

T10/02-187.r0 MMC Working Group Minutes - Wednesday 1 May 2002

Document: T10/02-187.r0
Subject: MMC Working Group Minutes - Wednesday 1 May 2002

From: Bill McFerrin, MMC WG Chair
To: T10 Members
Date: 3 May 2002

MMC Working Group Minutes - Wednesday 1 May 2002
9:00 AM - 5:00 PM

T10 Meeting week at:
Sheraton Nashua Hotel
11 Tara Boulevard
Nashua, New Hampshire
Phone: (US) 603 888-9970

Hosted by: Hitachi Cable Manchester, Inc., Zane Daggett

1.0 Opening Remarks

Bill McFerrin opened the meeting at 9:15AM

1) This meeting has been authorized by INCITS T10 and will be conducted under the NCITS rules. Ad hoc meetings take no final actions, but prepare recommendations for approval by the NCITS task group. The voting rules for the meeting are those of the parent committee, INCITS T10. For the ad hoc, other than straw votes, the voting rules are: one vote per participating company.

2) The minutes of this meeting will be posted to the T10 Reflector and will be included in the next T10 committee mailing. Attendance at a working group meeting does not count toward minimum attendance requirements for T10 membership. Working group meetings are open to any person or company to attend and to express their opinion on the subjects being discussed.

2.0 Introductions

Attendees:

Tim Bradshaw	IOMEGA
Emily Hill	MICROSOFT
Terry Nelson	PANASONIC AMERICA
Bill McFerrin	PHILIPS
Masaetsu Takahashi	RICOH
Masaaki Nakagawa	RICOH
Greg Frey	ROXIO
Norichika Mine	SONY

3.0 Document Distribution

MMC-4 Draft revision 1b (MMC4R01B.PDF) was distributed to attendees by the MMC-4 technical editor (Bill McFerrin).

A DVD+MRW format overview and command set document was provided to attendees by Philips (Bill McFerrin).

The firmware creation date feature proposal was provided to attendees by Microsoft (Emily Hill).

These will be assigned T10 document numbers and posted to the T10 web site within one week.

4.0 Call for Patents

None.

5.0 Approval of Agenda

Approved.

6.0 Old Business

No report on MMC-2 or MMC-3.

During the t10 plenary, it was announced that the MMC-3 vote closes on May 10. If it passes, ANSI editors should begin working on the document during June.

7.0 New Business

7.1 Review the MMC-4 draft revision 1b.

7.1.1 Review Clauses 1, 2, 3, and 4 - check again for errors/exclusions

Several comments from revision 1a were corrected. Additional changes were accepted as minor corrections for revision 1c.

7.1.2 Review new version of clause 6 (parameters)

Apply corrections to Write Parameters mode page.

7.2 New proposals for inclusion in MMC-4.

7.2.1 DVD+MRW Presentation

Bill McFerrin walked the DVD+MRW format overview and presented specific changes to the command set.

7.2.2 Firmware Information Feature Descriptor

Emily Hill reviewed this proposal in detail.

7.2.3 Proposals for obsolescence

Send Event command - No opposition
Set CD Speed command - Strong concerns
Pause/Resume command - No opposition
Mode page 0Dh - No opposition
Mode page 2Ah - Strong concerns

Discussion, Set CD Speed:

It was determined that Set CD Speed is not actually replaced by the Set Streaming command. Set Streaming is described as being associated with the READ (12) with the streaming bit set to 1. Set CD Speed provides a control over the physical spindle speed. So, rather than remove Set CD Speed, it was decided that the name should be changed to Set Speed and extend the definition to all MMC specified media.

Discussion, Obsolete:

Principally, the problem with any command, mode page or capability is the potential for loss of compatibility in legacy systems. T10 does not officially require the use of "obsolete". T13 defines "obsolete" differently as well. The MMC WG is allowed to remove or change the definition. We do not wish to create more confusion with a new definition of "obsolete", so the definition shall be removed from

T10/02-187.r0 MMC Working Group Minutes - Wednesday 1 May 2002

MMC and create an official term "legacy". This shall refer to commands, mode pages and fields that are not preferred. All such commands, mode pages, and fields shall be moved to an annex named "Legacy Specifications" that carries the following rules:

- Once any behavior is placed in the Legacy Specifications annex, its definition shall not be changed.
- Legacy behavior documented in the Legacy Specifications annex may be removed only when there are zero public review objections.

MMC4R01B shall be updated to reflect this change and posted to the T10 web site as R01C.

8.0 Review of Action Items - Plan for next revision of MMC-4 draft

Bill McFerrin shall apply corrections to errors discovered during review of revision 1b to revision 1c.

Bill McFerrin shall post the corrected version of 1b to the t10 web site.

Bill McFerrin shall continue working according to the MMC-4 development schedule and post revision 01D to the T10 web site by July 1.

Bill McFerrin to plan presentation of DVD+R format overview and command set at July meeting.

Emily Hill to review modification proposals of Firmware Information Feature descriptor and bring updated proposal to July meeting.

9.0 Future Meeting Schedule

T10 Meeting week at:
Wyndham Colorado Springs Hotel
5580 Tech Center Drive
Colorado Springs, Colorado 80919
Phone: (719) 260-1800 Fax: (719) 260-1492

Hosted by: LSI Logic, John Lohmeyer

10.0 Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 4:15PM.

Regards,
Bill McFerrin, (CD Edge, Inc) for Philips Electronics, NA
720-320-0790