

Date: 1996-05-03

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25
INTERCONNECTION OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY EQUIPMENT

Secretariat: Germany (DIN)

TITLE: Results of voting on CD xxxx-11 and Collation of Comments
Information Technology
Small Computer System Interface SCSI-3 Part 11: Serial Bus Protocol
(SBP)

SOURCE: SC 25 Secretary

PROJECT: 25.13.11.07

STATUS: CD xxxx-11 was distributed with SC 25 N 263. The draft
has reached substantial support.
The NWIP JTC 1 N 3697 has been aproved. see JTC N 3914.

REQUESTED: For information of Members of SC 25. The Comments are handed to SC
25IWG 4 for consideration and to update the text.

DISTRIBUTION: P-Members of SC 25 L-, 0-Members of SC 25

Secretariat- ISO/IEC JTC 1/ Sc 25 - Dr.-Ing. Walter von Pattay c/o Siemens AG, VS M 1 Ref,
Hofmannstrasse 51, D- 81359 Munchen Tel.: +49 89 72245 450, Tfx~: +49 89 72245 487

Comments of the German National Body to accompany the vote on document
ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 263

The German National Body submit the following comments concerning the general structure of SCSI-3 documents as well as particular improvements to N 263.

- DE 1 Document number: This document will become part of the standards series on SCSI-3. For the benefit of the users (i.e. JTC 1's customers) we request that the principles of numbering of multipart International Standards be applied. SC 25 and its relevant WG 4 should establish an appropriate structure of the set of SCSI-3 standards and develop a "roadmap", which is to become a "general part" of the Introduction of any published standard (see DE 4 and DE 5).
- DE 2 The presentation of the draft has to be aligned with Part 3 of the ISO/IEC Directives. E.g., hanging clauses shall be avoided (e.g. introduce heading "8.1 General" immediately after "8 Target memory"). See below for more examples. Replace "section" by "clause" or "subclause" as appropriate (e.g. in 6.3.3 to 6.3.6). Reference to International Standards rather than national standards is required.
- DE 3 The Abstract on page 2 is to be deleted (merge with Scope).
- DE 4 page 8: The standardized Foreword for JTC 1 standards is required here. The present text should become part of the Introduction.
- DE 5 The Introduction should be structured to give
- a) a general overview to SCSI-3 standards (text plus roadmap figure, see e.g. document SC 25 N 267)
 - b) general information on this part of the series
 - c) the document structure as given on page 8
- DE 6 The page references in the table of contents have to be corrected
- DE 7 page 10, clause 1:- amend to read "This International Standard defines a ..."

- correct text in accordance with comment on clause 2

DE 8 page 10, clause 2:- insert missing preamble used in clause 2 Normative references of ISO/IEC standards (see e.g. ISO/IEC 9316:1995)

Reference shall be made to International Standards:
i.e. replace "IEEE 1212" by "ISO/IEC 13213", replace "SCSI-3 Architecture model" and "SCSI-3 command set documents" by the relevant documents (full numbers and titles) and amend subsequent text accordingly.

The last sentence "All references made shall be deleted here, as this is not part of clause 2. It could be moved to e.g. clause 4.

DE 9 3.1 Insert sentence; "For the purposes of this International Standard, the following definitions apply."

DE 10 3.1.2. and 3.1.17 (page 10 - 11)

The definitions of asynchronous ACA FIFO and isochronous ACA FIFO are identical. It shall be mentioned that the ACA is associated with an asynchronous / isochronous operation.

DE 11 subclause 3.2 shall list all abbreviations used throughout the document (e.g. SAM, CDB, TAP, msb, lsb). Presently, there are not symbols listed therefore delete "Symbols" in heading.

DE 12 a) a better heading of clause 4 is required. We propose "Introduction of the Serial Bus Protocol"

b) introduce "4.1 General consideration" immediately after the heading of clause 4 and remember subsequent subdauses.

DE 13 The following references are wrong (subdause-numbering refers to present document):

4.0. page 12, paragraph 8: clause 14 should be clause 11.1
4.0. page 12, paragraph 9: clause 8 should be clause 5.2
clause 9 should be clause 6.1.1
clause 10 should be clause 6.1.1
4.0. page 12, paragraph 12: clause 14.3 should be 11.1.3
4.0. page 13, paragraph 13: clause 14.4 should be 11.3
5.1.1. page 14: clause 6.1 should be 8.1
5.2.3. page 15, paragraph 1: 5.1.1 should be 5.2.1
7.5.4. page 28, paragraph 3: table C-2 should be table 3
8.2.1. page 31:14.4.1 should be 11.1.1
8.3.1. page 32:14.4.2 should be 11.1.2
9.1. page 33, paragraph 7:14.3 should be 11.1.3
10.0. page 36, paragraph 1: clause 10 should be clause 6.1
10.2.1. page 39, paragraph 2: 8.2.1 should be Table 23
10.2.2. page 42, paragraph 2: 8.2.1. should be Table 23
10.5 page 46, paragraph 1: table 31 should be table 33

DE 14 Page 14, clause 5
a) avoid hanging clauses
b) 1st line: This clause

DE 15 page 15, subdause 5.2~3, 2nd line 5.1.1-> 5.2.1

DE 16 5~3.2, page 17, paragraph 4, 3rd line: ... completion of an isochronous

DE 17 clause 6, line 1/2:"... in detail in ISO/IEC xxxx-yy".

DE 18 6.2.1. page 18: the last sentence should be a head line

DE 19 6.3.4. page 20, paragraph 2: byte 22 bit 1 = 1...

DE 20 7.5.1. page 26, last line: incorrect line feed

DE 21 10.2.1. page 41, paragraph 2: "M_flag" should read "M-flag"

DE 22 10.2.2. page 43, paragraph 1: "M_flag" should read "M-flag"

DE 23 Annex A: replace "12.0" by "A.1", "12.1" by "A.2" etc.

DE 24 Annex B and Annex C: see comment on Annex A.

Yes Vote for ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 263 CD xxxx-10 SBP Revision 19

The U.S. member body votes YES with comments on ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 263 CD xxxx-10 SBP Revision 19. The comments request that the text for the DIS be based upon Revision 22 rather than Revision 19. A copy of Revision 22 is attached for discussion and resolution at the June SC 25-WG 4 meeting. The principal changes from Revision 19 to Revision 22 are outlined below:

1. Forward and Introductions were re-written for clarification. Editorial changes only.
2. Clauses I through 9 - editorial changes and changes pertaining to the incorporation of the ISOCHRONOUS Transfer commands and protocol.
3. Clause 10 has been rewritten to include the isochronous capability into the document. These changes are reflected in most of the sub-clauses of the document.
4. Annex A and B now contain informative data for isochronous transfers.
5. Annex C now contains configuration ROM information. ROM data has been modified to include isochronous configuration data.
6. All other annexes have been deleted from previous revisions.