

Accredited Standards Committee
NCITS, National Committee for Information Technology Standards

Doc: T10a/97a101r5
Date: March 28, 1997
Project: X3T10.1/1147D
Ref. Doc.: SSA-TL2 rev 4
Reply to: John Scheible

To: T10 Membership
From: John Scheible

Subject: Letter ballot comment resolution on SSA-TL2 rev 4

BACKGROUND

This proposal documents the responses to the T10 letter ballot comments for SSA-TL2 rev 4 as approved by T10.1 during its February 26, 1997 plenary meeting. Revision 1 of this document includes the modifications made in the X3T10 meeting.

Ballot totals:

43 Yes
2 No
0 Abstain
1 Organization(s) did not vote
46 Total voting organizations
3 Ballot(s) included comments

This 2/3rds majority ballot passed.

Comments attached to YesC ballot from John P. Scheible of IBM Corp.:

RESPONSE: Accept all as written with modifications to IBM-19) and IBM-20) as shown.

I consider all comments editorial (E) except for 9, 18, 19, and 20.

IBM-1) Global: Change ((to [(and)] to)) . Also (s.) to (s)].

IBM-2) Change <any letter>(to <any letter> (to add a space.

IBM-3) Table of tables: Change heading from Table to Tables (plural).

IBM-4) Table of tables: Table numbers for 41-60 should be bold.

IBM-5) Introduction: Change Clause 4 contains to Clause 4 defines for consistency.

IBM-6) 3.2: Add abbreviation OUI (Organizationally Unique Identifier).

IBM-7) 4, last paragraph: Change Figures and tables (highest) take precedence over text (lowest). to In case of conflict, figures take precedence over tables and both figures and tables take precedence over text.

IBM-8) end of 6.2: Change (see 0) to (see 9.5) . Also applies to end of 7.2.7 and 7.2.8.

IBM-9) 9.3, paragraph after pseudocode: Change Channels 0- 127 are addressed one byte. Channels 129-16 383 to Channels 0 - 127 are addressed one byte. Channels 128 - 16 383 (128 was left out).

IBM-10) 10.2.3, fifth para, end first sentence: change .). to).

IBM-11) Table 20, first column: Change small caps to all caps (values, not field names).

IBM-12) 10.3, add semicolon to d) first list, add period to e) of second list.

- IBM-13) 10.4.1, c): Change Ready State to Ready state (lower case S).
- IBM-14) 10.6: Change TL2 to SSA-TL2 (global).
- IBM-15) 11.1.3, element h): Change mod to modulo (two places) to match I).
- IBM-16) Table 29, sixth row from end: Should not be bold.
- IBM-17) Table 32, bottom of byte 12: should be solid line, not dotted.
- IBM-18) Table 37, version 00h: Change SSA-TL1 implementations before standardization to Implementations prior to standardization. Since version 00h is not SSA-TL1.
- IBM-19) Table 37, version 04h: Change SSA-IA/96PH to either reserved or SSA-IA/97PH depending on whether the SSA-IA plans to document this version. Confusion will occur since someone may try to obtain the non-existent document.
RESPONSE: Change SSA-IA96 (04) to reserved.
- IBM-20) 12.2.7, SSA-TL paragraph: Correct name, add if possible and add examples, by changing:
 The SSA-TL field defined in Table 37 identifies the version of SSA-TL being used by the sender. If multiple levels of SSA-TL are supported, then highest value shall be reported that is equal to or less than the SSA-TL field in the associated QUERY NODE SMS.
 to:
 The SSA-TL VERSION field defined in Table 37 identifies the version of SSA-TL being used by the sender. If multiple levels of SSA-TL are supported and any are numerically less than the SSA-TL VERSION field of the QUERY NODE SMS, then the highest value shall be reported in the QUERY NODE REPLY SMS that is equal to or less than the SSA-TL VERSION field in the associated QUERY NODE SMS.
 The following are examples:
 a) An SSA-TL1/SSA-TL2 Configurator sends a QUERY NODE SMS indicating an SSA-TL version of SSA-TL2. An SSA-TL1 only node responds with a QUERY NODE REPLY SMS indicating SSA-TL1. The Configurator now knows to use SSA-TL1 to communicate with the node.
 b) An SSA-TL1/SSA-TL2 Configurator sends a QUERY NODE SMS indicating an SSA-TL version of SSA-TL2. An SSA-TL1/SSA-TL2 or SSA-TL2 only node responds with a QUERY NODE REPLY SMS indicating SSA-TL2. The Configurator now knows to use SSA-TL2 to communicate with the node.
 c) An SSA-TL1 only Configurator sends a QUERY NODE SMS indicating an SSA-TL version of SSA-TL1. An SSA-TL1/SSA-TL2 node responds with a QUERY NODE REPLY SMS indicating SSA-TL1. The Responder now knows to use SSA-TL1 to communicate with the node.
 d) An SSA-TL1 only Configurator sends a QUERY NODE SMS indicating an SSA-TL version of SSA-TL1. An SSA-TL2 only node responds with a QUERY NODE REPLY SMS indicating SSA-TL2. The Configurator now knows it cannot communicate with the node, and does not register with it.
RESPONSE: Make two minor changes as shown above.
- IBM-21) 12.2.7, LONG bit paragraph: Remove the extraneous (.
- IBM-22) Table 53, blank rows between byte 3 and 4 should be removed.

Comments attached to No ballot from Edward A. Gardner of Ophidian Designs:

- OPH-1) I am uncomfortable with VLSI's negative vote remaining unresolved. I would like to see X3T10.1 respond to that vote and comment before forwarding this for review. If X3T10.1 has already responded to VLSI's vote, please refer me to the relevant document and I will amend my vote.

RESPONSE: Add and implementer's note after 8, paragraph 6 (Brad Kitson (VLSI) would change his vote to Yes based on this response)

Note n: Hardware implementers should allow at least 16 bytes (excluding CRC) of dedicated buffer space for future extensions to the Link Reset and Extended Link Reset frames .

Comments attached to No ballot from Gene Milligan of Seagate Technology:

RESOLUTION: (see each comment)

- SEA-1) The ballot does not show what the response was to the X3T10.1 "NO" ballot.
RESPONSE: See OPH-1 above.
- SEA-2) The ballot does not indicate why Rev 4 is being forwarded when X3T10.1 ballotted to forward Rev 3.
RESPONSE: T10.1 voted to forward Rev 3 as modified, and instructed the editor to create rev 4 with those modifications.
- SEA-3) The draft should have an editorial review checking at least for the appropriate use of key words (e.g. this drafts contains at least three musts and fifteen cans.
RESPONSE: Replace must with shall in 9.4.1 para 2, 13.1.1 second bullets a) and e). Replace can with may in 10.1.1 para 2, 10.1.7 para 1, 10.1.8 para 1, Table 19 note, 10.2.4 para 6, 10.4.2 bullets d) f) h), 12.2.12 last para, 13.1.1 para 1, B.4.2 para 1, B.4.3 para 1 and 3. Replace can with shall in 12.2.16 bullet a). Replace it can with the REGION IDENTIFIER field may in 12.2.17 para 4. Replace could with may in 13.1.1 para 1 and second bullet f), 10.2.4 para 2, and 13.3.2 para 1.
- SEA-4) If someone impliments SSA-TL2 and an appropriate selection of the other SSA drafts will they be interoperable with the defacto installed base of SSA subsystems? (This is a question and not the basis for the NO - see comments 1-3.)
RESPONSE: Yes, the different levels of PH1 / PH2, TL1 / TL2, and S2P / S3P may interoperate and co-exist on the same loop simultaneously. The physical layers may connect to each other and speed matching is done on a link by link basis. The transport layers identify themselves in the QUERY NODE and QUERY NODE REPLY SMSs. Likewise the S2P and S3P layers identify themselves in the QUERY NODE REPLY SMS and whichever protocol layer is needed may be used between different source and destination pairs.

Web page access

X3T10.1 is planning web sites to disseminate information regarding the implementation of the standard. The following changes will be made:

- 1) Add the following to the end of clause 2.2
Further information regarding the implementation of this standard may be available at <http://www.ncits.org/t10> or <http://www.ssaia.org>.
- 2) Add the following note to Tables 6, 29, 37, and B.5:
Add a table note: NOTE - This table is accurate as of the time of publication. Further information may be available at the web sites (see 2.2).

Sincerely,

John Scheible

Voice: (512) 823-8208

FAX: (512) 838-3822

Email: Scheible@vnet.ibm.com