To: NCITS T10 Membership

Subject: MMC-2 Public Review Comments Document number

Document No.: T10/99-333R0

Date: November 3, 1999

As of the above date only two comments have been received by the working group. The responses were formulated by the working group during th November 2nd meeting and are included below.

Comment #1

From: Frank Rutherford <rutherf@concentric.net>

Sent: Tuesday, October 12, 1999 1:19 PM

Doc # T10/99-307r0

After reviewing the NCITS 333:19x draft proposed for "SCSI Multimedia Command -2 (MMC-2) I have a comment, maybe a question, on implementing the "CUE" command.

It appears that when the "CUE" sheet data form id CD-ROM XA, CD-1, that the only way to determine if Form 1 or Form 2 is to extract this information from the sub header. Is there a reason Data Form cannot specify Form type also?

RESPONSE: Rejected The sub-header is 8 bytes. It is actually a 4 byte field which is simply repeated. The form is one bit in within 4 bytes. The presumption is you only want to send 2048 (instead of 2056) bytes per sector or 2328 (instead of 2336) bytes per sector. If specification of form is provided together with those block sizes, there is no way to specify the other 31 bits of the sub-header?

****

Comment #2

Paul A Suhler

99/10/18 14:10

Subject: Partial Medium Load for MAM Access

This is a discussion that will lead to a set of proposals for changes to SSC, SBC, MMC, SMC, and SPC commands. The purpose is to provide support for all removable media devices to be able to do a quick load of a medium cartridge to access its Medium Auxiliary Memory, without necessarily having the primary medium become Ready. An example where this would be necessary would be a low-cost tape library which would have to load each tape into a drive to read its MAM.

Thanks to all at the tape working group meeting in Huntington Beach for their comments on my original proposal. It was pointed out to me that this is a useful concept that probably belongs in any command set for removable media devices.

This message is an outline of how we might address all of the issues. There are several areas to consider:

1. How to implement a "load-without-thread" operation in each relevant command set.

2. How to handle a cartridge that is inserted (by hand or by robot); i.e., don't load, load but don't thread, or load and thread.

3. What statuses to report, i.e., should loading without threading cause a Unit Attention with a new ASC/ASCQ?

So, here is my proposal. Please reply and let me know what you'd like to change. My terminology here will be imprecise; I'd like to establish consensus on the overall behavior before wordsmithing the actual changes. My goal is to have a complete set of suggested changes ready for the Monterey meeting.

        1.3 MMC

In the Load/Unload Medium command (A6h), byte 4 bit 2 will be defined as HOLD. When LOUNL = 1, START = 1, and HOLD = 1, move the medium into the drive to the Hold state. (An alternative would be to use the remaining reserved combination of LOUNL + START (01b) for this function.) When LOUNL = 1, START = 0, and HOLD = 1, prepare the medium for ejection by returning it to the Hold state.

All command sets except SSC use byte 4 bit 2; SSC uses bit 3. Is there any reason to make them all use the same bit in the same byte? (Bit 3 is available in all.)

Finally, I'm not sure that "Hold" is the best term. How about Medium Auxiliary Memory Accessible, abbreviated "MAMA"?

RESPONSE: Rejected. It is the opinion of the MMC working group that this bit is not required for multimedia devices. When loading CD or DVD media into changers there is no intermediate or hold position. The media is either loaded and ready to play/read or is not loaded at all.

****