	P	6a	33	4.2.10 step 5	"can proceed" s/b "proceeds"
HP	129	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation	End each list item with ; End the second-to-last with “; and”
HP	130	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior	Change 1)2)3) to a)b)c) and use proper ; endings
HP	131	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations	Change initiator(s) to initiator port(s)
HP	133	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation	host initiated unload should be small caps (and probably abbreviated)
HP	128	T	C	6a	33	4.2.8 3rd Paragraph	What status should be returned?
HP	132	T	R		33	4.2.8 Enabling and disabling DTD primary ports	Implicitly is a FC concept. This text should be generic or given as a FC example.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	172	E	C	6a	33	4.2.8 Enabling and disabling DTD primary ports, 2nd paragraph	The statement << transport-level actions, such as SCSI Bus Reset or the Fibre Channel Loop Initialization or Loop Port Enable primitives. >> should be << transport-level actions (e.g., SCSI Bus Reset, the Fibre Channel Loop Initialization, or Loop Port Enable primitives). >>
IBM Penokie	173	E	R		33	4.2.8 Enabling and disabling DTD primary ports, 3rd paragraph	The statement << When an enabled port is disabled, >> should be << When a port is disabled, >>
IBM Penokie	174	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior, 1st paragraph	The statement << implements four classes of commands: >> should be << implements the following classes of commands: >>
IBM Penokie	175	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior, Item 1	The statement << Commands which are >> should be << Commands that are >>.
IBM Penokie	176	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior, item 1	The statement << device types - INQUIRY, TEST UNIT READY, and REQUEST SENSE. >> should be << device types (see SPC-3); >>.
IBM Penokie	177	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior	The 1,2,3 list is not an ordered list and therefore should be an a,b,c list. And the list should be placed in the correct format (see global comment).
IBM Penokie	178	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior, Item 2	The statement << Commands which must always ignore reservations placed by other initiators - such as LOAD UNLOAD. >> should be << Commands required to always ignore reservations placed by other initiators (e.g., LOAD UNLOAD); >>
IBM Penokie	179	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior, item 3	The statement << Commands which must ignore reservations for some values of command parameters, such as MODE SELECT. >> should be << Commands required to ignore reservations for some values of command parameters (e.g., MODE SELECT); and >>
IBM Penokie	180	E	R		33	4.2.9 Device reservations and command behavior, Item 4	The statement << Vendor unique commands; the device vendor is responsible for avoiding reservation conflicts. >> should be << Vendor specific commands. >> The part about avoiding reservation conflicts is not some that the standard can specific on vendor specific things.
IBM Penokie	181	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation, 1st paragraph	The statement << Some automation devices support a mode of operation referred to as 'sequential mode'. >> should be << Some automation devices support a sequential mode of operation. >> .
IBM Penokie	182	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation, 1st paragraph	The statement << configured in this mode, >> should be << configured in the sequential mode, >>.
IBM Penokie	183	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation, 1st paragraph	The statement << In this mode the automation device implicitly >> should be << In the sequential mode the automation device implicitly >>
IBM Penokie	184	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation, 1st paragraph	The statement << A typical sequence of operations would be as follows: >> should be << A typical sequence of operations follows: >>
IBM Penokie	185	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation	The 1,2,3 list is not in the correct format. See global comment.
IBM Penokie	186	E	R		33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation, Item 5	The statement << and the backup can proceed. >> should be << and the backup proceeds. >>
IBM Penokie	187	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation, Last paragraph	The statement << may use the host initiated unload bit in the VHF >> should be << may use the HIU bit in the VHF >>.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	188	E	C	6a	33	4.2.10 Sequential mode operation, Last paragraph	The statement <<(see clause 6.1.2.1) >> should be << (see 6.1.2.1) >>.
Microsoft	7	Q	C	6a	33	section 4.2.10	7. In section 4.2.10: In sequential mode operation, the automation device moves the next medium from a storage element to the DTD when the current one is full - isn't this dangerous? What if the media contains useful data? Is this sequential mode really a necessary feature? It isn't like the time saved will be noticeable considering that we're dealing with slow I/O devices.
Quantum	78	E	R		33	2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence	Change "received" to "already received"
Quantum	80	E	R		33	4.2.9, letter list	There is no priority to the item sin this list, so it should be letter instead of numbered
Quantum	79	T	C	6a	33	3rd sentence	Remove "and re-enable of"
Seagate	22	E	P	6a	33	4.2.10	Which device server is unclear; List items 1 and 5: Change "DTD" to "RMC device server"
Seagate	21	T	R		33	4.2.9	Should we mention REPORT LUNS? TBD
ENDL	51	E	C	6c	34	5.1, Table 6	The foot matter for the table should include a key defining M and O. Alternatively, mandatory and optional may be spelled out.
HP	64	E	C	6a	34	Table 6, 7th body row	Mode sense
HP	137	E	C	6a	34	5.1 Summary of commands	Table 6 - Command set Change SEND DIAGNOSTICS to SEND DIAGNOSTIC
HP	138	Q	C	6a	34	5.1 Summary of commands	“the command set is supported” If which command set is supported? ADC or the one which defines the command? By which logical unit? The ADC logical unit or the RMC logical unit?
HP	134	T	R		34	Table 6	Why is the writebuffer command optional, since it is needed for downloading?
HP	135	T	C	6c	34	5 Commands for ADI devices	Need to have a column added to SPC-3’s operation code column that agrees with this table May need to have NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE added to SPC-3’s list of SERVICE ACTION OUT (16) assignments.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	136	T	C	6c	34	5.1 Summary of commands	Table 6 - Command set for automation drive interface Unless this command set is special, it should support all the commands that are available in every other command set. (it might be good to drop support for the scc Commands): Add:ACCESS CONTROLS IN ACCESS CONTROLS OUT CHANGE ALIASES PERSISTENT RESERVE IN PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT REDUNDANCY GROUP IN REDUNDANCY GROUP OUT REPORT ALIASES REPORT DEVICE IDENTIFIER REPORT SUPPORTED TASK MANAGEMENT FUNCTIONS SET DEVICE IDENTIFIER SPARE IN SPARE OUT VOLUME SET IN VOLUME SET OUT
IBM Nishida	1	E	C	6a	34	Table 6	2) These commands are subject ... -> 2) This command is subject ...
IBM Penokie	189	E	C	6c	34	5.1 Summary of commands for automation drive interface devices, Table 6 (Global)	This is not the correct format for notes in tables see SAS, SAM-3 or SPC-3 for example on how table notes should be done.
IBM Penokie	190	E	C	6a	34	5.1 Summary of commands for automation drive interface devices, Table 6	The statement << medium, such that the logical unit is able to accept these identified medium-access commands without returning CHECK CONDITION status. >> should be << medium (i.e., the logical unit is able to accept these identified medium-access commands without returning CHECK CONDITION status). >>
IBM Penokie	191	E	C	6a	34	5.1 Summary of commands for automation drive interface devices, Table 6	The term << vendor unique >> should be << vendor specific >>.
IBM Pierce	1	E	C	6a	34	Table 6	The second Mode Select(6) should be Mode Sense(6).
IBM Roberts	1	E	C	6a	34	5.1 Table 6 Command Set for automation drive interface	The second occurance of "MODE SELECT(6)" should be "MODE SENSE(6)"
IBM Roberts	2	T	R		34	5.1 Table 6 Command Set for automation drive interface	Consider adding a command to allow the library to send a cartridge bar code label volser to the drive. This would allow the library to send the volser to the drive for use in drive error log entries, making it easier for service personnel to determine which cartridge was involved with a drive-reported error. This can be accomplished with a Write Buffer command, but having a standardized method of accomplishing this task would be helpful. Perhaps defining a standardized write buffer id for this purpose would be appropriate.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Roberts	3	T	A		34	5.1 Table 6 Command Set for automation drive interface	Consider adding a command to allow the library to send a time stamp (number of seconds since some date) to the drive. This would allow the library to update a real-time clock in the drive. This real-time clock would then allow the drive to provide meaningful date/time info in error log entries. This can be accomplished with a Write Buffer command, but having a standardized method of accomplishing this task would be helpful. Perhaps defining a standardized write buffer id for this purpose would be appropriate.
Seagate	23	E	C	6a	34	5.1 Table 6	READ BUFFER command lists SSC as reference; Should be SPC-2
Seagate	24	E	C	6c	34	5.1 Table 6	Notes run into right border; Fix
STK	15	E	C	6c	34	Table 6	Operation codes for each command should be included in this table.
STK	16	E	R		34	Table 6	Change SPC-2 references to SPC-3 unless the command is obsolete in SPC-3.
STK	17	E	R		34	Table 6	Remove notes field. These details are defined in the referenced standards.
STK	18	E	R		34	Table 6	Read attribute should be optional, not mandatory.
ADIC	45	E	P	6a	35	5.2 para 2	"device will not" s/b "device shall not"
ADIC	46	E	C	6a	35	last para	"It can also" s/b "It may also"
ENDL	52	E	C	6a	35	5.2, 1st p after table 7, s 2	A value of zero [s/b] An LdFail bit set to zero
ENDL	53	E	C	6a	35	5.2, 2nd p after table 7, s 1	The phrase 'bridging status byte' is used nowhere else in the standard. There for 'are collectively known as the bridging status byte and' should be deleted.
ENDL	54	E	C	6a	35	5.2, 4th p after table 7, s 1 & s 2	inquiry data [s/b] INQUIRY data [three times]
ENDL	55	E	C	6a	35	5.2, 4th p after table 7, s 1	vital product data [s/b] VPD
HP	140	E	R		35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command	Combine rows 6..14 into two rows
IBM Nishida	2	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command	I cannot find the description of byte 15, "CONTROL" field in table 7.
IBM Penokie	192	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 1st paragraph	The statement << Implementation of this command is mandatory. >> is not needed as the command is already stated as being mandatory in table 6. Delete the text.
IBM Penokie	193	E	C	6a	35	Global	A one bit field is not called a << field >> but a <<bit >>. To be a field the number of bits has to be greater than 1. This needs to be corrected in all cases in this standard.
IBM Penokie	194	E	C	6c	35	Global	The term << recovery requested >>is a field name and therefore should be in small caps. This is true for all field and bit names. This needs to be checked and fixed throughout this standard. However in this specific case this is a bit and should use the proper bit name of << RRQST >>. The statement then becomes << that the RRQST bit in the VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR is set to one while >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	195	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 1st paragraph after table 7	The term << VHF data >> appears to be incorrect in that the thing called VHF data looks like a descriptor not a field. I suggest the name be changed to << VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR >> all small caps.
IBM Penokie	196	E	C	6a	35	Global	All references to subclauses (i.e., that's anything except the first level of a section (e.g., 1 or 2 or 3) have to be (see x.x.x). This has to be fixed in all cases in this standard.
IBM Penokie	197	E	P	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 1st paragraph after table 7	The statement << the automation device will not attempt any additional recovery. >> should be << the automation device shall not attempt any additional recovery. >>
IBM Penokie	198	E	P	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 2nd paragraph after table 7	The statement << The fields in byte 3 are collectively known as the bridging status byte and >> should be << The bits in byte 3 are collectively known as the bridging status and >>
IBM Penokie	199	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 3rd paragraph after table 7	The statement << A value of one in the mode data changed (MDC) field indicates << should be << A mode data changed (MDC) bit set to one indicates >>
IBM Penokie	200	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 3rd paragraph after table 7	The statement << A value of zero indicates >> should be << A MDC bit set to zero indicates >>.
IBM Penokie	201	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 4th paragraph after table 7	The statement << A value of one in the inquiry data changed (IDC) field indicates >> should be << An inquiry data changed (IDC) bit set to one indicates >>.
IBM Penokie	202	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 4th paragraph after table 7	The statement << A value of zero indicates >> should be << An IDC bit set to zero indicates. >>
IBM Penokie	203	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 5th paragraph after table 7	The statement << A value of one in the not ready status changed (NRSC) field indicates >> should be << A not ready status changed (NRSC) bit set to one indicates >>.
IBM Penokie	204	E	C	6a	35	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 5th paragraph after table 7	The statement << It can also indicate >> should be << It may also indicate >>.
Quantum	81	E	C	6a	35	5.2, 1st paragraph	Replace "...is sent by the automation device to notify the data transfer device (DTD) of…" with "…is used to notify the device server of…"
Quantum	82	E	C	6a	35	2nd paragraph after Table 7	Add reference "(see 4.2.2.1.4)"
Quantum	83	E	C	6a	35	2nd paragraph after Table 7, 2nd sentence	Modify "...the use of any cached mode data shall be discontinued until…" to "...the use of any cached mode data by the local SMC device server (see 4.2.2.1.2) shall be discontinued until…
ENDL	56	E	C	6a	36	5.2, 1st on pg, s 2, 2nd p on pg s 1, and 3rd p on pg, s 2	ASC and ASCQ should be in small caps, like they are in table 7. [three times]
ENDL	57	E	C	6a	36	5.2, 5th p on pg, s 1	invoke [s/b] send
ENDL	58	E	C	6a	36	5.2, 5th p on pg, s 1	since the previous invocation of [s/b] since the most recent processing of
HP	141	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command	Use small caps for ASC and ASCQ (several times in this section)
HP	142	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command	Change initiators to initiator ports

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	143	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command	Change initiator to initiator port
HP	144	Q	R		36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER	pending unit attention condition" is unclear and seems CA-specific. In an autosense protocol, isn't the UA pending until reported?
HP	145	T	C	6b	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER	invocation or completion? Don't want to queue up lots of these
IBM Penokie	205	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 5th paragraph after table 7	The statement << When NRSC is one, the>> should be << When the NRSC bit is set to one, the>>.
IBM Penokie	206	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 5th paragraph after table 7	The statement << A value of zero indicates >> should be << An NRSC bit set to zero indicates. >>
IBM Penokie	207	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 5th paragraph after table 7	It is not clear what term << Not Ready status >> is referring to as there is not such status in SCSI. The is a NOT READY sense key and there is the concept of a device being not ready but there is no not ready status. Nor is any defined in this standard, So I don't know what it is or means. This needs to be fixed. Also whatever it is should not be capitalized.
IBM Penokie	208	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, 7th paragraph after table 7	The statement << When the broadcast unit attention (BUA) field is set to one, >> should be << A broadcast unit attention (BUA) bit set to one indicates >>
IBM Penokie	209	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command	The BUA and NRSC bits interact with one another and as such should both be defined in a single table that describes there interactions.
IBM Penokie	210	E	C	6a	36	5.2 NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command, Last paragraph	The term << Moreover >> should be deleted as it contains no useful information.
Quantum	84	E	C	6a	36	1st and 2nd paragraph on the page	Replace "sense data" and "additional sense code" with "addition sense data" (2 places each)
Quantum	85	E	C	6a	36	3rd paragraph on the page, 2nd sentence	Replace "ASC and ASCQ" with "ASC or ASCQ"
Quantum	86	E	C	6a	36	2nd to last paragraph	Replace "initiator" with "initiator port"
Seagate	25	T	R		36	5.x	A mechanism is needed for automation to update its microcode from a microcode tape. Define a new ADC device server buffer which can be accessed when a microcode medium is loaded. Reading the buffer provides the contents of the tape. Writing the buffer changes the contents of the tape, unless write-protected. Define ASC/Q to be reported if the medium loaded is not a microcode medium. (This could be put in the commands clause by adding subclauses for READ/WRITE BUFFER, and having each refer to the command definitions in SPC-2, and also define the new buffer. Alternatively, could this go as a new subclause in 6, Parameters for ADI devices?)
ADIC	47	T	R		37	6.1.2	Define way to retrieve drive status display character(s). Provide log page or parameter to retrieve LED or equivalent display code (to mimic drive panel and get error info). Need proposal
ENDL	59	E	C	6a	37	6.1.1, Table 8	The foot matter for the table should include a key defining M and O. Alternatively, mandatory and optional may be spelled out.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	146	E	C	6b	37	6.1.2 DTD Status log page	Fix hanging paragraph. Since there is a 6.1.21, there cannot be text at the 6.1.2 level. Perhaps move the text into a new 6.1.2.1 DTD Status log page overview section.
HP	147	E	C	6b	37	6.1.1 Log parameters overview	Change target to target device
HP	149	E	C	6b	37	Table 8 - Log page codes	Change Page Code to Log page code
HP	148	T	C	6c	37	6.1.1 Log parameters overview	Table 8 - Log page codes Probably need to add: 06h, 07h, 0Bh, 0Dh, 0Eh, 0Fh, 10h, 2Fh which are available to every other device type
IBM Penokie	211	E	C	6b	37	6.1.1 Log parameters overview, Last paragraph	The statement << servers in the same target shall be independent. >> should be << servers in the same target device shall be independent. >>
IBM Penokie	212	E	C	6b	37	6.1.1 Log parameters overview, Last paragraph	The statement << independent. That is, changes to log parameters caused by either LOG SELECT commands or other device operation of an RMC device server shall not be reflected by changes in the corresponding parameters reported by the ADC device server. Changes in log parameters caused by either LOG SELECT commands or other device operation of an ADC device server shall not be reflected by changes in the corresponding parameters reported by the RMC device server. >> should be << independent (i.e., changes to log parameters caused by either LOG SELECT commands or other device operation of an RMC device server shall not be reflected by changes in the corresponding parameters reported by the ADC device server. Changes in log parameters caused by either LOG SELECT commands or other device operation of an ADC device server shall not be reflected by changes in the corresponding parameters reported by the RMC device server). >>
IBM Penokie	213	E	P	6b	37	6.1.2 DTD Status log page, 1st paragraph	The statement << The DTD Status log page (see table 9) defines the most critical data that is needed most frequently during normal operation. >> should be << The DTD Status log page (see table 9) defines the data that used during normal operation. >>
IBM Penokie	214	E	C	6b	37	6.1.2 DTD Status log page	The text and tables between 6.1.2 and 6.1.2.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	215	E	C	6b	37	6.1.2 DTD Status log page, 2nd paragraph	The statement << Refer to SPC-2 for a description >> should be << See SPC-2 for a description >>
Quantum	88	E	C	6b	37	6.1.2, 1st paragraph	Replace "The DTD Status log page (see table 9) defines the most critical data that is needed most frequently during normal operation" with "The DTD Status log page (see table 9) contains log information pertaining the removable medium device and ports in the DTD"
Quantum	87	T	C	6b	37	Table 8	Page code 13h is listed as mandatory in this table and optional in clause 6.1.4.
STK	19	E	P	6b	37	clause 6.1.1	Replace first sentence with "This clause defines the log pages and parameters for ADC devices."
ADIC	48	E	P	6b	38	note 1	"drive" s/b "DTD"
ADIC	49	E	C	6b	38	below table 12	"drive" (2x) s/b "DTD"

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
ENDL	60	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2, Table 10	Change the double line between the last two rows to a single line. Add a cross reference to 6.1.2.3 in the last row.
ENDL	61	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1, 6.1.2.2, 6.1.2.3, 6.1.3, & 6.1.5, tables 11, 14, 15, 18, & 23	The absence of a space between the field/bit names (i.e., DU, DS, TSD ...) and the parenthetical field contents is causing me to think that the values are part of the names. Please insert spaces. Note that table 19 in 6.1.4 already has spaces and the information fits satisfactorily in the available space. [5 tables need changing]
ENDL	62	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1, 6.1.2.2, 6.1.2.3, 6.1.3, & 6.1.5, table 11	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the VHF DATA field.
ENDL	63	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1, between 2nd & 3rd p after table 11	[insert] See SPC-3 for descriptions of the DU bit, DS bit, TSD bit, ETC bit, TMC field, LBIN bit, and LP bit. These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown in table 11.
ENDL	64	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1, 1st p after table 12, s 1 & s 2	In 4.2.6, 'e - h' would be written '(e) - (h)'. Please use consistent notation in both subclauses. [2 instances in this paragraph]
ENDL	65	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1, 1st p after table 12, s 1	SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command [s/b] LOAD UNLOAD command (see SSC-2)
HP	150	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter	Delete (MSB) and (LSB) from the VHF DATA field. It has subfields.
HP	151	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter	Table 12 - VHF Data Change byte numbers 8,9,10,11 to 0,1,2,3
HP	152	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter	Change “Refer to table 12 for a description of the VHF DATA.” To “The VHF DATA field contents are defined in table 12.”
HP	153	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter	Table 11 - Very High Frequency Data log parameter - Add spaces before each bit assignment in: DU(0) DS(1) TSD(0) ETC(0) TMC(0) LBIN(1) LP(1) A few tables in the document have spaces, others don’t.
HP	155	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2 DTD Status log page	Table 10 - DTD Status parameter codes - Add reference to where DTD primary port status parameter defined, 6.1.2.3
HP	156	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 VHFD log parameter	Need to decide whether to use mixed-case small caps or not. If so, abbreviation acronyms like HIU in this table or DU in the previous table should always use all caps or all small caps consistently. (I recommend just using small caps and not mixed-case small caps)
HP	157	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 VHFD log parameter	load should be smallcaps
HP	154	Q	C	6b	38	6.1.2 DTD Status log page	Table 10 - DTD Status parameter codes - What about the unlisted parameter codes? Reserved?
HP	158	Q	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 VHFD log parameter	log parameter of the RMC or ADC either of them?
IBM Nishida	3	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter	... unload states e - h (see table 1) due to the ... -> ... unload states e - h (see table 3) due to the ...
IBM Nishida	4	E	P	6b	38	Table 12	Why does this table start with Byte 8? If it wants to map to table 11. It must be 4 through 7.
IBM Penokie	216	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, Table 11	The field << VHF DATA>> should be << VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	217	E	P	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 4th paragraph	The statement << Refer to table 12 for a description of the VHF DATA. >> should be << See table 12 for a description of the VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR. >>
IBM Penokie	218	E	C	6b	38	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 1st paragraph after table 12	The statement << The HIU bit shall be to zero when the >> should be << The HIU bit shall be set to zero when the >>
Quantum	89	E	C	6b	38	section 6.1.2.1	In this section the descriptions are in MSB to LSB order. All other sections list them LSB to MSB. Change the order of the bit description to be consistent.
Quantum	90	E	C	6b	38	Following Table 11	Add "Refer to SPC-2 for the definitions of the DU, DS, TSD, ETC, TMC, LBIN, and LP fields".
Quantum	91	E	C	6b	38	Note 1	We don't understand this note, please clarify
Quantum	92	E	P	6b	38	Table 12	Byte numbers are supposed to be 4 - 7
Quantum	93	E	C	6b	38	last paragraph, 2nd sentence	Change "...be to..." to "...be set to..."
Quantum	94	E	C	6b	38	last paragraph, 3rd sentence	Change "upon" to "following" or "after"
ADIC	52	E	C	6b	39	para 5	"must" s/b "shall"
ADIC	53	E	C	6b	39	para 8	"library" s/b "automation"
ADIC	54	E	C	6b	39	note 4	"drive" s/b "DTD"
ADIC	55	E	C	6b	39	note 5	"drive" s/b "DTD"
ADIC	56	E	C	6b	39	para 1	"can"; "cannot" s/b "is able to"; "is not able to"
ADIC	57	E	C	6b	39	para 5	"can" s/b "is able to"
ADIC	58	E	C	6b	39	para 8	"media can be" s/b "media is able to be"
ADIC	50	T	R		39	para after note 3	When Cmpr is enabled, how to find compressoin ratio? needs proposal to find compression ratio
ADIC	51	T	R		39	para 5	Can we define the difference between requested and required?
ENDL	66	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1, note 4	issued by commands to the drive [s/b] caused by commands sent to the drive
ENDL	67	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1, 4th p after note 4, s 2	as the DTD is attempting [s/b] because the DTD is attempting
HP	159	T	R		39	Note 4	How should the WRTP bit be set when handling WORM cartridges.
HP	160	T	C	6a	39	6.1.2.1	If the RAA value doesn't reflect prevent media removal how do you stop unloading prevented drives?
IBM Penokie	219	E	C	6a	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, note 2	The statement << described in clause 4.2.10 >> should be << described in 4.2.10 >>.
IBM Penokie	220	E	C	6b	39	Global	All bit definitions paragraphs in this section The statement << A value of one in the whatever (XXXX) field indicates >> should be << A whatever (XXXX) bit set to one indicates >>.
IBM Penokie	221	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after table 12	The statement << Media Auxiliary Memory (MAM) can be accessed. >> should be << Media Auxiliary Memory (MAM) is accessible. >>
IBM Penokie	222	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after table 12	The statement <<A value of zero indicates that the MAM cannot be accessed. >> should be << A MACC bit set to zero indicates the MAM is not accessible. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	223	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after table 12	The statement << When set to one, the DTD shall >> should be << If the MACC bit is set to one, the DTD shall >>.
IBM Penokie	224	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after table 12	The statement << If supported, this field should only be set to one in conjunction >> should be << If the MACC bit is supported it should only be set to one in conjunction >>.
IBM Penokie	225	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after table 12	The statement << be set to one in conjunction with Media Present. >> should be << be set to one in if the MPRSNT bit is set to one. >>
IBM Penokie	226	E	C	6b	39	Global	All bit definitions paragraphs in this section Every << a value of zero >> statement should be << A XXXX bit set to zero >>.
IBM Penokie	227	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, NOTE 3	This note looks like normative text and as such should be in-line text not a note.
IBM Penokie	228	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 1st paragraph before note 4	The statement << This field is only valid if media present is one, and should be set to zero when no media is present in the DTD. >> should be << The WRTP bit is only valid if the MPRSNT bit is set to one,. The WRPT bit should be set to zero if the MPRSNT bit is set to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	229	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, Note 4	The statement << 'Physically write protected' refers to any mechanism >> should be << Physically write protected refers to any mechanism >>
IBM Penokie	230	E	C	6a	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, Note 4	The statement << protect the media, such as sliding windows or tabs, and not logical >> should be << protect the media (e.g., sliding windows or tabs0 and not logical >>.
IBM Penokie	231	E	P	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after note 4	The statement << cleaning operation must be done before a data cartridge can reach the data accessible state, >> should be << cleaning operation shall be completed before a data cartridge reaches the data accessible state, >>
IBM Penokie	232	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after note 4	The statement << This field shall take priority over clean requested. It shall not be considered an error for both fields to be set to one. >> should be << The CRQRD bit shall take priority over CRQST bit. It shall not be considered an error for both the CRQRD bit and the CRQST bit to be set to one. >>
IBM Penokie	233	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 3rd paragraph after note 4	The statement << This field should be monitored for a value of one before relying on any other fields in the VERY HIGH FREQUENCY DATA log parameter. >> should be << The DINIT bit should be set to one before relying on any other bits in the Very High Frequency Data log parameter. >>
IBM Penokie	234	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 4th paragraph after note 4	The statement << governs the remaining fields within byte 9 to >> should be << governs the remaining bits within byte 9 to >>
IBM Penokie	235	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 4th paragraph after note 4	The statement << is in transition, as the DTD is attempting to go to another state. >> should be << is in transition, as the DTD is transitioning to another state. >>
IBM Penokie	236	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 4th paragraph after note 4	The statement << the in transition field shall be set to 0. >> should be << the INXTN bit shall be set to 0. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	237	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 5th paragraph after note 4	The statement << by the robotics if it is reasonably certain that media can be successfully inserted into or >> should be << by the robotics if media may be successfully inserted into or >>.
IBM Penokie	238	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 1st paragraph after note 5	The statement <<This would typically be a direct reflection of some type of hardware sensor. >> should be deleted as it contains no useful standard information.
IBM Penokie	239	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after note 5	The statement << mechanism. This means that the physical loading process has completed. >> should be << mechanism (i.e., the physical loading process has completed). >>
IBM Penokie	240	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after note 5	The statement << loading process (exclusive of tape threading). >> should be << loading process, exclusive of tape threading. >>
Quantum	96	E	C	6b	39	note 5 and the paragraph immediately preceding it	Change "library" to "automation" (3 places)
Quantum	95	T	C	6b	39	paragraph after note 2, last sentence	Change "DTD" to "ADC device server"
Seagate	26	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1, 1st Para on page	Per SPC-3, MAM is "Medium..." not "Media..."; Change all occurrences of "media auxiliary memory" to "medium auxiliary memory" Also change separate occurences of "media" to "medium" as appropriate.
Seagate	27	E	P	6b	39	6.1.2.1, 5th Para on page	1st sentence of CRqrd description is not clear.; Change to "A value of one in the clean required (CRQRD) field indicates that a head cleaning operation must be done before a data cartridge can reach the data accessible state, and that normal operation may not be possible if the cleaning is not performed."
Seagate	28	E	P	6b	39	6.1.2.1, 7th Para on page	1st sentence of InXtn description is unclear; Change "whether activity relative to state transitions is taking place." To "whether a state transition may take place."
Seagate	29	E	C	6b	39	6.1.2.1, last two Paras. on page	Media vs. medium. Change all occurrences of "media" to "medium", including field name. Say "a medium" where appropriate.
ADIC	61	E	C	6b	40	note 6	"drive" (2x) s/b "DTD"
ADIC	62	E	C	6b	40	para 2	"reset" s/b "set"
ADIC	63	E	C	6b	40	para below note 7	"reset" s/b "set"
ADIC	64	E	C	6b	40	last para	"resets" s/b "sets
ADIC	59	T	R		40	RRqst field	How does a power cycle affect this? clears due to hard reset, power cycle, etc.
ADIC	60	T	C	6a	40	table 13	What constitutes tape in motion? Tape is in motion for 05h-08h, so what is 04h?
ENDL	68	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1, note 6	This may or may not [s/b] The value of the MThrd bit may or may not
ENDL	69	T	C	6a	40	6.1.2.1, 1st p after note 7	[Technical] Does the retrieval of the DTD Primary Port Status log parameters set the IntfC bit to zero regardless of the initiator port retrieving the parameters? The behavior of the IntfC bit in the presence of multiple initiator ports needs to be clarified.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
ENDL	70	T	C	6a	40	6.1.2.1, 2st p after note 7	(Technical) The behavior of the TAFC bit in retrievals are made from multiple initiator ports needs to be clarified.
HP	164	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 VHFD log parameter, Note 6	Replace ““Ready”” with “a status of GOOD” (several times)
HP	165	E	C	6b	40	Table 13 - Tape Motion Status	Replace Status with Tape Motion Status
HP	106	Q	C	6a	40	Last paragraph	"at least one TapeAlert state flag has changed from its previous value since the last retrieval of the TapeAlert flags". Is this referring to retrieval of the ADI interface TA flag set (i.e. independent of host interface retrievals)? Can multiple automation controllers log into the drive? If so, is there a set of pages for each automation controller.
HP	162	T	A		40	paragraph 2	The text describing the DACC bit implies it'll be set regardless of the outcome of the Load operation. After successfully loading a cleaning cartridge I wouldn't expect the DACC bit to be set yet the spec. implies it would.
HP	163	T	C	6b	40	Tabel13	Should this table reflect only physical tape motion? Tape devices can read/write large amounts of data without any tape motion so does the library want to know the tape is moving or that the drive is read/writing?
IBM Penokie	241	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, Note 6	The statement << This may or may not correspond to the drive responding 'Ready' to a TEST UNIT READY command, as additional processing may be required by the drive after threading to achieve a SCSI 'Ready' state. >> should be << This may or may not correspond to the drive responding to a TEST UNIT READY command with a status of GOOD, as additional processing may be required by the drive after threading to before the logical unit becomes ready. >>
IBM Penokie	242	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 1st paragraph after note 6	The statement << It typically corresponds to the RMC device server being able to respond 'Ready' to a TEST UNIT READY command (when cleaning or microcode image media are loaded the RMC device server may respond 'Not Ready' to a TEST UNIT READY command). >> should be << The DACC bit set to one may correspond to the RMC device server being able to respond to a TEST UNIT READY command with a status for GOOD however when cleaning or microcode image media are loaded the RMC device server may respond to a TEST UNIT READY command with a CHECK CONDITON with the sense key set to NOT READY. >>
IBM Penokie	243	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 1st paragraph after note 6	The statement << It is reset to zero at the beginning of the >> should be << The DACC bit is set to zero at the beginning of the >>.
IBM Penokie	244	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, Table 13	The term << vendor unique >> should be << vendor specific >>.
IBM Penokie	245	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 1st paragraph after table 13	The statement << This field shall remain set to one as long as a recovery procedure is available. When this field is set to one, the in transition (InXtn) field shall be set to zero. >> should be << The RRQST bit shall remain set to one as long as a recovery procedure is available. When the RPQST bit is set to one, the in INXTN bit shall be set to zero. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	246	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 1st paragraph after note 7	The statement << This field is reset to zero after retrieval of any >> should be << The INTFC bit is set to zero after retrieval of any >>
IBM Penokie	247	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after note 7	The statement << resets this field to zero after retrieval of the TapeAlert >> should be << sets the TAFC bit to zero after retrieval of the TapeAlert >>
IBM Penokie	248	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, 2nd paragraph after note 7	The statement << It is possible to not find any difference in the >> should be << There may not be any difference in the >>
Quantum	97	E	C	6b	40	paragraph after note 6	Change "…respond "Ready" to a…" with "respond with GOOD status to a…"
Quantum	98	E	C	6b	40	paragraph after note 6, second sentence	The parenthetical phrase can't be left in parentheses. I'm not sure it is even required since the normative part of the sentence uses the term "typically"
Quantum	100	E	C	6b	40	Paragraph after note 7, 1st sentence	Change "interface status" to "one or more fields in the DTD Primary Port Status log parameters"
Quantum	101	E	C	6b	40	Paragraph after note 7	Change "…status has not changed. This field is reset to zero after retrieval…" to "…status has not changed since the last retrieval…"
Quantum	102	E	C	6b	40	2nd paragraph after not 7, 2nd sentence	Change "resets" to "sets"
Quantum	99	T	C	6a	40	Table 13	Add value for "Erasing"
Seagate	30	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1, 1st Para. on page	Media vs. medium. Change all occurrences of "media" to "medium", including field name. Say "a medium" where appropriate.
Seagate	31	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1, 2nd Para. on page	Media vs. medium. Change "when cleaning or microcode image media are" to "when a cleaning or microcode image medium is"
Seagate	32	E	C	6b	40	6.1.2.1, 1st Para. after Table 13	Cross reference needed. At end of 1st sentence, insert cross reference to 6.1.4.
Seagate	33	E	P	6b	40	6.1.2.1, Note 7	Reword note. Change "The recommended or requested recovery procedure in the log page may indicate that a recovery procedure is not requested or not defined." to "The log page may indicate that a recovery procedure is not defined."
Seagate	34	E	P	6b	40	6.1.2.1 last Para. on page	Split infinitive. Change "to not find any difference" to "to find no difference"
ADIC	65	E	C	6b	41	below table 15	"which uniquely" s/b "that uniquely"
ENDL	71	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.2, between 2nd & 3rd p after table 14	[insert] See SPC-3 for descriptions of the DU bit, DS bit, TSD bit, ETC bit, TMC field, LBIN bit, and LP bit. These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown in table 14.
ENDL	72	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3, table 15	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the DTD PRIMARY PORT STATUS DATA field.
ENDL	73	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3, between bottom of page	[insert] See SPC-3 for descriptions of the DU bit, DS bit, TSD bit, ETC bit, TMC field, LBIN bit, and LP bit. These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown in table 15.
ENDL	74	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3	Every field in a table should have a paragraph describing the contents of that field. The PARAMETER LENGTH and DTD PRIMARY PORT STATUS DATA fields do not have such paragraphs. Add them.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	167	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3 DTD Primary Port Status log parameter(s)	Table 15 - DTD Primary Port Status log parameter Delete the (MSB) and (LSB) labels from the DTD Primary Port Status Data field, since it has subfields.
HP	168	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3 DTD Primary Port Status log parameter(s)	Fix hanging paragraph.
HP	166	T	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3 DTD Primary Port Status log parameter(s)	Add a one-sentence paragraph introducing the DTD Primary Port Status Data field
IBM Penokie	249	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, NOTE 8	Note 8 looks like normative text and as such should be main line text.
IBM Penokie	250	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.1 Very High Frequency Data log parameter, Note 8	The statement << This field should be processed following the DINIT field. Pending TapeAlert state flags may affect the reliability of the values returned in other fields. >> should be << The TAFC bit should be processed following the DINIT bit. Pending TapeAlert state flags may affect the reliability of the values returned in other bits within the VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR. >>
IBM Penokie	251	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3 DTD Primary Port Status log parameter(s)	The text and tables between 6.1.2.3 and 6.1.2.3.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	252	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3 DTD Primary Port Status log parameter(s), 2nd paragraph	The statement << as assigned by the DTD, which uniquely identifies >> should be << as assigned by the DTD, that uniquely identifies >>
IBM Penokie	253	E	C	6b	41	6.1.2.3 DTD Primary Port Status log parameter(s), 2nd paragraph	The statement << defined in clause 6.2.2.2.1. >> should be << defined in 6.2.2.2.1. >>
Quantum	103	T	C	6b	41	1st paragraph after table 15, 1st sentence	Replace this sentence with "The PARAMETER CODE field contains a value from 101h to 01FFh which uniquely identifies the primary port relative to other primary ports in the device, as assigned by the DTD independent of the port type"
Seagate	35	T	C	6b	41	6.1.2.2	Should the device server enforce the polling delay, and if so how? "Either change "shall" to "should" in last paragraph or mandate Check Condition / Illegal Request / new ASC if LOG SENSE for the page is issued too soon. Or is this too ugly?
ADIC	66	E	C	6b	42	para 4	"can be" s/b "are"
ADIC	67	E	C	6b	42	last para	"can be" s/b "are"
ENDL	75	E	C	6c	42	6.1.2.3.1, 1st & 3rd p after table 16	The mention of LIP and AL_PA should be backed up by a reference to the appropriate T11 standard (FC-AL-2 I think). [one instance each for LIP and AL_PA]
IBM Penokie	254	E	C	6b	42	Global	All bit definitions paragraphs in this section The statement << A value of one in the whatever (XXXX) field indicates >> should be << A whatever (XXXX) bit set to one indicates >>.
IBM Penokie	255	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.1 Fibre Channel Status Data, 2nd paragraph	The statement << not complete. An example of a link negotiation process is the loop initialization process (LIP). >> should be << not complete (e.g.,. a loop initialization process (LIP)). >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	256	E	C	6b	42	Global	All bit definitions paragraphs in this section Every << a value of zero >> statement should be << A XXXX bit set to zero >>.
IBM Penokie	257	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.1 Fibre Channel Status Data	Using the references to LIP and AL_PA etc. in this section require a normative reference to FC-AL-2 be added to the references section.
IBM Penokie	258	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.1 Fibre Channel Status Data, 3rd paragraph	The statement << not detected. An example of signal detection is detection of light for an optical medium. >> should be << not detected (e.g., detection of light for an optical medium). >>.
IBM Penokie	259	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.1 Fibre Channel Status Data, 5th paragraph	The statement << The valid values can be found in table 34 in clause 6.2.2.2.2. This field is undefined when the LNPC field is set to zero. >> should be << The valid values for the CURRENT SPEED field are shown in table 34. If the LNPC bit is set to zero the CURRENT SPEED field shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	260	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.1 Fibre Channel Status Data, 6th paragraph	The statement << This field is undefined when the LNPC field is set to zero. >> should be << If the LNPC bit is set to zero the CURRTOP bit shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	261	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.1 Fibre Channel Status Data, Last paragraph	The statement << 24-bit N_Port_ID (as defined by FC-FS) that is assigned currently to >> should be << 24-bit N_Port_ID (see FC-FS) that is assigned to >>
IBM Penokie	262	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.1 Fibre Channel Status Data, Last paragraph	The statement << This field is undefined when the LNPC field is set to zero. >> should be << If the LNPC bit is set to zero the CURRENT N_PORT_ID field shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	263	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.2 Parallel SCSI Status Data	The title of the << Parallel SCSI Status Data >> section should be << SCSI Parallel Interface Status Data>>.
IBM Penokie	264	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.2 Parallel SCSI Status Data, 1st paragraph	The statement << Port Status data for a Parallel SCSI port is shown in >> should be << Port Status data for a SCSI port that support parallel transfers (see SPI-5) is shown in >>
IBM Penokie	265	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.2 Parallel SCSI Status Data, Table 17	The title of table 17 << Parallel SCSI Status data >> should be << SCSI Parallel Interface Status data>>
IBM Penokie	266	E	C	6b	42	6.1.2.3.2 Parallel SCSI Status Data, 2nd paragraph	The statement << port is operating currently. The valid values can be found in the SCSI Parallel Interface - 4 (SPI-4) standard. >> should be << port is operating currently (see SPI-5).
Quantum	104	T	P	6c	42	4th sentence after Table 16	Add a current speed value of "Unknown" and remove the requirement that LNPC be true for the CURRENT SPEED field to be valid.
Seagate	36	T	C	6a	42	6.1.2.3.1 Table 16	Eight speeds for FC may not be enough. Shift Current Speed field to bits 5:3, leaving 6 Reserved. This will give one bit for expansion.
ADIC	68	E	R		43	6.1.4	"which contains" s/b "that contains"
ADIC	69	E	C	6b	43	6.1.3 para 1	"reset" s/b "set"
ADIC	70	E	C	6b	43	first para	"can be" s/b "are"
ADIC	71	E	C	6b	43	last para	"can obtain" s/b "may obtain"
ENDL	76	E	C	6a	43	6.1.3, p 1, s 3	See table 5 in clause 4.2.6 [s/b] See table 5 in 4.2.6 [the word 'clause' is allowed/required only when the clause number does not contain a period.]

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
ENDL	77	E	C	6b	43	6.1.3, immediately after table 18	[insert] See SPC-3 for a description of the PAGE CODE field.
ENDL	78	E	C	6b	43	6.1.3, between 2nd & 3rd p after table 18	[insert] See SPC-3 for descriptions of the DU bit, DS bit, TSD bit, ETC bit, TMC field, LBIN bit, and LP bit. These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown in table 18.
ENDL	79	E	R		43	6.1.4, p 1, s 1	which [s/b] that
ENDL	80	E	C	6b	43	6.1.4, p 1, s 2	may set the RRQST bit [s/b] may set the RRQST bit to one
ENDL	81	E	P	6b	43	6.1.4, p 1, s 3	can [s/b] may
HP	121	Q	R		43	6.1.3 TapeAlert response log page	Is there provision for the expansion of the TA flags page? I think 64 may be insufficient.
HP	169	T	R		43	(Global)	How about some SAS data structures? What is the schedule for ADC-2?
IBM Penokie	267	E	C	6b	43	6.1.2.3.2 Parallel SCSI Status Data, 3rd paragraph	The statement << was negotiated most recently. The valid values can be found in the SCSI Parallel Interface - 4 (SPI-4) standard. >> should be << was negotiated most recently (see SPI-5). >>
Quantum	105	E	C	6b	43	6.1.3, 1st paragraph	Remove the phrase "(see SSC-2 for a description of TapeAlert and a definition of the flags)". If we need the cross reference, it should be in section 4.2.6.
Quantum	106	E	P	6b	43	6.1.4, 1st paragraph, last sentence	Replace "The automation device can obtain…" with "The application client should obtain…"
ADIC	72	T	C	6a	44	Table 20	Recovery actions 09h-0Ch persist across power cycle or not? Need to clarify persistance of recovery procedures (state that reconditioned upon initialization?)
ADIC	73	T	C	6a	44	table 20	Can recovery 03h be used as substitute for 02h if the automation cannot push?
ENDL	82	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4, 1st p on pg, s 1	(byte 8) [s/b] (i.e., in byte 8)
ENDL	83	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4, 1st p on pg, s 2	procedure for execution [s/b] recovery procedure [there shall be no executions in SCSI, nobody dies here]
ENDL	84	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4, 2nd p on pg, s 1	field [s/b] bit
ENDL	85	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4, 2nd p on pg, s 1	'Recovery not requested' procedure [s/b] code 00h (i.e., Recovery not requested)
ENDL	86	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4, immediately after table 19	[insert] See SPC-3 for a description of the PAGE CODE field and PAGE LENGTH field.
ENDL	87	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4, between 2nd & 3rd p after table 19	[insert] See SPC-3 for descriptions of the DU bit, DS bit, TSD bit, ETC bit, TMC field, LBIN bit, and LP bit. These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown in table 19. The PARAMETER LENGTH field indicates the number of recovery procedure bytes that follow.
ENDL	88	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4, table 20	The table title should include '(part 1 of 2)'. The line at the bottom of the first page should be a double line. The title on the second page should include '(part 2 of 2)'. The top line at the top of the second page should be a double line. The column headings should be repeated at the top of the second page.
HP	170	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page	Keep Table 20 on one page

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	171	E	C	6b	44	Table 20 - Recovery procedures	Change Recovery Action to Recovery Procedure
HP	127	I	R		44	Recovery procedure	Good idea. I think the descriptions need to be more specific/detailed to avoid ambiguity, e.g. "Push medium"??, "Issue LOAD command" - is this referring to an ADI load, or a message to be displayed on the OCP, or a message to be passed on to the ISV application/driver?
IBM Butt	1	T	A		44	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page	Add a method to indicate that a retrieval of a drive error log (dump) is requested prior to performing the requested recoveries.
IBM Penokie	268	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, Table 19	The term << Most preferred recovery procedure >> should be << RECOVERY PROCEDURE (first) >>. The order preference would be in the text per comment below.
IBM Penokie	269	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, Table 19	The term << Least preferred recovery procedure >> should be << RECOVERY PROCEDURE (last) >>. The order preference would be in the text per comment below.
IBM Penokie	270	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 2nd paragraph after table 19	The statement << The values reported in the recovery procedure fields are defined in table 20. >> should be << The RECOVERY PROCEDURE fields specify a list of recovery procedures (see table 20) listed in order from the most preferred to the least preferred action. >>
IBM Penokie	271	E	C	6b	44	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, Table 20 (global)	No table should cross a page boundary unless it will not fit on one page. If it will not fit on one page then it needs the << (x of x) >> notation.
IBM Roberts	4	T	P	6b	44	6.1.4 Requested Recovery Log Page	Need more description of Recovery Action 01h. Does this mean no recovery is needed? Or no recovery is possible? Also suggest that Recovery Actions 01h, 05h, 08h, and 09h may be good candidates for collecting a drive dump to assist support personnel in determining the root cause of the problem.
ADIC	74	E	C	6b	45	6.1.5	"can not be reset" s/b "are not able to be set to zero"
ADIC	75	E	C	6b	45	para 2	"will cause"; "will not" s/b "would cause"; "shall not"
ENDL	89	E	C	6b	45	6.1.5, p 1, s 3	Support of [s/b] Support for
HP	172	T	C	6b	45	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page	Replace with a LU independent method of reporting these parameters. Consider using the Target Logs W-LUN instead.
IBM Penokie	272	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, Table 20	The term << vendor unique >> should be << vendor specific >>.
IBM Penokie	273	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 1st paragraph after table 20	The statement << If the Requested Recovery log page is requested when the RRQST field in the Very High Frequency Data log parameter is zero, then a recovery action of 00h (Recovery not requested) shall be reported. >> should be << If the Requested Recovery log page is requested and the RRQST bit (see x.x.x.) is set to zero, then a recovery procedure of 00h (i.e., Recovery not requested) shall be reported. >>
IBM Penokie	274	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 2nd paragraph after table 20	The statement << If the requested recovery procedure will cause the data transfer >> should be << If the requested recovery procedure causes the data transfer >>.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	275	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 2nd paragraph after table 20	The statement << shall ensure that there will not be a conflict with the motion >> should be << shall ensure there is not conflict between the automation device and the motion >>.
IBM Penokie	276	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 3rd paragraph after table 20	The statement << is 09h (Contact service organization), >> should be << is 09h (i.e., Contact service organization), >>
IBM Penokie	277	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 4th paragraph after table 20	The statement << is 0Ah (Issue UNLOAD command, remove, and quarantine medium), >> should be << is 0Ah (i.e., Issue UNLOAD command, remove, and quarantine medium), >>
IBM Penokie	278	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 5th paragraph after table 20	The statement << is 0Bh (Do not insert medium), a non-recoverable >> should be << is 0Bh (i.e., Do not insert medium), a non-recoverable >> .
IBM Penokie	279	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 5th paragraph after table 20	The statement <<When this recovery procedure is requested, then the robotic access allowed (RAA) field in the Very High Frequency Data shall be set to zero, and no other recovery procedures shall be reported. >> should be << If the 0Bh recovery procedure is requested, then the robotic access allowed (RAA) bit (see x.x.x) shall be set to zero, and no other recovery procedures shall be reported. >>
IBM Penokie	280	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 6th paragraph under table 20	The statement << is 0Ch (Issue UNLOAD command, remove medium, and contact service organization), a non-recoverable >> should be << is 0Ch (i.e., issue UNLOAD command, remove medium, and contact service organization), a non-recoverable >>
IBM Penokie	281	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 Requested Recovery log page, 6th paragraph under table 20	The statement <<When this recovery procedure is requested and the medium is accordingly removed, then the robotic access allowed (RAA) field in the Very High Frequency Data shall be set to zero, and no other recovery procedures shall be reported. >> should be << If the 0Ch recovery procedure is requested and the medium is removed, then the robotic access allowed (RAA) bit (see x.x.x) shall be set to zero, and no other recovery procedures shall be reported. >>.
IBM Penokie	282	E	C	6b	45	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page, 1st paragraph	(Technical) The statement << Parameters can not be reset or changed via LOG SELECT. >> should be << Parameters shall not be reset or changed via LOG SELECT. >>.
IBM Penokie	283	E	C	6b	45	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page, Table 21	The statement << First device statistics parameter >> should be << DEVICE STATISTICS PARAMETER (first) >>
IBM Penokie	284	E	C	6b	45	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page, Table 21	The statement << Last device statistics parameter >> should be << DEVICE STATISTICS PARAMETER (last) >>
Quantum	107	E	C	6b	45	Table 20	This table needs a header on each page
Seagate	37	E	C	6b	45	6.1.4 last Para. in clause	Tense unclear; Change "medium is accordingly removed," to "medium has been accordingly removed,"
ADIC	76	E	C	6b	46	note 9	"can be" s/b "may be"
ENDL	90	E	C	6b	46	6.1.5, 1st p on pg, s 1	Page Code and Page Length fields [s/b] PAGE CODE field and PAGE LENGTH field [with field names in small caps]

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
ENDL	91	E	C	6b	46	6.1.5, end of subclause	[move table 22 and the paragraph that introduces it to after table 23.] [after that insert] See SPC-3 for descriptions of the DU bit, DS bit, TSD bit, ETC bit, TMC field, LBIN bit, and LP bit. These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown in table 23. The PARAMETER LENGTH field indicates the number of bytes in the DEVICE STATISTICS DATA COUNTER field that follows.
ENDL	92	E	P	6c	46	6.2.1, p 2, s 1	are in SPC-2 [s/b] are described in SPC-3 [The mode parameter list itself is in the device, or on the wire; SPC-3 contains only a description.]
HP	173	E	C	6c	46	6.2.1	There is a small paragraph that reads: "The mode paramater list, including…, are in SPC-22; It's should read "….are [defined] in SPC-2" or maybe expand the paragraph a bit more
HP	175	E	C	6b	46	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page Table 23 - Device Statistics log parameter	Delete the (MSB) and (LSB) labels from the Device Statistics Data Counter field. It must have subfields if it is variable length.
HP	176	E	C	6c	46	6.2.1 Mode parameters overview	Change “is contained in the mode parameter header. This field is reserved” to “in the mode parameter header is reserved” Similar text occurs 3 times in this section
HP	174	T	C	6b	46	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page	Add a description of the Device Statistics Data Counter field.
IBM Penokie	285	E	C	6b	46	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page, 1st paragraph after table 21	The statement << Refer to SPC-2 for a >> should be << See SPC-3 for a >>
IBM Penokie	286	E	C	6b	46	6.1.5 Device Statistics log page, Table 22	The column title << Parameter Code >> should be << Code >>.
IBM Penokie	287	E	P	6c	46	6.2.1 Mode parameters overview, 2nd paragraph	The statement << The mode parameter list, including the mode parameter header and mode block descriptor, are in SPC-2. >> should be << See SPC-3 for the mode parameter list, including the mode parameter header and mode block descriptor.>>.
IBM Penokie	288	E	C	6c	46	6.2.1 Mode parameters overview, Note 9	This does not look like a note and instead should be main line text and changed from << The ADC device server may require that the DTD primary port(s) be disabled before certain mode parameters can be changed. >> to << The ADC device server may require that the DTD primary port(s) be disabled before certain mode parameters are allowed to be changed (see x.x.x.). >>. There needs to be a reference to the mode parameters or a list of mode parameters being talked about here.
IBM Roberts	5	T	R		46	6.1.5 Device Statistics Log Page - Table 22	Should consider adding more statistics. Things like the following: , Write Permanent Errors , Write Temporary Errors , Read Permanent Errors , Read Temporary Errors , Load Permanent Errors , Load Temporary Errors , Unload Permanent Errors , Unload Temporary Errors , Host Interface Permanent Errors (uncorrectable parity errors) , Host Interface Recovered Errors (corrected parity errors) , Also consider adding similar statistics related to the currently mounted cartridge. , This info could all be in vendor unique, but why not standardize the commonly requested items.
Quantum	108	T	R		46	6.2.1, 5th paragraph	What about the other fields in the Block Descriptor? Maybe we should just state that a Block Descriptor is not supported by an ADC device.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Seagate	38	E	P	6c	46	6.2.1 2nd Para.	Missing verb; Change "are in SPC-2" to "are described in SPC-2"
Seagate	39	T	R		46	6.2.1 Note 9	Rejecting mode parameter change because port is enabled: Is a specific ASC needed so that it will be clear why Illegal Request is being reported? Promote note to normative text and get an ASC/Q from CAP. Don't need to specify which parameters are subject to this restriction; that can be left as vendor specific.
ENDL	94	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2, table 25	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the Mode Parameters bytes.
ENDL	95	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2, immediately after table 25	[insert] See SPC-3 for a description of the PS bit, SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, SUBPAGE CODE field, and PAGE LENGTH field.
ENDL	93	T	C	6a	47	6.2.1, table 24	[Technical] Table 24 is neither fish nor fowl, and thus leaves the ADC status of many mode pages unclear. Are codes 00h through 0Ch and 0Fh through 1Fh reserved, as specified in SPC-2, or what? Can you really have a device that does not support the Control mode page? What about the Disconnect-Reconnect Mode page?
HP	177	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page Table 25 - ADC Device Configuration mode page	Delete the (MSB) and (LSB) labels from the Mode parameters field.
HP	178	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page	Fix hanging paragraphs.
HP	179	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page	Change “sub-page” and “sub page” to “subpage”
HP	180	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page	Change “This mode sub-page” to “The Node Descriptor subpage”
HP	181	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page	Change “Node descriptor sub page” to Node Descriptor subpage”
HP	139	Q	A		47	Table 24 - Mode page codes	Is there provision for setting/reading the drive clock? or real-time clock? (similar to the set/get_time ACI commands)
HP	182	T	P	6c	47	6.2.1 Mode parameters overview Table 24	Probably need to add: 00h, 02h, 0Ah, 18h, 19h, 1Ch, 20h-3Eh
IBM Penokie	289	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page	The text and tables between 6.2.2 and 6.2.2.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	290	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page	Global: The term << sub-page >> should be changed to << subpage >> in all cases.
IBM Penokie	291	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page, Table 26 (Global)	The subpage name << Node descriptor sub-page >> should be changed to << Node subpage >>. The term descriptor noes not belong on the name of a mode page be it sub or not.
IBM Penokie	292	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page, Table 26 (Global)	The subpage name << DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page >> should be << DTD Primary Port subpage >>.
IBM Penokie	293	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page, Table 26 (Global)	The subpage name << Logical Unit descriptor sub-page >> should be << Logical Unit subpage >>
IBM Penokie	294	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2 ADC Device Configuration mode page, 1st paragraph after table 26	The statement << Each sub-page is comprised of one or more descriptors. >> should be << Each subpage contains of one or more descriptors. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	295	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page	Title of this section should be << Node subpage >>.
IBM Penokie	296	T	C	6c	47	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page	(Technical) There is no definition of what a << node >> or a << target device Node >> is. Whatever it is needs to be clearly defined so there is no confusion with it and a FC node which in itself is not will defined. One solution would be to state << ADC device server's node. For a definition of node see FC-FS. >>
IBM Penokie	297	E	C	6c	47	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, 1st paragraph	The statement << The page is defined in table 27. >> should be << The suppage is defined in table 27. >>
IBM Penokie	298	E	P	6c	47	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page	There needs to be more description in the beginning of this section as to what the mode page is being used to control. This is especially true as it is not being used in the normal way, in that, normally this type of mode page is defined at the protocol and used to control ports on that protocol. This mode page is being used to configure ports, other than the type that is receiving the command.
Seagate	40	E	P	6c	47	6.2.2 1st Para. after Table 26	Word choice; Change "comprised" to "composed". I think.
ENDL	96	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1, table 27	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the WORLD WIDE NODE NAME field.
ENDL	97	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1, table 27	All row lines in data structure tables should extend at least one byte into the field. This is not the case for one of the row lines between bytes 8 and 15.
ENDL	98	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1, immediately after table 27	[insert] See SPC-3 for a description of the PS bit, SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, SUBPAGE CODE field, and PAGE LENGTH field.
ENDL	99	E	P	6c	48	6.2.2.1	Every field in a table should have a paragraph describing the contents of that field. The WORLD WIDE NODE NAME field does not have such a paragraph. Add one.
ENDL	100	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.2	[Insert] 6.2.2.2.1 Introduction [to eliminate hanging text]
HP	183	E	R		48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor subpage Table 27 - Node descriptor sub page	Delete the 2 rows between 8 and 15
HP	184	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.2 DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page	Fix hanging paragraphs.
HP	185	T	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page	This subpage is FC specific. Make it generic and rename it. (it may employ protocol-specific fields if appropriate) Which name is it modifying? Put it in SCS VPD page 83h terms - the logical unit name, target port identifier/name, or target device name.
IBM Penokie	299	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 27	The title of this table should be << Node subpage >>.
IBM Penokie	300	E	R		48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page	The << MNN >> field name should be replaced with << MODIFY NODE NAME >>. There is not reason for this field name to be made into an acronym. This should be fixed in all places.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	301	T	P	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, table 27	(Technical) There is not clear definition or format of what the WORLD WIDE NODE NAME is or should be. This needs to be clearly defined. One solution is to use FC terminology. To do that change the field name to << NAME IDENTIFIER >>.
IBM Penokie	302	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, 1st paragraph after table 27	What is << devices Node_name, >> supposed to be. This term is not defined. This needs to be fixed. Also, whatever it is should not be capitalized nor have a << _ >> in it. One solution would be to change this to << ADC device server's node name (see FC-FS). >>.
IBM Penokie	303	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The column title << MNN >> should be << value >>.
IBM Penokie	304	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The title of the << MODE SENSE >> column should be << MODE SENSE command >> and there should be a reference to a table foot note. That footnote should state << See SPC-3 >>.
IBM Penokie	305	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The title of the << MODE SELECT >> column should be << MODE SELECT command >> and there should be a reference to a table foot note. That footnote should state << See SPC-3 >>.
IBM Penokie	306	E	R		48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The statement << This field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE>> should be placed in the paragraph above this table and be modified to << The MODIFY NODE NAME field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE command. >> And then give the CC/Key/ASC that would occur it is not set to zero.
IBM Penokie	307	E	P	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, table 28	The statement << Do not modify the nodes world wide name. The WWNN field shall be ignored. >> should be << Do not modify the ADC device server node name identifier (see FC-FS). The NAME IDENTIFIER field shall be ignored. >> In FC the proper term in 'name identifier' not 'wide wide name'. This needs to be changed in all cases.
IBM Penokie	308	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The is no definition for the term << WWNN >> and there is no such field defined anywhere. This needs to be fixed. See other comments for possible fix.
IBM Penokie	309	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The term << MODE SENSE. >> should be << MODE SENSE command. >>
IBM Penokie	310	E	P	6C	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The statement << Use the World Wide Node Name for logical unit 0 as the Node_Name. The value in the WWNN field shall be ignored. >> should be << Use logical unit 0's logical unit name as the name identifier for the ADC device server. The NAME IDENTIFIER field shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	311	E	P	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The statement << Set the node's world wide name to the manufacturer's default value. The value in the WWNN field shall be ignored. >> should be << Set the node's name identifier to the manufacturer's default value. The NAME IDENTIFIER field shall be ignored. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	312	E	P	6c	48	6.2.2.1 Node descriptor sub page, Table 28	The statement << Set the node's world wide name to the value in the WWNN field. >> should be << Set the node's name identifier to the value in the NAME IDENTIFIER field. >>
IBM Penokie	313	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.2 DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page	The title of this section should be << DTD Primary Port subpage >>
IBM Penokie	314	E	C	6c	48	6.2.2.2 DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page, 1st paragraph	The statement << The DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page is variable length, >> should be << The DTD Primary Port subpage is variable length, >>
Quantum	109	E	C	6c	48	Sentence before Table 28	Replace "The modify node name (MNN) field is used…" with "The modify node name (MNN) and WORLD WIDE NODE NAME fields are used…"
Quantum	110	E	C	6c	48	Table 28	WWN should be spelled out to match the field name in Table 27 (4 places)
ADIC	77	E	C	6c	49	last para	"can be" s/b "are"
ENDL	101	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2, table 29	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the DTD PRIMARY PORT DESCRIPTOR field.
ENDL	102	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2, immediately after table 29	[insert] See SPC-3 for a description of the PS bit, SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, SUBPAGE CODE field, and PAGE LENGTH field. (P) The DTD primary port descriptor is described in this subclause.
ENDL	103	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1	It appears to me that this subclause and particularly table 30 are not describing the 'descriptor header'. The are describing the whole descriptor.
ENDL	104	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1, table 30	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the DTD PRIMARY PORT DESCRIPTOR PARAMETERS field.
ENDL	105	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1, table 31	Add a Reference column to this table.
ENDL	106	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1, immediately after table 31	[insert]The ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH field indicates the number of descriptor bytes that follow.
HP	187	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2. DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page Table 29 - DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page	After PAGE LENGTH, add “(n - 3)”
HP	189	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2. DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-pageTable 29 - DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page	Delete the (MSB) and (LSB) labels from the DTD Primary Port Descriptor field since it has subfields.
HP	190	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1DTD Primary Port descriptor header Table 30 - DTD Primary Port descriptor header	Delete the (MSB) and (LSB) labels from the DTD Primary Port Descriptor Parameters since it has subfields.
HP	191	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header Table 31 - Port type descriptors	Make the Hs lower case in 00H 01H 02H – FFH
HP	193	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header	Change port to target port (Several times)
HP	194	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header	Change device to target device (or maybe DTD)

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	186	T	P	6b	49	Table 31	SAS not included. Similarly there are specific Mode pages to configure SAS ports.
HP	188	T	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2. DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page	Add a paragraph describing the DTD Primary Port Descriptor field.
HP	192	T	C	6b	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header	"The PORT TYPE indicates the type of protocol supported by the port. Values for this field are a subset of the protocol identifiers defined in SPC-2. Legal values for this field can be found in table 31." Rename this to PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER and use the values exactly as defined in SPC-3. Delete Table 31.
HP	195	T	P	6b	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header	RELATIVE TARGET PORT should point to SPC-3 for its definition (I assume the same values are meant) rather than redefine it here (potentially incorrectly or incompletely). SPC-3's r.t.p. is a 4 byte value, so a comment that a maximum of 255 are supported is in order. (or, make this field 4 bytes)
IBM Nishida	5	E	C	6c	49	Table 29	PAGE LENGTH -> PAGE LENGTH (n-3)
IBM Nishida	6	E	C	6c	49	Table 30	ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH -> ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (n-3)
IBM Penokie	315	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2 DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page, Table 29	The title of this table should be << DTD Primary Port subpage >>
IBM Penokie	316	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2 DTD Primary Port descriptor sub-page, Table 29 (Global)	Descriptors are not in small caps.
IBM Penokie	317	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header	The title of this section should be << DTD Primary Port header >>
IBM Penokie	318	E	P	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, 1st paragraph	The statement << Each descriptor contains a common header to facilitate parsing of the descriptors (see table 30). >> should be << Each descriptor contains a common header (see table 30). >>. The deleted information contains no useful standards information.
IBM Penokie	319	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 30 title (Global)	The term << Primary Port >> should not be capitalized
IBM Penokie	320	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header	All references to << target port >> should be changed to << DTD primary port >> in this section. That includes the names of the field << RELATIVE TARGET PORT >> table 30.
IBM Penokie	321	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 30	The ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH field needs to have a length indication for example << (n-4) >>.
IBM Penokie	322	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 30	Rename << DTD PRIMARY PORT DESCRIPTOR PARAMETERS >> to << PORT DESCRIPTOR >>.
IBM Penokie	323	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, 2nd paragraph	The term << device >> is used in several places. But it is not defined. It should be qualified with the type of device being referred to (e.g., removable medium device). This needs to be fixed.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	324	E	P	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, 2nd paragraph under table 30	The statement <<The PORT TYPE indicates the type of protocol supported by the port. Values for this field are a subset of the protocol identifiers defined in SPC-2. Legal values for this field can be found in table 31. >> should be << The PORT TYPE field (see table 31) indicates the type of protocol supported by the port. >>
IBM Penokie	325	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 31 title	The table title should be <<Port types >>.
IBM Penokie	326	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 31	The column title << Port Type >> should be << value >>.
IBM Penokie	327	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 31	The use of << H >> is not correct. It should be << h >>.
IBM Penokie	328	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 31	The statement << Fibre Channel (FCP, FCP-2) >> should be << Fibre Channel (e.g., FCP-2) >>
IBM Penokie	329	E	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header, Table 31	The statement << Parallel SCSI (SPI, SPI-2, SPI-3, SPI-4,...) >> should be << Parallel SCSI (e.g., SPI-5) >>
Quantum	111	E	C	6c	49	6.2.2.2.1 1st paragraph	DTD Primary Port Descriptors should not be small caps
Seagate	41	T	R		49	6.2.2.2.1 Table 31	Need iSCSI and SAS port types. Change SPC-2 reference to SPC-3, because SAS is not in SPC-2. Add 5h for iSCSI and 6h for SAS. See Table 239 in SPC-3 for full text.
ENDL	107	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2, table 32	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the PORT NAME field.
HP	197	E	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.1 DTD Primary Port descriptor header Table 32 - Fibre Channel descriptor parameters	PORT NAME to FIBRE CHANNEL WORLD WIDE PORT NAME and remove the (MSB) and (LSB) labels.
HP	198	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port Sequence number: 3
HP	199	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port Sequence number: 4
HP	200	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port Sequence number: 5
HP	201	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port Sequence number: 6
HP	202	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port Sequence number: 7
HP	203	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port Sequence number: 8
HP	204	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port Sequence number: 9
HP	205	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, RHA paragraph	Change target to target port

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	196	T	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2	When we did the crossroads bridges, we had to have the concept of current setting and future setting and what the alpa was actually set to. Which one is set in the FC-AL LOOP ID? If there is a conflicting address the current address on fibre the address switches to a non conflicting address. I think that we might need at least 2 fields for this alpa.
IBM Penokie	330	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters	The section title << Fibre Channel descriptor parameters >> should be << Fibre Channel port descriptor format >>.
IBM Penokie	331	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters	There needs to be more description in the beginning of this section as to what the mode page descriptor is being used to control. This is especially true as it is not being used in the normal way, in that, normally this type of mode page descriptor is defined at the protocol and used to control ports on that protocol. This mode page is being used to configure ports, other than the type that is receiving the command.
IBM Penokie	332	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 32 title	The title for this table should be << Fibre Channel descriptor format >>
IBM Penokie	333	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 32	Change to << MPN >> to << MODIFY PORT NAME >>. There is no need to make an acronym here. Also replace the MPN acronym everywhere else in the standard.
IBM Penokie	334	E	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph	The statement << The port enable (PE) bit is set to one to enable the port. >> should be << The port enable (PE) bit set to one enables the DTD's primary port. >>
IBM Penokie	335	E	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph	The statement << When it is set to zero, the port shall not enable its drivers and shall not respond to primitives, e.g., LIP and LPE (see clause 4.2.8). >> should be << When the PE bit is set to zero, the DTD device shall not enable the DTD primary port's drivers and the DTD primary port shall not respond to primitives (see FC-AL-2). >> The example is deleted because it is not necessary.
IBM Penokie	336	E	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph	Delete << (MPN) >> and make the name of the field in small caps.
IBM Penokie	337	E	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph	The statement << the device's port name, >> should be << the DTD primary port's name >>.
IBM Penokie	338	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 33	The column title << MPN >> should be << value >>.
IBM Penokie	339	E	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 33	The title of the << MODE SENSE >> column should be << MODE SENSE command >> and there should be a reference to a table foot note. That footnote should state << See SPC-3 >>.
IBM Penokie	340	E	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 33	The title of the << MODE SELECT >> column should be << MODE SELECT command >> and there should be a reference to a table foot note. That footnote should state << See SPC-3 >>.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	341	E	P	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 33	The statement << This field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE>> should be placed in the 3rd paragraph and be modified to << The MODIFY MODIFY PORT NAME field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE command. >> And then give the CC/Key/ASC that would occur it is not set to zero.
IBM Penokie	342	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, table 33	The statement << Do not modify the port's world wide name. >> should be << Do not modify the DTD's primary port's name identifier (see FC-FS). >> In FC the proper term in 'name identifier' not 'wide wide name'. This needs to be changed in all cases.
IBM Penokie	343	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 33	There is no such field as << PORT_NAME >> there is a << PORT NAME >> however but I don't know if that's the field you are referring to or not. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	344	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 33	The term << MODE SENSE. >> should be << MODE SENSE command. >>
IBM Penokie	345	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, table 33	The statement << Do not modify the port's world wide name. >> should be << Do not modify the DTD's primary port's name identifier. >>
IBM Penokie	346	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, table 33	The statement << Set the port's world wide name >> should be << Set the port's name identifier. >>
IBM Penokie	347	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Table 33	The statement << Set the port's world wide name to the value in the PORT_NAME field. >> should be << Set the port's name identifier to the value in the PORT_NAME field. >> .
IBM Penokie	348	T	A		50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters	(Technical) There are 2 bit defined (LIV and RHA) but there only appears to be two conditions specified. If both are zero then normal loop initialization occurs. If LIV is one and RHA is zero then normal loop initialization occurs. If LIV is zero and RHA is one then there is an error. If both are one then you have the special case. It would make more sense to do this with one bit and eliminate the possible error condition. It would also remove any confusion over the RHA bit described in FCP-2. Make LIV set to 0 do the normal loop initialization and LIV set to 1 do the special case. The resulting text would be << A loop ID valid (LIV) bit is set to one indicates that the DTD primary port attached to an arbitrated loop shall attempt, during loop initialization, to obtain its hard assigned AL_PA using the value in the FC-AL LOOP ID field. The DTD primary port shall not attempt to obtain an AL_PA during the LISA phase of loop initialization (see FC-AL-2). If there is a conflict for the hard assigned AL_PA selection during loop initialization or the DTD primary port does not have a valid hard assigned AL_PA available, the DTD primary port shall enter
IBM Penokie	349	E	C	6c	50	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph after table 33	The statement << bit of one indicates that a target attached to an arbitrated loop shall >> should be << bit of one indicates that the DTD primary port attached to an arbitrated loop shall >> . In addition all the wording changes in the general comment on this bit need to be applied even if that comment is rejected.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
Quantum	112	E	C	6c	50	Paragraph before Table 33	Replace "The modify port name (MPN) field is used…" with "The modify port name (MPN) and PORT NAME fields are used…"
Quantum	113	E	C	6c	50	Table 33	"PORT_NAME" should be "PORT NAME" with not underscore (4 places)
Quantum	114	T	C	6c	50	After table 33	We need to add a paragraph describing the form of the PORT NAME field. Suggestion: 'When the MPN value is 11b, the PORT NAME field contains an NAA type world wide unique name (See SPC-3)."
Quantum	115	T	A		50	First paragraph after Table 33	This paragraph implies that the port shall only try to get the hard address when RHA is set, and doesn't say what to do if it is not and LIV is set. Suggested rewording of this paragraph: "If the loop ID valid (LIV) bit is set to one, the port shall use the value in the FC-AL LOOP ID field to set the Hard AL_PA during a LIHA process. If the LIV bit is set to zero, the FC-AL LOOP ID field is ignored and the port shall not select an address during the LIHA phase of loop initialization.
Seagate	42	T	R		50	6.2.2.2.2 Table 32	Eight speeds for FC may not be enough. Shift Speed field to bits 3:1 and SpdLock field to bit 0. This will give a Reserved field to the left of Speed for future expansion.
ADIC	78	E	C	6c	51	para 5	"can be found" s/b "are found"
HP	206	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters	Change "is set to "bit is set"
HP	207	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters	Change target to target port Sequence number: 3
HP	208	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters	Change target to target port Sequence number: 4
HP	161	Q	C	6b	51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters	Presumably there is provision for setting WWN of SCSI devices?
HP	209	T	R		51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters	"defines values for this field" where? Name the mode page/field name whose values you're borrowing.
HP	210	T	R		51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters SCSI Parallel Interface 4 (SPI-4)	should be SPI-5 everywhere
IBM Penokie	350	T	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, NOTE 10	(Technical) This note << Targets attached in point to point mode ignore the RHA and FC-AL LOOP ID fields. >> contains nominate requirements and needs to be moved into main line text. See comment on the P2P bit for a suggested placed of this requirement.
IBM Penokie	351	T	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph under note 10	(Technical) The statement << The point-to-point (P2P) is set to one to indicate the port is configured to operate in point to point mode. When set to zero, the port is configured to operate in arbitrated loop mode. >> should be << A point-to-point (P2P) bit set to zero indicates the DTD primary port is configured to operate in arbitrated loop mode. A P2P bit set to one indicates the DTD primary port is configured to operate in point to point mode. When P2P is set to one the LIV bit and FC-AL LOOP ID field shall be ignored. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	352	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph after note 10	The statement << the port may negotiate the topology >> give no reference as to where I would go to find out how this negotiation would be done or is that outside the scope of this standard? In any case this needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	353	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph after note 10	The statement << The topology lock (TOPLOCK) bit is set to one to force the port to operate only in the mode selected by the P2P bit. When set to zero, the port may negotiate the topology and select the appropriate one. When this bit is set to zero on a MODE SELECT command, the P2P bit is ignored. >> should be << A topology lock (TOPLOCK) bit set to one forces the DTD primary port to operate only in the mode selected by the P2P bit. A TOPLOCK bit set to zero indicates the DTD primary port may negotiate the topology. When the TOPLOCK bit bit is set to zero on a MODE SELECT command, the P2P bit shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	354	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph after note 10	The statement << The SPEED field indicates the bit rate that the port is configured to operate in. The valid values can be found in table 34. >> should be <<The SPEED field indicates the bit rate (see table 34) that the DTD primary port is configured to operate at. >>
IBM Penokie	355	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph under table 34	The statement << The speed lock (SPDLOCK) field is set to one to force the port to only operate in the speed selected by the SPEED field. When set to zero, the port may negotiate the speed and select the appropriate one. When this bit is set to zero on a MODE SELECT command, the SPEED field is ignored. >> should be << A speed lock (SPDLOCK) bit set to one to forces the port to only operate in the speed selected by the SPEED field. A SPDLOCK bit set to zero allows the port to negotiate the speed and select the appropriate one (see FC-FS). If the SPDLOCK bit is set to zero on a MODE SELECT command, the SPEED field shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	356	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.2 Fibre Channel descriptor parameters, Last paragraph of section	The statement << The FC-AL LOOP ID field contains the Loop ID that shall be converted to a FC_PA value per the table in FC-AL-2. >> should be << The FC-AL LOOP ID field contains the loop identifier that shall be used to represent the hard assigned AL_PA (see FC-AL-2). >>
IBM Penokie	357	E	R		51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters	The section title << Parallel SCSI port descriptor parameters>> should be changed to << Parallel SCSI port descriptor format>>
IBM Penokie	358	E	P	6c	51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph	The statement << in the Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters. >> should be << in the PORT DESCRIPTOR for parallel SCSI port types. >>.
IBM Penokie	359	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters	There needs to be more description in the beginning of this section as to what the mode page descriptor is being used to control. This is especially true as it is not being used in the normal way, in that, normally this type of mode page descriptor is defined at the protocol and used to control ports on that protocol.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	360	E	R		51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Table 35 title	The title should be << Parallel SCSI descriptor format >>
IBM Penokie	361	E	R		51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Table 35 (Global)	Replace << BMQ >> with << BUS MODE QUALIFIER >> in all cases. There is not need to create an acronym here.
IBM Penokie	362	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph	The statement << The port enable (PE) bit is set to one to enable the port to respond to selections on the SCSI bus. When set to zero, the port shall not respond to or attempt selections or reselections on the SCSI bus and shall not respond to SCSI Bus Reset (see clause 4.2.8). >> should be << A port enable (PE) bit set to one enables the DTD primary port to respond to selections on the SCSI bus (see SPI-5). A PE bit set to zero prevents the DTD primary port from responding to or attempting selections, reselections or a hard resets on the SCSI bus (see 4.2.8). >>
IBM Penokie	363	E	C	6c	51	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph	The statement << The BUS MODE field identifies the transmission mode that the target device shall use for this target port. The SCSI Parallel Interface 4 (SPI-4) standard defines values for this field. >> should be << The BUS MODE field identifies the transmission mode that an ADC device server shall use in the TRANSCEIVER MODE field of the Negotiated Settings mode subpage (see SPI-5) for this DTD primary port. >>
Quantum	116	E	C	6c	51	1st and 2nd paragraphs after note 10	The description of P2P should come after TOPLOCK to keep the order consistent.
Seagate	43	T	C	6a	51	6.2.2.2.2 Table 34	A speed of 8 Gb/s is being proposed by FCIA to succeed 4 Gb/s. Add 8 Gb/s at 011b and move 10 Gb/s to 100b.
STK	20	E	R		51	table 34	Replace speed values with correct FC baud rates. (i.e., 1.06 Gb/sec instead of 1 Gb/sec.)
ENDL	108	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3, table 36, table footnote	Remove the dash in table footnote a.
HP	212	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page	Fix hanging paragraphs.
HP	213	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters Table 36 - Effect of bus mode qualifier field	Change target to target port
HP	214	E	R		52	Table 36 - Effect of bus mode qualifier field	Delete “the target port” Sequence number: 4
HP	215	E	R		52	Table 36 - Effect of bus mode qualifier field	Delete “the target port” Sequence number: 5
HP	216	E	R		52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters Table 36 - Effect of bus mode qualifier field	Delete “the target port” Sequence number: 6
HP	217	E	R		52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters Table 36 - Effect of bus mode qualifier field	Delete “the target port” Sequence number: 7
HP	211	I	C	6a	52	6.2.2.3	For HP, some of the fields will be non changeable.
HP	218	T	R		52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters “defines values for this field.”	Specify in what mode page and field name.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	364	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, 4th paragraph	The statement << The bus mode qualifier (BMQ) field qualifies the effect that the BUS MODE field has on the target port as listed in table 36. >> should be << The BUS MODE QUALIFER field qualifies the effect (see table 36) that the BUS MODE field has on the DTD primary port . >>
IBM Penokie	365	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Table 36	The statement << The target ignores the value of the bus mode qualifier field.>> should be << The ADC device server shall ignore the value of the BUS MODE QUALIFIER field.>>.
IBM Penokie	366	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Table 36	The statement << The target operates the target port in the mode specified by the bus mode qualifier field; the target port does not drive the DIFFSENS line with the associated voltage and current characteristics. >> should be << The ADC device server operates the DTD primary port as specified by the BUS MODE QUALIFIER field. The DTD primary port shall not drive the DIFFSENS line with the associated voltage and current characteristics (see SPI-5). >>. In addition delete the table footnote as it is not needed.
IBM Penokie	367	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Table 36	The statement << The target operates the target port in the mode specified by the bus mode qualifier field; the target port drives the DIFFSENS line with the associated voltage and current characteristics. >> should be << The ADC device server operates the DTD primary port in the mode specified by the BUS MODE QUALIFIER field. The DTD primary port drives the DIFFSENS line with the associated voltage and current characteristics (see SPI-5). >> . The table footnote should be deleted as it is not needed.
IBM Penokie	368	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph after table 36	The statement << The MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR field identifies the minimum transfer period factor that the target shall use when negotiating transfer agreements for this target port. The SCSI Parallel Interface 4 (SPI-4) standard defines values for this field. Devices that cannot support the identified minimum transfer period factor may enter negotiation using the next larger supported transfer period factor. >> should be << The MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR field identifies the minimum transfer period factor that the ADC device server shall use when negotiating transfer agreements (see SPI-5) for this DTD primary port. ADC device servers that are not able to support the identified minimum transfer period factor may enter negotiation using the next larger supported transfer period factor. >>
IBM Penokie	369	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph after table 36	The statement << field indicates the address that the port shall respond to on the SCSI bus. >> should be << field indicates the address that the DTD primary port shall respond to on the SCSI bus. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	370	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Last paragraph	The statement << A device receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled target port, where the command attempts to >> should be << An ADC device server receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled DTD primary port, where the command attempts to >>
IBM Penokie	371	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Last paragraph	The last paragraph starting with << A device receiving a MODE SELECT command >> in this section should be moved to the 1st paragraph under table 35.
IBM Penokie	372	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Last paragraph	The statement << If the port is disabled, it shall not be an error to change the BUS MODE, >> should be << If the DTD primary port is disabled, it may change the BUS MODE, >>
IBM Penokie	373	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.2.3 Parallel SCSI descriptor parameters, Last paragraph	The statement << and enable the port with the same MODE SELECT command. >> should be << and enable the DTD primary port with the same MODE SELECT command. >>
IBM Penokie	374	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page	This title of this section should be << Logical unit subpage >>.
IBM Penokie	375	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page	Global: The term << Logical Unit >> should not be capitalized. This needs to be fixed in all cases.
IBM Penokie	376	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page, 1st paragraph	The statement << The Logical Unit descriptor sub-page is variable length, >> should be << The Logical Unit subpage is variable length, >>
IBM Penokie	377	E	P	6c	52	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page, 1st paragraph	The statement << all Logical Units supported by the device other than W-LUNs shall have descriptors returned. >> should be << all logical units supported by the removable medium device (i.e., ADC logical units, RMC logical units, and SMC logical units), other than W-LUNs shall have descriptors returned. >>
IBM Penokie	378	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page	The text and tables between 6.2.2.3 and 6.2.2.3.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
Quantum	118	E	C	6c	52	3rd paragraph after Table 36	"Invalid Field in Parameter List" should be all caps.
Quantum	120	E	C	6c	52	6.2.2.3 1st paragraph	Add either a cross reference to SPC or a definition within this standard for the term W-LUN
Quantum	117	T	C	6c	52	Table 36	Throughout this table the test refers to the bus mode qualifier field. I think it should be referencing the BUS MODE field.
Quantum	119	T	C	6c	52	3rd paragraph after Table 36	I think we need a paragraph similar to this in the Fibre Channel sub-page description (6.2.2.2), or make it generic and put it in 6.2.2.1.
ENDL	109	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3, table 37	Per 03-127r1, the '(MSB)' and '(LSB)' should be removed from the LOGICAL UNIT DESCRIPTORS field.
ENDL	110	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3, table 37	All row lines in data structure tables should extend at least one byte into the field. This is not the case for one of the row lines between bytes 8 and n. In fact, why is the format of table 37 different from the format of table 30?
ENDL	111	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3, immediately after table 37	[insert] See SPC-3 for a description of the PS bit, SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, SUBPAGE CODE field, and PAGE LENGTH field. (P) The logical unit descriptor is described in this subclause.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
ENDL	112	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3.1	The introductory text should be on the same page as table 38.
HP	219	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page Table 37 - Logical Unit descriptor sub-page	After PAGE LENGTH add (n - 3)
HP	220	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page Table 37 - Logical Unit descriptor sub-page	Delete the two rows between 8 and 15
HP	221	T	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3Logical Unit descriptor sub-page Table 37 - Logical Unit descriptor sub page	Add a description of the LOGICAL UNIT DESCRIPTORS field.
IBM Nishida	7	E	C	6c	53	Table 37	PAGE LENGTH -> PAGE LENGTH (n-3)
IBM Penokie	379	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page, Table 37	The PAGE LENGTH field needs to have a length indication for example << (n-4) >>.
IBM Penokie	380	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3 Logical Unit descriptor sub-page	Global: The names of descriptors should not be in small caps. this needs to be fixed in all cases.
IBM Penokie	381	E	P	6c	53	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	The title of this section should be changed from << RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters >> to << RMC logical unit descriptor format >>
IBM Penokie	382	E	C	6c	53	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph	The statement << The descriptor parameters for an RMC logical unit >> should be << The descriptor format for an RMC logical unit >>
ENDL	114	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1, 2nd p after table 38, s 2	Peripheral Device Type [s/b] PERIPHERAL DEVICE TYPE [small caps] [to match SPC-3]
ENDL	113	T	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1, table 38	[Technical] How is this 2-byte logical unit number related to the 8-byte logical unit number format specified in SAM-3? My guess is that RMC devices are limited to being the lowest level in a hierarchy and thus need only 2-bytes to specify their logical unit number. But whatever the reason, the relationship to SAM-3 logical unit numbers needs to be spelled out in the description of this field.
HP	222	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters Table 38 - RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Change n-4 to n-3 Sequence number: 2
HP	223	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters Table 38 - RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Remove (MSB) and (LSB) labels from LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field
HP	224	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Change affect to effect
HP	225	T	**D**		54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Note that access controls' LUN mapping features means different initiator ports may see the same LUs with different LUNs. All this can do is report the LUN for the initiator port retrieving this mode page. Also, I think the mapping could be different through different target ports. Again, all the can be reported here is through the target port being used.
IBM Nishida	8	E	C	6c	54	Table 38	Is it correct? ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (n-4) -> ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (n-3)
IBM Penokie	383	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 38	The title of this table should be << RMC Logical Unit descriptor format >>.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	384	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 38	The <<ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (4-n)>> field name should be changed to <<ADDITIONAL LENGTH(3-n) >> as it appears to included the length of the rest of the descriptor and it's 3-n not 4-n.
IBM Penokie	385	E	R		54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 38 (Global)	The name of the << MLUD >> field should be changed to << modify logical unit descriptor >> (all small caps of course).
IBM Penokie	386	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 38	The term << IDENTIFICATION DESCRIPTOR >> should be << Identification descriptor >>.
IBM Penokie	387	E	P	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph	The statement << units on the device, independent >> should be << units on the ADC device, independent >>
IBM Penokie	388	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph	The term << Logical Unit Index >> should not be capitalized.
IBM Penokie	389	E	P	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph	The statement << The DEVICE TYPE field indicates the type of command set supported by the logical unit. This field contains the same value that would be returned by the logical unit in the Peripheral Device Type field for an INQUIRY command. >> should be << The DEVICE TYPE field indicates the type of device that contains the logical unit. The DEVICE TYPE field contains the same value that would be returned by the logical unit in the Peripheral Device Type field for an INQUIRY command (see SPC-3).>>.
IBM Penokie	390	E	R		54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 4th paragraph	This entire paragraph could be deleted or changed from << The ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH field contains a count of additional bytes used by the descriptor including the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field. >> to << The ADDITIONAL LENGTH field contains a count of number bytes used by the descriptor minus four. >>.
IBM Penokie	391	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 5th paragraph	The statement << The LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field is the logical unit number of the device server on the DTD primary port(s). >> should be << The LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field is the logical unit number of the logical unit that contains the device server and associated DTD primary port(s). >>
IBM Penokie	392	E	C	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 5th paragraph	The statement << This field has no affect if the ENABLE field is set to zero. >> should be << The LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field shall be ignored if the ENABLE bit is set to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	393	E	P	6c	54	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 5th paragraph	The statement << The ADC device server shall return a CHECK CONDITION to a MODE SELECT command when multiple descriptors with the ENABLE field set to one have >> should be << The selected device server shall return a CHECK CONDITION to a MODE SELECT command when multiple descriptors with the ENABLE bit set to one have >>
ADIC	79	E	P	6c	55	para 4	"can be used" s/b "may be used"
ENDL	115	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1, 2nd p on pg, s 2	Sense Key [s/b] sense key

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	228	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Hold should be smallcaps (several times in this paragraph)
HP	229	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Make “Logical Unit Not Ready, Operation In Progress.” all caps
HP	226	T	A		55	6.2.2.3.1	Maybe we should add a new sense code to the primary commands set that means not ready, logical unit offline. In progress is not very descriptive that the unit needs an external interface to put it online. I always thought the not ready in progress should be used if the outstanding command will sometime get finished on its own and you should be able to poll for the not ready to go away.
HP	227	T	P	6b	55	6.2.2.3.1	It's not clear why MLUD 00h and 01h are different values for Mode Select, when both values perform the same function. Get rid of those 2 values and shift the others, i.e., leave 00h as it is and change 02h to 01h and 03h to 02h
IBM Penokie	394	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 6th paragraph	The statement << If the ENABLE bit is set to one it indicates the RMC Logical Unit is reported and supported on the DTD primary port. When it is set to zero, the logical unit is not reported in response to a REPORT LUNS command and it does not respond to commands on the DTD primary port. This field has no effect on the availability of the RMC device server on the ADT port if one is available on the data transfer device. >> should be << An ENABLE bit set to one indicates the DTD primary port associated with the RMC logical unit shall be responsive to SCSI tasks received on that DTD primary port. An ENABLE bit set to zero indicates the DTD primary port associated with the RMC logical unit shall not respond to SCSI tasks received on that DTD primary port and the associated RMC logical unit number shall not be reported in any REPORT LUNS command. The ENABLE bit has no effect on the access to the RMC device server through the ADT port . >>
IBM Penokie	395	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 7th paragraph	The statement << require the logical unit to be ready. >> should be << require the RMC logical unit to be ready. >>
IBM Penokie	396	E	P	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 8th paragraph	The statement << The modify logical unit descriptor (MLUD) field is used to modify and report modifications to the logical unit's device identifiers, as defined in table 39. >> should be << The MODIFY LOGICAL UNIT DESCRIPTOR field (see table 39) modifies and reports modifications to the RMC logical unit's device identifiers. >>.
IBM Penokie	397	E	P	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The title of this table should be << MODIFY LOGICAL UNIT DESCRIPTOR field >>
IBM Penokie	398	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The title of the << MLUD >> column should be << Value >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	399	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The title of the << MODE SENSE >> column should be << MODE SENSE command >> and there should be a reference to a table foot note. That footnote should state << See SPC-3 >>.
IBM Penokie	400	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The title of the << MODE SELECT >> column should be << MODE SELECT command >> and there should be a reference to a table foot note. That footnote should state << See SPC-3 >>.
IBM Penokie	401	E	P	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The statement << This field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE>> should be placed in the 8th paragraph and be modified to << The MODIFY LOGICAL UNIT DESCRIPTOR field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE command. >> And then give the CC/Key/ASC that would occur it is not set to zero.
IBM Penokie	402	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The statement << Do not modify the logical unit's device identifiers. The identification descriptor list shall be ignored. >> should be << Do not modify the RMC logical unit's device identifiers. The identification descriptors shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	403	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	All the << MODE SENSE.>> statements should be << MODE SENSE command >>.
IBM Penokie	404	E	R		55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The statement << Do not modify the logical unit's device identifiers from the current values. The identification descriptor list shall be ignored. >> should be << Do not modify the RMC logical unit's device identifiers from the current values. The identification descriptors shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	405	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The statement << Set the logical unit's device identifiers to the manufacturer's default values. The values in the identification descriptor list shall be ignored. >> should be << Set the RMC logical unit's device identifiers to the manufacturer's default values. The identification descriptors shall be ignored. >>
IBM Penokie	406	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 39	The statement << Set the logical unit's device identifiers to the values in the identification descriptor list. >> should be << Set the RMC logical unit's device identifiers to the values in the identification descriptors. >>
IBM Penokie	407	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph after table 39	The statement << The autoload mode override (AMO) field can be used to override the Autoload Mode settings for the logical unit controlled with the Control mode page for the logical unit. When set to one, the load process shall be controlled by the Autoload Mode field in this page, overriding the settings in the Control mode page. When set to zero, the settings in the Control mode page shall be used to control the load process. >> should be << An autoload mode override (AMO) bit set to one indicates load process shall be controlled by the AUTOLOAD MODE field (see table 40), overriding the settings in the Control mode page AUTOLOAD MODE SETTINGS field (see SPC-3). An AMO bit set to zero indicates the settings in the Control mode page AUTOLOAD MODE SETTINGS field shall be used to control the load process. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	408	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph after table 39	The statement << The AUTOLOAD MODE field specifies the action to be taken when a medium is inserted. This field is ignored on the MODE SELECT if the AMO bit is set to zero. The field is defined in table 40. >> should be << The AUTOLOAD MODE field (see table 40) specifies the action to be taken when a medium is inserted. If the AMO bit is set to zero this field shall be ignored.>>.
IBM Penokie	409	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph after table 40	The term << Hold >> should be in small caps. There are several of these that need to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	410	E	C	6c	55	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph after table 40	The statement << The SCSI unload hold override (SUHO) bit shall be set to one to override the Hold bit in the SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command as processed by the RMC device server. When set to one, the Hold bit in a SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command shall be ignored by the RMC device server and the medium shall not be ejected. When set to zero, the Hold bit in the SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command shall control if the medium is ejected or not, as processed by the RMC device server. This field shall not effect unload requests as processed by the ADC device server. >> should be << A SCSI unload hold override (SUHO) bit set to one indicates the HOLD bit in a SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command (see SSC-2) shall be ignored by the RMC device server and the medium shall not be ejected. A SUHO bit set to zero indicates the HOLD bit in the SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command shall control if the medium is ejected or not, as processed by the RMC device server. The SUHO bit shall not effect unload requests as processed by the ADC device server. >>
Quantum	121	E	C	6c	55	1st paragraph, 1st sentence	"port" should be "port(s)"
Quantum	122	E	C	6c	55	2nd paragraph	"Logical Unit Not Ready, Operation In Progress" should be all caps.
Quantum	123	E	C	6c	55	1st paragraph after Table 39, 2nd sentence	"Autoload Mode" when referring to the field name in the Control mode page should be small caps.
Quantum	124	E	C	6c	55	1st and 2nd paragraphs after Table 39	AUTOLOAD MODE should be described before AMO
ADIC	80	E	C	6c	56	para 4	"will select";"will be" s/b "shall select";"shall be"
ADIC	81	E	C	6c	56	para 2	"can include" s/b "may include"
HP	233	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Hold should be smallcaps
HP	234	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	effect should be affect
HP	235	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	use should be used
HP	236	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Density Code should be small caps
HP	237	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	ASSOCIATION should be small caps

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	230	T	A		56	6.2.2.3.1	DENOVR bit. Consider this case: If it's set and SELECT WRITE DENSITY=Gen3 but tape is Gen1-type, then should we check condition? Specify in the manual what to do with different generations of tape being used i.e. explore corner cases. Also Mode sense should return the tape's highest density code, if a tape inserted, instead of the value set by SELECT WRITE DENSITY
HP	231	T	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1	Add an AUTODROFF bit
HP	232	T	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1	Add a paragraph describing the operation of the AUTODROFF bit. When zero, the RMC device server reverts from disaster recovery operation to non-disaster recovery operation upon detection of vendor specific conditions. Upon reverting to non-disaster recovery operation, the RMC device server will set the DRMODE bit to zero. When one, the RMC device server remains in disaster recovery mode until an application client changes the DRMODE bit to zero.
IBM Penokie	411	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph after table 40	The statement << The automatic unload hold (AUH) bit shall be set to one to disable ejecting the medium when it is unloaded due to device specific conditions. These conditions can include cleaning complete, invalid medium type, firmware update complete, unsupported format, or other error conditions detected by the device. This bit does not affect the unload operation initiated via the physical user interface of the data transfer device. >> should be << An automatic unload hold (AUH) bit set to one disables ejecting the medium when it is unloaded due to device specific conditions (e.g., cleaning complete, invalid medium type, firmware update complete, unsupported format, or other error conditions detected by the device). An AUH bit set to zero shall have no effect on the ejecting of the medium. The AUH bit shall not affect the unload operation initiated via the physical user interface of the data transfer device. >>.
IBM Penokie	412	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph after table 40	The statement << The write protect (WP) bit shall write protect the medium when set to one. This bit shall be set to zero by the device each time a medium is unloaded. >> should be << A write protect (WP) bit set to one write protects the medium. A WP be set to zero by the ADC device each time a medium is unloaded. >>.
IBM Penokie	413	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Global: The term << device >> is used in many places in this standard, however the term by itself is not enough. I have been replacing it in may places with << RMC device server >> or << ADC device >> but I lack the knowledge of the detail workings of this and may have picked the wrong one. This should be changed in the comment when not correct but the main point is that you have to be specific as to what being talked about in the standard.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	414	E	A		56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 4th paragraph after table 40	The statement << The density override (DENOVR) and SELECT WRITE DENSITY fields are use to override the Density Code field in the Mode Descriptor Block used by the device. When the DENOVR field is set to one and the SELECT WRITE DENSITY field contains a supported density code, any write operation will select that density. When the DENOVR field is set to zero, the density shall be selected through other means and the SELECT WRITE DENSITY field shall be ignored. The DENOVR field shall be set to zero by the device each time a medium is unloaded. On a MODE SENSE command, the SELECT WRITE DENSITY field shall contain the density code that will be used by the device should a write operation be started such that the device is capable of selecting a density. >> is just about the worst I have ever seen. I think it should be << A density override (DENOVR) bit set to one indicates the RMC device server shall use the contents of the SELECT WRITE DENSITY field as the density code for the RMC logical unit instead of the DENSITY CODE field in the Mode Descriptor Block (See SSC-2). The
IBM Penokie	415	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 5th paragraph after table 40	The statement << The disaster recovery mode (DRMODE) bit shall be set to one to place the device into Disaster Recovery Mode. When set to zero, the device shall operate in normal mode. >> should be << A disaster recovery mode (DRMODE) bit set to one places the DTD device into disaster recovery mode. DRMODE set to zero indicates the DTD device shall not operate in disaster recovery mode. >>.
IBM Penokie	416	E	P	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 6th paragraph after table 40	The statement << With the Clean Protect (CP) bit set to one, the DTD shall not perform a cleaning operation upon loading of cleaning media. With the CP bit set to zero, the ADC device server shall not regulate DTD cleaning operations. >> should be << A Clean Protect (CP) bit set to one indicates the DTD device shall not request the ADC device server perform a cleaning operation upon loading of cleaning media. A CP bit set to zero indicates the DTD device shall not regulate ADC device server's cleaning operations. >>
IBM Penokie	417	E	P	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 7th paragraph after table 40	The statement << With the microcode update protect (MUP) bit set to one, the DTD shall not perform a microcode update process upon loading of media containing a microcode image. With the MUP bit set to zero, the ADC device server shall not regulate the DTD microcode update process. >> should be << A microcode update protect (MUP) bit set to one indicates the DTD device shall request the ADC device serve not perform a microcode update process upon loading of media containing a microcode image. A MUP bit set to zero indicates the ADC device server shall not regulate the microcode update process. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	418	E	P	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 7th paragraph after table 40	The statement << The microcode update enable (MUE) bit shall be set to one to allow the device to prepare to accept a medium containing a microcode image. This preparation is vendor specific. This bit shall be set to zero by the device once the microcode update process is complete or aborted. >> should be << A microcode update enable (MUE) bit set to one allows the DTD device to request the ADC device server to prepare to accept a medium containing a microcode image. The preparation description is outside the scope of this standard. A MUE bit shall be set to zero by the ADC device server after the microcode update process completes or is aborted. >>
IBM Penokie	419	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 8th paragraph after table 40	The statement << the device is currently >> should be << the DTD device is currently >>.
IBM Penokie	420	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.1 RMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 9th paragraph after table 40	The statement << The IDENTIFICATION DESCRIPTOR fields are the same as used in the Device Identification VPD page as described in SPC-2. >> should be << The IDENTIFICATION DESCRIPTOR fields are the same as those in the Device Identification VPD page (see SPC-3). >>
IBM Penokie	421	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	The title of this section should be changed from << SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters >> to << SMC logical unit descriptor format >>
IBM Penokie	422	E	C	6c	56	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph	The statement << The descriptor parameters for an SMC logical unit (Device Type = 08h) >> should be << The descriptor format for an SMC logical unit (i.e., Device Type = 08h)>>
Quantum	126	E	C	6c	56	last paragraph before 6.2.2.3.2, 2nd sentence	Replace "reported" with "used"
Quantum	125	T	C	6c	56	4th paragraph, 1st sentence	Replace "…Mode Descriptor Block used by the device" with "…Mode Descriptor Block used by the RMC device server"
ENDL	116	T	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2, table 41	[Technical] How is this 2-byte logical unit number related to the 8-byte logical unit number format specified in SAM-3? My guess is that SMC devices are limited to being the lowest level in a hierarchy and thus need only 2-bytes to specify their logical unit number. But whatever the reason, the relationship to SAM-3 logical unit numbers needs to be spelled out in the description of this field.
HP	238	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters Table 41 - SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Change (n-4) to 4
HP	239	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters Table 41 - SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Remove (MSB) and (LSB) labels from LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field
IBM Nishida	9	E	C	6c	57	Table 41	ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (n-4) -> ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (4)
IBM Penokie	423	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 41	The title of this table should be << SMC Logical Unit descriptor format >>.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	424	E	P	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 41	The << ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (n-4) >> should be renamed to << ADDITIONAL LENGTH (4) >> as this is a fixed length.
IBM Penokie	425	E	R		57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph	The statement << The LOGICAL UNIT INDEX, DEVICE TYPE, ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH, and LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER fields are as described in 6.2.2.3.1. >> should be << The LOGICAL UNIT INDEX, DEVICE TYPE, and LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER fields are as described in 6.2.2.3.1. >>. The ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH does not need to be in the list as it is a fixed value.
IBM Penokie	426	E	P	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph	The statement << If the ENABLE field is set to one, it indicates that the SMC Logical Unit is reported and supported on the DTD primary port. Commands received for this logical unit shall either be processed by the local SMC device server or passed by the bridging manager to the remote SMC device server. When it is set to zero, the logical unit is not reported in response to a REPORT LUNS command and it does not respond to commands on the DTD primary port. >> should be << An ENABLE bit set to one indicates the DTD primary port associated with the SMC logical unit shall be responsive to SCSI tasks received on that DTD primary port. An ENABLE bit set to zero indicates the DTD primary port associated with the SMC logical unit shall not respond to SCSI tasks received on that DTD primary port and the associated RMC logical unit number shall not be reported in any REPORT LUNS command. The ENABLE bit has no effect on the access to the SMC device server through the ADT port . >>.
IBM Penokie	427	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 4th paragraph	The statement << If the ENABLE field is changed from >> should be << If the ENABLE bit is changed from >>
IBM Penokie	428	E	P	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 4th paragraph	The statement << remaining device servers in the data transfer device shall report a change in the logical unit inventory, as specified in SPC-2, to any >> should be << remaining device servers in the DTD device shall report a change in the logical unit inventory (see SPC-3) to any >> .
IBM Penokie	429	E	P	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 5th paragraph	The statement << If the device server receives a MODE SELECT command via a DTD primary port, >> should be << If the SMC device server receives a MODE SELECT command through a DTD primary port, >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	430	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 6th paragraph	The statement << If the CACHE field is set to one, the local SMC device server shall implement caching of SMC data and status (see 4.2.2.1.4). Enabling of caching requires enabling of bridging; if the ADC device server receives a MODE SELECT command for which the parameter data would set the ENABLE field to zero and the CACHE field to one, >> should be << A CACHE bit set to one and the ENABLE bit set to one indicates the local SMC device server shall enable caching of SMC data and status (see 4.2.2.1.4). If the ADC device server receives a MODE SELECT command for which the parameter data would set the ENABLE bit to zero and the CACHE bit to one, >>.
IBM Penokie	431	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 SMC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 7th paragraph	The statement << If the CACHE field is set to zero, the local SMC device server shall not implement caching of SMC data and status. >> should be << A CACHE bit set to zero indicates the local SMC device server shall not cache of SMC data and status. >>
IBM Penokie	432	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	The title of this section should be changed from << ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters >> to << << ADC logical unit descriptor format >>
IBM Penokie	433	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 1st paragraph	The statement << The descriptor parameters for an ADC logical unit (Device Type = 12h) >> should be << The descriptor format for an ADC logical unit (i.e., Device Type = 12h) >>
Quantum	127	E	C	6c	57	2nd and 3rd paragraphs after Table 41	Replace "DTD primary port" with "DTD primary port(s)" (3 places)
Quantum	128	E	P	6c	57	5th paragraph after Table 41, 2nd sentence	Replace "…MODE SELECT command for which the parameter data would set the ENABLE field to zero and the CACHE field to one" with "…MODE SELECT command with the ENABLE field set to zero and the CACHE field set to one.
Seagate	44	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.2 Table 41	Specify device type in table. In byte 1 row, change "device type" to "device type (08h)"
Seagate	45	E	C	6c	57	6.2.2.3.3 Table 42	Specify device type in table. In byte 1 row, change "device type" to "device type (12h)"
ENDL	117	T	C	6c	58	6.2.2.3.3, table 42	[Technical] How is this 2-byte logical unit number related to the 8-byte logical unit number format specified in SAM-3? My guess is that ADC devices are limited to being the lowest level in a hierarchy and thus need only 2-bytes to specify their logical unit number. But whatever the reason, the relationship to SAM-3 logical unit numbers needs to be spelled out in the description of this field.
HP	240	E	C	6c	58	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters Table 42 - ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Remove (MSB) and (LSB) labels from LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field
HP	241	E	C	6c	58	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters Table 42 - ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters	Change (n-4) to 4

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	242	E	C	6b	58	6.3.1 Vital product data parameters overview	Remove 6.3.1 level and put the text right into 6.3
HP	243	T	C	6b	58	6.3 VPD parameters	“Device Identification page 83h (as defined in SPC-2) may be different between ADC and RMC devices.” They must have different data if they’ve got logical unit names or will confuse software. I’d delete this sentence.
IBM Nishida	10	E	C	6c	58	Table 42	ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (n-4) -> ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (4)
IBM Penokie	434	E	C	6c	58	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 42	The title of this table should be << ADC Logical Unit descriptor format >>.
IBM Penokie	435	E	P	6c	58	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, Table 42	The << ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH (n-4) >> should be renamed to << ADDITIONAL LENGTH (4) >> as this is a fixed length.
IBM Penokie	436	E	R		58	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 2nd paragraph	The statement << The LOGICAL UNIT INDEX, DEVICE TYPE, ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH, and LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER fields are as described in 6.2.2.3.1. >> should be << The LOGICAL UNIT INDEX, DEVICE TYPE, and LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER fields are as described in 6.2.2.3.1. >>. The ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH does not need to be in the list as it is a fixed value.
IBM Penokie	437	E	C	6c	58	6.2.2.3.3 ADC Logical Unit descriptor parameters, 3rd paragraph	The statement << If the ENABLE bit is set to one it indicates the ADC Logical Unit is reported and supported on the DTD primary port. Commands received for this logical unit shall be passed on to the ADC device server. When it is set to zero, the logical unit is not reported in response to a REPORT LUNS command and it does not respond to commands on the DTD primary port. This field has no effect on the availability of the ADC device server on the ADT port if one is available on the data transfer device. >> should be << << An ENABLE bit set to one indicates the DTD primary port associated with the ADC logical unit shall be responsive to SCSI tasks received on that DTD primary port. An ENABLE bit set to zero indicates the DTD primary port associated with the ADC logical unit shall not respond to SCSI tasks received on that DTD primary port and the associated ADC logical unit number shall not be reported in any REPORT LUNS command. The ENABLE bit has no effect on the access to the ADC device server through the ADT port . >>
IBM Penokie	438	E	R		58	6.3.1 Vital product data parameters overview	The statement << Device Identification page 83h (as defined in SPC-2) may be different between ADC and RMC devices. >> should be << The Device Identification VPD page (see SPC-3) may be different between ADC and RMC devices. >>
Quantum	129	E	C	6c	58	2nd paragraph after Table 42	Replace "DTD primary port" with "DTD primary port(s)" (2 places)
STK	21	E	C	6b	58	clause 6.3.1	Subclause header should be removed.
ADIC	82	E			59	A.1, para 3	how does the automation device perform a hard reset?

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	439	E			59	A.1 Introduction, 1st paragraph	The statement << devices automatically, i.e., without manual configuration of the DTD before it is placed in the automation device. >> should be << devices automatically (i.e., without manual configuration of the DTD before it is placed in the automation device). >>
IBM Penokie	440	E			59	A.1 Introduction, 1st paragraph	The statement << Because DTD configuration information is presented and modified in a standard manner, automation application clients can implement one discovery and configuration process that will accommodate all compliant DTDs without need for DTD-specific changes. >> should be << Because DTD configuration information is presented and modified in a standard manner, automation application clients may implement one discovery and configuration process that accommodates all compliant DTDs without need for DTD-specific changes. >>
IBM Penokie	441	E			59	A.1 Introduction	The bulleted list in this section needs to be change to an a.b.c list the follows the conventions set in this standards. a) text; b) text; and c) text. Note there is no space between item in list, each list ends with a semi colon, and the 2nd to last item in list has an and or an or.
IBM Penokie	442	E			59	A.1 Introduction	Global - The term << must >> shall be deleted from this standard in all cases. In an informative annex shall are not allowed so the musts need to be restored to eliminate them or the requirements moved to a nominate part of the standard.
IBM Penokie	443	E			59	A.1 Introduction	Global - All cases of the term << will >> need to be removed from this standard.
IBM Penokie	444	E			59	A.1 Introduction, 1st paragraph after list	The statement << Configuration of all data transfer devices must be performed when the automation device performs a hard reset. Also, when a data transfer device performs a hard reset it must be configured. At that time, the automation application client will typically discover the DTD and if necessary modify its configuration prior to enabling its primary port(s). >> should be << Configuration of all data transfer devices is performed when the automation device performs a hard reset. Also, when a data transfer device performs a hard reset it is configured. At that time, the automation application client typically discovers the DTD and if necessary modifies its configuration prior to enabling its primary port(s). >>
IBM Penokie	445	E			59	A.1 Introduction	Global - All cases of the term << can >> need to be removed from this standard.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	446	E			59	A.1 Introduction, 2nd paragraph after list	The statement << While different DTDs may save different sets of parameters across power cycles and resets, the port enable (PE) field in the DTD primary port descriptors is the one that is required for the operation described above. When this bit is set to zero in the saved mode parameters, a power cycle or hard reset will leave the DTD primary ports disabled. The automation application client can then set the entire configuration and enable the DTD primary ports by setting the current mode parameters, which can be done with a single MODE SELECT command. In fact, if the DTD configuration is known to be acceptable, then this single command will be the only one necessary. >> should be << While different DTDs may save different sets of parameters across power cycles and resets, the PE bit (see 6.2.2.2.2 and 6.2.2.2.3) is the bit that is required for the operation described in this subclause. When the PE bit is set to zero in the saved mode parameters, a power cycle or hard reset leaves the DTD primary ports disabled. The automation application client may then set the entire configuration and enable the DTD primary ports
IBM Penokie	447	E			59	A.1 Introduction, 3rd paragraph after list	The statement << If the DTD detects that it is not connected to an automation device (by means beyond the scope of this standard), it may override a PE bit of zero and enable the port upon power on or hard reset. This will allow the DTD primary ports to operate when the DTD is in a standalone mode. >> should be << If the DTD device detects that it is not connected to an automation device it may override a PE bit that is set to zero and enable the DTD primary port upon power on or hard reset. This allows the DTD primary ports to operate when the DTD device is in a standalone mode. The method for detecting if the DTD device is not connected is outside the scope of this standard.>>
IBM Penokie	448	E			59	A.2 Command Sequence	Global - The references to tables are not capitalized unless it is the first word of a sentence. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	449	E			59	A.2 Command Sequence, 1st paragraph	The term << data transfer device >> should be << DTD device >>.
Quantum	130	E			59	bullet list	Should be a letter list.
Quantum	131	T			59	2nd paragraph after the bullet list	This paragraph states that the PE bit must be a savable parameter in the port descriptors. If that is true, then it needs to be stated somewhere in 6.2. If it is not required to be savable, the default value should be 0 and that should be documented in 6.2
STK	22	E			59	Annex A	Remove annex.
ADIC	83	E			60	A.3 para 1	"drive" s/b "DTD"
HP	244	E			60	A.3 Configuration process steps	Fix hanging paragraphs
HP	245	E			60	A.3 Configuration process steps	Change “table above” to Table A.1.
IBM Penokie	450	E			60	A.2 Command Sequence, 2nd paragraph	The statement << only necessary command will be the final MODE SELECT (10). >> should be << only necessary command is the final MODE SELECT (10). >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	451	E			60	A.2 Command Sequence, 2nd paragraph	The statement << they are mandatory and will be available on all DTDs. The six-byte forms are optional and thus may not be supported. >> should be << they are mandatory and are therefore available on all DTDs. The six-byte forms are optional and therefore may not be supported. >>.
IBM Penokie	452	E			60	A.3 Configuration process steps, 1st paragraph	The statement << device server, it can then begin to determine the characteristics of the DTD. >> should be << device server, it may then begin to determine the characteristics of the DTD. >>
IBM Penokie	453	E			60	A.3 Configuration process steps, 1st paragraph	The statement << Automation firmware need make no assumptions about the type of media handled by the drive, the number and types of primary ports, identifiers reported by it, etc. >> should be << Automation firmware is not required to make assumptions (e.g., about the type of media handled by the DTD device, the number and types of DTD primary ports, or the identifiers). >>
IBM Penokie	454	E			60	A.3 Configuration process steps	The text between A.3 and A.3.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	455	E			60	A.3 Configuration process steps, 2nd paragraph	The statement << command in the table above. >> should be << command in table A.1. >>
IBM Penokie	456	E			60	A.3.2 Obtaining saveable mode parameters	The statement << The data received must then be parsed to determine which parameters are supported. If none of these parameters need to be changed or if no parameters can be saved, then the automation application client can skip to clause A.3.4 below. >> should be << The data received is then parsed to determine which parameters are supported. If none of these parameters need to be changed or if no parameters are saveable, then the automation application client starts obtaining the current mode parameters (see A.3.4).>>
HP	246	E			61	A.4.1 Mode parameter header and block descriptor	Add text introducing the table, and add a table title
HP	247	E			61	A.4 Sample mode parameters	Fix hanging paragraphs
IBM Nishida	11	E			61	A.4.1 Mode parameter header and block descriptor	MODE DATA LENGTH (0000h) I think it should not be 0000h.
IBM Penokie	457	E			61	A.3.3 Saving mode parameters	The statement << If these bits are set to zero and saved, then after subsequent hard resets the DTD primary port(s) will be disabled. this will permit the automation application client to configure the DTD before it can be accessed through its primary ports. >> should be << If these bits are set to zero and saved, then after subsequent hard resets the DTD primary port(s) are disabled. this permits the automation application client to configure the DTD device before it is accessed through its DTD primary ports. >>
IBM Penokie	458	E			61	A.3.4 Obtaining current mode parameters	The statement << The automation application client can now set the DTD parameters to the values desired during normal operation. >> should be << The automation application client now sets the DTD parameters to the values desired during normal operation. >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	459	E			61	A.3.4 Obtaining current mode parameters	The statement << The data received must then be parsed to determine which parameters are supported. >> should be << The data received is then parsed to determine which parameters are supported. >>
IBM Penokie	460	E			61	A.3.5 Setting operational parameter values, 1st paragraph	The statement << The second MODE SELECT (10) command will typically set all of the operational parameter values and enable the DTD's primary ports. It is done with the save pages (SP) field set to zero. >> should be << The second MODE SELECT (10) command typically sets all of the operational parameter values and enables the DTD's primary ports. This is done with the save pages (SP) field set to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	461	E			61	A.3.5 Setting operational parameter values, 2nd paragraph	The statement << If the automation application client sets the OFFLINE field of the RMC logical unit descriptor to one in order to leave the device offline after the DTD primary ports are enabled, then an additional MODE SELECT (10) will be necessary to bring the device online. >> should be << If the automation application client sets the OFFLINE bit (see 6.2.2.3.1) to one in order to leave the device offline after the DTD primary ports are enabled, then an additional MODE SELECT (10) is necessary to bring the DTD device online. >>
IBM Penokie	462	E			61	A.4 Sample mode parameters	The statement << This clause presents a example of configuring the operational (changeable) parameters of a data transfer device. The DTD contains an SSC (tape) device server and two Fibre Channel ports. The values shown here are those set in clause A.3.5 above. >> should be << This subclause presents a example of configuring the operational (i.e., changeable) parameters of a DTD device. The DTD device contains a tape device that conforms to the SSC-2 standard and two Fibre Channel ports. The values shown here are those set by the procedure described in A.3.5. >>
IBM Penokie	463	E			61	A.4 Sample mode parameters	The text between A.4 and A.4.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	464	E			61	A.4.1 Mode parameter header and block descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	465	E			61	A.4.2 Node descriptor subpage	The statement << Because the automation application client wishes to change the world wide node name, it sets the WORLD WIDE NODE NAME field to the new value (2000012300000000h) and the MNN field to 11b. >> should be << << Because the automation application client requires a different node name identifier, it sets the NAME IDENTIFIER field to the new value (2000012300000000h) and the MNN field to 11b. >>
Quantum	132	E			61	1st paragraph	Capitalize "this"
Seagate	46	E			61	Annex A	Some switches will not accept certain NAA values for node names. Investigate with T11 and change text and table if example node name violates a standard.
HP	248	E			62	A.4.3 DTD primary port descriptor subpage	Change “Service Delivery Port” to “SCSI Target Port”

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
HP	249	E			62	A.4.2 Node descriptor subpage	In the unlabeled table, add a header row and change row numbers 8..23 to 8..15
HP	250	E			62	A.4.2 Node descriptor subpage	Add a title to the table
HP	251	E			62	A.4.3 DTD primary port descriptor subpage	Add a title to the table
HP	252	E			62	A.4.3 DTD primary port descriptor subpage	In the untitled table, add a header row and change 24..27 to 0..3
HP	253	E			62	A.4.2 Node descriptor subpage	Remove the (MSB) and (LSB) labels from WORLD WIDE NODE NAME
HP	254	E			62	A.4.3 DTD primary port descriptor subpage	Fix hanging paragraphs
IBM Penokie	466	E			62	A.4.2 Node descriptor subpage	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	467	E			62	A.4.2 Node descriptor subpage	The field name << WORLD WIDE NODE NAME >> should be changed to << NAME IDENTIFER >>
IBM Penokie	468	E			62	A.4.3 DTD primary port descriptor subpage	The statement << This example DTD has two Fibre >> should be << In this example the DTD device has two Fibre >>.
IBM Penokie	469	E			62	A.4.3 DTD primary port descriptor subpage	The text and table between A.4.3and A.4.3.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	470	E			62	A.4.3 DTD primary port descriptor subpage	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	471	E			62	A.4.3.1 Port A port descriptor, 1st paragraph	The statement << application client may wish to change a number of >> should be << application client may change a number of >>
IBM Penokie	472	E			62	A.4.3.1 Port A port descriptor	The bulleted list in this section needs to be change to an a.b.c list the follows the conventions set in this standards. a) text; b) text; and c) text. Note there is no space between item in list, each list ends with a semi colon, and the 2nd to last item in list has an and or an or.
Quantum	133	E			62	A.4.3.1	Change bullet list to lettered.
Quantum	134	E			62	A.4.3.1	This example is odd since it specifies a value for P2P but sets TOPLOCK to 0 which by definition means that the P2P bit is ignored. The same comment applies to the speed values.
HP	255	E			63	A.4.3.1 Port A port descriptor	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers
HP	256	E			63	A.4.3 Port B port descriptor	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers
HP	257	E			63	A.4.4 Logical unit descriptor subpage	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers
HP	258	E			63	A.4.4 Logical unit descriptor subpage	Fix hanging paragraphs
IBM Penokie	473	E			63	A.4.3.1 Port A port descriptor	The field name << ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH >> should be << ADDITIONAL LENGTH >>
IBM Penokie	474	E			63	A.4.3.1 Port A port descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	475	E			63	A.4.3.1 Port A port descriptor	The needs to be a row number after 35.
IBM Penokie	476	E			63	A.4.3.2 Port B port descriptor	The field name << ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH >> should be << ADDITIONAL LENGTH >>
IBM Penokie	477	E			63	A.4.3.2 Port B port descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	478	E			63	A.4.3.2 Port B port descriptor	There needs to be a row number after 51.

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	479	E			63	A.4.4 Logical unit descriptor subpage	The statement << The logical unit descriptor subpage will contain at least one logical unit descriptor. >> should be << The logical unit descriptor subpage contains at least one logical unit descriptor. >>
IBM Penokie	480	E			63	A.4.4 Logical unit descriptor subpage	The text and table between A.4.4 and A.4.4.1 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
ADIC	84	E			64	A.4.4.1 bullet 3	"drive" s/b "DTD"
HP	259	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers
HP	260	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor	Fix hanging paragraphs
HP	261	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor	Delete interface
IBM Penokie	481	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor, 1st paragraph	The statement << If the automation application client the RMC device server to appear on its primary interface ports, it must set the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field to the desired value and set the ENABLE field to one. Otherwise, it must set the ENABLE field to zero. Typically, the LUN will be 0000h and ENABLE will be 1. During normal operation, the OFFLINE bit will be 0. >> should be << If the automation application client requires the RMC device server to appear on its DTD primary ports, it sets the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field to a specific value and sets the ENABLE bit to one. Otherwise, it the ENABLE bit is set to zero. Typically, the LUN is 0000h and ENABLE bit is set to one. During normal operation, the OFFLINE bit is set to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	482	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor, 2nd paragraph	The statement << This example is for a Stream (tape) device, so the DEVICE >> should be << This example is for a stream device (i.e., tape device), so the DEVICE >>
IBM Penokie	483	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor	The text and table between A.4.4.1 and A.4.4.1.2 is hanging. This needs to be fixed.
IBM Penokie	484	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor, 2nd item in list	The statement << modify logical unit descriptor (MLUD) field >> should be << MODIFY LOGICAL UNIT DESCRIPTOR field >>.
IBM Penokie	485	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor, 3nd item in list	The statement << The drive will be online when the DTD primary ports are >> should be << The drive will be online when the DTD primary ports are >>
IBM Penokie	486	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor	The bulleted list in this section needs to be change to an a.b.c list the follows the conventions set in this standards. a) text; b) text; and c) text. Note there is no space between item in list, each list ends with a semi colon, and the 2nd to last item in list has an and or
IBM Penokie	487	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor	The field name << ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH >> should be << ADDITIONAL LENGTH >>
IBM Penokie	488	E			64	A.4.4.1 RMC logical unit descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	489	E			64	A.4.4.1.2 T10 vendor identifier descriptor, 1st paragraph	The statement << descriptors, a T10 vendor identifier and a NAA identifier. >> should be << descriptors, a T10 vendor identifier and a NAA identifier (see SPC-3). >>

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	490	E			64	A.4.4.1.2 T10 vendor identifier descriptor, 2nd paragraph	The statement << bit are both zero. >> should be << bit are both set to zero. >>
Quantum	135	E			64	A.4.4.1	Change bullet list to lettered.
HP	262	E			65	A.4.4.1.2 T10 vendor identifier descriptor	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers
HP	263	E			65	A.4.4.1.3 IEEE extended identifier descriptor	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers
IBM Penokie	491	E			65	A.4.4.1.2 T10 vendor identifier descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	492	E			65	A.4.4.1.3 IEEE extended identifier descriptor, 1st paragraph	The statement << value is zero. >> should be << value is set to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	493	E			65	A.4.4.1.3 IEEE extended identifier descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	494	E			65	A.4.4.1.3 IEEE extended identifier descriptor, 3rd paragraph	The statement << the ADC device server must parse the data provided by the MODE SELECT >> should be << the ADC device server parses the data provided by the MODE SELECT >>
IBM Penokie	495	E			65	A.4.4.2 SMC logical unit descriptor, 1st paragraph	The statement << This DTD supports ADI bridging (see clause 4.2.2.1), so the mode data includes a Medium Changer logical unit descriptor with a logical unit index of one. Because the automation application client wishes to enable bridging, it sets the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field to one and the ENABLE field to one. >> should be << This DTD supports ADI bridging (see 4.2.2.1), so the mode data includes a Medium Changer logical unit descriptor with the LOGICAL UNIT INDEX field set to 01h. Because the automation application client is going to enable bridging, it sets the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field to 0001h and the ENABLE bit to one. >>
IBM Penokie	496	E			65	A.4.4.2 SMC logical unit descriptor, 2nd paragraph	The statement << If multiple logical units are enabled for reporting on the primary ports, then the ADC device server must ensure that their logical unit numbers are different. If the LUN field in the RMC descriptor is the same as that for another logical unit and both of their ENABLE bits are one, then the ADC device server will report an invalid field in the parameter data, with sense data indicating the LUN field in a descriptor other than that for the RMC logical unit. >> should be << If multiple logical units are enabled for reporting on the DTD primary ports, then the ADC device server ensures that their logical unit numbers are different. If the LUN field in the RMC descriptor is the same as that for another logical unit and both of their ENABLE bits are set to one, then the ADC device server reports an invalid field in the parameter data, with sense data indicating the LUN field in a descriptor other than that for the RMC logical unit. >>
HP	264	E			66	A.4.4.2 SMC logical unit descriptor	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers
HP	265	E			66	A.4.4.3 ADC logical unit descriptor	Add a title to the table, add a header row, and fix the row numbers

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
IBM Penokie	497	E			66	A.4.4.2 SMC logical unit descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	498	E			66	A.4.4.2 SMC logical unit descriptor	The field name << ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH >> should be << ADDITIONAL LENGTH >>
IBM Penokie	499	E			66	A.4.4.3 ADC logical unit descriptor	The statement << Because the automation application client does not wish the ADC device server to appear on the DTD primary ports, it sets the ENABLE field to zero. >> should be << Because the automation application client does not require that the ADC device server appear on the DTD primary ports, it sets the ENABLE bit to zero. >>
IBM Penokie	500	E			66	A.4.4.3 ADC logical unit descriptor	The table in this section has no table title. This needs to be fixed and then a reference to the table needs to be added.
IBM Penokie	501	E			66	A.4.4.3 ADC logical unit descriptor	The field name << ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTOR LENGTH >> should be << ADDITIONAL LENGTH >>
ADIC	1	E	C	6b	glbl		Five occurrences of "library" throughout. Should be changed to "automation device"
Quantum	1	E	C	6b	glbl		It would helpful to implementers if when fields are defined in paragraph format, the first phrase in the first sentence of the paragraph contain the name of the field to be defined.
Seagate	7	E	C	6a	glbl	*	Are one-bit fields "fields" or "bits"? Standard usage, if any.
IBM Butt	2	T	A			Drive Error Log	Add a method to force and retrieve a drive error log (dump)
HP	17	Q	C	6b			Should drive behaviour relating to host SCSI load command issued when library has seated the cartridge but not threaded be part of spec or not?
HP	266	Q	R				What about f/w upgrade cartridge handling - containing drive images, controller images, images for other drives, invalid firmware images, image copying. Not sure to what extent this is covered in the spec
HP	267	Q	C	6b			Is there a means to report media type?
HP	268	Q	R				Should there be special provision for FC port failover?
HP	269	Q	R				Is the case when the drive powers up and may not responding covered (e.g. powered up with cartridges loaded)?
HP	270	Q	R				Are there response time limits specified or is solely contained within transport layer spec?
1202			1104			91.85%	
E/T column indicates nature of comment: E = Editorial; T = Technical; I = Informational; Q = Question.							
S column indicates status of comment as follows:							
A = Comment accepted, changes not yet made							
R = Comment rejected, no change will be made (majority due to being superceded by other comment or edit)							
C = Changes complete in the indicated revision							

Company	#	E/T	S	Rev	Pg	Reference	Comment/Suggestion
P = Partially accepted and complete in the indicated revision							
D = Initially discussed, not closed yet							
Rev column indicates which draft revision change was made.							
Sorted by PDF page number to help identify duplicate comments and consolidate resolution.							
			12	Accepted, need to complete			
			833	Completed			
			143	Rejected			
			115	Partially accepted and completed			
			1	Discussing			
			1104	Reviewed			
			98	Remain			