

Minutes

T10 SBP-2 working group

T10 RBC working group

November 3, 1997

Attendees:

Jack Hollins	Adaptec	Mike Bryan	Seagate
Ron Roberts	Apple	Burt Wagner	Seagate
Peter Johansson	Congruent	Anthony Fung	SGS-Thomson
Don Vohar	Fujitsu	Danny Hui	SGS-Thomson
Dan Colegrove	IBM	Harry Hvostov	SGS-Thomson
Darrell Redford	Iomega	Steve Finch	SSI
Pete McLean	Maxtor	Frank Campbell	Solution Tech
John Fuller	Microsoft	Dave Evans	Symbios
Jake Berzon	NEC	Patrick Mercer	Syquest
Mark Evans	Quantum	Bill Frank	WD
		Jon Hanmann	WD

Pete McLean thanked Norm Harris and Adaptec for hosting the meeting.

As usual, those present introduced themselves.

It was explained that this meeting would operate under the ANSI NCITS T10 rules.

The agenda was reviewed.

The old action items were reviewed:

- 1) John Hanmann turn a rev of the Tailgate letter ballot response to T13 - completed.
- 2) All were to consider a proposal for expanding LBA address space - no proposals.
- 3) Pete McLean check on the sense code for SMART with Ralph Weber - completed.
- 4) Peter Johansson turn a rev of 97-256 (r1) and these were presented at the SCSI-3 working group - completed.
- 5) Mike Bryan turn a new rev of RBC - completed.
- 6) Peter Johansson turn a new rev of 97-245r0 SBP-2 security annex - completed.
- 7) Darrell Redford is to turn a new rev of removable commands proposal (see below)

Review of minutes (T10/97-259r0)

While reviewing the minutes of the last meeting Peter Johansson stated that he had been present at the meeting but had not been listed as present.

SBP-2 (T10/1155D)

Peter Johansson said that there was no response to the request for additional input for a bi-directional ORB from the printer folks and the issue was dropped.

It was resolved that there should be no option on the NOTIFY bit for management ORBs. Peter Johansson recommended that this be included in letter ballot comments if it was agreed to forward SBP-2 for letter ballot.

Pete McLean made the traditional call for patents specifically for SBP-2. Maxtor responded to the call and provided patent letter (T10/97-271r0) stating that they would abide by the ANSI patent policy.

A potential issue with patent 5375243 issued to Compaq for the use of passwords. Pete McLean will ask John Lohmeyer to write a letter to Compaq. It was mentioned that Gene Milligan had written a letter to Compaq on behalf of T13 and received the response from Compaq stating that they thought there was no infringement for the Security Mode feature set in ATA/ATAPI-4.

Peter Johansson moved that SBP-2 rev 3 be prepared by the editor and that this revision be recommended to the T10 plenary for letter balloting for forwarding to NCITS for further processing. Revision 3 shall be the same as revision 2h but without the change bars. The only changes between revision 2g and 2h are editorial and those approved for 97-245r1. Steve Finch seconded the motion.

Mark Evans asked if the isochronous portion was complete. Steve Finch and Peter Johansson said that they had done significant review of those portions of the document and thought that, though there may be some areas that need more refinement, but what was there was workable. Steve Finch said that he would be happy to take comments from others outside T10 for inclusion in his letter ballot comments.

The motion passed 14:0:0.

Reduced Block Commands (T10/97-260r0)

Jonathan Hanmann made a presentation on his proposal for a power management model for RBC devices.

John Fuller discussed how there were changes being made in P1394.a in the link, phy core and phy port power states. It was discussed that this element could be removed from RBC.

There was discussion on what the definition of the power states D0-D3 should be, and how these relate to the START/STOP UNIT command. One option is to make these definitions be like what's in ATA, i.e., that D1 may consume less power than D0 and may require more time to respond to a command, etc.

All agreed that we needed a model that would work for RBC, MMC-2 and other SCSI devices. Pete McLean suggested that we set up a joint meeting in March. It was decided to see if it's possible to have Peter Johansson, Mike Bryan, Ron Roberts and Jon Hanmann to reconcile any issues between their documents. The Start/Stop bit in SBP-2 issue is to be included in this discussion.

The next discussion was about WRITE vs WRITE/VERIFY. The consensus was that only VERIFY would be in RBC.

John Fuller said that Microsoft required the READ CAPACITY command. Peter Johansson moved and John Fuller seconded that Mike Bryan include READ CAPACITY command in RBC. The motion carried 12:1:4. Peter Johansson said that he voted against this because he thinks that this is counter to the intent of RBC and is being done only to appease Microsoft.

Darrell Redford reviewed comments for removable devices relative to RBC. Mike Bryan agreed to include these several elements (including a table for extended error codes) based on the comments into the next rev of RBC.

There was discussion about expanding what was in config ROM, e.g., whether a device used removable media. It was suggested that this be included in letter ballot comments for SBP-2.

An editorial review was conducted for clauses 11 and 12 in SBP-2 r02g. Peter Johansson will include the agreed upon editorial changes into SBP-2 rev 3.

An editorial review was conducted of RBC rev 0. Mike Bryan will make a new revision of the document including all of the agreed upon changes.

Pete McLean reviewed the new action items:

- 1) Pete McLean to request that John Lohmeyer send a letter to Compaq regarding patent 5375243.
- 2) Peter Johansson to prepare rev 3.0 of SBP-2 for letter ballot to take to the T10 plenary.
- 3) Darrell Redford to provide Mike Bryan with removable clause.
- 4) Mike Bryan to prepare a new rev of RBC.

Pete McLean reviewed what is required to get the next clean copy of RBC:

- 1) removable command items from Darrell Redford. Darrell says two weeks.
- 2) new rev of RBC including removable material, today's changes, annex changes (with Peter Johansson), and editorial (ANSI format type) changes with Pete McLean. Mike Bryan says he can have a rev by Jan 9th.
- 3) the next meeting will be around Feb 2nd with a joint meeting with MMC-2 the following day.

Pete McLean reviewed the open issues with RBC:

- 1) Power management
- 2) START/STOP UNIT
- 3) Read protection

Pete McLean made the traditional call for patents specifically for RBC. There were no responses.

Pete McLean reviewed the timeline for SBP-2:

- 06 Nov - request letter ballot at T10 plenary
- 15 Dec - letter ballot out
- 15 Jan - letter ballot closes
- 17 Mar - resolve letter ballot comments

Pete McLean reviewed the meeting schedule:

- 02 Feb - RBC review hosted by Iomega in Salt Lake City area
- 03 Feb - Joint RBC/MMC-2 meeting to discuss RBC and power management hosted by Iomega in Salt Lake City area
- 17 Mar - resolve SBP-2 letter ballot comments at Hyatt Islandia, San Diego hosted by Qlogic
- 18 Mar - RBC review at Hyatt Islandia, San Diego hosted by Qlogic

Pete McLean adjourned the meeting.