Voting Results on T10 Letter Ballot 08-316r0 on
Forwarding SAT-2 to First Public Review
Ballot closed: 2008/09/04 12:00 noon MDT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Add'l Info</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AMCC</td>
<td>Paul von Stamwitz</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brocade</td>
<td>David Peterson</td>
<td>P Abs</td>
<td>Cmmts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dell, Inc.</td>
<td>Kevin Marks</td>
<td>P No</td>
<td>Cmmts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMC Corp.</td>
<td>Sean Dolan</td>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emulex</td>
<td>William Martin</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td>Cmmts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENDL</td>
<td>Ralph O. Weber</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td>Cmmts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCI</td>
<td>Douglas Wagner</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finisar Corp.</td>
<td>Chris Cicchetti</td>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foxconn Electronics</td>
<td>Elwood Parsons</td>
<td>P Abs</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fujitsu</td>
<td>Mike Fitzpatrick</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Dynamics</td>
<td>Nathan Hastad</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hewlett Packard Co.</td>
<td>Rob Elliott</td>
<td>P No</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hitachi Global Storage Tech.</td>
<td>Dan Colegrove</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBM Corp.</td>
<td>Kevin Butt</td>
<td>P Abs</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intel Corp.</td>
<td>Mark Seidel</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iomega Corp.</td>
<td>Robert Payne</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kawasaki Microelectronics Am</td>
<td>Joel Silverman</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KnowledgeTek, Inc.</td>
<td>Dennis Moore</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexar Media, Inc.</td>
<td>John Geldman</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSI Corp.</td>
<td>John Lohmeyer</td>
<td>P No</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.</td>
<td>David Geddes</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maxim Integrated Products</td>
<td>Gregory Tabor</td>
<td>P Abs</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microsoft Corp.</td>
<td>Robert Griswold</td>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Molex Inc.</td>
<td>Jay Neer</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NetApp</td>
<td>Frederick Knight</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nvidia Corp.</td>
<td>Mark Overby</td>
<td>P No</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMC-Sierra</td>
<td>Tim Symons</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantum Corp.</td>
<td>Paul Suhler</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samsung</td>
<td>Michael Rogers</td>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SanDisk Corporation</td>
<td>Avraham Shimor</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seagate Technology</td>
<td>Gerald Houlder</td>
<td>P No</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STMicroelectronics, Inc.</td>
<td>Benoît MERCIER</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun Microsystems, Inc.</td>
<td>Dale LaFollette</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symantec</td>
<td>Roger Cummings</td>
<td>P Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TycoElectronics</td>
<td>Michael Fogg</td>
<td>P Abs</td>
<td>Cmnts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Digital</td>
<td>Curtis Stevens</td>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ballot totals: (26:5:5:0=36)
26 Yes
5 No
5 Abstain
0 Organization(s) did not vote
36 Total voting organizations
12 Ballot(s) included comments

This 2/3rds majority ballot passed.
26 Yes are more than half the membership eligible to vote
[greater than 18] AND
26 Yes are at least 21 (2/3rds of those voting YES or NO [31]).

Key:
P Voter is principal member
A Voter is alternate member
Abs Abstain vote
DNV Organization did not vote
Cmnts Comments were included with ballot
NoCmnts No comments were included with a vote that requires comments

[This report prepared by LB2 v2.3.]

************************************************************
Comments attached to Abs ballot from David Peterson of Brocade:
The work of our organization is not affected by the subject matter of this standard.

************************************************************

Comments attached to No ballot from Kevin Marks of Dell, Inc.:

Dell comment number 1
Page=1 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Revision 05
s/b
Revision 06

Dell comment number 2
Page=1 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Global - We've got references all over the place. We have references to SAM-3, SAM-4, SBC-2, SBC-3, SPC-3 and SPC-4, SAS-1.1, SAS-2. Very confusing.

Suggest using latest:
SAM-4 - thru LB
SPC-4 is stable
SBC-3 going to LB soon
SAS-2 in LB resolution

Dell comment number 3
Page=3 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2
s/b
SBC-3

Dell comment number 4
Dell comment number 5
Page=13 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure numbering is messed up in Figure Table. Multiple 8,9,10

Dell comment number 6
Page=14 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove Revision History prior to forwarding.

Dell comment number 7
Page=16 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=George O. Penokie, Vice-Chair

s/b
Mark Evans, Vice-Chair

Dell comment number 8
Page=17 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Add T10 Membership list

Dell comment number 9
Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Clause 6 is titled Command Management Model, seems confusing.

Dell comment number 10
Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Annex A describes the INQUIRY command translation for ATAPI devices.

s/b
Annex A describes the translation for ATAPI devices.

Dell comment number 11
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3, and SBC-2

s/b
SPC-4, and SBC-3

Dell comment number 12
Page=21 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should the SCSI Architecture Model box stop at SAT?

Dell comment number 13
Page=22 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Following global comment on using SAM-4, SPC-4 and SBC-3, remove Approved References: ATA-7, since its based on 8 according to above, SAM-3, SPC-3, SBC-2

Also SAS-2 missing, but referenced in definitions

SAM-2 ok, because of non autosense reference.

Dell comment number 14
Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 15
Page=24 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=,

Dell comment number 16
Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 17
Page=24 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=,

Dell comment number 18
Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= through
s/b
over

Dell comment number 19
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= address
s/b
Address

Dell comment number 20
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= address
s/b
Address

Dell comment number 21
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
s/b
Address

Dell comment number 22
Page=25 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 23
Page=25 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 24
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
QUEUED
s/b
QUEUED command

Dell comment number 25
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
EXT ( s/b
EXT command ( 

Dell comment number 26
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
EXT), s/b
EXT command),

Dell comment number 27
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
QUEUED (see s/b
QUEUED command (see

Dell comment number 28
Page=25 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 29
Page=26 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 30
Page=26 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 31
Page=26 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Dell comment number 32
Page=27 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 33
Page=27 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see ATA8-ACS).
s/b
(see SATA-2.6).

Most NCQ related material in this standard refer to SAS 2.6

Dell comment number 34
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=layer

Dell comment number 35
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=layer
s/b
Layer

Dell comment number 36
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 37
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 38
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 39
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 40
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 41
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 42
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 43
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 44
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 45
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 46
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 47
Page=28 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Should the 32 byte read, write and verify commands be added to the different definitions.

Dell comment number 48
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1)
s/b
(see SAS-2)

Dell comment number 49
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAS-1.1.
s/b
SAS-2.
Dell comment number 50
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 51
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1).
\s/b
(see SAS-2).

Dell comment number 52
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1).
\s/b
(see SAS-2).

Dell comment number 53
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
KEVIN MARKS Needs to update: 3.1.80 SCSI write command:

Does WRITE SAME(10) (16) need to be added here? or WRITE LONG?

Dell comment number 54
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1).
\s/b
see SAS-2).

Dell comment number 55
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAM-3).
\s/b
(see SAM-4).

Dell comment number 56
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see 2.3)

I'm not sure how this reference helps.

Dell comment number 57
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3 SCSI Primary Commands-3 standard (see 2.2)
\s/b
SPC-4 SCSI Primary Commands-4 standard (see 2.3)

Why is SBC-3 not included?
Dell comment number 58
Page=32 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Table 2 - missing line indents between bytes 0 & 1 and 2&3.

Dell comment number 59
Page=33 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SPC-3 and SBC-2);
s/b
(see SPC-4 and SBC-3);

Dell comment number 60
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
A SCSI / ATA Translation implementation
s/b
The SATL
to match 1st example

Dell comment number 61
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
sent,
s/b
received,

Dell comment number 62
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4,

Dell comment number 63
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 64
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 65
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).
Dell comment number 66
Page=36 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-3)
s/b
SAM-4)

Dell comment number 67
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAS-1.1
s/b
SAS-2

Dell comment number 68
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
START STOP UNIT, REQUEST SENSE).
s/b
START STOP UNIT command or REQUEST SENSE command).

Dell comment number 69
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Serial ATA device
s/b
SATA device

for consistency with rest of doc

Dell comment number 70
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Serial ATA
s/b
SATA

Dell comment number 71
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE data,
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data,

Dell comment number 72
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"b) when interpreting SMART READ DATA data for the Summary SMART error log
(i.e., log address
01h), the Comprehensive SMART error log (i.e., log address 02h), the SMART
self-test log (i.e., log address 06h), or the Selective self-test log (i.e., log address 09h) (see
ATA8-ACS), the SATL shall use
the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct; and"
s/b
"b) when interpreting ATA SMART READ DATA data for the ATA Summary SMART
error log (i.e., log address 01h), the ATA Comprehensive SMART error log (i.e., log address 02h), the
ATA SMART self-test log (i.e., log address 06h), or the ATA Selective self-test log (i.e., log address 09h)
(see ATA8-ACS), the SATL shall use
the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct; and"

Dell comment number 73
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"c) when interpreting READ LOG EXT data for the Extended Comprehensive
SMART error log (i.e., log address 03h) or Extended SMART self-test log (i.e., log address 07h) (see
ATA8-ACS), the SATL
shall use the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct."
s/b
"c) when interpreting ATA READ LOG EXT data for the ATA Extended
Comprehensive SMART error log (i.e., log address 03h) or ATA Extended SMART self-test log (i.e., log address 07h)
(see ATA8-ACS), the SATL
shall use the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct."

Dell comment number 74
Page=38 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 75
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 76
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
device, the
s/b
device, then the

Dell comment number 77
Page=39 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 78
Page=39 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Need a),b),c) list formatting, missing : and ;'s

Dell comment number 79
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
add space.

Dell comment number 80
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 81
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 82
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ALIGNMENTfield

add space

Dell comment number 83
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 84
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 85
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the READ CAPACITY (16) data.
s/b
the READ CAPACITY (16) command data.

Dell comment number 86
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure 8 is missing reference in text

Dell comment number 87
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 88
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 89
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
3:
s/b
3h:

Dell comment number 90
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 91
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
2:
s/b
2h:

Dell comment number 92
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
2:
s/b
2h:

Dell comment number 93
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 94
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
3:
s/b
3h:

Dell comment number 95
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the READ CAPACITY (16) data.
s/b
the READ CAPACITY (16) command data.

Dell comment number 96
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure 9 missing reference in text.

Dell comment number 97
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure 10 missing reference in text

Dell comment number 98
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 99
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
7:
s/b
7h:

Dell comment number 100
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
7:
s/b
7h:

Dell comment number 101
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 102
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the READ CAPACITY (16) data.
s/b
the READ CAPACITY (16) command data.

Dell comment number 103
Page=43 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
native command queueing
s/b
Native Command Queueing

Dell comment number 104
Do we want to add a table note about NCQ Priority Bit?

If we base SAT-2 off of SAM-4, then the basic task management model is obsolete. Additionally BQUE is also obsolete.

If following SAM-4

SCSI command identifier.

Add (see SAM-4).

by IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 75),
s/b by ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 75),

Remove Editor's note.

(see SAM-3)
s/b (see SAM-4)
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 116
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"SAM-4, the command tags maintained in the SATL mapping of command tags to NCQ tags or TCQ tags"
s/b
"SAM-4, the command identifiers maintained in the SATL mapping of command identifiers to NCQ tags or TCQ tags"

Dell comment number 117
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"corresponding SCSI command tag, the"
s/b
"corresponding SCSI command identifier, the"

Dell comment number 118
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SCSI command tag.
s/b
SCSI command identifier.

Dell comment number 119
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
return TASK SET FULL even
s/b
return TASK SET FULL status even

Dell comment number 120
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
native command queuing
s/b
Native Command Queuing

Dell comment number 121
Page=46 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 122
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
6.3 command Priority
s/b
6.3 Command Priority

Dell comment number 123
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 124
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 125
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
bis
s/b
bit

Dell comment number 126
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"READ FPDMA QUEUED and WRITE FPDMA QUEUED commands."
s/b
"ATA READ FPDMA QUEUED command and ATA WRITE FPDMA QUEUED command."

Dell comment number 127
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 128
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=0h

Dell comment number 129
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=1h - 3h

Dell comment number 130
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=4h - Fh

Dell comment number 131
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 132
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
or even better, just PRIO bit.

Dell comment number 133
Page=49 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 134
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SPC-3);
s/b(see SPC-4);

Dell comment number 135
Page=49 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Is the reasoning for the addition of the _L on most of the tmf text, that the SATL may not be considered the device server? In each of these the _L is always the same.

Dell comment number 136
Page=50 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=yeah, link is obsolete in SAM-4

Dell comment number 137
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=nexusus
s/b
nexuses

Dell comment number 138
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=nexusus
s/b
nexuses

Dell comment number 139
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=nexusus
s/b
nexuses

Dell comment number 140
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=unit, the
s/b unit, then the

Dell comment number 141
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
each affected I_T nexus
s/b the affected I_T nexus

although wording is technically ok, since there can only be one, why each affected.

Dell comment number 142
Page=51 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b SPC-4

Dell comment number 143
Page=51 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL IN/OUT missing from table 10.

Dell comment number 144
Page=53 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b SPC-4

Dell comment number 145
Page=53 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b SPC-4

Dell comment number 146
Page=54 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SPC-3) (e.g., 05h for SPC-3).
s/b (see SPC-4) (e.g., 06h for SPC-4).

Dell comment number 147
Page=54 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= SPC-3
s/b SPC-4

Dell comment number 148
Page=54 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 149
Page=54 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 150
Page=55 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 151
Page=55 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= IDENTIFY DEVICE
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 152
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 153
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= IDENTIFY DEVICE
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 154
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= (see SPC-3)
 s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 155
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= (e.g., SPC-3);
s/b
(e.g., SPC-3);

Dell comment number 156
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= (e.g., SBC-2);
s/b
(e.g., SBC-3);

Dell comment number 157
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(e.g., SAS-1.1)
s/b
(e.g., SAS-2)

Dell comment number 158
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 159
Page=56 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Will need to add sub-page support row for SPC-4

Dell comment number 160
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 161
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 162
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= 8.2.3 PAGE CODE field
s/b
8.2.3 PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field

Dell comment number 163
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= PAGE CODE field
s/b
PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field

Dell comment number 164
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= Table 15 - PAGE CODE field

Add in column for subpage set to 00h for each.
Dell comment number 165  
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(see SPC-3)  
s/b  
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 166  
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(correspond to SPC-3 and SBC-2 mode page formats).  
s/b  
(correspond to SPC-4 and SBC-3 mode page formats).

Dell comment number 167  
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(see SPC-3)  
s/b  
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 168  
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(see SPC-3)  
s/b  
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 169  
Page=59 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
SPC-3  
s/b  
SPC-4

Dell comment number 170  
Page=59 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(see SPC-3)  
s/b  
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 171  
Page=60 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(see SPC-3)  
s/b  
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 172  
Page=60 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
SPC-3.  
s/b  
SPC-4.
Dell comment number 173
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 174
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= 3.1.29), the
s/b 3.1.29), then the

Dell comment number 175
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= (see SPC-3).
s/b (see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 176
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Temp Comment: (in any case need comment to change sentence to complete with error.)

If the ATA CHECK POWER MODE command does not complete with success then no power condition sense data shall be returned.

This one is confusing to me.

Seems CHECK POWER MODE command should always complete with success, assuming you did just not blow away an NCQ commands. Only time one would get a error is NCQ blown queue/Device Fault and I do not see the relation to a REQUEST SENSE and returning the state. Why is there no mapping from the CPM to SCSI state (need to check what Fred added)

Dell comment number 177
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= SPC-3
s/b SPC-4

Dell comment number 178
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= Table 20 - Special Request Sense behavior reference

Need to add sections 8.8.6 and 8.8.7 (idle and standby). Would also suggest rearranging 8.8.4 with 8.8.6 and 8.8.7

Dell comment number 179
In a similar context to pass thru, if 8 byte LBA are supported, isn't the descriptor format also required to return LBA in error.

Dell comment number 181
Page=62 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Is stated above - therefore table not needed.

Dell comment number 182
Page=62 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 183
Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment="command, the"
  s/b
"command, then the"

Dell comment number 184
Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SBC-2 and SPC-3.
  s/b
SBC-3 and SPC-4.

Dell comment number 185
Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=IDENTIFY DEVICE data
  s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data

Dell comment number 186
Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment="return parameter data containing sense data with the sense key set to NO SENSE with the additional sense code set to NO ADDITIONAL SENSE DATA; and"
  s/b
"return parameter data containing sense data with the sense key set to NO SENSE with the additional sense code set to NO ADDITIONAL SENSE DATA or LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, INITIALIZING COMMAND REQUIRED; and"

as per SBC-3.
(see SPC-3);
s/b
(see SPC-4);

8.8.6 IDLE power condition
s/b
8.8.6 Idle power condition

8.8.7 STANDBY power condition
s/b
8.8.7 Standby power condition

IDLE) then
s/b
IDLE), then

in 8.8.6 a) and b) seem to be able to both be true. From what I can tell
ATA CPM does not give a reason for being in idle, only that it is. If it
were based on a timer, does the SATL know that it when to idle mode. Why
is the IDLE CONDITION ACTIVATED BY TIMER not included?

in 8.8.7 a) and b) seem to be able to both be true. From what I can tell
ATA CPM does not give a reason for being in standby, only that it is. If it
were based on a timer, does the SATL know that it when to standby mode.
Why is the STANDBY CONDITION ACTIVATED BY TIMER not included?

OPERATION CODE -->

Wondering if we need a table note that says if allocation length = 0, then
use ATA TRUSTED NON-DATA command as stated in allocation length section.
I'm not sure that Protocol ID 01h-06h belong in this spec as they belong to TCG.

ALLOCATION LENGTH varies

the ALLOCATION LENGTH field is set to

INC_512 is

INC_512 bit is

of TRUSTED RECEIVE or TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA.

of ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command.

ALLOCATION LENGTH is greater than FFFFh,

the ALLOCATION LENGTH field contains a value greater than FFFFh,
set to ALLOCATION LENGTH (15:0).
set to the contents of bits (15:0) of the ALLOCATION LENGTH field.

Dell comment number 203
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment="After completion of the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command,"
 s/b "After the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command completes without error,"

Dell comment number 204
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH is greater than 1FF_FE00h
 s/b the ALLOCATION LENGTH field contains a value greater than 1FF_FE00h

Dell comment number 205
Page=64 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 206
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(ALLOCATION LENGTH +
 s/b (ALLOCATION LENGTH field +

Dell comment number 207
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment="After successful completion of the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command, the data shall be transferred to the SCSI application client up to the specified ALLOCATION LENGTH number of bytes."
 s/b "After the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command completes without error, the data shall be transferred to the SCSI application client up to the specified allocation length number of bytes."

Assume this sentence only goes with the INC_512=0. Its not that clear.

Dell comment number 208
Page=64 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 209
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=07h - FFh
 s/b 01h - FFh
based on assumption that 01h-06h should not be defined above.

Dell comment number 210
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
OPERATION CODE -->

Wondering if we need a table note that says if transfer length = 0, then use ATA TRUSTED NON-DATA command as stated in transfer length section.

Dell comment number 211
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"The SATL shall send the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command to the ATA device."
s/b
"The SATL shall send the ATA TRUSTED SEND command or the ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command to the ATA device."

Dell comment number 212
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the value of SECURITY PROTOCOL.
s/b
the value contained in the SECURITY PROTOCOL field.

Dell comment number 213
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH varies
s/b
transfer length varies

Dell comment number 214
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
value of SECURITY PROTOCOL.
s/b
value contained in the SECURITY PROTOCOL field.

Dell comment number 215
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If transfer length is zero
s/b
If TRANSFER LENGTH field is set to zero

Dell comment number 216
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
instead of TRUSTED SEND or TRUSTED SEND DMA.
s/b
instead of the ATA TRUSTED SEND command or ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command.

Dell comment number 217
INC_512
s/b
INC_512 bit

Dell comment number 218
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH is greater than FFFFh,
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field contains a value greater than FFFFh,

Dell comment number 219
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The ATA TRUSTED SEND or ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command shall transfer the data.
s/b
The ATA TRUSTED SEND command or ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command shall be used to transfer the data.

Dell comment number 220
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
set to ALLOCATION LENGTH (15:0).
s/b
set to the contents of bits (15:0) of the TRANSFER LENGTH field.

Dell comment number 221
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH is greater than 1FF_FE00h,
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field contains a value greater than 1FF_FE00h,

Dell comment number 222
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
8.10.1.3.2 SECURITY PROTOCOL values 00h - 06h

I'm not sure that Protocol ID 01h-06h belong in this spec as they belong to TCG.

Dell comment number 223
Page=65 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 224
Page=65 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 225
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
TRANSFER LENGTH field

Dell comment number 226
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ATA TRUSTED SEND or
s/b
ATA TRUSTED SEND command or

Dell comment number 227
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
07h - FFh
s/b
01h - FFh

based on assumption that 01h-06h should not be defined above.

Dell comment number 228
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 229
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 230
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 231
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 232
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4
Dell comment number 233
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 234
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 235
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 236
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 237
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 238
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 239
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 240
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the
Dell comment number 241
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 242
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3),
s/b
SPC-4),

Dell comment number 243
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 244
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 245
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 246
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3)
s/b
SPC-4)

Dell comment number 247
Page=69 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 248
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The SELF-TEST CODE field is valid, and the
s/b
If the SELF-TEST CODE field is valid, the

Dell comment number 249
Dell comment number 250
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=ATA Count field

Dell comment number 251
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=ATA LBA field

Dell comment number 252
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 253
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 254
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
device, the
s/b
device, then the

Dell comment number 255
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
mode, the
s/b
mode, then the

Dell comment number 256
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the stopped state as
s/b
the stopped power condition as

Dell comment number 257
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 258
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(i.e., if supported);

Does not sound like an i.e.?

Dell comment number 259
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
MODE
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 260
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 261
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
02h, the
s/b
02h, then the

Dell comment number 262
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
05h the
s/b
05h, then the

Dell comment number 263
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 264
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 30 - Download Microcode Mode 07h ATA Field Values

Remove black box/save toner.

Dell comment number 265
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0h
s/b
0b

Dell comment number 266
Oh
s/b
Ob

Dell comment number 267
IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 235 and the IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 235 is a non-zero value
s/v the contents of the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 235 and the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 235 is a non-zero value

Dell comment number 268
IF
s/b
If

Dell comment number 269
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH
s/b in small CAPS

Dell comment number 270
"than IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 and IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 is a non-zero value"
"than the contents of the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 and the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 is a non-zero value"

Dell comment number 271
BUFFER OFFSET and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field
s/b BUFFER OFFSET field and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field

and make fields in small CAPS

Dell comment number 272
(see 3.1.35), the
s/b
(see 3.1.35), then the

Dell comment number 274
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Size
s/b
size

Dell comment number 275
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see 3.1.39), the
s/b
(see 3.1.39), then the

Dell comment number 276
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS and
s/b
LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS field and

Dell comment number 277
Page=75 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove empty page on Page 57 or page 75 of 166 in PDF

Dell comment number 278
Page=76 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
KEVIN MARKS COMMENT - NEED ANSWER:

Need to check if write uncorrectable needs to be added to table, and possibly other

Dell comment number 279
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 280
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 281
Page=78 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a FMTDATA bit of one, the SATL
s/b
a FMTDATA bit set to one, then the SATL

Dell comment number 282
Page=78 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=shouldn't the be read error

Dell comment number 283
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= (see SCT)
s/b (see ATA8-ACS)

Dell comment number 284
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= SCT
with ACS including SCT, should these be changed to ATA?

Dell comment number 285
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= SCT
with ACS including SCT, should these be changed to ATA?

Dell comment number 286
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= SCT
with ACS including SCT, should these be changed to ATA?

Dell comment number 287
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= command, the
s/b command, then the

Dell comment number 288
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= READ (10), READ (12) or READ (16) command
s/b READ (10) command, READ (12) command or READ (16) command

Dell comment number 289
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= one) the
s/b one), then the
Dell comment number 290
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a READ
s/b
an ATA READ

Dell comment number 291
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
FUA bit
s/b
ATA FUA bit

Dell comment number 292
Page=79 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 293
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
device, send
s/b
device, then send

Dell comment number 294
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
enabled (ATA8-ACS)
s/b
enabled (i.e., ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 5 is set to one)

or at least add see in front of ATA8-ACS

Dell comment number 295
Page=79 Subtype=Caret Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(i.e., ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 76 bit 8 is set to one

Dell comment number 296
Page=79 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 297
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
enabled on
s/b
enabled (i.e., ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 5 is set to one) on

Dell comment number 298
Page=79 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 299
Page=80 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=  
(see SBC-2).
s/b  
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 300  
Page=80 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(see SBC-2).
s/b  
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 301  
Page=81 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
Dell comment number 302  
Page=81 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
SBC-2.
s/b  
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 303  
Page=81 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 304  
Page=82 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
SBC-2.
s/b  
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 305  
Page=82 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 306  
Page=83 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
SBC-2.
s/b  
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 307  
Page=83 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 308  
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks  
Comment=  
(see SBC-2)
s/b  
(see SBC-3)
Dell comment number 309
Page=85 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Combined in P_TYPE field in SBC-3

Dell comment number 310
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 311
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
this
s/b
, then this

Dell comment number 312
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
this
s/b
, then this

Dell comment number 313
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 314
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See SBC-2
s/b
See SBC-3

Dell comment number 315
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See SBC-2
s/b
See SBC-3

Dell comment number 316
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 317
(see SBC-2).

Dell comment number 318

(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 319

(see SBC-2)

s/b

(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 320

Remove white space before table 45.

Dell comment number 321

need and/or. Not sure which, because 3) and 4 look like an if/else.

Dell comment number 322

Send

Dell comment number 323

Dell comment number 324

Dell comment number 325

Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 326

Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 327

Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 328
zero.

s/b
zero; or

Dell comment number 329
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 330
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 331
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 332
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 333
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 334
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=If the ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes without error, then the count field shall be set to zero, and the SATL shall send an ATA STANDBY command to the ATA device;

s/b
If the ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes without error, then the SATL shall send an ATA STANDBY command to the ATA device with the count field shall be set to zero;

Dell comment number 335
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 336
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SPC-3)

s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 337
Page=92 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 338
Page=92 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 339
Dell comment number 340

Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 341

Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 342

Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
send
s/b
Send

Dell comment number 343

Page=92 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 344

Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
command.
s/b
command as part of emulating the START STOP UNIT command.

Dell comment number 345

Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 346

Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 347

Page=94 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).
Wondering if this needs to be expanded or change op code row. The operation code row, says shall use an ATA verify command, but if BYTCHK=1 then there is no need for the verify, but a read command.

Wondering if this needs to be expanded or change op code row. The operation code row, says shall use an ATA verify command, but if BYTCHK=1 then there is no need for the verify, but a read command.

(see SBC-2).

s/b

(see SBC-3).

(see SBC-2).

s/b

(see SBC-3).

Wondering if this needs to be expanded or change op code row. The operation code row, says shall use an ATA verify command, but if BYTCHK=1 then there is no need for the verify, but a read command.

The reasoning for these two commands is? ATA black magic?

(see SBC-2).

s/b

(see SBC-3).

(see SBC-2).

SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 357
Page=99 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 358
Page=100 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 359
Page=100 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 360
Page=101 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 361
Page=101 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Why is NOTE 1 missing as in WRITE (10) and (12)?

Dell comment number 362
Page=101 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Does this need to be expanded to include read command for BYTCHK=1.

Dell comment number 363
Page=102 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 364
Page=103 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 365
Page=104 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 366
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the WRITE
s/b
the ATA WRITE

Dell comment number 367
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ACS), the
s/b
ACS), then the

Dell comment number 368
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
shal
s/b
shall

Dell comment number 369
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
if
s/b
If

Dell comment number 370
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment='byte transfer length' should be in small CAPS

Dell comment number 371
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
client and
s/b
client and

Dell comment number 372
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ACS), the
s/b
ACS), then the

Dell comment number 373
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 374
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
002h or 004h
s/b
0002h or 0004h

Dell comment number 375
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 376
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 377
Page=108 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove white space.

Dell comment number 378
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=ACS), the
s/b
ACS), then the

Dell comment number 379
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 380
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=client and
s/b
client and

Dell comment number 381
Page=110 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(i.e.,
s/b
(i.e.,

Dell comment number 382
Page=110 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 383
See SPC-3 and SBC-2
s/b
See SPC-4 and SBC-3

Dell comment number 384
See SPC-4 and SBC-3
s/b

Dell comment number 385

Dell comment number 386

Dell comment number 387

Dell comment number 388

Dell comment number 389

Dell comment number 390

Dell comment number 391
data, the
s/b
data, then the

Dell comment number 392
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 393
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 394
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 395
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 396
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 397
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 398
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 399
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 400
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 401
Page=114 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=add row for
SPF no Shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 402
Page=115 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=add row for
SPF no Shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 403
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 404
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 405
Page=119 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Change all Yes/No in changeably column of Table 73 to yes/no to match other tables.

Dell comment number 406
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=STANDBY
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 407
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=STANDBY
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 408
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 409
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
one, the
s/b
one, then the

Dell comment number 410
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 411
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LIST;
s/b
LIST; and

Dell comment number 412
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 413
Page=119 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 414
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY CONDITION TIMER
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 415
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY CONDITION TIMER
s/b
in small CAPS and add field
Dell comment number 416
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
in small CAPS and add bit

Dell comment number 417
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
COUNT
s/b
ATA Count

Dell comment number 418
Page=120 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 419
Page=120 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 420
Page=120 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 421
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
power condition
s/b
Power Condition

Dell comment number 422
Page=120 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Wondering if it would be better to remove z and place the STANDBY CONDITION TIMER field directly in equation

Dell comment number 423
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
reading log page address 00h using READ LOG EXT, READ LOG DMA EXT, or SMART READ LOG.
s/b
reading ATA log page address 00h using ATA READ LOG EXT command, ATA READ LOG DMA EXT command or ATA SMART READ LOG command.

Dell comment number 424
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Does
s/b
does
Dell comment number 425
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Does
s/b
does

Dell comment number 426
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Then
s/b
then

Dell comment number 427
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LOG SELECT is not define as a translation in this standard. Also if keep in add the word command.

Dell comment number 428
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LOG SELECT is not define as a translation in this standard. Also if keep in add the word command.

Dell comment number 429
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Need to add LOG SELECT translation to 8.3.

Dell comment number 430
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=table 2.
s/b
table 78.

Dell comment number 431
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a SMART WRITE LOG, WRITE LOG EXT, or WRITE LOG DMA EXT command to the device
s/b
a ATA SMART WRITE LOG command, ATA WRITE LOG EXT command or ATA WRITE LOG DMA EXT command to the device

Dell comment number 432
Page=121 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Add sub page code field DS bit and SPF for SPC-4

Dell comment number 433
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Dell comment number 434
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 435
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 436
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 437
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 438
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 439
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1b
s/b
set to one

Dell comment number 440
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0b
s/b
set to zero

Dell comment number 441
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0b
s/b
set to zero

Dell comment number 442
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0b
s/b
set to 11b

Dell comment number 443
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
FCh
s/b
set to FCh
Table 78 - Parameter Storage Location - need statement that says 0200h-FFFFh is reserved of check conditions.

a SMART READ LOG, READ LOG EXT, or READ LOG DMA EXT command
s/b
a ATA SMART READ LOG command, ATA READ LOG EXT command, or ATA READ LOG DMA EXT command

Table 2.

s/b
table 78.

Add sub page code field =00h, DS bit and SPF = 0 for SPC-4

Need to add Application log page if supported. Or say may include others

Add sub page code field =00h, DS bit and SPF = 0 for SPC-4

LBIN Shall be set to one
LP Shall be set to one
s/b
FORMAT AND LINKING and set to 11b.

Move to table 80 as not part of each parameter in SPC-4
Comment=Add sub page code field =00h, DS bit and SPF = 0 for SPC-4

Dell comment number 454
Page=127 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 455
Page=127 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
non-packet - Why is this one specifically called out as non-packet. Non-packet apply to the self-test log also and I would say almost all other areas of this standard.

s/b
ATA

Dell comment number 456
Page=127 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
non-packet/
s/b ATA

Dell comment number 457
Page=128 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= Move to after page code.

Dell comment number 458
Page=128 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBIN Shall be set to one
LP Shall be set to one
s/b
FORMAT AND LINKING and Shall be set to 11b

Dell comment number 459
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SCT),
s/b
(see ATA8-ACS),

Dell comment number 460
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
an SCT Status Request
s/b
an ATA SCT Status Request

Dell comment number 461
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See SPC-3 and SBC-2
s/b
See SPC-4 and SBC-3
Why are the VPD pages shown in this format, instead of field/description or reference table?

For a VPD only defined in this standard, such as ATA page this format would be correct.
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 470
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= identification
s/b designation

Dell comment number 471
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= identification
s/b designation

Dell comment number 472
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= identification
s/b designation

Dell comment number 473
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= 108), the
s/b 108), then the

Dell comment number 474
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= identification
s/b designation

Dell comment number 475
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= 108), the
s/b 108), then the

Dell comment number 476
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= Table 91 - Logical unit name derived from the world wide name

Why are the VPD pages shown in this format, instead of field/description or reference table?

For a VPD only defined in this standard, such as ATA page this format would be correct.
The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field shall be set to 0h.
The CODE SET field shall be set to 1h (i.e., binary).
The PIV bit shall be set to 0b.
The ASSOCIATION field shall be set to 00b (i.e., logical unit).
The IDENTIFIER TYPE field shall be set to 3h (i.e., NAA).

This is all stated in the table. If you are going to keep this format then change text to:

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field, CODE SET field, PIV bit, ASSOCIATION field and DESIGNATOR TYPE field shall be set as shown in table 91.

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field shall be set to 0h.
The CODE SET field shall be set to 2h (i.e., ASCII).
The PIV bit shall be set to 0b.
The ASSOCIATION field shall be set to 00b (i.e., logical unit).
The IDENTIFIER TYPE field shall be set to 1h (i.e., T10 vendor identification).
The VENDOR IDENTIFICATION field contains the string 'ATA'.

This is all stated in the table. If you are going to keep this format then change text to:

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field, CODE SET field, PIV bit, ASSOCIATION field and DESIGNATOR TYPE field shall be set as shown in table 93.
The CODE_SET field is set to 1h (i.e., binary).  
The PIV bit is set to one.  
The ASSOCIATION field is set to 01b (i.e., target port).  
The IDENTIFIER_TYPE field is set to 3h (i.e., NAA).  

This is all stated in the table.  If you are going to keep this format then change text to:

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field, CODE_SET field, PIV bit, ASSOCIATION field and DESIGNATOR_TYPE field shall be set as shown in table 95.
Dell comment number 489
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFIER
s/b
DESIGNATOR

Dell comment number 490
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Identification

Dell comment number 491
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Identification
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 492
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 493
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 494
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 495
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 496
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 497
Identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 498
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Identification
s/b
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 499
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 500
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 501
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 96 - Mode Page Policy VPD page for SAT

Why are the VPD pages shown in this format, instead of field/description or reference table?

For a VPD only defined in this standard, such as ATA page this format would be correct.

Dell comment number 502
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The PAGE CODE field shall be set to 87h.
s/b
The PAGE CODE field shall be set as shown in table 96.

Dell comment number 503
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 97 - Mode policy descriptor for SAT

Section 10.10.1 has a bunch of should's for these fields, but I see no reference to it here? Add a See 10.1.1 somewhere in this section

If not, then including the translation of this page code is useless. All
fields unspecified expect page code :)
make hex values

Dell comment number 513
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
15

make hex value

Dell comment number 514
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero
s/b
Oh
assuming they are hex values

Dell comment number 515
Page=141 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 516
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a SET
s/b
an ATA SET

Dell comment number 517
Page=142 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a READ MULTIPLE command, a READ MULTIPLE EXT command, a WRITE MULTIPLE
command, a WRITE MULTIPLE EXT command, or a WRITE MULTIPLE FUA EXT command,
s/b
an ATA READ MULTIPLE command, an ATA READ MULTIPLE EXT command, an ATA
WRITE MULTIPLE command, an ATA WRITE MULTIPLE EXT command or an ATA WRITE
MULTIPLE FUA EXT command,

Dell comment number 518
Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the EXTEND bit is set to zero, then the FEATURES (15:8) field, the
SECTOR_COUNT (15:8) field, the LBA_LOW (15:8) field, the LBA_MID (15:8)
field, and the LBA_HIGH (15:8) field shall be ignored by the SATL, and the
SATL shall process this command as specified in 12.2.2.

If the EXTEND bit is set to one, then the FEATURES (15:8) field, the
SECTOR_COUNT (15:8) field, the LBA_LOW (15:8) field, the LBA_MID (15:8)
field, and the LBA_HIGH (15:8) field are valid, and the SATL shall process
this command as specified in 12.2.2 except as described in the remainder of
this subclause.
These should be moved to after Table 104

Dell comment number 519
Page=144 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See 12.2.2 for a description of the MULTIPLE_COUNT field, the PROTOCOL field, the OFF_LINE field, the CK_COND bit, the T_DIR bit, and the BYTE_BLOCK bit.

The SATL shall determine the transfer length by the method specified in the T_LENGTH field (see table 106).

This should be in the previous section 12.2.3, since it defines fields for pass thru (16)

Dell comment number 520
Page=145 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
respond to a REQUEST SENSE command and shall return sense data with the sense key set to NO SENSE with the additional sense code set to NO ADDITIONAL SENSE INFORMATION.
s/b return GOOD status.

Or don't include this row

Dell comment number 521
Page=145 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see 12.2.5)
s/b
(see 12.2.6)

Dell comment number 522
Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SECTOR_COUNT (15:8) field shall be ignored.

Who shall ignore this? Are you telling the app client to ignore?

I would say shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 523
Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA_LOW (15:8) field, LBA_MID (15:8) field, and LBA_HIGH (15:8) field shall be ignored

Who shall ignore this? Are you telling the app client to ignore?

I would say shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 524
A SATL shall support the appropriate mode page for the attached ATA environment (e.g., PATA).

What does this mean? You have a may support, the saying their optional, then saying shall for ATA environment with an example of PATA? Is the PATA Control Mode page mandatory if supporting PATA drives?

Why is this specifically Reserved? Or did you mean subcodes F2 thru FE are reserved?

The SPF bit (see SPC-3) shall be set to one to access this mode page. The PAGE CODE field shall be set to 0Ah. The PAGE LENGTH field shall be set to 0004h. The SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to F1h.

The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, PAGE LENGTH field and SUBPAGE CODE field
shall be set as shown in table 110.

Dell comment number 533
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Transfer
s/b

Dell comment number 534
Page=149 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Need to indent 1),2),3) list on a) and b)

Dell comment number 535
Page=149 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Command is complete with check condition.

Dell comment number 536
Page=149 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 537
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
modes;
s/b
modes; and

Dell comment number 538
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SET FEATURES
s/b
ATA SET FEATURES

Dell comment number 539
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
requested
s/b
requested

Dell comment number 540
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Mode
s/b
mode

Dell comment number 541
Page=150 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
UDMA bit

Why are the uDMA's below not in small CAPS?
When the SATL receives a MODE SELECT command and the UDMA bits request a change in the UDMA transfer rate, then the SATL shall:

1) if the SET FEATURES command completes with an error, then the SATL shall:
   A) not change any host transfer modes;
   B) complete the MODE SELECT command with a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ABORTED COMMAND with the additional sense code set to ATA DEVICE FAILED SET FEATURES; and
   C) take no further action regarding this request to change the UDMA transfer rate;
   and

2) if the SET FEATURES command completes without error, then the SATL shall:
   A) configure the ATA host to communicate with the device at the requested UDMA transfer rate; and
   B) complete the MODE SELECT command with GOOD status.

s/b

"If the SATL receives a MODE SELECT command and the UDMA bits specify a change from the current settings, then the SATL shall send an ATA SET FEATURES - Set transfer mode (i.e., Features register set to 03h) command to the ATA device to set the UDMA mode on the ATA device to the requested state, and then:

a) if the SET FEATURES command completes with an error, then the SATL shall:
   1) not change any host transfer modes; and
   2) complete the MODE SELECT command with a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ABORTED COMMAND with the additional sense code set to ATA DEVICE FAILED SET FEATURES; and

or

b) if the SET FEATURES command completes without error, then the SATL shall:
   1) configure the ATA host to communicate with the device at the requested UDMA transfer rate; and
   2) complete the MODE SELECT command with GOOD status."
The SPF bit (see SPC-4) shall be set to one to access this page.

PAGE CODE shall be set to 1Ah.

SUBPAGE CODE shall be set to F1h.

Stated in Table 115 already.

s/b

The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to as shown in table 115.

Dell comment number 548
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= MODE SELECT, if
s/b
MODE SELECT command, if

Dell comment number 549
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= MODE SELECT, if
s/b
MODE SELECT command, if

Dell comment number 550
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= value, the
s/b
value, then the

Dell comment number 551
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Enable/disable advanced power management
s/b
Enable/disable the APM feature set

Dell comment number 552
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Disable advanced power management
s/b
Disable the APM feature set

Dell comment number 553
Page=152 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 554
Page=152 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
MODE SELECT with
s/b
MODE SELECT command with

Dell comment number 555
Page=153 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 556
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
contain:
s/b
contains:

Dell comment number 557
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the ATA
s/b
the unmodified ATA

Dell comment number 558
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
command
s/b
command (see 12.2)

Dell comment number 559
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The PAGE CODE field shall be set to 89h.
The PAGE LENGTH field shall be set to 238h.

already stated in table 116.
The PAGE CODE field and PAGE LENGTH field shall be set to as shown in table 116.

Dell comment number 560
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 561
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the IDENTIFY DEVICE or IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field

Dell comment number 562
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the of the ATA command

contains the what? should this be operation code or command code. Not sure what ATA calls it?

Dell comment number 563
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 564
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE

Dell comment number 565
Page=155 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
EXECUTE
s/b
ATA EXECUTE

Dell comment number 566
Page=156 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 567
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
IDENTIFY DEVICE OR IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE data field

If following table 116

Dell comment number 568
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE OR IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE data field

If following table 116

Dell comment number 569
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE OR IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE data field

If following table 116

Dell comment number 570
Page=156 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
This should be in SPC-4, not SAT-2 :)

As it is currently defined, the translation is not included between these commands and ATA. Need to add. If this were in SPC-4, then this would be correct. and a translation would be in SAT.

Dell comment number 571
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 572
Page=156 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 573
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
When
s/b
If

Dell comment number 574
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
command, the
s/b
command, then the

Dell comment number 575
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
for the set password function.
s/b
a SECURITY PROTOCOL IN command with the SECURITY PROTOCOL field set to EFh.

Dell comment number 576
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH
s/b
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH (0Dh)

Dell comment number 577
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 578
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH shall be set to the number of bytes following byte 1 of the SECURITY PROTOCOL IN parameter data.

s/b
The PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field shall be set to a shown in table 120.

Dell comment number 579
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the ATA Security feature set supported (S_SUPRT) bit is set to zero, then the ATA device does not support the ATA Security feature set. If the S_SUPRT bit is set to one, then the ATA device supports the ATA Security feature set.

s/b
If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 82 bit 1 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the ATA Security feature set supported (S_SUPRT) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 82 bit 1 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the ATA Security feature set supported (S_SUPRT) bit to one.

Dell comment number 580
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the ATA Security feature set enabled (S_ENABLD) bit is set to zero, then the ATA Security feature set is not enabled in the ATA device. If the S_ENABLD bit is set to one, then the ATA Security feature set is enabled in the ATA device based on the setting of the user password via a set password function (see 12.5.1.2.1).
If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 1 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the ATA Security feature set enabled (S_ENABLD) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 1 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the ATA Security feature set enabled (S_ENABLD) bit to one. Enabling of this bit is based on setting of the user password via a set password function (see 12.5.1.2.1).

Dell comment number 581
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_marks
Comment=
The value in the SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in normal mode.

The value in the SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in normal mode. The SATL shall set the least significant byte of the SECURITY ERASE TIME field to the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 89 bits (0:7) and the most significant byte of the SECURITY ERASE TIME field to 00h.

Dell comment number 582
Page=157 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 583
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_marks
Comment=i

Dell comment number 584
Page=158 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 585
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_marks
Comment=
The value in the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in enhanced mode. Table 121 defines the values in the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field.

The value in the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in enhanced mode. The SATL shall set the least significant byte of the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field to the the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 90 bits (0:7) and the most significant byte of the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field to 00h.

Dell comment number 586
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_marks
Comment=
If the ATA device does not support the ATA Security feature set (i.e., the S_SUPRT bit is set to zero) or the master password identifier, then the MASTER PASSWORD IDENTIFIER field shall be set to 0000h or FFFFh. If the ATA device supports the ATA Security feature set and the master password identifier, then the MASTER PASSWORD IDENTIFIER field shall be set to the master password identifier set when the master password was last changed.

s/b
The SATL shall set the MASTER PASSWORD IDENTIFIER field to the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 82.

Dell comment number 587
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the master password capability setting (MAXSET) bit is set to zero, and the ATA Security feature set is enabled (i.e., the S_ENABLD bit is set to one), then the security level is set to high. If the MAXSET bit is set to one, then the security level is set to maximum.

s/b
If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 8 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the master password capability setting (MAXSET) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 8 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the master password capability setting (MAXSET) bit to one.

Dell comment number 588
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the enhanced erase mode supported (EN_ER_SUP) bit is set to zero, then the ATA device does not support the enhanced erase mode. If the EN_ER_SUP bit is set to one, then the ATA device supports the enhanced erase mode.

s/b
If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 5 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the enhanced erase mode supported (EN_ER_SUP) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 5 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the enhanced erase mode supported (EN_ER_SUP) bit to one.

Dell comment number 589
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the password attempt counter exceeded (PWCNTEX) bit is set to zero, then the password attempt counter has not decremented to zero. If the PWCNTEX bit is set to one, then the password attempt counter has decremented to zero.

s/b
If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 4 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the password attempt counter exceeded (PWCNTEX) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 4 is set to one, then the SATL
shall set the password attempt counter exceeded (PWCNTEX) bit to one.

Dell comment number 590
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the frozen state (FROZEN) bit is set to zero, then the ATA device is not in the security frozen state. If the FROZEN bit is set to one, then the ATA device is in the security frozen state.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 3 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the frozen state (FROZEN) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 3 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the frozen state (FROZEN) bit to one.

Dell comment number 591
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the locked state (LOCKED) bit is set to zero, then the ATA device is not in the security locked state. If the LOCKED bit is set to one, then the ATA device is in the security locked state.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 2 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the locked state (LOCKED) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 2 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the locked state (LOCKED) bit to one.

Dell comment number 592
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the command and
s/b

the command and defined in this standard and

Dell comment number 593
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
of the , then
s/b

of the ATA device, then

Dell comment number 594
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If a command in table 122 is not implemented by the SATL, then processing of the command is vendor specific.

What? If it is not supported, then SATL shall check condition the command with ILLEGAL REQUEST, and ASC = INVALID COMMAND OPERATION CODE.

Dell comment number 595
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 596
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
??

ok, didn't know we supported ?? in standards.

Dell comment number 597
Page=159 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
I assume that the shaded rows are commands not translated in this standard. This is not stated, and LOG SELECT is not in this standard, but LOG SENSE is?

Dell comment number 598
Page=160 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 599
Page=160 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=These should not be shaded.

Dell comment number 600
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 601
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 602
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If a command in table 123 is not implemented by the SATL, then processing of the command is vendor specific.

s/b

What? If it is not supported, then SATL shall check condition the command with ILLEGAL REQUEST, and ASC = INVALID COMMAND OPERATION CODE.
Dell comment number 603
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=READ (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 604
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=VERIFY (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 605
Page=161 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=See no reason to split this out.

Dell comment number 606
Page=161 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 607
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 608
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=WRITE (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 609
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
WRITE AND VERIFY (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 610
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
WRITE SAME (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 611
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
shall contain a single numeric value as described in table 124.

s/b

specifies the ATA command that the SATL shall send to the ATA device (see table 124.)

Dell comment number 612
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a See ATA8-ACS for a description of how this security protocol specific field value shall be processed.

This table note sounds strange, in that it sounds like the security
protocol specific values are defined in ATA8-ACS.

I would remove the table note.

Table 125 defines the parameter data for the set password function.

s/b
Table 125 - Set password parameter data

s/b

Table 125 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0001h (Set password) parameter data

Table 126 - Unlock parameter data

s/b

Table 126 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0002h (unlock) parameter data

If the maximum security level bit (MAXLVL) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall set the security level to high. If the MAXLVL bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall set the security level to maximum.

This could be shortened by saying copy the value.

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall set the user password to the value in the PASSWORD field. If the MSTRPW bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall set the master password to the value in the PASSWORD field.

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command. If the master password bit
(MSTRPW) is set to one, then the SATL shall set the ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

Dell comment number 624
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The SATL shall set the PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

s/b

The SATL shall set the ATA Password field (i.e., words 1-16) of the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content to the contents of the PASSWORD field when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command.

Does this need a byte swap?

Dell comment number 625
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 126 defines the parameter data for the unlock function.

s/b

Table 126 defines the parameter data for the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command when the SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field is set to 0002h (unlock).

Dell comment number 626
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

s/b

The SATL shall set the ATA Password field (i.e., words 1-16) of the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK data content to the contents of the PASSWORD field when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK command.

Does this need a byte swap?

Dell comment number 627
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the user password. If the MSTRPW bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the master password.

s/b
If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the
ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK data
content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for
the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK command. If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set
to one, then the SATL shall set ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the
ATA SECURITY UNLOCK data content to one when transferring the data content
to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

Dell comment number 628
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 127 - Erase unit parameter data

s/b

Table 127 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0004h (erase unit) parameter
data

Dell comment number 629
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 128 - Disable password parameter data

s/b

Table 128 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0006h (disable password)
parameter data

Dell comment number 630
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 127 defines the parameter data for the erase unit function.

s/b

Table 127 defines the parameter data for the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command
when the SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field is set to 0004h (erase unit).

Dell comment number 631
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

s/b

The SATL shall set the ATA Password field (i.e., words 1-16) of the ATA
SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to the contents of the PASSWORD field when
transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE
UNIT command.

Does this need a byte swap?
If the enhanced erase mode bit (EN_ER) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall be set to use the normal erase mode. If the EN_ER bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall be set to enhanced erase mode.

s/b

If the enhanced erase mode bit (EN_ER) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Erase mode bit (i.e., word 0 bit 1) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command. If the enhanced erase mode bit (EN_ER) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Erase mode bit (i.e., word 0 bit 1) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the user password. If the MSTRPW bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the master password.

s/b

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command. If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

Does this need a byte swap?
If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero and the value in the PASSWORD field matches the user password, then the ATA device shall disable the user password. If the MSTRPW bit is set to one and the value in the PASSWORD field matches the master password, then the ATA device shall disable the master password.

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD command. If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD command.

Dell comment number 636

Table 128 defines the parameter data for the disable password function.

Table 128 defines the parameter data for the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command when the SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field is set to 0006h (disable password).

Dell comment number 637

Dell comment number 638

Dell comment number 639

Dell comment number 640
Dell comment number 641
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 642
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 643
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PACKET
s/b
ATA PACKET

Dell comment number 644
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 645
Page=165 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 646
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PACKET
s/b
ATA PACKET

Dell comment number 647
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 648
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 649
Page=166 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 650
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PACKET
s/b
ATA PACKET

*******************************************************************************

Comments attached to Yes ballot from William Martin of Emulex:

Emulex comment number 1
Page=26 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment= Why is this different than SAM-4 definition? How is this an object?

Emulex comment number 2
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment= are

s/b

is

Emulex comment number 3
Page=37 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=bmartin
Comment= fully

I do not believe that we have any specifications for operation of multiple I_T nexuses.

Emulex comment number 4
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment= This is a circular reference that does not add any clarity.

Emulex comment number 5
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment= These should reference the title of the Annexes rather than a lettered annex (if they even belong here)

Emulex comment number 6
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment= See ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE for details on when the data contained in words 106, 117-118, and 209 are valid.

s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE provides details on when the data contained in words 106, 117-118, and 209 are valid.

Emulex comment number 7
Page=45 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=bmartin
Comment=
Editor's Note 1: The basic task management model and full task management mode in SAM-4 are gone.

Emulex comment number 8
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
do we also need to state that no additional commands shall be queued to the ATA device until the non-queued command has been sent to and a response received from the ATA device?

Emulex comment number 9
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
The SATL shall resend the ATA command and continue processing the corresponding I_T_L_Q nexus.

s/b

The SATL shall terminate the affected I_T_L_Q nexus with CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key and the additional sense code set according to the reported ATA error as described in clause 11, and the SATL shall resend the aborted ATA command.

Emulex comment number 10
Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
an ATA CHECK POWER MODE command to the ATA device

An alternative that gives more information is READ LOG EXT (log page 0x10). This additionally gets status information for the ATA command that is aborted.

suggest rewordint to CHECK POWER MODE command to the ATA device or READ LOG EXT (log page 0x10) to the ATA device.

Emulex comment number 11
Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
Don't put a self reference in here.

This subclause

Emulex comment number 12
Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
affected
s/b

specified

Emulex comment number 13
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
ATA

s/b

ACA

Emulex comment number 14
Page=60 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
The SATL shall send the ATA READ BUFFER command to the ATA device.

To follow the style of table 28, this should be

The SATL shall:
a) send an ATA READ BUFFER command to the ATA device; or
c) emulate the specified function (i.e., if supported);
depending on the values in the BUFFER ID field and MODE field (see 8.7.2.1).

Emulex comment number 15
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
one,

s/b

zero

Emulex comment number 16
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=What is returned if the ATA verify command fails?

Emulex comment number 17
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=table 2.

s/b

table 78

************************************************************************************************************

Comments attached to Yes ballot from Ralph O. Weber of ENDL:

88
Wherever possible the latest versions of standards should be referenced (e.g., SBC-2 s/b SBC-3, SPC-3 s/b SPC-4). This appears to have already been done for SAM-4.

The description of Annex A in the Introduction does not match the contents of Annex A.

Since - is specified to mean subtraction, it should not be used when ranges of values are specified (e.g., 1 - 3 in table 8). Instead the ISO preferred 'to' should be used.

vital product data s/b VPD

The table footnote sentence is missing a period.

The 'or' should be aligned with the 'If' in b), not with ATA.

The description of the support requirements in this subclause seems inconsistent. The first sentence seems to say full support for the field is required. Table 14 suggests otherwise.

This table appears to contain three columns (Code, SPC-4 Description, and Description), not two (Code and Description). The break between the SPC-4 description and the SAT-2 description occurs at the colons.

See clause 10 s/b See 10.1

... via ATA. See clause 10 for specific requirements. s/b ... via ATA (see 10.1). [as is found in table 17]
What is it about the MODE SELECT command that necessitates using a length field definition which differs from the 'The SATL shall implement support for this field as defined in SPC-4.' definition used for other length fields?

Other instances of this description text do not include a cross reference. Remove or add cross reference(s) to make this text consistent throughout the standard.

Why is the table 18 treatment of unspecified values different than the table 19 treatment of what appears to be the same case (i.e., why is the text about processing the command as defined in SPC-4 needed)?

The meaning of this field s/b The translation of this field

It might be easier to correlate the codes to the subclauses which follow if the word 'mode' were added to the two i.e. instances.

... return sense data using autosense. s/b ... return the sense data associated with a CHECK CONDITION status using autosense.

... return sense data in response to the REQUEST SENSE command (see SAM-2). s/b return contingent allegiance (see SAM-2) sense data in response to the REQUEST SENSE command.

... is sense data to return ... s/b ... is contingent allegiance (see SAM-2) sense data ...
It seems like paragraph 3 would be more readable if broken into several smaller paragraphs (e.g., the last two sentences would work better as two separate paragraphs)

Delete the first row in table 20. Its function is already covered by the text which introduces the table. Besides, the reference should be SAM-2, not SPC-3.

Why are both description text and a table footnote needed to specify that support for the ATA PASS-THROUGH command mandates support for setting the desc bit to one.

It is not clear that the translation of the allocation length field should be differentiated based on the contents of the security protocol field. The translation specified for security protocol codes 00h to 06h appears to be globally applicable.

The content of this subclause makes no mention of allocation length. Therefore, the subclause cannot appropriately be identified as a subclause of the allocation length field translation.

It is not clear that the translation of the transfer length field should be differentiated based on the contents of the security protocol field. The translation specified for security protocol codes 00h to 06h appears to be globally applicable.

SECURITY PROTOCOL field translation overview s/b TRANSFER LENGTH field translation overview
The content of this subclause makes no mention of transfer length. Therefore, the subclause cannot appropriately be identified as a subclause of the allocation length field translation.

what is reported s/b the information that is reported

The unordered list looks as if someone might have intended it to be ordered. Or, is the goal that the three ATA verify commands can be sent in any order with respect to the contents of their LBA fields?

The meaning of this field s/b The translation of this field

It looks like some but not all of the contents of table 29 is specified in the introduction to table 29. Is this necessary?

Since 8.13.2.3 and 8.13.2.4 begin with an 'In this mode ...' sentence, perhaps 8.13.2.2 should replicate that style.

This paragraph appears to be telling the reader to return GOOD status and after that to determine if an error should be reported. It is tough to take back a GOOD status after it has been sent. Note that 8.13.2.4 does not have this problem.

RE: 'The SATL shall check if the ATA DOWNLOAD MICROCODE command completed with an error.' Is it possible to be more specific about how the SATL performs this check?

RE: 'successfully, running' The comma should be removed.
RE: 'successfully, running' The comma should be removed.

ENDL 40
PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, table 30
Why is there a black hole in this table? Which element of the T10 Style Guide
requires this to be present?

ENDL 41
PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, 4th p after table 30, s 1
IF s/b If

ENDL 42
PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, 4th p after table 30, s 1
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH should be in small caps

ENDL 43
PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, 6th p after table 30, s 1
BUFFER OFFSET and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field s/b BUFFER OFFSET field and
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field [with the field names in small caps]

ENDL 44
PDF pg 139, pg 121, 12.1, 2nd to last line in subclause
Vital Product Data s/b VPD

******************************************************************************
Comments attached to Abs ballot from Elwood Parsons of
Foxconn Electronics:

Lack of expertise

******************************************************************************
Comments attached to No ballot from Rob Elliott of
Hewlett Packard Co.:

---
comment number 1
Page=1 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Revision 05
s/b
Revision 06

---
comment number 2
Page=1 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
22 June 2008
is incorrect
---
comment number 3
Page=15 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add dates to R.5 and R.6 and future revision history headers
---
comment number 4
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
2006
s/b
2008 (or 2009)
---
comment number 5
Page=20 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete all the "i.e.,"s from figure 2. That is not used for acronyms in parenthesis - just the acronym is fine, like "(ATA8-ACS)"
---
comment number 6
Page=21 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete i.e., in figure 3 (see reasoning in comment on figure 2)
---
comment number 7
Page=22 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Include the planned ISO/IEC numbers for the ATA8 documents
---
comment number 8
Page=22 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Approved
s/b
lowercase
(or b) and c) should also start capitalized)
---
comment number 9
Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
ISO/IEC 14776-413, SCSI Architecture Model - 3 (SAM-3) [ANSI INCITS 402-2005]
and upgrade all references to SAM-4
---
comment number 10
Page=22 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SAM-4 has an ANSI INCITS number now, so the T10 project number can be replaced.

The international ISO/IEC 14776-414 is still "under development" so don't move this into 2.2.

... comment number 11
Page=22 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete ISO/IEC 14776-151, Serial Attached SCSI - 1.1 (SAS-1.1) [ANSI INCITS 417-2006]
and upgrade all SAS-1.1 references to SAS-2

... comment number 12
Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete ISO/IEC 14776-322, SCSI Block Commands - 2 (SBC-2) [ANSI INCITS 405-2005]
and upgrade all SBC-2 references to SBC-3, which should be nearing completion

... comment number 13
Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete ISO/IEC 14776-453, SCSI Primary Commands - 3 (SPC-3) [ANSI INCITS 408-2005]
and upgrade all SPC-3 references to SPC-4

... comment number 14
Page=22 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add FCP-3 (or FCP-4), as that is used in some example figures and text.

... comment number 15
Page=24 Subtype=Underline Subj=Underline Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=(global)
For cross-references in definitions that apply to the entire defined term, use "xxx. See SPC-3." format. Use "(see SPC-3)" format just for references for the words preceding it in the sentence.

... comment number 16
Page=27 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=After LUN definition, add "See SAM-4."
comment number 17
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
subsystem
s/b
subsystem

comment number 18
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(see SAM-3)
s/b
(see SAM-4)

and update the definition if needed

comment number 19
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Force Unit Access
s/b
lowercase

comment number 20
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Least
s/b
lowercase

comment number 21
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Most
s/b
lowercase

comment number 22
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Logical
s/b
lowercase

comment number 23
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Native command queuing
s/b
mixed case

---
comment number 24
Page=29 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=The (see 3.1.5) cross references don't seem to work in the PDF file

---
comment number 25
Page=29 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=3.1.60 cross reference seems broken in the PDF file

---
comment number 26
Page=29 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=3.1.72 cross reference doesn't seem to work in the PDF file

---
comment number 27
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= (see 2.2) should be (see 2.3), since SAM-4 is still "under development" at the ISO level

---
comment number 28
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= (see 2.3)

Nothing in 2.3 refers to an "SCT" standard.

---
comment number 29
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= Tagged command queuing
s/b
mixed case

---
comment number 30
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= Vital Product Data
s/b
lowercase

---
comment number 31
Page=32 Subtype=Underline Subj=Underline Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= (global)
Change every usage of "if" to include a "then". This helps separate the conditions from the resulting actions, which is helpful when there are compound conditions or actions.

If <condition>, then <result>

---
comment number 32
Page=32 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 2

---
comment number 33
Page=33 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 3

---
comment number 34
Page=33 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace after table 3

---
comment number 35
Page=34 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
LBA Mid register

"register" terminology no longer exists in ATA8-ACS, and LBA is now just LBA (47:0), not Low/Mid/High, so this is not a good example any more.

---
comment number 36
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
translation layer
s/b
SCSI/ATA translation layer

---
comment number 37
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
otherwise
s/b
otherwise

---
comment number 38
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
otherwise
s/b
otherwise
Serial ATA or Parallel ATA devices by representing ATA devices as SCSI direct-access block devices

s/b ATA or ATAPI devices by representing them as SCSI peripheral devices.
since there is an ATAPI annex now.

---

device server
ATA device or ATAPI device

---

(see SAM-3)
(see SAM-4)

---

EXAMPLE 1 -
Change these 3 "EXAMPLEs" back into standard paragraphs.

---

ATA device
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards
ATA device s/b ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

---

ATA device s/b ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

---

ATA device s/b ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

---

ATA device s/b ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

---

ATA device s/b ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

---

ATA device s/b ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

occurs:

occurs, then:

Serial ATA device

since this does not apply to ATAPI devices, but the term "Serial ATA device" means both ATA and ATAPI

An ATA nexus loss also occurs for ATAPI devices.
READ CAPACITY (16)
s/b
READ CAPACITY (16) parameter data

throughout table 5

---

comment number 57
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Table 5 -

font in table title is wrong

---

comment number 58
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
.  
s/b
;

---

comment number 59
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
.  
s/b
;

---

comment number 60
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
that  
s/b
that:

---

comment number 61
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
It is important to note...

is not standardese

---

comment number 62
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Not supposed to refer to section numbers in other standards

---

comment number 63
Page=39 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 5

102
ATA device

ATAPI devices also respond to ATA hardware resets and software resets

Text in c) after the : needs to be indented more

where should be on its own line

In figures 8, 9, and 10, the ATA row "LOGICAL" start with a capital L and then has smallcaps. It should be all smallcaps or all mixed case

There needs to be a paragraph introducing each figure.

ALIGNMENT field
s/b
ALIGNMENT field

ALIGNMENT field
s/b
ALIGNMENT field

After queue
add.

---
comment number 72
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
command Priority
s/b
Command priority

---
comment number 73
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Command Priority
s/b lowercase

---
comment number 74
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Command Priorities
s/b lowercase

---
comment number 75
Page=46 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=delete whitespace above table 8

---
comment number 76
Page=46 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Consider adding (i.e., ) to confirm the meaning of the priority values in SCSI and ATA:

| 0h (i.e., vendor-specific) | 0 (i.e., normal priority) |
| 1h (i.e., highest priority) | 1 (i.e., high priority) |
| Fh (i.e., lowest priority) | 0 (i.e., normal priority) |

---
comment number 77
Page=47 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
6.4 needs to mention how TMFs for ATAPI devices are handled or not handled.

Just defining that all TMFs are replied to with FUNCTION REJECTED would suffice.

---
comment number 78
Page=47 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Section 6.4.3 probably also applies to ATAPI devices.

---
comment number 79
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
CLEAR ATA
s/b
CLEAR ACA

---
comment number 80
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
"shall process the CLEAR ACA task management function as defined in SAM-4" is misleading, because NOTE 7 then says that the only option is to reject it.

---
comment number 81
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add:
I_T_NEXUS_RESET

It should be similar to ABORT TASK SET

---
comment number 82
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
6.4.8 should also mention establishing the unit attention condition defined in SAM-4

---
comment number 83
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
devices
s/b
PATA devices

---
comment number 84
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add:
QUERY TASK SET

It should be similar to QUERY TASK, but reporting if any task is in the task set, not just a specific I_T_L_Q nexus.

---
comment number 85
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Add: QUERY ASYNCHRONOUS EVENT
to report any unit attention conditions that the SATL has established.

---

The smallcaps are lost in the table of contents.

---

Delete this level:
6.5.1 CONTROL byte overview since there is no 6.5.2.

---

occurred s/b occurred

---

nexusus s/n nexuses

---

nexusus s/n nexuses

---

nexusus s/n nexuses
---
comment number 92
Page=50 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add more 6.x sections describing what the SATL does if it detects every
SCSI event defined in SAM-4 on the front side, just like 6.6 describes
handling of I_T nexus loss on the front side. (e.g. if the SATL is in a
FC to SATA bridge, and there is a hard reset, etc. on the FC side).
Make them subsections of one "6.x SCSI events" section
a) power on: <not sure what to say>
b) hard reset: abort outstanding ATA commands, delete commands in the
internal context, establish unit attention condition. Should it send an
ATA hardware reset in all cases rather than a software reset?
c) logical unit reset: move the functional description from 6.4.8 into
here.
c) power loss expected: abort outstanding ATA commands like with I_T nexus
loss (or like hard reset?), delete commands in the internal context,
establish unit attention condition.
---
comment number 93
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(see 6.4.2)
6.4.2 only covers queued commands; need to also refer to 6.4.3 to cover
non-queued commands. (I_T nexus loss is a SCSI event, so could occur even
while a non-queued command is outstanding)
---
comment number 94
Page=50 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Section 6.6 also applies to ATAPI devices; there's no way to reject a SCSI
event (unlike the TMFs).
The SATL doesn't abort commands with CHECK POWER MODE in that case; it
should use the ATA hardware reset or software reset only. In the first
list, changing 1) to refer to 6.4.3 should cover that. Item 3) does not apply, however, as the ATAPI device establishes its own unit attention
condition.
---
comment number 95
Page=50 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
LINK
If set to one, the SATL shall terminate the command with CHECK CONDITION
status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB.

since it is obsolete in SAM-4

---

comment number 96
Page=51 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete this level

7.1 Translated and emulated commands

since there is no 7.2

---

comment number 97
Page=51 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SCSI to ATA command mapping for ATA devices

Add in the concept of "mapping to a SCSI logical unit with a peripheral device type of 00h (i.e., direct-access block device)"

---

comment number 98
Page=51 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Translation

is not the right word for ATAPI

---

comment number 99
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
In the ATA command list,

FORMAT UNIT uses no "and" or "or"
REASSIGN BLOCKS uses "and"
START STOP UNIT uses "or"
SYNCHRONIZE CACHE uses "or"
WRITE BUFFER uses "or"

pick one convention

---

comment number 100
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add SECURITY PROTOCOL IN/OUT to table 10

---

comment number 101
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add CHECK POWER MODE to the ATA command(s) for REQUEST SENSE
---
comment number 102
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add IDLE IMMEDIATE and STANDBY IMMEDIATE to list of ATA command(s) for
START STOP UNIT

---
comment number 103
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add "ATA verify commands" and "ATA flush commands" to the list of ATA
command(s) for START STOP UNIT

---
comment number 104
Page=52 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add GET MEDIA STATUS to the list of ATA command(s) for TEST UNIT READY

---
comment number 105
Page=53 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
mapping
s/b
command mapping

since SPC mode pages, VPD pages, etc. are not described in section 8

---
comment number 106
Page=54 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete

BQUE Unspecified (see 3.4.2)

it is obsolete in SPC-4

---
comment number 107
Page=54 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete

MCHNGR
The SATL shall set this bit to zero to indicate the peripheral device is
not attached to a medium transport element.

it is obsolete in SPC-4

---
comment number 108
Add a CDB table in 8.4 with "As defined in MODE SELECT (6) (see 8.3)" descriptions.

Note that the operation code must change to 55h for MODE SELECT (10).

---

Add a CDB table in 8.6 with "As defined in MODE SENSE (6) (see 8.5)" descriptions.

Note that the OPERATION CODE must change to 5Ah for MODE SENSE (10).

---

ILLEGIAL s/b ILLEGAL

---

standby power management state

s/b

Standby mode

when referring to the ATA device state

---

Information on sense data contents should be moved into a new clause in chapter 5, since it is equally applicable to both REQUEST SENSE parameter data and autosense data.

---

FORMAT UNIT in progress

s/b

Format operation in progress

to match terminology in sbc3r15

---

sbc3r15
Comment=
(i.e., the ATA device is in the Standby power management state)

ATA Standby can also mean SCSI standby, so this is not a good i.e. It would even be misleading as an e.g.

---

comment number 115
Page=62 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Keep 8.8.4, 8.8.6, and 8.8.7 together since they're all power conditions. 8.8.5 belongs elsewhere.

---

comment number 116
Page=63 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
8.9.1 has "hanging paragraphs"

There should be no 8.9.1 if there is no 8.9.2.

If a section has subsections, it cannot have introductory text.

---

comment number 117
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Security_Protocol

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

---

comment number 118
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SP_Specific

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

---

comment number 119
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDLE power condition
s/b
lowercase

---

comment number 120
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
STANDBY power condition
s/b
lowercase
standby power condition
s/b
Standby mode

when referring to the ATA device state. (ATA8-ACS is inconsistent, sometimes using state, power management mode, etc.)

power condition field
s/b
smallcaps

power condition field
s/b
smallcaps

idle power condition
s/b
Idle mode

(or whatever ATA-ACS2 decides is the preferred terminology)

IDLE
s/b
Idle

STANDBY
s/b
Standby
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
A2h
s/b
B5h

---

comment number 128
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=All the 8.9.1.x references in table 23 should be to 8.10.1.x

---

comment number 129
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Description needs to include TRUSTED NON-DATA too

---

comment number 130
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=8.10.1 has "hanging paragraphs"

There should be no 8.10.1 if there is no 8.10.2.

If a section has subsections, it cannot have introductory text.

---

comment number 131
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

---

comment number 132
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

---

comment number 133
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SECURITY PROTOCOL
s/b
the SECURITY PROTOCOL field

---

comment number 134
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
allocation length is zero,
the ALLOCATION LENGTH field is set to zero, then

---
comment number 135
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
specified ALLOCATION LENGTH number of bytes
s/b
number of bytes specified by the ALLOCATION LENGTH field

with caution for how INC_512 makes that violate the standard SCSI
definition for ALLOCATION LENGTH (which should never have been done - the
field should have a different name in SPC-4)

---
comment number 136
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
INC_512 was proposed as necessary to ease SAT translations. SAT-2 has no
problem defining that the SATL multiply by 512 when needed, however. I
suggest the SAT WG consider if INC_512 should be dropped from SPC-4.

---
comment number 137
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
the INC_512 is set
s/b
the INC_512 bit is set

---
comment number 138
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field

---
comment number 139
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SECURITY PROTOCOL
s/b
the SECURITY PROTOCOL field

---
comment number 140
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field
---
comment number 141
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field

---
comment number 142
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
lowercase

---
comment number 143
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ALLOCATION LENGTH (15:0)
s/b
the value of the ALLOCATION LENGTH field.

---
comment number 144
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
"this field" is overstated

Applies only for these values in this field

---
comment number 145
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
for...
s/b
for the number of blocks specified by the ATA Trans_Length field

---
comment number 146
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Security_Protocol

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

---
comment number 147
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SP_Specific

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _
---
comment number 148
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer_Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

---
comment number 149
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer_Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

---
comment number 150
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
transfer length is zero
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field is set to 00000000h, then

---
comment number 151
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FFFFh
s/b
0000FFFFh

to make it clearer how wide the field is and why it could exceed all Fs

---
comment number 152
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1FF_FE00h
s/b
01FF_FE00h (i.e., FFFFh x 512)

to make it clear how wide the field is

---
comment number 153
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
bytes
s/b
a number of bytes

---
comment number 154
SECURITY PROTOCOL field
s/b
TRANSFER LENGTH field

... comment number 155
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DIAGNOSTIC
s/b
DIAGNOSTIC

... comment number 156
Page=70 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= delete whitespace above table 27

... comment number 157
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
s/b
,

... comment number 158
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= convert this sentence into an a)b)c) list like the first row of the table.

... comment number 159
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
the the
s/b
the

... comment number 160
Page=71 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= Delete:
If the MODE field is set to 02h, the SATL shall send an ATA WRITE BUFFER
command to the ATA device. If the MODE field is set to 05h the SATL shall
send a DOWNLOAD MICROCODE command to the ATA device as specified in table
29.

Those sentences omit 07h, and those rules already fully described by table
29.

...
comment number 161
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
features register
s/b
ATA Features field

---

comment number 162
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
indicating
downloaded microcode is saved for immediate and future
use (see 8.13.2.3)
Convert to an (i.e., )

---

comment number 163
Page=71 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=In 07h row, add reference to 8.13.2.4.

---

comment number 164
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
 s/b
 ,

---

comment number 165
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
 s/b
 ,

---

comment number 166
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
field the
 s/b
field, then the

---

comment number 167
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
MODE
 s/b
smallcaps

---
comment number 168
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
"and then complete the WRITE BUFFER command with GOOD status"

is technically wrong. Two sentences later says the command is terminated with CHECK CONDITION status if there is an error.

---

comment number 169
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set of WRITE BUFFER commands
s/b
WRITE BUFFER command

There is no "set" with mode 5h.

---

comment number 170
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
07:00
s/b
7:0

(similarly through table 30 and 8.13.2.4, delete leading 0s in the decimal bit numbers)

---

comment number 171
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
BUFFER OFFSET
s/b
smallcaps

---

comment number 172
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH
s/b
smallcaps

---

comment number 173
Page=73 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
delete the black fill in table 30; straddle cell vertically with Contents

---

comment number 174
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Field Name Bits
s/b bold

---

comment number 175
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= indirect
s/b indirect

---

comment number 176
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= mapping
s/b command mapping

since SBC mode pages, VPD pages, etc. are not described in section 9

---

comment number 177
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= may implement...

convert into a) b) list

---

comment number 178
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Size

should probably be lowercase

---

comment number 179
Page=76 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= Delete blank page above table 31.

If that makes the table wrap pages, add (page 1 of 2) to table title

---

comment number 180
Page=76 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= The Overlap feature set no longer exists in ATA8-ACS

---

comment number 181
Page=76 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= SATA-2.6 NCQ
because ATA8-ACS defines this feature set, mentioning SATA-2.6 in the name is not necessary (although the details are in SATA-2.6, SAT doesn't need to say that)

---

comment number 182
Page=76 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DMA is not a "feature set" so doesn't really fit as a column labeled "ATA feature sets required to be supported and enabled"

---

comment number 183
Page=77 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
delete specified for consistency

---

comment number 184
Page=77 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
The usual sorting of fields in SCSI standards is top-to-bottom, left-to-right, so this should be:
OPERATION CODE
FMTPINFO
LONGLIST
FMTDATA
CMPLIST
DEFECT LIST FORMAT

---

comment number 185
Page=80 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
delete specified for consistency

---

comment number 186
Page=81 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
delete specified by the READ (10) command.
so other command descriptions can refer to this field

---
comment number 187  
Page=82 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott  
Comment=  
Replace RDPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER,  
and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:  
As defined in READ (10) (see 9.5)

---

comment number 188  
Page=83 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott  
Comment=  
Replace RDPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER,  
and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:  
As defined in READ (10) (see 9.5)

---

comment number 189  
Page=84 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott  
Comment=  
Delete specified  
for consistency

---

comment number 190  
Page=85 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott  
Comment=  
Delete  
RTO_EN Unspecified (see 3.4.2)

It was merged into P_TYPE

---

comment number 191  
Page=85 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott  
Comment=  
Delete specified  
for consistency

---

comment number 192  
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott  
Comment=  
The SATL shall emulate the REASSIGN BLOCKS command as defined in table 43.

s/b  
Table 41 shows the translation for fields in the REASSIGN BLOCKS CDB.  
for consistency. Although this table has no literal translations, it also has no information about emulation.
comment number 193
Page=87 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(see 3.1.17)

Cannot create active cross references to Frame sections inside Visio figures, so better to leave these out.

comment number 194
Page=88 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)

NOFLUSH
s/b
NO_FLUSH
to match SBC-3

comment number 195
Page=88 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
To match the order in SBC-3:
Move POWER CONDITION MODIFIER after IMMED
Move NO_FLUSH after POWER CONDITION

comment number 196
Page=88 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified
for consistency

comment number 197
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0
s/b
00h
to match other entries

comment number 198
Page=90 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Make table 45 Descriptor column wider so it doesn't take as much space.
Add (part 1 of 2) to table title if it continues to wrap
Adjust formatting so there is not a page of white space above the table

---

comment number 199
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
OOh - START_VALID
s/b
OOh (i.e., START_VALID)

Use uppercase, not smallcaps.

Make similar change in other rows in table 45

---

comment number 200
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Translation
s/b
field translation

---

comment number 201
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
POWER CONDITION
s/b
Code

---

comment number 202
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
stopped power state
s/b
stopped power condition, standby power condition, or idle power condition

since this moves out of any state, not just stopped

---

comment number 203
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes
s/b
If the ATA flush command in step 2) completes

---

comment number 204
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b
If the ATA flush command in step 2) completes

---

comment number 205
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

---

comment number 206
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

---

comment number 207
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
..
s/b
; or

---

comment number 208
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
.. s/b
;

---

comment number 209
Page=90 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete (see 9.11.2)

That section is only for errors; this is a GOOD status entry.

---

comment number 210
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
zero
s/b
00h

to communicate the field width and better parallel the 44h below

---

comment number 211
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
03
s/b
03h

---
comment number 212
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

---
comment number 213
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

---
comment number 214
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

---
comment number 215
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

---
comment number 216
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete (see 9.11.2)
since this is for GOOD status

---
comment number 217
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete (see 9.11.2)
since this is for GOOD status

---
comment number 218
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
ATA STANDBY command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY command in step 4) completes

---
comment number 219
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY command in step 4) completes

---
comment number 220
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

---
comment number 221
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

---
comment number 222
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FORCE_S_0
s/b
FORCE_STANDBY_0

---
comment number 223
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Comment on Text Author=HPQ-jwolford
Comment=
one
s/b
zero

---
comment number 224
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

s/b

---
comment number 225
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

... comment number 226
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

... comment number 227
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

... comment number 228
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

... comment number 229
ATA MEDIA EJECT command completes
s/b
ATA MEDIA EJECT command in step 2) completes

... comment number 230
ATA MEDIA EJECT command completes
s/b
ATA MEDIA EJECT command in step 2) completes

... comment number 231
Replace SYNC_NV, IMMED, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and NUMBER OF BLOCKS descriptions with:
As defined in Synchronize (10) (see 9.12)
comment number 232
Page=93 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete specified
for consistency

---

comment number 233
Page=93 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete specified
for consistency

---

comment number 234
Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
If the NOFLUSH bit is set to one, the SATL shall not send an ATA flush command. If the NOFLUSH bit is set to zero, the SATL shall send an ATA flush command.

Really, this field is just used in table 45 while interpreting certain POWER CONDITION values; these statements don't make sense on their own.

Reword to something generic like:
The NOFLUSH bit specifies whether the SATL sends an ATA flush condition while processing certain power condition requests (see table 45 in 9.11.2).

---

comment number 235
Page=94 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
describes s/b shows
for consistency

---

comment number 236
Page=95 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace VRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and VERIFICATION LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in VERIFY (10) (see 9.14)

---

comment number 237
Page=95 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
describes

129
s/b shows for consistency

---
comment number 238
Page=95 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=In VERIFY (12), GROUP NUMBER belongs after VERIFICATION LENGTH

---
comment number 239
Page=96 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Replace VRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and VERIFICATION LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in VERIFY (10) (see 9.14)

---
comment number 240
Page=96 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=s/b shows for consistency

---
comment number 241
Page=96 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=In VERIFY (16), GROUP NUMBER belongs after VERIFICATION LENGTH

---
comment number 242
Page=97 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For consistency, add:
9.xx VERIFY commands overview
9.xx WRITE LONG commands overview
9.xx WRITE SAME commands overview

---
comment number 243
Page=98 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete specified for consistency

---
comment number 244
Page=99 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete specified for consistency

---
comment number 245
Page=100 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE (10) (see 9.19)

---
comment number 246
Page=100 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete specified for consistency

---
comment number 247
Page=100 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE (12), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

---
comment number 248
Page=101 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FUA-NV
s/b
FUA_NV

---
comment number 249
Page=101 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
As appropriate, replace WRPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE (10) (see 9.19)
Note that this table is not literally the same (unlike WRITE (12)). WRITE (10) has a NOTE 1 inside the FUA_NV description, while this table has a similar footnote a. These discrepancies are why it is better to only have the rules one place.

---
comment number 250
Page=101 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete specified
for consistency

---
comment number 251
Page=101 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE (16), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

---
comment number 252
Page=102 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

---
comment number 253
Page=103 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE AND VERIFY (10) (see 9.23)

---
comment number 254
Page=103 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

---
comment number 255
Page=103 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE AND VERIFY (12), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

---
comment number 256
Page=104 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
mappingthe
s/b
mapping the

---
comment number 257
Page=104 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE AND VERIFY (10) (see 9.23)

---
comment number 258
Page=104 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified
for consistency

---

comment number 259
Page=104 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified
for consistency

---

comment number 260
Page=104 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE AND VERIFY (16), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

---

comment number 261
Page=105 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=delete whitespace above table 60

---

comment number 262
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Field Translations
s/b
lowercase

---

comment number 263
Page=106 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=physical
s/b
physical

---

comment number 264
Page=106 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified
for consistency

---

comment number 265
Page=106 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Field Translations
s/b
lowercase

---
comment number 266
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
client and
s/b
client and

---
comment number 267
Page=107 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add "shows" sentence for consistency

---
comment number 268
Page=107 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=PBDATA goes ahead of LBDATA

---
comment number 269
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

---
comment number 270
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

---
comment number 271
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

---
comment number 272
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS
---
comment number 273
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
in
s/b
in the

---
comment number 274
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
and
s/b
and the

---
comment number 275
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
clientand
s/b
client and

---
comment number 276
Page=109 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, LBDATA, PBDATA, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and NUMBER OF BLOCKS descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE SAME (10) (see 9.28)

---
comment number 277
Page=109 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add "shows" sentence for consistency

---
comment number 278
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

---
comment number 279
Page=109 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
For WRITE SAME (16), GROUP NUMBER goes after NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

---
comment number 280
Page=110 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
while
s/b
and

---
comment number 281
Page=111 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace below table 66

---
comment number 282
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Unspecified (see 3.4.2)
s/b
Shall be set to zero

for SPF

---
comment number 283
Page=113 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=This field

---
comment number 284
Page=113 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=TAS should be after ATO

---
comment number 285
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=UA_INTLCK_CTRL
no
Shall be set to 00b

I think this should be Unspecified (see 3.4.2). SATL should be allowed to implement unit attention interlock if it wants.

---
comment number 286
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=n/a
s/b
no

for SPF

---
comment number 287
Page=114 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete blank row in table 70, or (more likely) add the missing SPF row:
SPF no Shall be set to zero (see SBC-3)

---
comment number 288
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
00h
s/b
0000h

---
comment number 289
Page=114 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
; and

---
comment number 290
Page=114 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
.

---
comment number 291
Page=114 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
;

---
comment number 292
Page=115 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add SPF row
SPF no Shall be set to zero

---
comment number 293
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
,
s/b
;

---
comment number 294
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set zero
s/b
set to zero
---
comment number 295
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set zero
s/b
set to zero
---

---
comment number 296
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set zero
s/b
set to zero
---

---
comment number 297
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Pages
s/b
lowercase
---

---
comment number 298
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Pages Overview
s/b
lowercase
---

---
comment number 299
Page=117 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add EBACKERR bit above LOGERR
---

---
comment number 300
Page=118 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Move table 74 intro paragraph directly above table 74.
Move table 75 intro paragraph directly above table 75.
---

---
comment number 301
Page=118 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Page
s/b
lowercase
---
comment number 302
Page=118 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Page
s/b lowercase

---
comment number 303
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Changable
s/b Changeable

---
comment number 304
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Page Fields
s/b lowercase

---
comment number 305
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
seto
s/b
set

---
comment number 306
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
the STANDBY CONDITION TIMER shall return zero
s/b
this field shall be set to zero

---
comment number 307
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
the STANDBY bit

---
comment number 308
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
COUNT field
s/b
the Count field
---
comment number 309
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
STANDBY CONDITION TIMER field
s/b
smallcaps
---

comment number 310
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
: s/b
,
and join the paragraphs
---

comment number 311
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
: s/b
,
and join the paragraphs
---

comment number 312
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Log pages
s/b
Log parameters
---

comment number 313
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Log pages
s/b
Log parameters
---

comment number 314
Page=120 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
I recommend sorting table 74 by the left column's values, not the right column's values
---

comment number 315
Page=120 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Show what happens to value 0 in table 75
After F1h
add (i.e., 30 minutes)

[or whatever is correct]

power condition mode page
s/b
Power Condition mode page

Mode Page
s/b
lowercase

Add Supported Log Pages and Subpages (00h / FFh)

Most of the description can reference Supported Log Pages (00h / 00h)

Add subpage codes after each log page code (these pages are all xxh / 00h)

delete whitespace above table 77

table 2
is incorrect; probably mean table 78.
---
comment number 323
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to
---

comment number 324
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to
---

comment number 325
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to
---

comment number 326
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to
---

comment number 327
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to
---

comment number 328
Page=121 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=left justify Description or Reference in table 77
---

comment number 329
Page=121 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Decide if all log pages should describe the log page header fields (DS, SPF, PAGE CODE, SUBPAGE CODE, PAGE LENGTH) or not and make them consistent.

Right now, 10.2.2 shows none of them, 10.2.4 shows two of the fields, ...
comment number 330
Page=122 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Table 2
s/b
table 78 (see 10.2.2.2)

---

comment number 331
Page=123 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
table 81.1).
s/b
table 81).

---

comment number 332
Page=123 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SUPPORTED PAGE LIST
s/b
Supported pages

---

comment number 333
Page=123 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
DS  Shall be set to zero

---

comment number 334
Page=123 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Combine LBIN and LP into FORMAT AND LINKING 2-bit field

---

comment number 335
Page=125 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TIMESTAMP
s/b
ACCUMULATED POWER ON HOURS

---

comment number 336
Page=128 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DS
Shall be set to zero

---

comment number 337
Page=128 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Combine LBIN and LP into FORMAT AND LINKING (2 bit field)
---
comment number 338
Page=128 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Vendor Specific
s/v
Vendor specific

---
comment number 339
Page=129 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Make the left column of table 86 wider to avoid wrapping the B1h row

---
comment number 340
Page=129 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Put PERIPHERAL QUALIFIER first

---
comment number 341
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SUPPORTED VPD LIST
s/b
Supported VPD page list

---
comment number 342
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
This list shall contain the page codes of the pages supported by the SATL
in ascending order of page codes beginning with page code 00h.
s/b
Unspecified (see 3.4.3)

---
comment number 343
Page=130 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
80h
s/b
the value defined in table 88

---
comment number 344
Page=130 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
14h
s/b
the value defined in table 88

---
comment number 345
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
83h
s/b
the value defined in table 90

---
comment number 346
Page=131 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Change "identification descriptor" to "designation descriptor" throughout 10.3.4

---
comment number 347
Page=131 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
Designation descriptor list
with horizontal double lines
between 3-4

---
comment number 348
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0b
s/b
the value defined in table 91

---
comment number 349
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
00b
s/b
the value defined in table 91

---
comment number 350
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
3h
s/b
the value defined in table 91

---
comment number 351
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0h
s/b
the value defined in table 91

---
comment number 352
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1h
s/b
the value defined in table 91

---

comment number 353
Page=132 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
The IDENTIFIER LENGTH field shall be set to the value defined in table 91.

---

comment number 354
Page=132 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
After table 91 and 93, change the "shall be" verbs to "is" to match wording after table 95.

---

comment number 355
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

---

comment number 356
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER LENGTH
s/b
DESIGNATOR LENGTH

---

comment number 357
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

---

comment number 358
Page=132 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
The DESIGNATOR LENGTH field shall be set to the value defined in table 91.

---

comment number 359
Page=133 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
The DESIGNATOR LENGTH field shall be set to the value defined in table 93.

---
comment number 360
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Oh
s/b
the value defined in table 93

---
comment number 361
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
2h
s/b
the value defined in table 93

---
comment number 362
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Ob
s/b
the value defined in table 93

---
comment number 363
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
00b
s/b
the value defined in table 93

---
comment number 364
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1h
s/b
the value defined in table 93

---
comment number 365
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
contains the string "ATA``"
s/b
shall be set to the value defined in table 93

---
comment number 366
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER LENGTH
s/b
DESIGNATOR LENGTH

---
comment number 367
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

---
comment number 368
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

---
comment number 369
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
al be
s/b
shall be

---
comment number 370
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1h
s/b
the value defined in table 95

---
comment number 371
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
one
s/b
the value defined in table 95

---
comment number 372
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
01b
s/b
the value defined in table 95

---
comment number 373
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
3h
s/b
the value defined in table 95

---
comment number 374
Page=135 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
The DESIGNATOR LENGTH field is set to the value defined in table 95.

---
comment number 375
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

---
comment number 376
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

---
comment number 377
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER LENGTH
s/b
DESIGNATOR LENGTH

---
comment number 378
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
block device characteristics
s/b
mixed case

---
comment number 379
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
87h
s/b
the value defined in table 96

---
comment number 380
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
The medium rotation rate needs to be treated as a 16-bit value and have its endianness converted (bytes swapped). SBC-3 revision 16 incorrectly omits the (MSB)/(LSB) labels, which might lead someone into byte preserving rather than byte swapping.

To avoid endianness confusion, I recommend a table like table 94 be added,
specifying exactly where each byte goes.

SCSI byte 4 = ATA word 217 bits 15:8
SCSI byte 5 = ATA word 217 bits 7:0

---
comment number 387
Page=138 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete the level

11.1 Error translation - ATA device error to SCSI error map

since there is no 11.2

---
comment number 388
Page=138 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Change:
Error and sense reporting
to:
Translation of ATA errors to SCSI errors

---
comment number 389
Page=138 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Consider moving 11 into 5.xx, since it is only one page long.

---
comment number 390
Page=139 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
mode pages and VPD pages
add "security protocols" to cover 12.5.

Add an introductory paragraph for security protocols after the VPD paragraph.

---
comment number 391
Page=139 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
In the mode page list, add ATA Power Condition mode page to cover 12.3.3.

---
comment number 392
Page=139 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Consider moving 12.2 (SAT-specific SCSI commands) into its own top level
section (after 9), and moving 12.3 (mode pages), 12.4 (VPD pages), and 12.5
(security protocols) into section 10.xx.

---
comment number 393
Page=139 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Incorporate:
08-344r0 SAT-2 ATA PASS-THROUGH sense data format
to stop returning descriptor format sense data to applications expecting fixed format sense data.

---
comment number 394
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DEVICE RESET
s/b Device Reset
to match capitalization in ata8-acs-r6.
To match terminology in ata8-aam-r3, though, this should be Non-data Command - DEVICE RESET

---
comment number 395
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Device Diagnostic
s/b Execute Device Diagnostic
to match ata8-acs-r6

---
comment number 396
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FPDMA
ata8-acs defines no such protocol; it lumps the FPDMA commands into the "DMA Queued" protocol. Mark as obsolete?

---
comment number 397
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
UDMA Data In
UDMA Data Out
ata8-acs-r6 and ata8-aam-r3 define no such protocols. Mark as obsolete?

---
comment number 398
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Non-data
s/b
Non-Data
to match capitalization in ata8-acb-r6. However, ata8-aam-r3 uses "Non-data".

---
comment number 399
Page=140 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ata8-acb-r6 and ata8-aam-r3 add the word "Command" to the end of:
PIO Data-In
PIO Data-Out
DMA
DMA Queued
Non-data

---
comment number 400
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA hardware reset
s/b
Device Management - ATA hardware reset
to match terminology in ata8-aam-r3

---
comment number 401
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SRST
s/b
Device Management - ATA software reset
to match terminology in ata8-aam-r3

---
comment number 402
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=ATA Status Return Descriptor

---
comment number 403
Page=141 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
value in the

---
comment number 404
Page=141 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
value in the
---
comment number 405
Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
format
s/b
the format

---
comment number 406
Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
; s/b
,

---
comment number 407
Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PASSTHROUGH
s/b
PASS-THROUGH

---
comment number 408
Page=147 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
one to access this mode page
s/b
the value defined in table 110

---
comment number 409
Page=148 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace below table 111

---
comment number 410
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
shown
s/b
shown in

---
comment number 411
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0Ah
s/b
the value defined in table 110

---
comment number 412
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0004h
s/b
the value defined in table 110

---

comment number 413
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
F1h
s/b
the value defined in table 110

---

comment number 414
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer
s/b
Transfer

---

comment number 415
Page=151 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 115

---

comment number 416
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1Ah
s/b
the value defined in table 115

---

comment number 417
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
F1h
s/b
the value defined in table 115

---

comment number 418
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PAGE CODE
s/b
The PAGE CODE field

---

comment number 419
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
The SUBPAGE CODE field

---

comment number 420
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
one to access this page
s/b
the value defined in table 115

---

comment number 421
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device signature

Since ata8-acs-r6 uses the terms "ATA device signature" and "ATAPI device signature", it may be best to rename this field to plain "device signature"

---

comment number 422
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
89h
s/b
the value defined in table 116

---

comment number 423
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
238h
s/b
the value defined in table 116

---

comment number 424
Page=155 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Footnote b is not consistent with field names ending with EXP any more, as ata8-acs-r6 does not use those names. It uses names like LBA LOW (7:0) and LBA LOW (15:8).

Rename the fields to match the ata8-acs-r6 terminology.

---

comment number 425
Page=155 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
may contain the values shown in table 118
s/b
is defined in table 118
The INC_512 bit shall be set to zero. If a SECURITY PROTOCOL IN command is received with the INC_512 bit is set to one, then the SECURITY PROTOCOL IN command shall be terminated with CHECK CONDITION status, with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB.

This is unnecessary. A SATL should be allowed to return 512 byte chunks of data with padding. Ease of mapping into ATA was touted as the reason the INC_512 bit was proposed.
---
comment number 432
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
LENGTH
s/b
LENGTH (13)

since it is known.
(assuming the paragraph below is accurate)

---
comment number 433
Page=157 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=(global)

SAT-2 needs to define specifically how to translate ATA information into these SCSI fields. What IDENTIFY DEVICE data word and bit cause S_SUPRT to be set to one and zero?

---
comment number 434
Page=157 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Field definition paragraphs should be top-to-bottom, left-to-right.

---
comment number 435
Page=157 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=10-15 should be one straddled Reserved field

---
comment number 436
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=set password function

The "set password function" has not been defined for SP IN (unlike SP OUT). This should probably be "for the ATA Device Server Password security protocol" since there are no subfunctions defined.

---
comment number 437
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=of the , then
s/b
??

---
comment number 438
Page=158 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=The SATL needs to snoop the current security mode to implement table 123.
What it is expected to snoop to do that should be defined.

---
comment number 439
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Table footnotes 1 and 2 should be a and b

---
comment number 440
Page=159 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Define what shading means in a table footnote.

---
comment number 441
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Fix ??

---
comment number 442
Page=159 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Rather than try to list each mode page, combine all the entries into one row:
"All other mode pages"

---
comment number 443
Page=160 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Rather than try to list each security protocol, combine into one row:
"All other security protocols"

---
comment number 444
Page=161 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=fix double line on page 161

---
comment number 445
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Table footnotes in table 123 should be a b not 1 2

---
comment number 446
Page=162 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete:

The INC_512 bit shall be set to zero. If a SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command is received with the INC_512 bit is set to one, then the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command shall be terminated with CHECK CONDITION status, with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB

This is unnecessary. A SATL should be allowed to accept 512 byte chunks of
data with padding. Ease of mapping into ATA was touted as the reason the INC_512 bit was proposed.

---

comment number 447
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)
"The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value."
and the (MSB) and (LSB) labels.

That’s an awful large number. This means the SATL converts:
SCSI byte 2 (with the MSB) to ATA word 16 bits 15:8 (the MSB in little-endian)
SCSI byte 3 to ATA word 16 bits 7:0
SCSI byte 32 to ATA word 1 bits 15:8
SCSI byte 33 (with the LSB) to ATA word 1 bits 7:0 (the LSB in little-endian)

I suspect the intend was that the PASSWORD field to be passed along preserving the byte order.
SCSI byte 2 to ATA word 1 bits 7:0 (i.e. ATA byte 2)
SCSI byte 3 to ATA word 1 bits 15:8 (i.e., ATA byte 3)
...
SCSI byte 32 to ATA word 16 bits 7:0 (i.e. ATA byte 32)
SCSI byte 33 to ATA word 16 bits 15:8 (i.e. ATA byte 33)

The fix is to simply remove the (MSB) and (LSB) labels. A table showing the desired mapping is highly advisable as well.

Check the other PASSWORD fields as well.

---

comment number 448
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
shall be set to 24h

Weaken this rule to allow INC_512 to be used, and also to allow padding even if the extra bytes are not used. If ATA adds some more fields in that area, SATL should just pass them through.

---

comment number 449
Page=163 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)

SAT-2 should not try to define the functionality of any of the bits in the parameter lists/parameter data. That functionality is defined by ATAB8-ACS; if ACS adds more fields or modifies the definitions, there’s no point in SAT trying to keep up. The SAT-2 standard cannot say "the ATA device shall" do anything - that’s outside of its control. The SATL can hope that the ATA device will work as documented in ATAB8-ACS, but that’s about all.
If this were a command defined in SPC-4 or SBC-3 that native SCSI device servers could implement, then a functional definition would be appropriate (and SAT-2 would define how to translate each SCSI field to the corresponding ATA field).

For table 125, just define that the parameter list is passed along byte-by-byte to the ATA device as the SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content. Apply this same concept to the other definitions.

The SATL does need to snoop the current security mode to implement table 123. What it is expected to snoop to do that should be defined.

---

comment number 450
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)

parameter data
s/b
parameter list

(data-out uses "parameter list", data-in uses "parameter data")

---

comment number 451
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Command Transmission
s/b
lowercase

---

comment number 452
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATAPI device
should not be bold

---

comment number 453
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Device Model
s/b
lowercase

---

comment number 454
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transmission
s/b
lowercase
Comment 455
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= operates by using an ATA command, the PACKET command, in order to transmit a SCSI CDB to the device
s/b accepts a SCSI CDB using the ATA PACKET command (see ATA-ACS)

Comment 456
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= (e.g., read or write operations)

move this earlier, after "primary function"

Comment 457
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= peripheral device type
s/b smallcaps

Comment 458
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= INQUIRY command
s/b standard INQUIRY data

Comment 459
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= A packet device
s/b An ATAPI device

to match term defined in ata8-acs-r6

Comment 460
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment= ATAPI devices may be identified through the issuance of the IDENTIFY DEVICE command. If the device is an ATAPI device, the device aborts the IDENTIFY DEVICE command and returns a specific signature in the ATA register set. The SATL can then obtain the correct identification information about the ATA specific configuration of the ATAPI device by issuing an IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE command.
Rewrite as:
To detect whether an attached device is an ATA device or an ATAPI device, the SATL may issue an IDENTIFY DEVICE command. If the device is an ATAPI device, the device aborts the IDENTIFY DEVICE command and returns a specific signature in the ATA register set.

---
comment number 461
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
CDB
add .

---
comment number 462
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
INQUIRY
s/b
INQUIRY

---
comment number 463
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
error
s/b
CHECK CONDITION status

---
comment number 464
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Command Management
s/b
lowercase

---
comment number 465
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Implementations
s/b
lowercase

---
comment number 466
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Logical Unit Numbers
s/b
lowercase
---
comment number 467
Page=166 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete elsewhere

---
comment number 468
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATAPI protocol
s/b PACKET Command Protocol

---
comment number 469
Page=166 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
This is incorrect.

A SATL shall intercept INQUIRY commands requesting the ATA Information VPD page 89h and return the data for that page directly. If it does so, it must also intercept the Supported VPD pages VPD page 00h and add page 83h to the list.

---
comment number 470
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
command
s/b
command as required by SPC-4.

(provide a little more info)

---
comment number 471
Page=166 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
I suggest deleting A.6. How is a SATL supposed to know that it needs to do this? Only a SATL that only supports a specific ATAPI device could do so; generic SATLs might make things worse by trying to implement REPORT LUNS if the ATAPI device does indeed implement it.

******************************************************************************

Comments attached to Abs ballot from Kevin Butt of IBM Corp.:

Not materially effected
Comments attached to No ballot from John Lohmeyer of LSI Corp.:

LSI comment number 1
Page=1 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=Should all SBC-2 be SBC-3 instead?

LSI comment number 2
Page=3 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This should be << SCSI Block Commands-3 (SBC-3) and SCSI Primary Commands-4 (SPC-4) standards >>

LSI comment number 3
Page=14 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The revision history needs to be removed in the final version.

LSI comment number 4
Page=16 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Mark Evans, Vice-Chair

LSI comment number 5
Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SCSI Primary Commands-4 a

LSI comment number 6
Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SCSI Block Commands-3

LSI comment number 7
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SPC-4, and SBC-3 standards

LSI comment number 8
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=It looks like there is no space between the I and the /. This needs to be fixed.

LSI comment number 9
Page=19 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=Marked set by bbesmer

LSI comment number 10
Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Replace all references to SPC-3 with SPC-4 within this standard.

LSI comment number 11
Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Replace all references to SBC-2 with SBC-3 within this standard.
LSI comment number 12
Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Replace all references to SAS-1.1 with SAS-2 within this standard.

LSI comment number 13
Page=22 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SAS-2 needs to be added to this list.

LSI comment number 14
Page=23 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=Do we have any references to the USB-BOT standard?

LSI comment number 15
Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=All of this << calculated as two times the value returned in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data words 118:117 (see ATA8-ACS) if the ATA device returns a value of one in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 106 bit 12 (i.e., the ATA device supports the Long Logical Sector feature set). The size of an ATA Logical Sector is 512 bytes if the ATA device returns a value of zero in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 106 bit 12 (i.e., the ATA device does not support the Long Logical Sector feature set). >> should be describe in the main body of the text not part of the definition.

LSI comment number 16
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note << NOTE 1 - The Logical Sector >> should be describe in the main body of the text not part of the definition.

LSI comment number 17
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << represented in words; therefore, the number >> should be << represented in words, therefore, the number >>. The semicolon is changed to a comma.

LSI comment number 18
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=All of this << returned in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data words (103:100) minus one if the ATA device returns a value of one in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 86 bit 10 (i.e., the ATA device supports the 48-bit address feature set), or the total number of user addressable sectors returned in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data words (61:60) minus one if the ATA device returns a value of zero in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 86 bit 10 (i.e., the ATA device does not support the 48-bit address feature set) (see ATA8-ACS), >> should be describe in the main body of the text not part of the definition.

LSI comment number 19
Page=28 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=It appears that the READ (32), WRITE (32), VERIFY (32), WRITE AND VERIFY (32) are not here. Is that intentional or should they be added.
LSI comment number 20
Page=29 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
The abbreviations list needs to be scrubbed as the list of standards is not consistent with the normative references.

LSI comment number 21
Page=29 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=
no definition for "dword"

From SAS-2:

dword: A sequence of four contiguous bytes or four contiguous characters considered as a unit. The meaning depends on the context (e.g., when discussing the bits being transmitted over a physical link, dword represents four characters (i.e., 40 bits). When discussing the contents of a frame before 8b10b encoding (see 3.1.2) or after 10b8b decoding (see 3.1.3), dword represents four bytes (i.e., 32 bits)).

LSI comment number 22
Page=29 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=is TCQ obsolete?

LSI comment number 23
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
<< expected >> is not defined a SCSI keyword and should not be in this list.

LSI comment number 24
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This section should be removed and the two entries should be moved to the definitions section.

LSI comment number 25
Page=31 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=
This text (from sas-2) should be added to this specification:

In the event of conflicting information the precedence for requirements defined in this standard is:
1) text;
2) tables; and
3) figures.
Notes do not constitute any requirements for implementers.

LSI comment number 26
Page=35 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=
otherwise
s/b
otherwise

LSI comment number 27
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << I_T nexuses are partially specified in this >>

LSI comment number 28
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=With the previous change this << (e.g., interactions of START STOP UNIT, REQUEST SENSE). >> may have to be modified.

LSI comment number 29
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This is not a "" on this e.g. << (e.g., using cold presence detect, >>

LSI comment number 30
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note should be changed to normative text.

LSI comment number 31
Page=38 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=ASCQ "DRIVE NOT PRESENT" does not exist, perhaps "MEDIUM NOT PRESENT".

LSI comment number 32
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This font is wrong

LSI comment number 33
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=You have to put the name of these annexs or you have to delete the references.

LSI comment number 34
Page=39 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Table 5 - text in this table is too close to the column lines. This needs to be fixed.

LSI comment number 35
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << 117-118 >> is the not correct as it is not the 117 minus 118. It should be changed to 117..118 or 117 through 118.

LSI comment number 36
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << It is important to note that >> should be << Further relationships between SCSI and ATA follow: >>
LSI comment number 37
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << words. >> should be << words; >>

LSI comment number 38
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << valid. >> should be << valid; and >

LSI comment number 39
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should not be a << x >> as it can be easily confused with the multiplication symbol. Either change to an different variable or just replace the << x >> with << logical sectors per physical sector >> and remove the where statement.

LSI comment number 40
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Needs to have a space between << ALIGNMENT >> and << field >>.

LSI comment number 41
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << (part 1) >> should be << (part 1 of 3)

LSI comment number 42
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << (part 2) >> should be << (part 2 of 3)

LSI comment number 43
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << (part 3) >> should be << (part 3 of 3)

LSI comment number 44
Page=43 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << SATA native command queueing (NCQ) or the ATA Tagged Command Queuing (TCQ) feature set. >> should be << SATA NCQ or the ATA TCQ feature set. >> as the acronyms have already been defined.

LSI comment number 45
Page=44 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << Some differences >> should be << Examples of the differences >> or delete << some >>.

LSI comment number 46
Page=45 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=This statement is over-reaching "shall use the maximum queue depth".

LSI comment number 47
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << 16 priorities (0-15), >> should be << 16 priorities (i.e., 0..15), >>
LSI comment number 48  
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie  
Comment=1..3

LSI comment number 49  
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie  
Comment=4..15

LSI comment number 50  
Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie  
Comment=  
Which of the 300 subclauses in this standard is being referenced here?

LSI comment number 51  
Page=47 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer  
Comment=Is it always possible to send this?

LSI comment number 52  
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie  
Comment=This should be << terminate >> as the command ends with at CC.

LSI comment number 53  
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie  
Comment=This << Obsolete >> should be deleted.

LSI comment number 54  
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie  
Comment=  
This << obsolete TARGET RESET task management function >> should be <<  
TARGET RESET task management function (see SAM-2)>>

LSI comment number 55  
Page=50 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer  
Comment=How is this different from section 5.5?

LSI comment number 56  
Page=51 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer  
Comment=  
Missing:  
- SECURITY PROTOCOL IN  
- SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT

LSI comment number 57  
Page=51 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer  
Comment=  
Missing from Start/Stop Unit:  

IDLE IMMEDIATE  
STANDBY IMMEDIATE  
READ VERIFY SECTOR(S) EXT

LSI comment number 58  
Page=62 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie  
Comment=
What happens if the SMART feature set is enabled and MRIE or DExcpt are some other value?

LSI comment number 59
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << IDLE), then the SATL >>

LSI comment number 60
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << STANDBY), then the S >>

LSI comment number 61
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should be not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 62
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 63
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 64
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 65
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 66
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 67
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=(ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 68
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << specified ALLOCATION LENGTH number of bytes >> should be << number of bytes specified in the ALLOCATION LENGTH field. >>

LSI comment number 69
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to one: >>

LSI comment number 70
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to zero: >>

LSI comment number 71
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 72
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
Should be << translation of the SECURITY PROTOCOL field is unspecified >>

LSI comment number 73
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 74
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 75
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 76
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 77
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 78
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 79
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 80
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 81
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to one: >>

LSI comment number 82
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to zero: >>

LSI comment number 83
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
Should be << translation of the SECURITY PROTOCOL field is unspecified >>

LSI comment number 84
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << performing >> should be << processing >>
LSI comment number 85
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << 1 through 6 exist >> should be << 1 through 6 are valid >>

LSI comment number 86
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << set to 512; >> should be << set to 512; >> i.e. semicolon replaced with comma.

LSI comment number 87
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << other than 512; >> should be << other than 512; >> i.e. semicolon replaced with comma.

LSI comment number 88
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << when the SATL receives >>

LSI comment number 89
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << when the SATL receives >>

LSI comment number 90
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << BUFFER OFFSET and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field >> should be << BUFFER OFFSET field and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field >>
Also, both field names should be in small caps.

LSI comment number 91
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS field and >>

LSI comment number 92
Page=75 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Get rid of this blank page.

LSI comment number 93
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << one), then the >>

LSI comment number 94
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << format (110b), then the defect >>

LSI comment number 95
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note << NOTE 10 - The SATL should >> should be made normative.

LSI comment number 96
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
Change to << READ(6) command, READ(10) command, READ(12) command, and READ(16) command.

LSI comment number 97
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << the READ (10) command, READ (12) command, or READ (16) command.

LSI comment number 98
Page=81 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 99
Page=82 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 100
Page=83 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 101
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Change this to << Otherwise, this >>

LSI comment number 102
Page=90 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=In table 45 the 1st column should be subdivided into code and name columns. The code column would contain the number (e.g., 01h) and the name column would contain the name (e.g., active). Also the names are not in small caps but should be just caps.

LSI comment number 103
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << ERROR; and >>

LSI comment number 104
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This needs a hypertext link to the referenced step.

LSI comment number 105
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << zero; or >>

LSI comment number 106
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Table 45 title should have << (part 1 of x) at the end of the title.

LSI comment number 107
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This needs a hypertext link to the referenced step.

LSI comment number 108
This needs a hypertext link to the referenced step.

This should be << of WRITE(6) command, WRITE(10) command, WRITE(12) command, and WRITE(16) command.

This should be << WRITE (10) command, WRITE (12) command, and WRITE (16) command >>

This should be << a) the following ATA commands: >>

This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

This should be << WRITE AND VERIFY (10) command, WRITE AND VERIFY (12) command, and WRITE AND VERIFY (16) command. >>

There is a missing space between << client >> and << and >>.

This should be << set to 00b (i.e., shared) for >>

This << than 00h, then the>>
Comment=This should be << block descriptors as follows: >>

LSI comment number 121
Page=111 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << descriptor is eight bytes long; or >>

LSI comment number 122
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << command, then the SATL shall >>

LSI comment number 123
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=I do not know what the information that should be cached the cache this information

LSI comment number 124
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << exceeded condition, then the SATL shall >>

LSI comment number 125
Page=117 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This has to be deleted or rewritten. I say delete as it has nothing to do with the mode page.

LSI comment number 126
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << PARAMETER LIST; and >>

LSI comment number 127
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << log pages, >>

LSI comment number 128
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << then the SATL >>

LSI comment number 129
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << address (e.g., parameter code 0000h is stored at offset 0 of the first 512-byte block of data at log address 90h and parameter code 0001h is stored at offset 256 in the first 512-byte block of data at log address 90h). >>

LSI comment number 130
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << a SMART WRITE LOG command, WRITE LOG EXT command, or WRITE LOG DMA EXT command >>

LSI comment number 131
Page=122 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This should be << SMART READ LOG command, READ LOG EXT command, or READ LOG DMA EXT command >>

LSI comment number 132
Page=124 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This is missing a space between the <<returned. >> and the << If >>.

LSI comment number 133
Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << SATA bridge) that contain: >>

LSI comment number 134
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The sentence leading into the a,b,c list has no lead into the a.b.c list and I can't figure out how to change it to make it read correctly. This needs to be fixed.

LSI comment number 135
Page=139 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << This clause defines additional >>

LSI comment number 136
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << device processes the command >>

LSI comment number 137
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << If the PROTOCOL field contains 15 (i.e., Return Response Information) and return the contents in the ATA Status Return Descriptor as defined in 12.2.6, then the SATL shall:
a) if the transport is SATA, read the current Shadow Command Block registers; or
b) if the transport is PATA, read the current Command Block registers. >>

LSI comment number 138
Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << See 12.2.4 for a description of the mapping from >>

LSI comment number 139
Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << See 12.2.4 for a description of the mapping >>

LSI comment number 140
Page=149 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The 1,2,3 list needs to be indented.

LSI comment number 141
Page=149 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The 1,2 list needs to be indented.
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << defined in this standard >>..

LSI comment number 143
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << mode setting, then the SATL shall

LSI comment number 144
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This needs to be replaced with conflict or allowed.

LSI comment number 145
Page=159 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Table 122 footnotes need to be a and b not 1 and 2.

LSI comment number 146
Page=161 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Table 122 footnotes need to be a and b not 1 and 2.

LSI comment number 147
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << defined in this standard >>..

LSI comment number 148
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << the INQUIRY command >>

LSI comment number 149
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should not be bolded.

LSI comment number 150
Page=165 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The first word in each item in this 1,2,3 list should not be capitalized.

LSI comment number 151
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << REQUEST SENSE >>

LSI comment number 152
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << translation specified in this standard >>

************************************************************************************************* 

Comments attached to Abs ballot from Gregory Tabor of 
Maxim Integrated Products:

Maxim has no expertise in this topic and defers to those with informed opinions.
Comments attached to No ballot from Mark Overby of Nvidia Corp.:

Comments provided to editor and to chair in separate form.

Comments attached to No ballot from Gerald Houlder of Seagate Technology:

Seagate comment number 1
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
SPC-3, and SBC-2
s/b
SPC-4 and SBC-3

Seagate comment number 2
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
ATA hardware reset
---
This does not account for SATA Software Settings Preservations. Should there be additional text to talk about SSP?

Seagate comment number 3
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
A2h
s/b
B5h

Seagate comment number 4
Page=73 Subtype=Text Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
(formatting)
What is this blacked-out cell?

Seagate comment number 5
Page=84 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
SBC-2
s/b
SBC-3

Seagate comment number 6
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
RTO_EN
---
this was obsoleted by SBC-3
Please remove this row.

*******************************************************************************

Comments attached to Abs ballot from Michael Fogg of TycoElectronics:

Tyco Electronics is only involved in the physical layer implementation. Protocol and software issues are beyond the scope of our involvement.

******************************************************************************

End of Ballot Report ***************