

X3 Secretariat
Attention: Lynn Barra
1250 Eye Street NW., Suite 200
Washington, DC 2005-3922

X3T10/95-189r0

March 17, 1995

The following are Digital Equipment Corporation's public review comments on Fibre Channel Protocol for SCSI (FCP) (X3T10-993D, revision 010).

Comments are organized as follows:

#xxx (?) y.y.y Where #xxx is the comment number; "?" is the type (E: Editorial, T: Technical); y.y.y is the clause or subclause number.

Comments

#001 (E) 3.1.5:

All text after the first sentence is explanatory material which is outside the scope of the definition and should be deleted.

#002 (E) 3.1.7: See comment 001.

#003 (E) 3.1.9: See comment 001

#004 (E) 3.1.10: See comment 001.

#005 (E) 3.1.12: See comment 001.

#006 (E) 3.1.13: See comment 001.

#007 (E) 3.1.15: See comment 001

#008 (E) 3.1.18: See comment 001.

#009 (E) 3.1.20: See comment 001.

#010 (E) 3.1.25: See comment 001.

#011 (T) 3.1.28:

The definition for "tag" in the first sentence should be changed to: "The initiator-specified component of the task identifier." All text following the first sentence should be deleted.

#012 (E) 3.1.33: See comment 001.

#013 (E) 3.1.34: See comment 001.

#014 (T) Table 2:

The names in parentheses in column 1 appear to be the names of SIP messages corresponding to the specified task management functions. These names should be deleted.

#015 (T) SAM Protocol Services

In clauses 6.3 and 7.7 of SAM, protocol services to be provided by an LLP are defined that support the command and task management functions. The FCP protocol description should reference the service and its arguments by name. I would expect to see a clause in FCP for each applicable SAM task management or command protocol service. In addition to showing the service interface and its parameters, the clause should map each SAM parameter into its FCP-equivalent and describe corresponding FCP behavior.

#016 (T) SAM Protocol-Specific Responses

As required by clauses 6 and 7 of SAM, FCP should identify the protocol-specific responses corresponding to the following service responses: Task Complete, Linked Command Complete, Linked Command Complete (with flag), Service Delivery or Target Failure, Function Complete.

#017 (T) Asynchronous Event Reporting

The mechanism for Asynchronous Event Reporting is not defined as required by clause 6.6.4.1 of SAM.

Charles Monia
SHR3-2/C5
Digital Equipment Corporation
334 South Street
Shrewsbury, MA 01545
Telephone: (508) 841-6757
FAX: (508) 841-6100
EMAIL: monia@shr.dec.com