Joint T10/T11.3 Activity Working Group AdHoc Meeting Minutes   T11/00-167v1.pdf
Dallas, Texas, March 6, 2000
Revised April 5, 2000
Stewart Wyatt, Secretary

1. Introductions   Dale LaFollette

The facilitator, Dale LaFollette called the meeting to order at 9AM. He thanked TI for hosting the meeting and had the participants introduce themselves.

2. Approve this agenda: T11/00-138v0   Dale LaFollette

Approved as modified in these minutes.

3. Approve 01/13/00 minutes: T11/00-118v0   Stewart Wyatt

Approved with two amendments as noted in reflector traffic. Stewart will issue revised minutes with the corrections.

4. Review Old Action Items: Stewart Wyatt

#1. Carl Zeitler – Update the Out-Of-Order proposal drawings in T10/00-137r0. Completed
#2. Carl Zeitler – Determine the correct response to a lost ACK: BA_RJT or BA_ACC. On today's agenda
#3. Bob Snively – End exchange cases in FC-PH does not include the class 3 case of lost FCP_CONF. Needs to be added to FC-FS. Check for other cases. On going
#5. Paul Suhler – SSC letter ballot comment requesting restoring the Set Capacity command. Paul will investigate some other means of limiting the available capacity of a large tape. Completed and on today's agenda
#6. Neil Wanamaker – Revise proposal defining behavior with both target and initiator bits set in PRLI. Ongoing
#7. Paul Suhler – Revise proposal for Large Block Addresses in the SSC. Completed
#8. Charles Binford: Proposal to notify initiators of cleared commands to be taken to the SCSI working group. On going
#9. Bob Snively: Include revised Annex E (T11/99-340v3) in the next revision of the FCP-2. Completed in FCP-2 revision 4. This item is still open and the subject of a letter ballot comment. Closed
#10. Bill Martin: Bob Snively requests that Bill Martin review the Out-Of-Order proposal looking for corner case problems. Bob has not made the request to Bill

+++ T10 +++
5. New Business

    A. SSC Large Block Addresses T10/00-135r1 Paul Suhler

Paul reviewed his proposal. Dale asked for a vote of acceptance for a future revision of the SSC. George suggested that it be taken to the plenary for a vote. Ralph will reserve the op codes.

Dale LaFollette made the motion that this working group propose to the T10 plenary to accept this proposal, 00-135r1 as amended, for inclusion in a future version of the SSC (SSC-2). Paul Suhler seconded the motion, which passed with 9 in favor, 0 opposed and 1 abstained.

    B.   SSC Public Review Comment T10/00-159r0 Paul Suhler

Paul considered several options using mode pages. He found none of them to be acceptable. Neil Wanamaker was concerned that mode pages would apply to the device and not to the medium. In this case and some others the mode page should apply exclusively to that particular medium. There was some discussion on that point. After considering the options, Paul Suhler recommended that the Set Capacity command be revived for a future version of the SSC.

Paul made a motion that this working group recommend that T10 reject his public review comment and consider the concept proposed in the comment for inclusion in a future version of the SSC. Seconded by Dale LaFollette. For 10, opposed 0, abstained 3.

    C. New version of the SSC.

Dale noted that Dave Peterson has indicated that he would be willing to be the editor of a new version of the SSC. Dave also will start the preparation of a new project proposal for SSC-2 to be presented in a future T10 working group meeting.

+++T11.3+++
6. New Business
    A. BA_ACC Carl Zeitler T11/00-133v1

Carl worked through some overheads to define the issue. A discussion followed about how a target would avoid confusing a new command with the same OX-ID, with the previous one with the missing ACK – a unique RX-ID is required. Charles Binford and Bob Snively looked at some multiple frame loss cases which complicated sorting out the exchanges. As the discussion began to bog down, Carl said he would take it off line and sort the issues out.

    B. R_R_TOV Carl Zeitler T11/00-145v0

Carl reported that this issue resulted from a conversation with Rob Basham (IBM). After a discussion about recovering resources in Class 3 after an error, the conclusion was reached that RR_TOV needs to be lengthened. Carl's example assumed an FCP-RSP is lost and then the SRR is lost also. Carl calculated the minimum RR_TOV to recover from this double error and it needs to be 7*REC_TOV. Do we increase the timeout for the

double error case or consider it an unrecoverable error and abort the exchange? Carl prefers changing RR_TOV.

Charles Binford asked it we would have an in-order timeout shorter than an out-of-order timeout? Carl said he would prefer one set of values that everyone uses. Carl suggested that action be deferred until next month and that the group review the proposal.

+++Joint T10/T11.3+++
7. FCP-2 T10 Working Drafts FCP2R04 Bob Snively
Letter Ballot Results/Comments T10/00-005r0
Letter Ballot Comments T10/00-150r1

Bob wants to cover all technical comments as perceived by either him or the commenter and all editorial comments that he disagrees with.

Bob has color coded his letter ballot comments document. The black text is unresolved editorial comments while the red text is unresolved technical comments. Blue text are comments that have been resolved and accepted.

George Penokie and Ralph Weber discussed whether the FCP-2 should reference another document by mnemonic or number? The decision was to use the mnemonics.

George Penokie noted that killing the MCM proposal reverts Mode Page 19 to its original length. Bob agreed and will correct the text.

Bob spent the rest of the meeting and the following SCSI Protocol   meeting reviewing the comments from Crossroads and HP.

8. New Business

+++Admin+++
9. Next Meeting Requirements Dale LaFollette

Dale commented that we will need all the time we can get in the next meeting.

10 Review New Action Items: Stewart Wyatt

New Action Items:
#1 Paul Suhler – Revise proposal for SET CAPACITY command, T10/00-161r0.
#2 Ralph Weber – will take the recommendations to the plenary made in today's meeting to the SCSI plenary.
#3 Carl Zeitler – Continue BA_ACC discussion off line and return with a proposal
#4 Group – Review Carl's proposal extending RR_TOV proposal for action next month
#5 Dave Peterson – Create and champion new SSC version proposal

Old Forwarded Action Items:

#6 Bob Snively – FS end exchange cases needs to include class 3 of lost FCP_CONF. Check for other new end exchange cases.
#7 Neil Wanamaker – Revise proposal defining behavior when both target and initiator bits are set in PRLI.
#8 Charles Binford – Proposal for target to inform initiator of cleared commands.
#9 Bob Snively – Request Bill Martin to review out-of-order proposal for corner case problems.

11. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at noon.

Note: FCP-2 Letter Ballot Comment Resolution will continue in the SCSI Protocol meeting from 1-6 PM!

Attendance:

Dale LaFollette	StorageTek	Erich Oetting	StorageTek
Bob Snively	SUN	Carl Zeitler	Compaq
Stewart Wyatt	HP	Paul Suhler	Seagate
Jim Coomes	Seagate	Matt Wakeley	HP/Agilient
Arlan Stone	UNISYS	Pak Seto	Quantum
Neil Wanamaker	Crossroads Systems	John Tyndall	Crossroads Systems
Gene Milligan	Seagate	Ralph Weber	ENDL
Nathan Hastad	General Dynamics Information Systems		
Eugene Lew	Fujitsu	George Penokie	IBM
Charles Binford	LSI Logic	Pak Seto	Quantum
Mike Fitzpatrick	Fujitsu CPA	Paul Aloisi	TI
John Scheible	IBM		