TITLE: Results of voting on CD xxxx-z and Collation of Comments
Information Technology
Small Computer System Interface SCSI-3
Part z: Controller Commands (SCC)

SOURCE: SC 25 Secretary

PROJECT: 25.13.11.15

STATUS: CD 9314-29 was distributed with SC 25 N 267. The draft has reached substantial support. The NWIP JTC I N 3701 has been approved see JTC I N 3916.

REQUESTED: For information of Members of SC 25.
The Comments are handed to SC 25IWG 4 for consideration and to update the text.

DISTRIBUTION: P-Members of SC 25
L-, 0-Members of SC 25

Comments of the German National Body to accompany the vote on document
ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 267

The German National Body submit the following comments concerning the general structure of
SCSI 3 documents as well as particular improvements to N 267.

General:

DE 1  This document will become part of the standards series on SCSI-3. For the benefit of
the users (i.e. JTC 1's customers) we request that the principles of numbering of
multipart International Standards be applied. SC 25 and its relevant WG 4 should
establish an appropriate structure of the set of SCSI-3 standards and develop a
"roadmap", which is to become a "general part" of the Introduction of any published
standard (see DE 3 and DE 4).

DE 2  Presentation, although quite well, needs to be improved to comply with ISO/IEC
Directives Part 3. Amongst others

- hanging clauses shall be avoided
- where ranges of values are specified, "to" is to be used instead of "-" (e.g. in NOTE 3:
  "0 to 7, Oto 15")
- frames around figures shall be avoided
- pagination is to be changed to "ISO/IEC )xxx-v"
- the regular ISO/IEC JTC I Foreword is required

DE 3  Reference to national standards is not appropriate in International Standards. Any
references shall be amended, giving the full document number and - in clause 2 - the
complete titles of International Standards and envisaged ones, respectively.

DE 4  Rephrase text like"... and the SCSI-3 Architecture Model Standard ..." by replacing or
at least adding the relevant International Standard(s). E.g. clause 4, 2nd paragraph, 2nd
line:
"... are defined in ISO/IEC XXX-1".

Detailed:

DE 5  The Abstract given on page ii shall be deleted. Its contents is to be merged with clause I
Scope.

DE 6  Move the upper half of the present Foreword ("The SCSI-3 Controller Commands... B
and C are for information only.") to the Introduction and insert after the 3rd paragraph.

DE 7  Introduction: Delete text starting with 4th paragraph to the end of the clause as already
annotated manually.

DE 8  The introduction should be structured to give
a) a general overview to the series of SCSI-3 standards (text plus roadmap figure, see
e.g. document SC 25 N 267)
b) general information on this part of the series (see DE 6)
c) the document structure

DE 9  1 Scope, 1st line: amend to read "This International Standard..."

DE 10  The Scope of an IS shall describe the subject specified (and, if necessary, what is
        excluded from the standard). Therefore, the paragraph "Figure 1... transport" and Figure
        1 shall be deleted here. This text should be moved into the Introduction.

        Furthermore, the text below Figure 1 shall be moved into subclause 3.3. The correct

DE 11  subclause 3.1: Insert sentence "For the purposes of this International standard the
        following definitions apply" before 3.1.1.
Japan's Comments on SC2S N267

Title: CD xxxx-z, Information Technology - Small Computer System Interface (SCSI-3)
Part z: Controller Commands (SCC)

The National Body of Japan approves ISO/IEC JTC I/S SC25 N267 with the following comments.

I. Title. (General)

“Information Technology - Small Computer System Interface (SCSI-3)” should be “Information Technology - Small Computer System Interface-3”

2. P. 1, 2nd line from bottom. Editorial)

"9316-I" should be "ISO/IEC 9316".