Minutes of the SBP-3 Working Group meeting, November 5-6, 2002
Hilton Waterfront Hotel, Huntington Beach

Attendees:

Eric Anderson Apple ewa@apple.com
Andy Green Oxford Semiconductor andy.green@oxsemi.com
Peter Johansson Congruent Software Pjohansson@ACM.org

The following agenda was presented by Johansson. In the minutes that follow, the start of discussion of items listed below is denoted by the index number listed within square brackets, such as [4.1]. Note that these references do not always appear in order, and may not signify the conclusion of discussion of a previous agenda item.

1. Introductions and procedures
   1.1 T10 Membership and voting
   1.2 Document naming conventions
   1.3 Two-week rule
   1.4 Meeting fees
   1.5 Approval of prior minutes (02-282r0)
2. Call for patents
3. Informal liaison
   3.1 IEEE P1394.1 [Johansson]
   3.2 IEEE P1394.3 [Johansson]
   3.3 PTP on SBP [Anderson]
4. Prior action items
   4.1 Review draft in re bridge-aware login when no bridges are present [Fuller]
   4.2 Request Apple comment on 02-281r0 [Anderson]
   4.3 Request Microsoft comment on 02-281r0 [Johansson]
5. Review of changes in working draft
6. Review reflector traffic
7. Old business
   7.1 Bare-bones isochronous [Johansson]
8. New business
   8.1 Review draft in re bridge-aware login when no bridges are present
8.2 Retry strategies [1394 TA Technical Bulletin]
8.3 Editorial review of draft (page turner)
9. Meeting schedule
10. Review of action items
11. Adjournment

[1] Johansson called the meeting to order and updated the agenda, as reflected above.

[1.3] Johansson briefly reviewed the two-week rule, explaining that it did not prevent the discussion of documents posted less than two weeks before a meeting.

[1.5] Anderson noted that he had previously distributed draft minutes from July 16-17 (Colorado Springs). The group approved the minutes from that meeting.

ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.02/02-282r0.pdf

[1.1] [2] Johansson reviewed general T10 policies and procedures. In general, attendance and participation at T10 ad hoc meetings (such as this one) is open to both visitors and T10 members. When formal votes are taken, either in an ad hoc meeting or in the T10 plenary, one vote is permitted each organization, to be cast by its principal representative or designated alternative. A two-week rule is in effect: No matter may be voted on unless notice was given at least two weeks prior. Documents to be voted on must have been posted two weeks prior to the vote. The two-week rule can be waived if nobody objects. Announcements of new documents and meetings must be posted to the T10 email reflector; all other business can be conducted on the working group reflector.

The following paragraph about ANSI/T10 patent policy is copied from past T10 Plenary minutes:


[3.1] Johansson reported that the IEEE 1394.1 BRC had a very productive meeting October 28-30 in New York. Johansson said that the group appeared to have resolved all open issues, but extensive editing would still be required in order to incorporate the changes. Johansson predicted completion (and
recirculation) in one or at most two more meetings. Johansson also noted that the group planned to specify enhancements to output plug control registers to permit the use of speed codes indicating s800 and higher speeds.

[3.2] Johansson noted that Alan Berkema, acting chair of IEEE 1394.3 had, in principle, resolved all unresolved comments. Johansson anticipated that recirculation could be performed soon.

[3.3] Anderson reported that the 1394 Trade Association and the I3A had agreed to a joint work project to specify a transport for the Picture Transport Protocol (PTP) over SBP. Anderson noted that his presentation would be uploaded to the 1394 TA and I3A/IT-10 web sites later in the week, and welcomed feedback.

[4.1] Johansson noted that Fuller was not present and suggested the group conduct a review of bridge-aware login as new business. This became [8.1].

[4.2] [4.3] Action items for comment on 02-281r0 were carried over.

Action: Anderson to review 02-281r0 with Apple and provide comment.

Action: Johansson to request similar consideration from Microsoft.

[5] Johansson led a review of changes in SBP-3 draft "2b":


In section 5.1.2 the group discussed at length the wording regarding the isochronous bit in an ORB. The existing wording was agreed to be somewhat confusing. Johansson agreed to reword the text.

In 5.1.3.3, Green suggested that task set IDs should be explicitly required to be unique within a Target. Everyone agreed to add this requirement.

Anderson related at least two instances of SBP-2 devices that ignored the page-table present bit and attempted to transfer data at the page table address for auxiliary commands, because the device implementer evidently did not anticipate that a page table would be used for such as small data transfer. Johansson offered to add advisory text if Anderson provided some.

After extensive study, the first note in section 8.2.1 was agreed to be correct, yet very difficult to understand. Johansson improved the text by rearranging it.
The group revisited the recently-added text in 8.3.3 requiring a GUID confirmation after self-ID analysis, and the reasoning for this requirement, but made no changes.

Anderson and Johansson made minor wording changes to 9.1.5 in the hope of avoiding confusion.

Anderson questioned the change in the fifth paragraph of 10.5, asking if an Initiator that had requested a bridge-aware login would be surprised to find that the Target had ignored a net update because both were on the same bus. Johansson observed that the preceding paragraph was also not entirely correct because of the possibility that the bus reset it discussed could have been caused by a net update. Johansson added text to clarify these points.


The group reviewed an email discussion triggered by the group's previous consideration of busy retry and the BUSY TIMEOUT register. The group decided to review the technical bulletin that the 1394 TA Architecture working group was preparing on this topic to see how well it applied to SBP. This became [8.2].

The group reviewed several letters regarding confusion over the use of 1394 transaction code "E" for internal (on-media) representation of isochronous data, and all present agreed that a packet with such a transaction code was not specified to appear on the 1394 bus.

[8.1] The group reviewed section 8.2.1 but found no problems that would happen in the absence of a bridge. Green noted that in the absence of any bridge, a Target could not receive a login with a global node ID as its source ID. The action item previously given to Fuller was considered to be complete.

[8.2] The group reviewed 1394 TA TB2002002 and decided to incorporate parts of it, with changes, directly into SBP-3, rather than waiting to reference the future TA document. Anderson noted a previous suggestion that the BUSY_TIMEOUT register, though deprecated, should continue to accept read and write requests, to minimize the chance of confusing a legacy Initiator: Read requests could return a fixed value that most closely represents the device's behaviors, while write requests would be ignored but completed without error (ack_complete or resp_complete). Johansson said he would add the related parts to a new section 6.3.

[7.1] Johansson suggested that the addition of Config ROM entries to indicate the presence of input and/or output plug control registers could make the existing
SBP-3 isochronous mechanisms complete enough for simple use, while still permitting more complex control through command-set-specific mechanisms.

Johansson added a Fast Start key to the sample Configuration ROM for a SCSI Target in section F.2.

[8.3] The group performed a "page turner" review of the document and made numerous small clarifications. Significant changes are mentioned here.

Anderson observed that section 6 made no mention of 1394.1 bridge-awareness registers that a Target might require. Johansson agreed to study adding appropriate content to 6.1 or 6.2.

The group found various confusion in section 5.1.2 regarding ORB fields that describe data transfer (such as direction) when isochronous transfer was specified, especially when both isochronous and asynchronous transfer were specified. Green observed that the dual-buffer ORB did not have an isochronous bit and asked if it should have one, or perhaps even two, and could optionally be used as a better way to express and ORB with both isochronous and asynchronous transfer. Everyone agreed to this change.

The group discussed the unnumbered figure in section 5.1.2 showing the possible combination of in and out directional bits in a dual-buffer ORB, and reworded the figure to make it more clear.

The group concluded the page-turner work at the end of section 5.1.2 (r02b).

[9] The next scheduled meeting is January 20-21, following the January 2003 1394 TA meeting in Wailea, HI.

[10] Johansson briefly reviewed the newly assigned action items. There was one, for Johansson to incorporate plug control register information into the configuration ROM.

General information and document index

The SBP-3 email reflector SBP3@isg.apple.com can be accessed as follows:

Subscribing:
email requests@isg.apple.com w/subject "subscribe sbp3"

Help?:
email requests@isg.apple.com w/subject "help"

An automated system had been created for the allocation of T10 document numbers, and the subsequent submission of documents for posting:

http://www.t10.org/members/ad.htm

The following documents have been posted pertaining to SBP-3:

00-328  Eric Anderson
Fast Start proposal (PowerPoint slides)
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.00/00-328r0.pdf

00-371  Peter Johansson
Minutes of SBP-3 Study Group  September 19, 2000
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.00/00-371r0.pdf

00-388  Peter Johansson
SBP-3 Project Proposal
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.00/00-388r0.pdf

01-057  Eric Anderson
Fast Start Proposal
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-057r0.pdf

01-060  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group  January 24-25, 2001
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-060r0.pdf

01-067  Lance Flake
RBC Access For AV/C Data Interchange
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-067r0.pdf
01-069  Steve Powers
Surprise Removal of 1394 Storage Devices
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-069r0.pdf

01-070  Peter Johansson
Bridge-aware targets and node handles
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-070r0.pdf

01-101  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group  March 6-7, 2001
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-101r0.pdf

01-102  Scott Smyers
Proposal for modifications to SBP3 and RBC
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-102r0.pdf

01-103  Firooz Farhoodmand
Using SBP-3 for DVD playback
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-103r0.pdf

01-137  Peter Johansson
Stream command block ORB
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-137r0.pdf

01-138  Peter Johansson
Bi-directional ORBs (PowerPoint slides)
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-138r0.pdf

01-139  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group  April 26-27, 2001
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-139r0.pdf

01-179  Andy Green
Proposal to modify isochronous recording format
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-179r0.pdf

01-180  Peter Johansson
RBC-2 commands for extent management

01-187  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group  June 5-6, 2001
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-187r0.pdf
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document Number</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>URL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01-200</td>
<td>Peter Johansson</td>
<td>Distributed Buffers</td>
<td>ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-200r0.pdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01-222</td>
<td>Peter Johansson</td>
<td>Simplified Isochronous</td>
<td>ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-222r0.pdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01-287</td>
<td>Peter Johansson</td>
<td>Bare-bones Isochronous</td>
<td>ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-287r1.pdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01-304</td>
<td>John Fuller</td>
<td>SBP3 Changes</td>
<td>ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-304r0.pdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01-318</td>
<td>Rob Elliott</td>
<td>Elimination of SCSI-2 from SAM-2 SPC-3</td>
<td>ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-318r0.pdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01-331</td>
<td>Eric Anderson</td>
<td>Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group November 6-7, 2001</td>
<td>ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-331r0.pdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01-332</td>
<td>Scott Smyers</td>
<td>Isochronous SBP-3</td>
<td>ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.01/01-332r0.pdf</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
02-069  Peter Johansson
Bridge-aware SBP-3 target operations
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.02/02-069r2.pdf

02-075  Peter Johansson
EUI-48 software interface ID VPD page

02-206  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group January 21-22, 2002
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.02/02-206r0.pdf

02-207  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group March 12-13, 2002
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.02/02-207r0.pdf

02-208  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group May 29-30, 2002
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.02/02-208r0.pdf

02-281  Peter Johansson
Prototype AVD Commands

02-282  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group July 16-17, 2002
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.02/02-282r0.pdf

02-480  Eric Anderson
Minutes of SBP-3 Working Group November 5-6, 2002
ftp://ftp.t10.org/t10/document.02/02-480r0.pdf

Latest draft SBP-3 document:


[end]