

Date: Dec 21, 1994

X3T10/95-108 rev 0

To: X3T10 Committee (SCSI)

From: George Penokie (IBM)

Subject: Comments on RAID 5 Support on SCSI Disk Drives
(94-111r2)

1-The XDWRITE command does not follow the conventions set down within the SPC standard. It does not even follow the conventions set down within the XOR document. I suggest the following (or something like this) for the XDWRITE CDB format:

Byte	Description
0	Op Code
1	No Change
2-5	No Change (Logical Block Length)
6-7	Reserved
8-9	Parameter List Length (Bytes)
10-11	Reserved
12-13	Transfer Length (Blocks)
14	Reserved
15	Control

The parameter list would contain the secondary address and secondary logical block address. Now the secondary address can be any size you want. The CDB follows the same format as defined in the Rebuild and Regenerate commands and is SPC compatible.

2-The CONTROL part of the CONTROL byte includes the Flag and Link bits so those bits should not appear in this proposal.

3-The format of the SECONDARY ADDRESS field and the SOURCE ADDRESS field are not defined. So I have no way of knowing how many bytes is enough to address all the devices. I do know that in SCC you can address all devices in a single layer with two bytes. And since the XOR proposal is only addressing a single layer I do not understand why you would need a different addressing protocol than is already defined in SCC.