From: Charles Monia
To: SCSI Reflector; Lynn Barra
Subject: SBP Public review comments
Date: Monday, March 20, 1995 2:25PM

X3 Secretariat
Attention: Lynn Barra
1250 Eye Street NW., Suite 200
Washington, DC 2005-3922

The following are Digital Equipment Corporation's public review comments on SCSI-3 Serial Bus Protocol (SBP) (X3T10-992D, revision 19).

Comments are organized as follows:
#xxx (?) y.y.y

Where :
#xxx is the comment number;
"?" is the type (E: Editorial, T: Technical);
y.y.y is the clause or subclause number.

Comments
#001 (E) 3.1.1

The text after the first sentence is extraneous material, unrelated to the definition of the term and should be deleted.

#002 (E) 3.1.5

The accompanying definition is hard to parse. I suggest replacing it with the following:
"fifo: A target-resident buffer, containing CDS addresses, which is written by the initiator and read by the target. Buffer entries are read in first-in first-out order."

"asynchronous normal fifo: A fifo containing the addresses of CDSs to be serviced according to the target's policy for normal CDS execution."

#003 (E) 3.1.6

See comment 002.

#004 (E) 3.1.10

I suggest modifying the definition as follows:

command fifo: A fifo containing SCSI command CDS addresses.

#005 (T) 3.1.20

See comment 002.

#006 (T) 3.1.21

See comment 002.

#007 (T) 3.1.28

The definition for stream identifier seems incomplete. What does a stream identifier identify?

#008 (T) 5.2.1

The first sentence seems incomplete. What kind of target resource is the TAP slot?

#009 (T) SAM Protocol Services

In clauses 6.3 and 7.7 of SAM, protocol services to be provided by an LLP are defined that support the command and task management functions. The SBP protocol description should reference the SAM protocol service and it's arguments explicitely by name. In addition to showing the service interface and its parameters, the clause should map each SAM parameter into its SBP-equivalent .

#010 (T) SAM Protocol-Specific Responses

As required by clauses 6 and 7 of SAM, SBP should identify the protocol-specific responses corresponding to the following service responses:

Task Complete, Linked Command Complete, Linked Command Complete (with flag), Service Delivery or Target Failure, Function Complete.

Charles Monia
SHR3-2/C5
Digital Equipment Corporation
334 South Street
Shrewsbury, MA 01545

Telephone: (508) 841-6757
FAX: (508) 841-6100
EMAIL: monia@shr.dec.com