Accredited Standards Committee
X3, Information Processing Systems

Doc: X3T10.1/96a103r1
Date: January 30, 1997
Project: X3T10.1/1051D
Ref Doc.: SSA-S3P rev 4
Reply to: John Scheible

To: X3T10.1 Membership
From: John Scheible

Subject: Letter ballot comment resolution on SSA-S3P rev 4

BACKGROUND

This proposal documents the responses to the X3T10 letter ballot for SSA-S3P rev 4. Revision 1 is my attempt to address the concerns and does not represent the agreement of the X3T10.1 group.

Ballot totals:

43 Yes
 2 No
 0 Abstain
 1 Organization(s) did not vote
46 Total voting organizations
 3 Ballot(s) included comments

This 2/3rds majority ballot passed.

Comments attached to YesC ballot from John P. Scheible of IBM Corp.:

RESPONSE: Accept as written all comments (IBM-1 thru IBM-10)

IBM-1)   Change Header from "X3T10.1 / 1051D revision 3" to "X3T10.1 / 1051D revision 4"

IBM-2)   1.1.1: Change "(project X3T10.1/1121)" to "(X3.294:1996)".

IBM-3)   1.1.2: Change "(project X3T10.1/0989)" to "(X3.295:1996)".

IBM-4)   1.1.3: Change "(project X3T10.1/1145)" to "(X3.293:1996)".

IBM-5)   1.1.4: Change "(project X3T10.1/1051)" to "(project X3T10.1/1051, this standard)".

IBM-6)   4: Add "In case of conflict, figures take precedence over tables and both figures and tables take precedence over text."

IBM-7)   8.5, five places: Change "I_T nexus" to "I_T nexus or I_T_L nexus". 8.5 is uses the term I_T nexus in 5 places when referencing by 6.11 (ABORT TASK SMS), 6.12 (ABORT TASK SET SMS), 6.13 (CLEAR TASK SET SMS), and 6.15 (LOGICAL UNIT RESET SMS) which refers to an I_T_L nexus. However it is also referenced to by 6.14 (TARGET RESET SMS) for an I_T nexus.

IBM-8)   8.5, bullet c): Add "LOGICAL UNIT RESET" to the list.

IBM-9)   C.1.6, bullet b): the reference to the OOT bit in "7.4", should be "6.6" (SCSI COMMAND SMS).

IBM-10) D.1.2, third paragraph: the reference to "7.2" should be "6.2" (SMS validation). The reference is not automated, and should be.

Comments attached to No ballot from Edward A. Gardner of Ophidian Designs:

OPH-1) It appears, from the ballot, that VLSI's negative vote remains unresolved. I would like to see a response from X3T10.1 on VLSI's comment before approving this. If X3T10.1 has already responded to VLSI's comment, please refer me to the relevant document and I will amend my vote.

RESPONSE: VLSI's response only concerned SSA-TL2 related to adding a Unique ID to the Link Reset frame, and does not impact SSA-S3P. See SSA-TL2 comments for resolution.

Comments attached to No ballot from Gene Milligan of Seagate Technology:

SEA-1) The ballot does not indicate what the response was to the X3T10.1 NO ballot.
RESPONSE: VLSI's response only concerned SSA-TL2 related to adding a Unique ID to the Link Reset frame, and does not impact SSA-S3P. See SSA-TL2 comments for resolution.

SEA-2) The ballot does not indicate why Rev 4 is being forwarded when X3T10.1 balloted to forward Rev 3.
RESPONSE: X3T10.1 voted to forward Rev 3 as modified, and instructed the editor to create rev 4 with those modifications.

SEA-3) An editing session needs to review the document at least for proper use of key words (e.g. the draft has at least two musts and ten cans).
ACCEPTED RESPONSE: Change the following occurrences of "can" to "may" end 6.3, before table 10, second and third occurrences in 8.2, 8.3.3, D.2.2, D.2.3 second occurrence. Change first occurrence of 8.2 from "Can only come" to "comes". Before table 22 from "can now be released, and the" to "shall be released and any". D.2.3 from "can be" to "is". I could only find 1 must in C.1.5 which changes from "must" to "needs to".

SEA-4) This draft and the other SSA drafts need to have the cover page revised since the document is no longer an internal X3T10.1 document.
ACCEPTED RESPONSE: In the past, we have kept the X3T10.1 designation on the document until just before public review. The X3T10.1 cover page remains (and will be removed at publication), and the remainder of the document refers to the X3 number. The version with the letter ballot comments incorporated will have the X3 designation.

 Sincerely,

John Scheible
Voice: (512) 823-8208
FAX: (512) 838-3822
Email: Scheible@vnet.ibm.com