

T10/08-317r0

Voting Results on T10 Letter Ballot 08-316r0 on
 Forwarding SAT-2 to First Public Review
 Ballot closed: 2008/09/04 12:00 noon MDT

| Organization | Name | S | Vote | Add'l Info |
|------------------------------|-------------------|---|------|------------|
| AMCC | Paul von Stamwitz | P | Yes | |
| Brocade | David Peterson | P | Abs | Cmnts |
| Dell, Inc. | Kevin Marks | P | No | Cmnts |
| EMC Corp. | Sean Dolan | A | Yes | |
| Emulex | William Martin | P | Yes | Cmnts |
| ENDL | Ralph O. Weber | P | Yes | Cmnts |
| FCI | Douglas Wagner | P | Yes | |
| Finisar Corp. | Chris Cicchetti | A | Yes | |
| Foxconn Electronics | Elwood Parsons | P | Abs | Cmnts |
| Fujitsu | Mike Fitzpatrick | P | Yes | |
| General Dynamics | Nathan Hastad | P | Yes | |
| Hewlett Packard Co. | Rob Elliott | P | No | Cmnts |
| Hitachi Global Storage Tech. | Dan Colegrove | P | Yes | |
| IBM Corp. | Kevin Butt | P | Abs | Cmnts |
| Intel Corp. | Mark Seidel | P | Yes | |
| Iomega Corp. | Robert Payne | P | Yes | |
| Kawasaki Microelectronics Am | Joel Silverman | P | Yes | |
| KnowledgeTek, Inc. | Dennis Moore | P | Yes | |
| Lexar Media, Inc. | John Geldman | P | Yes | |
| LSI Corp. | John Lohmeyer | P | No | Cmnts |
| Marvell Semiconductor, Inc. | David Geddes | P | Yes | |
| Maxim Integrated Products | Gregory Tabor | P | Abs | Cmnts |
| Microsoft Corp. | Robert Griswold | A | Yes | |
| Molex Inc. | Jay Neer | P | Yes | |
| NetApp | Frederick Knight | P | Yes | |
| Nvidia Corp. | Mark Overby | P | No | Cmnts |
| PMC-Sierra | Tim Symons | P | Yes | |
| Quantum Corp. | Paul Suhler | P | Yes | |
| Samsung | Michael Rogers | A | Yes | |
| SanDisk Corporation | Avraham Shimor | P | Yes | |
| Seagate Technology | Gerald Houlder | P | No | Cmnts |
| STMicroelectronics, Inc. | Benoit MERCIER | P | Yes | |
| Sun Microsystems, Inc. | Dale LaFollette | P | Yes | |
| Symantec | Roger Cummings | P | Yes | |
| TycoElectronics | Michael Fogg | P | Abs | Cmnts |
| Western Digital | Curtis Stevens | A | Yes | |

Ballot totals: (26:5:5:0=36)
 26 Yes
 5 No
 5 Abstain
 0 Organization(s) did not vote
 36 Total voting organizations
 12 Ballot(s) included comments

This 2/3rds majority ballot passed.
 26 Yes are more than half the membership eligible to vote
 [greater than 18] AND

26 Yes are at least 21 (2/3rds of those voting YES or NO [31]).

Key:

- P Voter is principal member
- A Voter is alternate member
- Abs Abstain vote
- DNV Organization did not vote
- Cmnts Comments were included with ballot
- NoCmnts No comments were included with a vote that requires comments

[This report prepared by LB2 v2.3.]

Comments attached to Abs ballot from David Peterson of Brocade:

The work of our organization is not affected by the subject matter of this standard.

Comments attached to No ballot from Kevin Marks of Dell, Inc.:

Dell comment number 1
 Page=1 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
 Comment=
 Revision 05

s/b

Revision 06

Dell comment number 2
 Page=1 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
 Comment=
 Global - We've got references all over the place. We have references to SAM-3,SAM-4, SBC-2, SBC-3, SPC-3 and SPC-4, SAS-1.1, SAS-2. Very confusing.

Suggest using latest:
 SAM-4 - thru LB
 SPC-4 is stable
 SBC-3 going to LB soon
 SAS-2 in LB resolution

Dell comment number 3
 Page=3 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
 Comment=
 SBC-2
 s/b
 SBC-3

Dell comment number 4

Page=3 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 5
Page=13 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure numbering is messed up in Figure Table. Multiple 8,9,10

Dell comment number 6
Page=14 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove Revision History prior to forwarding.

Dell comment number 7
Page=16 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
George O. Penokie, Vice-Chair

s/b

Mark Evans, Vice-Chair

Dell comment number 8
Page=17 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Add T10 Membership list

Dell comment number 9
Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Clause 6 is titled Command Management Model, seems confusing.

Dell comment number 10
Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Annex A describes the INQUIRY command translation for ATAPI devices.

s/b

Annex A describes the translation for ATAPI devices.

Dell comment number 11
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3, and SBC-2

s/b

SPC-4, and SBC-3

Dell comment number 12
Page=21 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should the SCSI Architecture Model box stop at SAT?

Dell comment number 13
Page=22 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Following global comment on using SAM-4, SPC-4 and SBC-3, remove Approved References: ATA-7, since its based on 8 according to above, SAM-3, SPC-3, SBC-2

Also SAS-2 missing, but referenced in definitions

SAM-2 ok, because of non autosense reference.

Dell comment number 14

Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

SPC-3

s/b

SPC-4

Dell comment number 15

Page=24 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=,

Dell comment number 16

Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

SPC-3

s/b

SPC-4

Dell comment number 17

Page=24 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=,

Dell comment number 18

Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

through

s/b

over

Dell comment number 19

Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

address

s/b

Address

Dell comment number 20

Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

address

s/b

Address

Dell comment number 21

Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

address
s/b
Address

Dell comment number 22
Page=25 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=,

Dell comment number 23
Page=25 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 24
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
QUEUED
s/b
QUEUED command

Dell comment number 25
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
EXT (
s/b
EXT command (

Dell comment number 26
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
EXT),
s/b
EXT command),

Dell comment number 27
Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
QUEUED (see
s/b
QUEUED command (see

Dell comment number 28
Page=25 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 29
Page=26 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 30
Page=26 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 31
Page=26 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 32
Page=27 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 33
Page=27 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see ATA8-ACS).
s/b
(see SATA-2.6).

Most NCQ related material in this standard refer to SAS 2.6

Dell comment number 34
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=layer

Dell comment number 35
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
layer
s/b
Layer

Dell comment number 36
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 37
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 38
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 39
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 40
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b

(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 41
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 42
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 43
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 44
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 45
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 46
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 47
Page=28 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Should the 32 byte read, write and verify commands be added to the
different definitions.

Dell comment number 48
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1)
s/b
(see SAS-2)

Dell comment number 49
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAS-1.1.
s/b
SAS-2.

Dell comment number 50
Page=28 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 51
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1).
s/b
(see SAS-2).

Dell comment number 52
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1).
s/b
(see SAS-2).

Dell comment number 53
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
KEVIN MARKS Needs to update: 3.1.80 SCSI write command:

Does WRITE SAME(10) (16) need to be added here? or WRITE LONG?

Dell comment number 54
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAS-1.1).
s/b
see SAS-2).

Dell comment number 55
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAM-3).
s/b
(see SAM-4).

Dell comment number 56
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see 2.3)

I'm not sure how this reference helps.

Dell comment number 57
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3 SCSI Primary Commands-3 standard (see 2.2)
s/b
SPC-4 SCSI Primary Commands-4 standard (see 2.3)

Why is SBC-3 not included?

Dell comment number 58
Page=32 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Table 2 - missing line indents between bytes 0 & 1 and 2&3.

Dell comment number 59
Page=33 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3 and SBC-2);
s/b
(see SPC-4 and SBC-3);

Dell comment number 60
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
A SCSI / ATA Translation implementation
s/b
The SATL

to match 1st expample

Dell comment number 61
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
sent,
s/b
received,

Dell comment number 62
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4,

Dell comment number 63
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 64
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 65
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 66
Page=36 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-3)
s/b
SAM-4)

Dell comment number 67
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAS-1.1
s/b
SAS-2

Dell comment number 68
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
START STOP UNIT, REQUEST SENSE).
s/b
START STOP UNIT command or REQUEST SENSE command).

Dell comment number 69
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Serial ATA device
s/b
SATA device

for consistency with rest of doc

Dell comment number 70
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Serial ATA
s/b
SATA

Dell comment number 71
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE data,
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data,

Dell comment number 72
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"b) when interpreting SMART READ DATA data for the Summary SMART error log (i.e., log address 01h), the Comprehensive SMART error log (i.e., log address 02h), the SMART self-test log (i.e., log address 06h), or the Selective self-test log (i.e., log address 09h) (see ATA8-ACS), the SATL shall use the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct; and"

s/b

"b) when interpreting ATA SMART READ DATA data for the ATA Summary SMART error log (i.e., log address 01h), the ATA Comprehensive SMART error log (i.e., log address 02h), the ATA SMART self-test log (i.e., log address 06h), or the ATA Selective self-test log (i.e., log address 09h) (see ATA8-ACS), the SATL shall use the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct; and"

Dell comment number 73

Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

"c) when interpreting READ LOG EXT data for the Extended Comprehensive SMART error log (i.e., log address 03h) or Extended SMART self-test log (i.e., log address 07h) (see ATA8-ACS), the SATL shall use the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct."

s/b

"c) when interpreting ATA READ LOG EXT data for the ATA Extended Comprehensive SMART error log (i.e., log address 03h) or ATA Extended SMART self-test log (i.e., log address 07h) (see ATA8-ACS), the SATL shall use the data only if the data structure checksum (i.e., byte 511) is correct."

Dell comment number 74

Page=38 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Dell comment number 75

Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

SPC-3

s/b

SPC-4

Dell comment number 76

Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

device, the

s/b

device, then the

Dell comment number 77

Page=39 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Dell comment number 78

Page=39 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=Need a),b),c) list formatting, missing : and ;'s

Dell comment number 79

Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
ALIGNMENTfield

add space.

Dell comment number 80
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 81
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 82
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ALIGNMENTfield

add space

Dell comment number 83
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 84
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 85
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the READ CAPACITY (16) data.
s/b
the READ CAPACITY (16) command data.

Dell comment number 86
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure 8 is missing reference in text

Dell comment number 87
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0:

s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 88
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

0:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 89
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

3:
s/b
3h:

Dell comment number 90
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 91
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

2:
s/b
2h:

Dell comment number 92
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

2:
s/b
2h:

Dell comment number 93
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 94
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

3:
s/b
3h:

Dell comment number 95
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

the READ CAPACITY (16) data.
s/b
the READ CAPACITY (16) command data.

Dell comment number 96
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure 9 missing reference in text.

Dell comment number 97
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Figure 10 missing reference in text

Dell comment number 98
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 99
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
7:
s/b
7h:

Dell comment number 100
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
7:
s/b
7h:

Dell comment number 101
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1:
s/b
1h:

Dell comment number 102
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the READ CAPACITY (16) data.
s/b
the READ CAPACITY (16) command data.

Dell comment number 103
Page=43 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
native command queueing
s/b
Native Command Queueing

Dell comment number 104

Page=44 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Do we want to add a table note about NCQ Priority Bit?

Dell comment number 105
Page=45 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If we base SAT-2 off of SAM-4, then the basic task management model is obsolete. Additionally BQUE is also obsolete.

Dell comment number 106
Page=45 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=If following SAM-4

Dell comment number 107
Page=45 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=If following SAM-4

Dell comment number 108
Page=45 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 109
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SCSI command identifier.

Add (see SAM-4).

Dell comment number 110
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
by IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 75),
s/b
by ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 75),

Dell comment number 111
Page=45 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove Editor's note.

Dell comment number 112
Page=45 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 113
Page=45 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 114
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SAM-3)
s/b
(see SAM-4)

Dell comment number 115

Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 116
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"SAM-4, the command tags maintained in the SATL mapping of command tags to
NCQ tags or TCQ tags"
s/b
"SAM-4, the command identifiers maintained in the SATL mapping of command
identifiers to NCQ tags or TCQ tags"

Dell comment number 117
Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"corresponding SCSI command tag, the"
s/b
"corresponding SCSI command identifier, the"

Dell comment number 118
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SCSI command tag.
s/b
SCSI command identifier.

Dell comment number 119
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
return TASK SET FULL even
s/b
return TASK SET FULL status even

Dell comment number 120
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
native command queuing
s/b
Native Command Queuing

Dell comment number 121
Page=46 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 122
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
6.3 command Priority
s/b
6.3 Command Priority

Dell comment number 123

Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 124
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 125
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
bits
s/b
bit

Dell comment number 126
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"READ FPDMA QUEUED and WRITE FPDMA QUEUED commands."
s/b
"ATA READ FPDMA QUEUED command and ATA WRITE FPDMA QUEUED command."

Dell comment number 127
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 128
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=0h

Dell comment number 129
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=1h - 3h

Dell comment number 130
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=4h - Fh

Dell comment number 131
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SAM-4
s/b
SCSI

Dell comment number 132
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
SATA NCQ PRIO
s/b
SATA NCQ PRIO bit

or even better, just PRIO bit.

Dell comment number 133
Page=49 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 134
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3);
s/b
(see SPC-4);

Dell comment number 135
Page=49 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Is the reasoning for the addition of the _L on most of the tmf text, that the SATL may not be considered the device server? In each of these the _L is always the same.

Dell comment number 136
Page=50 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=yeah, link is obsolete in SAM-4

Dell comment number 137
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
nexusus
s/b
nexuses

Dell comment number 138
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
nexusus
s/b
nexuses

Dell comment number 139
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
nexusus
s/b
nexuses

Dell comment number 140
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
unit, the

s/b
unit, then the

Dell comment number 141
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
each affected I_T nexus
s/b
the affected I_T nexus

although wording is technically ok, since there can only be one, why each affected.

Dell comment number 142
Page=51 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 143
Page=51 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL IN/OUT missing from table 10.

Dell comment number 144
Page=53 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 145
Page=53 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 146
Page=54 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3) (e.g., 05h for SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4) (e.g., 06h for SPC-4).

Dell comment number 147
Page=54 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 148
Page=54 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

IDENTIFY DEVICE

s/b

ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 149

Page=54 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 150

Page=55 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

SPC-3

s/b

SPC-4

Dell comment number 151

Page=55 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

IDENTIFY DEVICE

s/b

ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 152

Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

SPC-3

s/b

SPC-4

Dell comment number 153

Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

IDENTIFY DEVICE

s/b

ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 154

Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

(see SPC-3)

s/b

(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 155

Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

(e.g., SPC-3);

s/b

(e.g., SPC-3);

Dell comment number 156

Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

(e.g., SBC-2);

s/b

(e.g., SBC-3);

Dell comment number 157
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(e.g., SAS-1.1)
s/b
(e.g., SAS-2)

Dell comment number 158
Page=56 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 159
Page=56 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Will need to add sub-page support row for SPC-4

Dell comment number 160
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 161
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 162
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
8.2.3 PAGE CODE field
s/b
8.2.3 PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field

Dell comment number 163
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PAGE CODE field
s/b
PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field

Dell comment number 164
Page=57 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 15 - PAGE CODE field

Add in column for subpage set to 00h for each.

Dell comment number 165
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 166
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
correspond to SPC-3 and SBC-2 mode page formats).
s/b
correspond to SPC-4 and SBC-3 mode page formats).

Dell comment number 167
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 168
Page=58 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 169
Page=59 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 170
Page=59 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 171
Page=60 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 172
Page=60 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 173
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 174
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
3.1.29), the
s/b
3.1.29), then the

Dell comment number 175
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 176
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Temp Comment: (in any case need comment to change sentence to complete with error.)

If the ATA CHECK POWER MODE command does not complete with success then no power condition sense data shall be returned.

This one is confusing to me.

Seems CHECK POWER MODE command should always complete with success, assuming you did just not blow away an NCQ commands. Only time one would get a error is NCQ blown queue/Device Fault and I do not see the relation to a REQUEST SENSE and returning the state. Why is there no mapping from the CPM to SCSI state (need to check what Fred added)

Dell comment number 177
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 178
Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 20 - Special Request Sense behavior reference

Need to add sections 8.8.6 and 8.8.7 (idle and standby). Would also suggest rearranging 8.8.4 with 8.8.6 and 8.8.7

Dell comment number 179

Page=61 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 180

Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

"If the SATL supports the ATA PASS-THROUGH command"

s/b

"If the SATL supports the ATA PASS-THROUGH command or CDBs supporting long LBA"

In a similar context to pass thru, if 8 byte LBA are supported, isn't the descriptor format also required to return LBA in error.

Dell comment number 181

Page=62 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Is stated above - therefore table not needed.

Dell comment number 182

Page=62 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 183

Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

"command, the"

s/b

"command, then the"

Dell comment number 184

Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

SBC-2 and SPC-3.

s/b

SBC-3 and SPC-4.

Dell comment number 185

Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

IDENTIFY DEVICE data

s/b

ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data

Dell comment number 186

Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

"return parameter data containing sense data with the sense key set to NO SENSE with the additional sense code set to NO ADDITIONAL SENSE DATA; and"

s/b

"return parameter data containing sense data with the sense key set to NO SENSE with the additional sense code set to NO ADDITIONAL SENSE DATA or LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, INITIALIZING COMMAND REQUIRED; and"

as per SBC-3.

Dell comment number 187
Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3);
s/b
(see SPC-4);

Dell comment number 188
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
8.8.6 IDLE power condition
s/b
8.8.6 Idle power condition

Dell comment number 189
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
8.8.7 STANDBY power condition
s/b
8.8.7 Standby power condition

Dell comment number 190
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDLE) then
s/b
IDLE), then

Dell comment number 191
Page=63 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
in 8.8.6 a) and b) seem to be able to both be true. From what I can tell
ATA CPM does not give a reason for being in idle, only that it is. If it
were based on a timer, does the SATL know that it when to idle mode. Why
is the IDLE CONDITION ACTIVATED BY TIMER not included?

Dell comment number 192
Page=63 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
in 8.8.7 a) and b) seem to be able to both be true. From what I can tell
ATA CPM does not give a reason for being in standby, only that it is. If it
were based on a timer, does the SATL know that it when to standby mode.
Why is the STANDBY CONDITION ACTIVATED BY TIMER not included?

Dell comment number 193
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
OPERATION CODE -->

Wondering if we need a table note that says if allocation length = 0, then
use ATA TRUSTED NON-DATA command as stated in allocation length section.

Dell comment number 194
Page=63 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Dell comment number 195
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
8.9.1.3.2 SECURITY PROTOCOL 00h - 06h

I'm not sure that Protocol ID 01h-06h belong in this spec as they belong to TCG.

Dell comment number 196
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ALLOCATION LENGTH varies
s/b
allocation length varies

Dell comment number 197
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
allocation length is
s/b
the ALLOCATION LENGTH field is set to

Dell comment number 198
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
INC_512 is
s/b
INC_512 bit is

Dell comment number 199
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
INC_512 is
s/b
INC_512 bit is

Dell comment number 200
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
of TRUSTED RECEIVE or TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA.
s/b
of ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command.

Dell comment number 201
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ALLOCATION LENGTH is greater than FFFFh,
s/b
the ALLOCATION LENGTH field contains a value greater than FFFFh,

Dell comment number 202
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

set to ALLOCATION LENGTH (15:0).
s/b
set to the contents of bits (15:0) of the ALLOCATION LENGTH field.

Dell comment number 203
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"After completion of the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA
command,"
s/b
"After the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command
completes without error,"

Dell comment number 204
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ALLOCATION LENGTH is greater than 1FF_FE00h
s/b
the ALLOCATION LENGTH field contains a value greater than 1FF_FE00h

Dell comment number 205
Page=64 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 206
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(ALLOCATION LENGTH +
s/b
(ALLOCATION LENGTH field +

Dell comment number 207
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"After successful completion of the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE or ATA TRUSTED
RECEIVE DMA command, the data shall be transferred to the SCSI application
client up to the specified ALLOCATION LENGTH number of bytes."
s/b
"After the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command
completes without error, the data shall be transferred to the SCSI
application client up to the specified allocation length number of bytes."

Assume this sentence only goes with the INC_512=0. Its not that clear.

Dell comment number 208
Page=64 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 209
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
07h - FFh
s/b
01h - FFh

based on assumption that 01h-06h should not be defined above.

Dell comment number 210
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
OPERATION CODE -->

Wondering if we need a table note that says if transfer length = 0, then use ATA TRUSTED NON-DATA command as stated in transfer length section.

Dell comment number 211
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"The SATL shall send the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE command or the ATA TRUSTED RECEIVE DMA command to the ATA device."
s/b
"The SATL shall send the ATA TRUSTED SEND command or the ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command to the ATA device."

Dell comment number 212
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the value of SECURITY PROTOCOL.
s/b
the value contained in the SECURITY PROTOCOL field.

Dell comment number 213
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH varies
s/b
transfer length varies

Dell comment number 214
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
value of SECURITY PROTOCOL.
s/b
value contained in the SECURITY PROTOCOL field.

Dell comment number 215
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If transfer length is zero
s/b
If TRANSFER LENGTH field is set to zero

Dell comment number 216
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
instead of TRUSTED SEND or TRUSTED SEND DMA.
s/b
instead of the ATA TRUSTED SEND command or ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command.

Dell comment number 217

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
INC_512
s/b
INC_512 bit

Dell comment number 218
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH is greater than FFFFh,
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field contains a value greater than FFFFh,

Dell comment number 219
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The ATA TRUSTED SEND or ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command shall transfer the data.
s/b
The ATA TRUSTED SEND command or ATA TRUSTED SEND DMA command shall be used to transfer the data.

Dell comment number 220
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
set to ALLOCATION LENGTH (15:0).
s/b
set to the contents of bits (15:0) of the TRANSFER LENGTH field.

Dell comment number 221
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH is greater than 1FF_FE00h,
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field contains a value greater than 1FF_FE00h,

Dell comment number 222
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
8.10.1.3.2 SECURITY PROTOCOL values 00h - 06h

I'm not sure that Protocol ID 01h-06h belong in this spec as they belong to TCG.

Dell comment number 223
Page=65 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 224
Page=65 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=a), b) without and or or?

Dell comment number 225
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
TRANSFER LENGTH field

Dell comment number 226
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ATA TRUSTED SEND or
s/b
ATA TRUSTED SEND command or

Dell comment number 227
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
07h - FFh
s/b
01h - FFh

based on assumption that 01h-06h should not be defined above.

Dell comment number 228
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 229
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 230
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 231
Page=66 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 232
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 233
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 234
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 235
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 236
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 237
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 238
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 239
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 240
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 241
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 242
Page=67 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3),
s/b
SPC-4),

Dell comment number 243
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBA Low register
s/b
ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 244
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 245
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 246
Page=68 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3)
s/b
SPC-4)

Dell comment number 247
Page=69 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 248
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The SELF-TEST CODE field is valid, and the
s/b
If the SELF-TEST CODE field is valid, the

Dell comment number 249

Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=ATA Count field

Dell comment number 250
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=ATA LBA field

Dell comment number 251
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=ATA LBA Low register

Dell comment number 252
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 253
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
error, the
s/b
error, then the

Dell comment number 254
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
device, the
s/b
device, then the

Dell comment number 255
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
mode, the
s/b
mode, then the

Dell comment number 256
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the stopped state as
s/b
the stopped power condition as

Dell comment number 257
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 258
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
(i.e., if supported);

Does not sound like an i.e. ?

Dell comment number 259
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
MODE
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 260
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 261
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
02h, the
s/b
02h, then the

Dell comment number 262
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
05h the
s/b
05h, then the

Dell comment number 263
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 264
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 30 - Download Microcode Mode 07h ATA Field Values

Remove black box/save toner.

Dell comment number 265
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0h
s/b
0b

Dell comment number 266

Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0h
s/b
0b

Dell comment number 267
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 235 and the IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 235 is a
non-zero value
s/v
the contents of the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 235 and the ATA IDENTIFY
DEVICE data Word 235 is a non-zero value

Dell comment number 268
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IF
s/b
If

Dell comment number 269
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 270
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
"than IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 and IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 is a
non-zero value"
s/b
"than the contents of the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 and the ATA
IDENTIFY DEVICE data Word 234 is a non-zero value"

Dell comment number 271
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
BUFFER OFFSET and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field
s/b
BUFFER OFFSET field and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field

and make fields in small CAPS

Dell comment number 272
Page=74 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 273
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see 3.1.35), the

s/b
(see 3.1.35), then the

Dell comment number 274
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Size
s/b
size

Dell comment number 275
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see 3.1.39), the
s/b
(see 3.1.39), then the

Dell comment number 276
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS and
s/b
LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS field and

Dell comment number 277
Page=75 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove empty page on Page 57 or page 75 of 166 in PDF

Dell comment number 278
Page=76 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
KEVIN MARKS COMMENT - NEED ANSWER:

Need to check if write uncorrectable needs to be added to table, and possibly other

Dell comment number 279
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 280
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 281
Page=78 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a FMTDATA bit of one, the SATL
s/b

a FMTDATA bit set to one, then the SATL

Dell comment number 282
Page=78 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=shouldn't the be read error

Dell comment number 283
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SCT)
s/b
(see ATA8-ACS)

Dell comment number 284
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SCT

with ACS including SCT, should these be changed to ATA?

Dell comment number 285
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SCT

with ACS including SCT, should these be changed to ATA?

Dell comment number 286
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SCT

with ACS including SCT, should these be changed to ATA?

Dell comment number 287
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
command, the
s/b
command, then the

Dell comment number 288
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
READ (10), READ (12) or READ (16) command
s/b
READ (10) command, READ (12) command or READ (16) command

Dell comment number 289
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
one) the
s/b
one), then the

Dell comment number 290
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a READ
s/b
an ATA READ

Dell comment number 291
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
FUA bit
s/b
ATA FUA bit

Dell comment number 292
Page=79 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 293
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
device, send
s/b
device, then send

Dell comment number 294
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
enabled (ATA8-ACS)
s/b
enabled (i.e., ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 5 is set to one)

or at least add see in front of ATA8-ACS

Dell comment number 295
Page=79 Subtype=Caret Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=(i.e., ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 76 bit 8 is set to one)

Dell comment number 296
Page=79 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 297
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
enabled on
s/b
enabled (i.e., ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 5 is set to one) on

Dell comment number 298
Page=79 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 299
Page=80 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 300
Page=80 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 301
Page=81 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 302
Page=81 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 303
Page=81 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 304
Page=82 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 305
Page=82 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 306
Page=83 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 307
Page=83 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 308
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 309
Page=85 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Combined in P_TYPE field in SBC-3

Dell comment number 310
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 311
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
this
s/b
, then this

Dell comment number 312
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
this
s/b
, then this

Dell comment number 313
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 314
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See SBC-2
s/b
See SBC-3

Dell comment number 315
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See SBC-2
s/b
See SBC-3

Dell comment number 316
Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 317

Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 318
Page=88 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 319
Page=89 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove white space before table 45.

Dell comment number 320
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
send
s/b
Send

Dell comment number 321
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=need and/or. Not sure which, because 3) and 4 look like an if/else.

Dell comment number 322
Page=90 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 323
Page=90 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 324
Page=90 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 325
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 326
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 327
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 328
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

zero.
s/b
zero; or

Dell comment number 329
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 330
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Should not be small CAPS

Dell comment number 331
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 332
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 333
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 334
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

If the ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes without error,
then the count field shall be set to zero, and the SATL shall send an ATA
STANDBY command to the ATA device;

s/b

If the ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes without error,
then the SATL shall send an ATA STANDBY command to the ATA device with the
count field shall be set to zero;

Dell comment number 335
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 336
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 337
Page=92 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 338
Page=92 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 339

Page=92 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 340
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 341
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 342
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
send
s/b
Send

Dell comment number 343
Page=92 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 344
Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
command.
s/b
command as part of emulating the START STOP UNIT command.

Dell comment number 345
Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 346
Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 347
Page=94 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 348

Page=94 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Wondering if this needs to be expanded or change op code row. The operation code row, says shall use an ATA verify command, but if BYTCHK=1 then there is no need for the verify, but a read command.

Dell comment number 349

Page=95 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Wondering if this needs to be expanded or change op code row. The operation code row, says shall use an ATA verify command, but if BYTCHK=1 then there is no need for the verify, but a read command.

Dell comment number 350

Page=95 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 351

Page=96 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 352

Page=96 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Wondering if this needs to be expanded or change op code row. The operation code row, says shall use an ATA verify command, but if BYTCHK=1 then there is no need for the verify, but a read command.

Dell comment number 353

Page=97 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=The reasoning for these two commands is? ATA black magic?

Dell comment number 354

Page=98 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 355

Page=99 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 356

Page=99 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

SBC-2.

s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 357
Page=99 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 358
Page=100 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=This should be a table note.

Dell comment number 359
Page=100 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 360
Page=101 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2.
s/b
SBC-3.

Dell comment number 361
Page=101 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Why is NOTE 1 missing as in WRITE (10) and (12)?

Dell comment number 362
Page=101 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Does this need to be expanded to include read command for BYTCHK=1.

Dell comment number 363
Page=102 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 364
Page=103 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 365
Page=104 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 366

Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the WRITE
s/b
the ATA WRITE

Dell comment number 367
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ACS), the
s/b
ACS), then the

Dell comment number 368
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
shal
s/b
shall

Dell comment number 369
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
if
s/b
If

Dell comment number 370
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment='byte transfer length' should be in small CAPS

Dell comment number 371
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
clientand
s/b
client and

Dell comment number 372
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ACS), the
s/b
ACS), then the

Dell comment number 373
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 374
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

002h or 004h
s/b
0002h or 0004h

Dell comment number 375
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 376
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 377
Page=108 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Remove white space.

Dell comment number 378
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
ACS), the
s/b
ACS), then the

Dell comment number 379
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 380
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
clientand
s/b
client and

Dell comment number 381
Page=110 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(.i.e.,
s/b
(i.e.,

Dell comment number 382
Page=110 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 383

Page=110 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See SPC-3 and SBC-2
s/b
See SPC-4 and SBC-3

Dell comment number 384
Page=110 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=10.1.1 General information

Dell comment number 385
Page=111 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SBC-2)
s/b
SBC-3)

Dell comment number 386
Page=111 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 387
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 388
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
n/a
s/b
no

Dell comment number 389
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Unspecified (see 3.4.2)
s/b
Shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 390
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
one, the
s/b
one, then the

Dell comment number 391
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

data, the
s/b
data, then the

Dell comment number 392
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 393
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 394
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 395
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 396
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 397
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 398
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 399
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
(see SBC-2)
s/b
(see SBC-3)

Dell comment number 400
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SBC-2).
s/b
(see SBC-3).

Dell comment number 401
Page=114 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
add row for
SPF no Shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 402
Page=115 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
add row for
SPF no Shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 403
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 404
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 405
Page=119 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Change all Yes/No in changeably column of Table 73 to yes/no to match other
tables.

Dell comment number 406
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 407
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY

s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 408
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 409
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
one, the
s/b
one, then the

Dell comment number 410
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 411
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LIST;
s/b
LIST; and

Dell comment number 412
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero, the
s/b
zero, then the

Dell comment number 413
Page=119 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 414
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY CONDITION TIMER
s/b
in small CAPS

Dell comment number 415
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY CONDITION TIMER
s/b
in small CAPS and add field

Dell comment number 416
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
in small CAPS and add bit

Dell comment number 417
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
COUNT
s/b
ATA Count

Dell comment number 418
Page=120 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 419
Page=120 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 420
Page=120 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 421
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
power condition
s/b
Power Condition

Dell comment number 422
Page=120 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Wondering if it would be better to remove z and place the STANDBY CONDITON
TIMER field directly in equation

Dell comment number 423
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
reading log page address 00h using READ LOG EXT, READ LOG DMA EXT, or SMART
READ LOG.
s/b
reading ATA log page address 00h using ATA READ LOG EXT command, ATA READ
LOG DMA EXT command or ATA SMART READ LOG command.

Dell comment number 424
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Does
s/b
does

Dell comment number 425
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Does
s/b
does

Dell comment number 426
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Then
s/b
then

Dell comment number 427
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LOG SELECT is not define as a translation in this standard. Also if keep in
add the word command.

Dell comment number 428
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LOG SELECT is not define as a translation in this standard. Also if keep in
add the word command.

Dell comment number 429
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Need to add LOG SELECT translation to 8.3.

Dell comment number 430
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
table 2.
s/b
table 78.

Dell comment number 431
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a SMART WRITE LOG, WRITE LOG EXT, or WRITE LOG DMA EXT command to the
device
s/b
a ATA SMART WRITE LOG command, ATA WRITE LOG EXT command or ATA WRITE LOG
DMA EXT command to the device

Dell comment number 432
Page=121 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Add sub page code field DS bit and SPF for SPC-4

Dell comment number 433
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 434
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 435
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 436
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 437
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 438
Page=121 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 439
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
1b
s/b
set to one

Dell comment number 440
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0b
s/b
set to zero

Dell comment number 441
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0b
s/b
set to zero

Dell comment number 442
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0b
s/b
set to 11b

Dell comment number 443
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
FCh
s/b
set to FCh

Dell comment number 444
Page=122 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 78 - Parameter Storage Location - need statement that says
0200h-FFFFh is reserved of check conditions.

Dell comment number 445
Page=122 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a SMART READ LOG, READ LOG EXT, or READ LOG DMA EXT command
s/b
a ATA SMART READ LOG command, ATA READ LOG EXT command, or ATA READ LOG DMA
EXT command

Dell comment number 446
Page=122 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 2.
s/b
table 78.

Dell comment number 447
Page=123 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Add sub page code field=00 DS bit and SPF=0 for SPC-4

Dell comment number 448
Page=123 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Need to add Application log page if supported. Or say may include others

Dell comment number 449
Page=123 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Add sub page code field =00h, DS bit and SPF = 0 for SPC-4

Dell comment number 450
Page=123 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
table 81.1).\
s/b
table 81.

Dell comment number 451
Page=123 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Move to table 80 as not part of each parameter in SPC-4

Dell comment number 452
Page=123 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBIN Shall be set to one
LP Shall be set to one
s/b
FORMAT AND LINKING and set to 11b.

Dell comment number 453
Page=127 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=Add sub page code field =00h, DS bit and SPF = 0 for SPC-4

Dell comment number 454
Page=127 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 455
Page=127 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
non-packet - Why is this one specifically called out as non-packet.
Non-packet apply to the self-test log also and I would say almost all other
areas of this standard.

s/b
ATA

Dell comment number 456
Page=127 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
non-packet/
s/b ATA

Dell comment number 457
Page=128 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment= Move to after page code.

Dell comment number 458
Page=128 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
LBIN Shall be set to one
LP Shall be set to one
s/b
FORMAT AND LINKING and Shall be set to 11b

Dell comment number 459
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SCT),
s/b
(see ATA8-ACS),

Dell comment number 460
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
an SCT Status Request
s/b
an ATA SCT Status Request

Dell comment number 461
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
See SPC-3 and SBC-2
s/b
See SPC-4 and SBC-3

Dell comment number 462
Page=130 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 463
Page=130 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 464
Page=130 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 88 - Unit Serial Number VPD page for SAT

Why are the VPD pages shown in this format, instead of field/description or reference table?

For a VPD only defined in this standard, such as ATA page this format would be correct.

Dell comment number 465
Page=130 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 466
Page=130 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 467
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 90 - Device Identification VPD page for SAT

Why are the VPD pages shown in this format, instead of field/description or reference table?

For a VPD only defined in this standard, such as ATA page this format would be correct.

Dell comment number 468
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 469
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Identification

s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 470
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 471
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 472
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 473
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
108), the
s/b
108), then the

Dell comment number 474
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 475
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
108), the
s/b
108), then the

Dell comment number 476
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 91 - Logical unit name derived from the world wide name

Why are the VPD pages shown in this format, instead of field/description or reference table?

For a VPD only defined in this standard, such as ATA page this format would be correct.

Dell comment number 477

Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field shall be set to 0h.
The CODE SET field shall be set to 1h (i.e., binary).
The PIV bit shall be set to 0b.
The ASSOCIATION field shall be set to 00b (i.e., logical unit).
The IDENTIFIER TYPE field shall be set to 3h (i.e., NAA).

This is all stated in the table. If you are going to keep this format then change text to:

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field, CODE SET field, PIV bit, ASSOCIATION field and DESIGNATOR TYPE field shall be set as shown in table 91.

Dell comment number 478

Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

IDENTIFIER
s/b
DESIGNATOR

Dell comment number 479

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

IDENTIFIER
s/b
DESIGNATOR

Dell comment number 480

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field shall be set to 0h.
The CODE SET field shall be set to 2h (i.e., ASCII).
The PIV bit shall be set to 0b.
The ASSOCIATION field shall be set to 00b (i.e., logical unit).
The IDENTIFIER TYPE field shall be set to 1h (i.e., T10 vendor identification).
The VENDOR IDENTIFICATION field contains the string 'ATA-----'.

This is all stated in the table. If you are going to keep this format then change text to:

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field, CODE SET field, PIV bit, ASSOCIATION field and DESIGNATOR TYPE field shall be set as shown in table 93.

Dell comment number 481

Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 482

Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 483
Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Identification
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 484
Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Identification
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 485
Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 486
Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 487
Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Identification
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 488
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The CODE SET field is set to 1h (i.e., binary).
The PIV bit is set to one.
The ASSOCIATION field is set to 01b (i.e., target port).
The IDENTIFIER TYPE field is set to 3h (i.e., NAA).

This is all stated in the table. If you are going to keep this format then change text to:

The PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field, CODE SET field, PIV bit, ASSOCIATION field and DESIGNATOR TYPE field shall be set as shown in table 95.

Dell comment number 489
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFIER
s/b
DESIGNATOR

Dell comment number 490
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Identification

Dell comment number 491
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Identification
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 492
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 493
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 494
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 495
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 496
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identifier
s/b
designator

Dell comment number 497

Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
identification
s/b
designation

Dell comment number 498
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Identification
s/b
s/b
Designation

Dell comment number 499
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3).
s/b
(see SPC-4).

Dell comment number 500
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
(see SPC-3)
s/b
(see SPC-4)

Dell comment number 501
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 96 - Mode Page Policy VPD page for SAT

Why are the VPD pages shown in this format, instead of field/description or reference table?

For a VPD only defined in this standard, such as ATA page this format would be correct.

Dell comment number 502
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The PAGE CODE field shall be set to 87h.
s/b
The PAGE CODE field shall be set as shown in table 96.

Dell comment number 503
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 97 - Mode policy descriptor for SAT

Section 10.10.1 has a bunch of should's for these fields, but I see no reference to it here? Add a See 10.1.1 somewhere in this section

If not, then including the translation of this page code is useless. All

fields unspecified expect page code :)

Dell comment number 504
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3)
s/b
SPC-4)

Dell comment number 505
Page=137 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 98 - Block Device Characteristics VPD Page Field Translation

Back to Field / Description or Reference format

Dell comment number 506
Page=137 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 507
Page=137 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 508
Page=137 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
value of
s/b
value contained in the

Dell comment number 509
Page=137 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
value of
s/b
value contained in the

Dell comment number 510
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Code

Are these decimal or hex. Assuming hex, fix and add h to them.

Dell comment number 511
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
0 to 11.
Make hex values

Dell comment number 512
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
3 to 12

make hex values

Dell comment number 513
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
15

make hex value

Dell comment number 514
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
zero
s/b

0h

assuming they are hex values

Dell comment number 515
Page=141 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 516
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a SET
s/b
an ATA SET

Dell comment number 517
Page=142 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a READ MULTIPLE command, a READ MULTIPLE EXT command, a WRITE MULTIPLE
command, a WRITE MULTIPLE EXT command, or a WRITE MULTIPLE FUA EXT command,
s/b
an ATA READ MULTIPLE command, an ATA READ MULTIPLE EXT command, an ATA
WRITE MULTIPLE command, an ATA WRITE MULTIPLE EXT command or an ATA WRITE
MULTIPLE FUA EXT command,

Dell comment number 518
Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the EXTEND bit is set to zero, then the FEATURES (15:8) field, the
SECTOR_COUNT (15:8) field, the LBA_LOW (15:8) field, the LBA_MID (15:8)
field, and the LBA_HIGH (15:8) field shall be ignored by the SATL, and the
SATL shall process this command as specified in 12.2.2.

If the EXTEND bit is set to one, then the FEATURES (15:8) field, the
SECTOR_COUNT (15:8) field, the LBA_LOW (15:8) field, the LBA_MID (15:8)
field, and the LBA_HIGH (15:8) field are valid, and the SATL shall process
this command as specified in 12.2.2 except as described in the remainder of
this subclause.

These should be moved to after Table 104

Dell comment number 519

Page=144 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

See 12.2.2 for a description of the MULTIPLE_COUNT field, the PROTOCOL field, the OFF_LINE field, the CK_COND bit, the T_DIR bit, and the BYTE_BLOCK bit.

The SATL shall determine the transfer length by the method specified in the T_LENGTH field (see table 106).

This should be in the previous section 12.2.3, since it defines fields for pass thru (16)

Dell comment number 520

Page=145 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

respond to a REQUEST SENSE command and shall return sense data with the sense key set to NO SENSE with the additional sense code set to NO ADDITIONAL SENSE INFORMATION.

s/b

return GOOD status.

Or don't include this row

Dell comment number 521

Page=145 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

(see 12.2.5)

s/b

(see 12.2.6)

Dell comment number 522

Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

SECTOR_COUNT (15:8) field shall be ignored.

Who shall ignore this? Are you telling the app client to ignore?

I would say shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 523

Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

LBA_LOW (15:8) field, LBA_MID (15:8) field, and LBA_HIGH (15:8) field shall be ignored

Who shall ignore this? Are you telling the app client to ignore?

I would say shall be set to zero.

Dell comment number 524

Page=147 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 525
Page=147 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Stated above already with the "may"

Dell comment number 526
Page=147 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
A SATL shall support the appropriate mode page for the attached ATA
environment (e.g., PATA).

What does this mean? You have a may support, the saying their optional,
then saying shall for ATA environment with an example of PATA? Is the PATA
Control Mode page mandatory if supporting PATA drives?

Dell comment number 527
Page=147 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 528
Page=147 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 529
Page=147 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Why is this specifically Reserved? Or did you mean subcodes F2 thru FE are
reserved?

Dell comment number 530
Page=147 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3.
s/b
SPC-4.

Dell comment number 531
Page=147 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=See next comment. Included in it.

Dell comment number 532
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The SPF bit (see SPC-3) shall be set to one to access this mode page.
The PAGE CODE field shall be set to 0Ah.
The PAGE LENGTH field shall be set to 0004h.
The SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to F1h.

These are already stated in table 110.

s/b

The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, PAGE LENGTH field and SUBPAGE CODE field

shall be set as shown in table 110.

Dell comment number 533
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Trnasfer
s/b
transfer

Dell comment number 534
Page=149 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Need to indent 1),2),3) list on a) and b)

Dell comment number 535
Page=149 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=Command is complete with check condition.

Dell comment number 536
Page=149 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 537
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
modes;
s/b
modes; and

Dell comment number 538
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SET FEATURES
s/b
ATA SET FEATURES

Dell comment number 539
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
requireseted
s/b
requested

Dell comment number 540
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Mode
s/b
mode

Dell comment number 541
Page=150 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
UDMA bit

Why are the udmax's below not in small CAPS?

Dell comment number 542

Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

"When the SATL receives a MODE SELECT command and the UDMA bits request a change in the UDMA

transfer rate, then the SATL shall:

1) if the SET FEATURES command completes with an error, then the SATL shall:

A) not change any host transfer modes;

B) complete the MODE SELECT command with a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ABORTED COMMAND with the additional sense code set to ATA DEVICE FAILED SET FEATURES; and

C) take no further action regarding this request to change the UDMA transfer rate;

and

2) if the SET FEATURES command completes without error, then the SATL shall:

A) configure the ATA host to communicate with the device at the requested UDMA transfer rate; and

B) complete the MODE SELECT command with GOOD status."

s/b

"If the SATL receives a MODE SELECT command and the UDMA bits specify a change from the current

settings, then the SATL shall send an ATA SET FEATURES - Set transfer mode (i.e., Features register set to

03h) command to the ATA device to set the UDMA mode on the ATA device to the requested state, and

then:

a) if the SET FEATURES command completes with an error, then the SATL shall:

1) not change any host transfer modes; and

2) complete the MODE SELECT command with a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ABORTED COMMAND with the additional sense code set to ATA DEVICE FAILED SET FEATURES; and
or

b) if the SET FEATURES command completes without error, then the SATL shall:

1) configure the ATA host to communicate with the device at the requested UDMA transfer rate; and

2) complete the MODE SELECT command with GOOD status.

"

Dell comment number 543

Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Mode Page

s/b

mode page

Dell comment number 544

Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Mode Page
s/b
mode page

Dell comment number 545
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Mode Page
s/b
mode page

Dell comment number 546
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Mode Page
s/b
mode page

Dell comment number 547
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The SPF bit (see SPC-4) shall be set to one to access this page.
PAGE CODE shall be set to 1Ah.
SUBPAGE CODE shall be set to F1h.

Stated in Table 115 already.

s/b

The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to as shown in table 115.

Dell comment number 548
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
MODE SELECT, if
s/b
MODE SELECT command, if

Dell comment number 549
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
MODE SELECT, if
s/b
MODE SELECT command, if

Dell comment number 550
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
value, the
s/b
value, then the

Dell comment number 551
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
Enable/disable advanced power management
s/b
Enable/disable the APM feature set

Dell comment number 552
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Disable advanced power management
s/b
Disable the APM feature set

Dell comment number 553
Page=152 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 554
Page=152 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
MODE SELECT with
s/b
MODE SELECT command with

Dell comment number 555
Page=153 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 556
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
contain:
s/b
contains:

Dell comment number 557
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the ATA
s/b
the unmodified ATA

Dell comment number 558
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
command
s/b
command (see 12.2)

Dell comment number 559
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The PAGE CODE field shall be set to 89h.
The PAGE LENGTH field shall be set to 238h.

already stated in table 116.

s/b

The PAGE CODE field and PAGE LENGTH field shall be set to as shown in table 116.

Dell comment number 560
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SPC-3
s/b
SPC-4

Dell comment number 561
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the IDENTIFY DEVICE or IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field

Dell comment number 562
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
the of the ATA command

contains the what? should this be operation code or command code. Not sure what ATA calls it?

Dell comment number 563
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE

Dell comment number 564
Page=154 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE

Dell comment number 565
Page=155 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
EXECUTE
s/b
ATA EXECUTE

Dell comment number 566
Page=156 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 567
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE OR IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE data field

If following table 116

Dell comment number 568
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE OR IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE data field

If following table 116

Dell comment number 569
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY DEVICE OR IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE DATA field
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data or ATA IDENTIFY PACKET DEVICE data field

If following table 116

Dell comment number 570
Page=156 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
This should be in SPC-4, not SAT-2 :)

As it is currently defined, the translation is not included between these commands and ATA. Need to add. If this were in SPC-4, then this would be correct. and a translation would be in SAT.

Dell comment number 571
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 572
Page=156 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 573
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
When
s/b
If

Dell comment number 574
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

command, the
s/b
command, then the

Dell comment number 575
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
for the set password function.
s/b
a SECURITY PROTOCOL IN command with the SECURITY PROTOCOL field set to EFh.

Dell comment number 576
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH
s/b
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH (0Dh)

Dell comment number 577
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 578
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH shall be set to the number of bytes following byte 1
of the SECURITY PROTOCOL IN
parameter data.

s/b
The PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field shall be set to a shown in table 120.

Dell comment number 579
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the ATA Security feature set supported (S_SUPRT) bit is set to zero,
then the ATA device does not support the ATA Security feature set. If the
S_SUPRT bit is set to one, then the ATA device supports the ATA Security
feature set.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 82 bit 1 is set to zero, then the SATL
shall set the ATA Security feature set supported (S_SUPRT) bit to zero. If
the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 82 bit 1 is set to one, then the SATL
shall set the ATA Security feature setsupported (S_SUPRT) bit to one.

Dell comment number 580
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the ATA Security feature set enabled (S_ENABLD) bit is set to zero, then
the ATA Security feature set is not enabled in the ATA device. If the
S_ENABLD bit is set to one, then the ATA Security feature set is enabled in
the ATA device based on the setting of the user password via a set password
function (see 12.5.1.2.1).

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 1 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the ATA Security feature set enabled (S_ENABLD) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 85 bit 1 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the ATA Security feature set enabled (S_ENABLD) bit to one. Enabling of this bit is based on setting of the user password via a set password function (see 12.5.1.2.1).

Dell comment number 581

Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

The value in the SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in normal mode.

s/b

The value in the SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in normal mode. The SATL shall set the least significant byte of the SECURITY ERASE TIME field to the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 89 bits (0:7) and the most significant byte of the SECURITY ERASE TIME field to 00h.

Dell comment number 582

Page=157 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Dell comment number 583

Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=i

Dell comment number 584

Page=158 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Dell comment number 585

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

The value in the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in enhanced mode. Table 121 defines the values in the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field.

s/b

The value in the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field indicates the time required by the ATA device to complete its security erase procedure in enhanced mode. The SATL shall set the least significant byte of the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field to the the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 90 bits (0:7) and the most significant byte of the ENHANCED SECURITY ERASE TIME field to 00h.

Dell comment number 586

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the ATA device does not support the ATA Security feature set (i.e., the S_SUPRT bit is set to zero) or the master password identifier, then the MASTER PASSWORD IDENTIFIER field shall be set to 0000h or FFFFh. If the ATA device supports the ATA Security feature set and the master password identifier, then the MASTER PASSWORD IDENTIFIER field shall be set to the master password identifier set when the master password was last changed.

s/b

The SATL shall set the MASTER PASSWORD IDENTIFIER field to the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 82.

Dell comment number 587

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the master password capability setting (MAXSET) bit is set to zero, and the ATA Security feature set is enabled (i.e., the S_ENABLD bit is set to one), then the security level is set to high. If the MAXSET bit is set to one, then the security level is set to maximum.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 8 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the master password capability setting (MAXSET) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 8 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the master password capability setting (MAXSET) bit to one.

Dell comment number 588

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the enhanced erase mode supported (EN_ER_SUP) bit is set to zero, then the ATA device does not support the enhanced erase mode. If the EN_ER_SUP bit is set to one, then the ATA device supports the enhanced erase mode.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 5 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the enhanced erase mode supported (EN_ER_SUP) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 5 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the enhanced erase mode supported (EN_ER_SUP) bit to one.

Dell comment number 589

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the password attempt counter exceeded (PWCNTEX) bit is set to zero, then the password attempt counter has not decremented to zero. If the PWCNTEX bit is set to one, then the password attempt counter has decremented to zero.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 4 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the password attempt counter exceeded (PWCNTEX) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 4 is set to one, then the SATL

shall set the password attempt counter exceeded (PWCNTEX) bit to one.

Dell comment number 590

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the frozen state (FROZEN) bit is set to zero, then the ATA device is not in the security frozen state. If the FROZEN bit is set to one, then the ATA device is in the security frozen state.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 3 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the frozen state (FROZEN) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 3 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the frozen state (FROZEN) bit to one.

Dell comment number 591

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the locked state (LOCKED) bit is set to zero, then the ATA device is not in the security locked state. If the LOCKED bit is set to one, then the ATA device is in the security locked state.

s/b

If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 2 is set to zero, then the SATL shall set the locked state (LOCKED) bit to zero. If the ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 128 bit 2 is set to one, then the SATL shall set the locked state (LOCKED) bit to one.

Dell comment number 592

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

the command and

s/b

the command and defined in this standard and

Dell comment number 593

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

of the , then

s/b

of the ATA device, then

Dell comment number 594

Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If a command in table 122 is not implemented by the SATL, then processing of the command is vendor specific.

What? If it is not supported, then SATL shall check condition the command with ILLEGAL REQUEST, and ASC = INVALID COMMAND OPERATION CODE.

Dell comment number 595

Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 596
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
??

ok, didn't know we supported ?? in standards.

Dell comment number 597
Page=159 Subtype=Text Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
I assume that the shaded rows are commands not translated in this standard.
This is not stated, and LOG SELECT is not in this standard, but LOG SENSE
is?

Dell comment number 598
Page=160 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 599
Page=160 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=These should not be shaded.

Dell comment number 600
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 601
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 602
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If a command in table 123 is not implemented by the SATL, then processing
of the command is vendor specific.

s/b

What? If it is not supported, then SATL shall check condition the command
with ILLEGAL REQUEST, and ASC = INVALID COMMAND OPERATION CODE.

Dell comment number 603
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=READ (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 604
Page=161 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=VERIFY (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 605
Page=161 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=See no reason to split this out.

Dell comment number 606
Page=161 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 607
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
various security modes
s/b
various ATA security modes

Dell comment number 608
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=WRITE (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 609
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
WRITE AND VERIFY (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 610
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
WRITE SAME (32) is not defined in this standard, so it should be shaded

Dell comment number 611
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
shall contain a single numeric value as described in table 124.

s/b

specifies the ATA command that the SATL shall send to the ATA device (see table 124.)

Dell comment number 612
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
a See ATA8-ACS for a description of how this security protocol specific field value shall be processed.

This table note sounds strange, in that it sounds like the security

protocol specific values are defined in ATA8-ACS.

I would remove the table note.

Dell comment number 613
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SECURITY
s/b
ATA SECURITY

Dell comment number 614
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SECURITY
s/b
ATA SECURITY

Dell comment number 615
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SECURITY
s/b
ATA SECURITY

Dell comment number 616
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SECURITY
s/b
ATA SECURITY

Dell comment number 617
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SECURITY
s/b
ATA SECURITY

Dell comment number 618
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
SECURITY
s/b
ATA SECURITY

Dell comment number 619
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 125 defines the parameter data for the set password function.

s/b

Table 125 defines the parameter data for the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command when the SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field is set to 0001h (set password).

Dell comment number 620
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 125 - Set password parameter data

s/b

Table 125 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0001h (Set password)
parameter data

Dell comment number 621
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 126 - Unlock parameter data

s/b

Table 126 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0002h (unlock) parameter
data

Dell comment number 622
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the maximum security level bit (MAXLVL) is set to zero, then the ATA
device shall set the security level to high. If the MAXLVL bit is set to
one, then the ATA device shall set the security level to maximum.

s/b

If the maximum security level bit (MAXLVL) is set to zero, then the shall
set the ATA Master Password Capability bit (i.e., word 0 bit 8) of the ATA
SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content to zero when transferring the data
content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command. If the
maximum security level bit (MAXLVL) is set to one, then the shall set ATA
Master Password Capability bit (i.e., word 0 bit 8) of the ATA SECURITY SET
PASSWORD data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA
device for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

Dell comment number 623
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the ATA device
shall set the user password to the value in the PASSWORD field. If the
MSTRPW bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall set the master password
to the value in the PASSWORD field.

s/b

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the shall set the
ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD
data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device
for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command. If the master password bit

(MSTRPW) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

Dell comment number 624

Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

The SATL shall set the The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

s/b

The SATL shall set the ATA Password field (i.e., words 1-16) of the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content to the contents of the PASSWORD field when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY SET PASSWORD command.

Does this need a byte swap?

Dell comment number 625

Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Table 126 defines the parameter data for the unlock function.

s/b

Table 126 defines the parameter data for the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command when the SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field is set to 0002h (unlock).

Dell comment number 626

Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

s/b

The SATL shall set the ATA Password field (i.e., words 1-16) of the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK data content to the contents of the PASSWORD field when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK command.

Does this need a byte swap?

Dell comment number 627

Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the user password. If the MSTRPW bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the master password.

s/b

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK command. If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY UNLOCK command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

Dell comment number 628
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 127 - Erase unit parameter data

s/b

Table 127 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0004h (erase unit) parameter data

Dell comment number 629
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 128 - Disable password parameter data

s/b

Table 128 - SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field = 0006h (disable password) parameter data

Dell comment number 630
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
Table 127 defines the parameter data for the erase unit function.

s/b

Table 127 defines the parameter data for the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command when the SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field is set to 0004h (erase unit).

Dell comment number 631
Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

s/b

The SATL shall set the ATA Password field (i.e., words 1-16) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to the contents of the PASSWORD field when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command.

Does this need a byte swap?

Dell comment number 632

Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the enhanced erase mode bit (EN_ER) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall be set to use the normal erase mode. If the EN_ER bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall be set to enhanced erase mode.

s/b

If the enhanced erase mode bit (EN_ER) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Erase mode bit (i.e., word 0 bit 1) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command. If the enhanced erase mode bit (EN_ER) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Erase mode bit (i.e., word 0 bit 1) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

Dell comment number 633

Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the user password. If the MSTRPW bit is set to one, then the ATA device shall compare the value in the PASSWORD field to the master password.

s/b

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command. If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for theATA SECURITY ERASE UNIT command.

This could be shorted by saying copy the value.

Dell comment number 634

Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value.

s/b

The SATL shall set the ATA Password field (i.e., words 1-16) of the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD data content to the contents of the PASSWORD field when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD command.

Does this need a byte swap?

Dell comment number 635

Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero and the value in the PASSWORD field matches the user password, then the ATA device shall disable the user password. If the MSTRPW bit is set to one and the value in the PASSWORD field matches the master password, then the ATA device shall disable the master password.

s/b

If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to zero, then the shall set the ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD data content to zero when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD command. If the master password bit (MSTRPW) is set to one, then the shall set ATA Identifier bit (i.e., word 0 bit 0) of the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD data content to one when transferring the data content to the ATA device for the ATA SECURITY DISABLE PASSWORD command.

Dell comment number 636

Page=164 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Table 128 defines the parameter data for the disable password function.

s/b

Table 128 defines the parameter data for the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command when the SECURITY PROTOCOL SPECIFIC field is set to 0006h (disable password).

Dell comment number 637

Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=the ATA PACKET command

Dell comment number 638

Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

the
s/b
a

Dell comment number 639

Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

packet
s/b
ATAPI

Dell comment number 640

Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 641
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 642
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 643
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PACKET
s/b
ATA PACKET

Dell comment number 644
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 645
Page=165 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=

Dell comment number 646
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PACKET
s/b
ATA PACKET

Dell comment number 647
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 648
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
IDENTIFY
s/b
ATA IDENTIFY

Dell comment number 649
Page=166 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=Kevin_Marks

Comment=

Dell comment number 650
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Author=Kevin_Marks
Comment=
PACKET
s/b
ATA PACKET

Comments attached to Yes ballot from William Martin of
Emulex:

Emulex comment number 1
Page=26 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
Why is this different than SAM-4 definition? How is this an object?

Emulex comment number 2
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
are

s/b

is

Emulex comment number 3
Page=37 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=bmartin
Comment=
fully

I do not believe that we have any specifications for operation of multiple
I_T nexuses.

Emulex comment number 4
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=This is a circular reference that does not add any clarity.

Emulex comment number 5
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
These should reference the title of the Annexes rather than a lettered
annex (if they even belong here)

Emulex comment number 6
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
See ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE for details on when the data contained in words
106, 117-118, and 209 are valid.

s/b

ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE provides details on when the data contained in words 106, 117-118, and 209 are valid.

Emulex comment number 7

Page=45 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=bmartin

Comment=

Editor's Note 1: The basic task management model and full task management mode in SAM-4 are gone.

Emulex comment number 8

Page=45 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin

Comment=

do we also need to state that no additional commands shall be queued to the ATA device until the non-queued command has been sent to and a response received from the ATA device?

Emulex comment number 9

Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin

Comment=

The SATL shall resend the ATA command and continue processing the corresponding I_T_L_Q nexus.

s/b

The SATL shall terminate the affected I_T_L_Q nexus with CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key and the additional sense code set according to the reported ATA error as described in clause 11, and the SATL shall resend the aborted ATA command.

Emulex comment number 10

Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin

Comment=

an ATA CHECK POWER MODE command to the ATA device

An alternative that gives more information is READ LOG EXT (log page 0x10).

This additionally gets status information for the ATA command that is aborted.

suggest rewordint to CHECK POWER MODE command to the ATA device or READ LOG EXT (log page 0x10) to the ATA device.

Emulex comment number 11

Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin

Comment=

Don't put a self reference in here.

This subclause

Emulex comment number 12

Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin

Comment=

affected

s/b

specified

Emulex comment number 13
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
ATA

s/b

ACA

Emulex comment number 14
Page=60 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
The SATL shall send the ATA READ BUFFER command to the ATA device.

To follow the style of table 28, this should be

The SATL shall:

- a) send an ATA READ BUFFER command to the ATA device; or
 - c) emulate the specified function (i.e., if supported);
- depending on the values in the BUFFER ID field and MODE field (see 8.7.2.1).

Emulex comment number 15
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
one,

s/b

zero

Emulex comment number 16
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=What is returned if the ATA verify command fails?

Emulex comment number 17
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=bmartin
Comment=
table 2.

s/b

table 78

Comments attached to Yes ballot from Ralph O. Weber of
ENDL:

ENDL 1

PDF pg 1, pg i, Global

Wherever possible the latest versions of standards should be referenced (e.g., SBC-2 s/b SBC-3, SPC-3 s/b SPC-4). This appears to have already been done for SAM-4.

ENDL 2

PDF pg 18, pg xviii, Introduction

The description of Annex A in the Introduction does not match the contents of Annex A.

ENDL 3

PDF pg 29, pg 11, Global

Since - is specified to mean subtraction, it should not be used when ranges of values are specified (e.g., 1 - 3 in table 8). Instead the ISO preferred ' to ' should be used.

ENDL 4

PDF pg 53, pg 35, 8.1.1, p 1, s 2
vital product data s/b VPD

ENDL 5

PDF pg 53, pg 35, 8.1.1, table 11
The table footnote sentence is missing a period.

ENDL 6

PDF pg 55, pg 37, 8.1.1, table 12, product revision level row
The 'or' should be aligned with the 'If' in b), not with ATA.

ENDL 7 Technical

PDF pg 57, pg 39, 8.2.2

The description of the support requirements in this subclause seems inconsistent. The first sentence seems to say full support for the field is required. Table 14 suggests otherwise.

ENDL 8

PDF pg 57, pg 39, 8.2.2, table 14

This table appears to contain three columns (Code, SPC-4 Description, and Description), not two (Code and Description). The break between the SPC-4 description and the SAT-2 description occurs at the colons.

ENDL 9

PDF pg 58, pg 40, 8.3.1, p 2, s 3
See clause 10 s/b See 10.1

ENDL 10

PDF pg 58, pg 40, 8.3.2, table 16, operation code row
... via ATA. See clause 10 for specific requirements. s/b ... via ATA (see 10.1). [as is found in table 17]

ENDL 11

PDF pg 58, pg 40, 8.3.2, table 16, parameter list length row
What is it about the MODE SELECT command that necessitates using a length field definition which differs from the 'The SATL shall implement support for this field as defined in SPC-4.' definition used for other length fields?

ENDL 12

PDF pg 59, pg 41, 8.5.2, table 17, allocation length row
Other instances of this description text do not include a cross reference. Remove or add cross reference(s) to make this text consistent throughout the standard.

ENDL 13

PDF pg 60, pg 42, 8.7.1, table 18, buffer id row
Why is the table 18 treatment of unspecified values different than the table 19 treatment of what appears to be the same case (i.e., why is the text about processing the command as defined in SPC-4 needed)?

ENDL 14

PDF pg 60, pg 42, 8.7.1, table 18, buffer offset and allocation length rows
The meaning of this field s/b The translation of this field

ENDL 15

PDF pg 60, pg 42, 8.7.2.1, table 19
It might be easier to correlate the codes to the subclauses which follow if the word 'mode' were added to the two i.e. instances.

ENDL 16

PDF pg 61, pg 43, 8.7.2.3, list entry a
offset boundary set s/b <smallcaps>offset boundary<\smallcaps> field set

ENDL 17

PDF pg 61, pg 43, 8.7.2.3, list entry b
<smallcaps>buffer capacity<\smallcaps> set s/b <smallcaps>buffer capacity<\smallcaps> field set

ENDL 18

PDF pg 61, pg 43, 8.8.1, p 2, s 1
... return sense data using autosense. s/b ... return the sense data associated with a CHECK CONDITION status using autosense.

ENDL 19

PDF pg 61, pg 43, 8.8.1, p 2, s 2
... return sense data in response to the REQUEST SENSE command (see SAM-2). s/b return contingent allegiance (see SAM-2) sense data in response to the REQUEST SENSE command.

ENDL 20

PDF pg 61, pg 43, 8.8.1, p 3, s 1
... is sense data to return ... s/b ... is contingent allegiance (see SAM-2) sense data ...

ENDL 21

PDF pg 61, pg 43, 8.8.1, p 3

It seems like paragraph 3 would be more readable if broken into several smaller paragraphs (e.g., the last two sentences would work better as two separate paragraphs)

ENDL 22 Technical

PDF pg 61, pg 43, 8.8.1, table 20

Delete the first row in table 20. Its function is already covered by the text

which introduces the table. Besides, the reference should be SAM-2, not SPC-3.

ENDL 23

PDF pg 62, pg 44, 8.8.1, table 21, desc row

Why are both description text and a table footnote needed to specify that support for the ATA PASS-THROUGH command mandates support for setting the desc

bit to one.

ENDL 24

PDF pg 63, pg 45, 8.8.6, p 1, s 1

IDLE) then s/b IDLE), then

ENDL 25

PDF pg 63, pg 45, 8.8.7, p 1, s 1

STANDBY) then s/b STANDBY), then

ENDL 26

PDF pg 64, pg 46, 8.9.1.3

It is not clear that the translation of the allocation length field should be

differentiated based on the contents of the security protocol field. The translation specified for security protocol codes 00h to 06h appears to be globally applicable.

ENDL 27

PDF pg 64, pg 46, 8.9.1.3.3

The content of this subclause makes no mention of allocation length.

Therefore, the subclause cannot appropriately be identified as a subclause of

the allocation length field translation.

ENDL 28

PDF pg 65, pg 47, 8.10.1.3

It is not clear that the translation of the transfer length field should be differentiated based on the contents of the security protocol field. The

translation specified for security protocol codes 00h to 06h appears to be globally applicable.

ENDL 29

PDF pg 65, pg 47, 8.10.1.3

SECURITY PROTOCOL field translation overview s/b TRANSFER LENGTH field translation overview

ENDL 30

PDF pg 65, pg 47, 8.10.1.3.3

The content of this subclause makes no mention of transfer length.

Therefore,

the subclause cannot appropriately be identified as a subclause of the allocation length field translation.

ENDL 31

PDF pg 67, pg 49, 8.11.2, p 1, s 1

what is reported s/b the information that is reported

ENDL 32

PDF pg 69, pg 51, 8.11.3, table 26, 1|no|n/a row

The unordered list looks as if someone might have intended it to be ordered.

Or, is the goal that the three ATA verify commands can be sent in any order with respect to the contents of their LBA fields?

ENDL 33

PDF pg 71, pg 53, 8.13.1, table 28, buffer offset and parameter list length rows

The meaning of this field s/b The translation of this field

ENDL 34

PDF pg 71, pg 53, 8.13.2.1

It looks like some but not all of the contents of table 29 is specified in the

introduction to table 29. Is this necessary?

ENDL 35

PDF pg 72, pg 54, 8.13.2.2

Since 8.13.2.3 and 8.13.2.4 begin with an 'In this mode ...' sentence, perhaps

8.13.2.2 should replicate that style.

ENDL 36

PDF pg 72, pg 54, 8.13.2.3, p 2

This paragraph appears to be telling the reader to return GOOD status and after that to determine if an error should be reported. It is tough to take back a GOOD status after it has been sent. Note that 8.13.2.4 does not have this problem.

ENDL 37

PDF pg 72, pg 54, 8.13.2.3, p 2, s 3

RE: 'The SATL shall check if the ATA DOWNLOAD MICROCODE command completed with

an error.' Is it possible to be more specific about how the SATL performs this

check?

ENDL 38

PDF pg 72, pg 54, 8.13.2.3, p 3, s 1

RE: 'successfully, running' The comma should be removed.

ENDL 39

PDF pg 72, pg 54, 8.13.2.4, p 3, s 1

RE: 'successfully, running' The comma should be removed.

ENDL 40

PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, table 30

Why is there a black hole in this table? Which element of the T10 Style Guide

requires this to be present?

ENDL 41

PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, 4th p after table 30, s 1

IF s/b If

ENDL 42

PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, 4th p after table 30, s 1

PARAMETER LIST LENGTH should be in small caps

ENDL 43

PDF pg 73, pg 55, 8.13.2.4, 6th p after table 30, s 1

BUFFER OFFSET and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field s/b BUFFER OFFSET field and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field [with the field names in small caps]

ENDL 44

PDF pg 139, pg 121, 12.1, 2nd to last line in subclause

Vital Product Data s/b VPD

Comments attached to Abs ballot from Elwood Parsons of Foxconn Electronics:

Lack of expertise

Comments attached to No ballot from Rob Elliott of Hewlett Packard Co.:

comment number 1

Page=1 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Revision 05

s/b

Revision 06

comment number 2

Page=1 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

22 June 2008

is incorrect

comment number 3
Page=15 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add dates to R.5 and R.6 and future revision history headers

comment number 4
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
2006
s/b
2008 (or 2009)

comment number 5
Page=20 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete all the "i.e.,"s from figure 2. That is not used for acronyms in
parenthesis - just the acronym is fine, like "(ATA8-ACS)"

comment number 6
Page=21 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete i.e., in figure 3 (see reasoning in comment on figure 2)

comment number 7
Page=22 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Include the planned ISO/IEC numbers for the ATA8 documents

comment number 8
Page=22 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Approved
s/b
lowercase

(or b) and c) should also start capitalized)

comment number 9
Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
ISO/IEC 14776-413, SCSI Architecture Model - 3 (SAM-3) [ANSI INCITS
402-2005]

and upgrade all references to SAM-4

comment number 10
Page=22 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

SAM-4 has an ANSI INCITS number now, so the T10 project number can be replaced.

The international ISO/IEC 14776-414 is still "under development" so don't move this into 2.2.

comment number 11

Page=22 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete

ISO/IEC 14776-151, Serial Attached SCSI - 1.1 (SAS-1.1) [ANSI INCITS 417-2006]

and upgrade all SAS-1.1 references to SAS-2

comment number 12

Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete

ISO/IEC 14776-322, SCSI Block Commands - 2 (SBC-2) [ANSI INCITS 405-2005]

and upgrade all SBC-2 references to SBC-3, which should be nearing completion

comment number 13

Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete

ISO/IEC 14776-453, SCSI Primary Commands - 3 (SPC-3) [ANSI INCITS 408-2005]

and upgrade all SPC-3 references to SPC-4

comment number 14

Page=22 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Add FCP-3 (or FCP-4), as that is used in some example figures and text.

comment number 15

Page=24 Subtype=Underline Subj=Underline Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

(global)

For cross-references in definitions that apply to the entire defined term, use "xxx. See SPC-3." format. Use "(see SPC-3)" format just for references for the words preceding it in the sentence."

comment number 16

Page=27 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=After LUN definition, add "See SAM-4."

comment number 17
Page=28 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
subsystem
s/b
subsystem

comment number 18
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(see SAM-3)
s/b
(see SAM-4)

and update the definition if needed

comment number 19
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Force Unit Access
s/b
lowercase

comment number 20
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Least
s/b
lowercase

comment number 21
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Most
s/b
lowercase

comment number 22
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Logical
s/b
lowercase

comment number 23
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

Native command queuing
s/b
mixed case

comment number 24
Page=29 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=The (see 3.1.5) cross references don't seem to work in the PDF file

comment number 25
Page=29 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=3.1.60 cross reference seems broken in the PDF file

comment number 26
Page=29 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=3.1.72 cross reference doesn't seem to work in the PDF file

comment number 27
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(see 2.2) should be (see 2.3), since SAM-4 is still "under development" at
the ISO level

comment number 28
Page=29 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(see 2.3)

Nothing in 2.3 refers to an "SCT" standard.

comment number 29
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Tagged command queuing
s/b
mixed case

comment number 30
Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Vital Product Data
s/b
lowercase

comment number 31
Page=32 Subtype=Underline Subj=Underline Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)

Change every usage of "if" to include a "then". This helps separate the conditions from the resulting actions, which is helpful when there are compound conditions or actions.

If <condition>, then <result>

comment number 32
Page=32 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 2

comment number 33
Page=33 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 3

comment number 34
Page=33 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace after table 3

comment number 35
Page=34 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
LBA Mid register

"register" terminology no longer exists in ATA8-ACS, and LBA is now just LBA (47:0), not Low/Mid/High, so this is not a good example any more.

comment number 36
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
translation layer
s/b
SCSI/ATA translation layer

comment number 37
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
oterwise
s/b
otherwise

comment number 38
Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
oterwise
s/b
otherwise

comment number 39

Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Serial ATA or Parallel ATA devices by representing ATA devices as SCSI direct-access block devices

s/b

ATA or ATAPI devices by representing them as SCSI peripheral devices.

since there is an ATAPI annex now.

comment number 40

Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=this is not good material for a list; merge back into the sentence.

comment number 41

Page=35 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

device

s/b

<not sure: maybe:>

device server

ATA device or ATAPI device

comment number 42

Page=36 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

(see SAM-3)

s/b

(see SAM-4)

comment number 43

Page=36 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

EXAMPLE 1 -

Change these 3 "EXAMPLEs" back into standard paragraphs.

comment number 44

Page=36 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

ATA device

s/b

ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

comment number 45
Page=36 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device
s/b
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

comment number 46
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device
s/b
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

comment number 47
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device
s/b
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

comment number 48
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device
s/b
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

comment number 49
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device
s/b
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

comment number 50
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device
s/b
ATA device or ATAPI device

since "ATA device" is narrowly defined as General feature set only, not a term for all devices defined by the ATA standards

comment number 51
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
occurs:
s/b
occurs, then:

comment number 52
Page=38 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete ,

comment number 53
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
)
s/b
)

comment number 54
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Serial ATA device
s/b
Serial ATA attached ATA device

since this does not apply to ATAPI devices, but the term "Serial ATA device" means both ATA and ATAPI

comment number 55
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device

An ATA nexus loss also occurs for ATAPI devices.

comment number 56
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

READ CAPACITY (16)
s/b
READ CAPACITY (16) parameter data

throughout table 5

comment number 57
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Table 5 -

font in table title is wrong

comment number 58
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

.
s/b
;

comment number 59
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

.
s/b
;

comment number 60
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

that
s/b
that:

comment number 61
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

It is important to note...

is not standardese

comment number 62
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Not supposed to refer to section numbers in other standards

comment number 63
Page=39 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 5

comment number 64
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device

ATAPI devices also respond to ATA hardware resets and software resets

comment number 65
Page=40 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Text in c) after the : needs to be indented more

comment number 66
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
where
should be on its own line

comment number 67
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
In figures 8, 9, and 10, the ATA row "LOGICAL" start with a capital L and then has smallcaps. It should be all smallcaps or all mixed case

comment number 68
Page=40 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=There needs to be a paragraph introducing each figure.

comment number 69
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ALIGNMENTfield
s/b
ALIGNMENT field

comment number 70
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ALIGNMENTfield
s/b
ALIGNMENT field

comment number 71
Page=44 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
After
queue

add .

comment number 72
 Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 command Priority
 s/b
 Command priority

comment number 73
 Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 Command Priority
 s/b
 lowercase

comment number 74
 Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 Command Priorities
 s/b
 lowercase

comment number 75
 Page=46 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=delete whitespace above table 8

comment number 76
 Page=46 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 Consider adding (i.e.,) to confirm the meaning of the priority values in
 SCSI and ATA:

| | | |
|-----------------------------|--|---------------------------|
| 0h (i.e., vendor-specific) | | 0 (i.e., normal priority) |
| 1h (i.e., highest priority) | | 1 (i.e., high priority) |
| Fh (i.e., lowest priority) | | 0 (i.e., normal priority) |

comment number 77
 Page=47 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 6.4 needs to mention how TMFs for ATAPI devices are handled or not handled.

Just defining that all TMFs are replied to with FUNCTION REJECTED would
 suffice.

comment number 78
 Page=47 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=Section 6.4.3 probably also applies to ATAPI devices.

comment number 79
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
CLEAR ATA
s/b
CLEAR ACA

comment number 80
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
"shall process the CLEAR ACA task management function as defined in SAM-4"
is misleading, because NOTE 7 then says that the only option is to reject
it.

comment number 81
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add:
I_T NEXUS RESET

It should be similar to ABORT TASK SET

comment number 82
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
6.4.8 should also mention establishing the unit attention condition defined
in SAM-4

comment number 83
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
devices
s/b
PATA devices

comment number 84
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add:
QUERY TASK SET

It should be similar to QUERY TASK, but reporting if any task is in the
task set, not just a specific I_T_L_Q nexus.

comment number 85
Page=49 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
Add:
QUERY ASYNCHRONOUS EVENT

to report any unit attention conditions that the SATL has established

comment number 86
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
CONTROL Byte

The smallcaps are lost in the table of contents

comment number 87
Page=50 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete this level:
6.5.1 CONTROL byte overview

since there is no 6.5.2.

comment number 88
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
occured
s/b
occurred

comment number 89
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
nexusus
s/n
nexuses

comment number 90
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
nexusus
s/n
nexuses

comment number 91
Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
nexusus
s/n
nexuses

comment number 92

Page=50 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Add more 6.x sections describing what the SATL does if it detects every SCSI event defined in SAM-4 on the front side, just like 6.6 describes handling of I_T nexus loss on the front side. (e.g. if the SATL is in a FC to SATA bridge, and there is a hard reset, etc. on the FC side).

Make them subsections of one "6.x SCSI events" section

a) power on: <not sure what to say>

b) hard reset: abort outstanding ATA commands, delete commands in the internal context, establish unit attention condition. Should it send an ATA hardware reset in all cases rather than a software reset?

c) logical unit reset: move the functional description from 6.4.8 into here.

c) power loss expected: abort outstanding ATA commands like with I_T nexus loss (or like hard reset?), delete commands in the internal context, establish unit attention condition.

comment number 93

Page=50 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

(see 6.4.2)

6.4.2 only covers queued commands; need to also refer to 6.4.3 to cover non-queued commands. (I_T nexus loss is a SCSI event, so could occur even while a non-queued command is outstanding)

comment number 94

Page=50 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Section 6.6 also applies to ATAPI devices; there's no way to reject a SCSI event (unlike the TMFs).

The SATL doesn't abort commands with CHECK POWER MODE in that case; it should use the ATA hardware reset or software reset only. In the first list, changing 1) to refer to 6.4.3 should cover that. Item 3) does not apply, however, as the ATAPI device establishes its own unit attention condition.

comment number 95

Page=50 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete

LINK

If set to one, the SATL shall terminate the command with CHECK CONDITION

status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB.

since it is obsolete in SAM-4

comment number 96
Page=51 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete this level

7.1 Translated and emulated commands

since there is no 7.2

comment number 97
Page=51 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SCSI to ATA command mapping for ATA devices

Add in the concept of "mapping to a SCSI logical unit with a peripheral device type of 00h (i.e., direct-access block device)"

comment number 98
Page=51 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Translation

is not the right word for ATAPI

comment number 99
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
In the ATA command list,

FORMAT UNIT uses no "and" or "or"
REASSIGN BLOCKS uses "and"
START STOP UNIT uses "or"
SYNCHRONIZE CACHE uses "or"
WRITE BUFFER uses "or"

pick one convention

comment number 100
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add SECURITY PROTOCOL IN/OUT to table 10

comment number 101
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add CHECK POWER MODE to the ATA command(s) for REQUEST SENSE

comment number 102
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add IDLE IMMEDIATE and STANDBY IMMEDIATE to list of ATA command(s) for
START STOP UNIT

comment number 103
Page=51 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add "ATA verify commands" and "ATA flush commands" to the list of ATA
command(s) for START STOP UNIT

comment number 104
Page=52 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add GET MEDIA STATUS to the list of ATA command(s) for TEST UNIT READY

comment number 105
Page=53 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
mapping
s/b
command mapping

since SPC mode pages, VPD pages, etc. are not described in section 8

comment number 106
Page=54 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete

BQUE Unspecified (see 3.4.2)

it is obsolete in SPC-4

comment number 107
Page=54 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete

MCHNGR

The SATL shall set this bit to zero to indicate the peripheral device is
not attached to a medium transport element.

it is obsolete in SPC-4

comment number 108

Page=58 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

Add a CDB table in 8.4 with "As defined in MODE SELECT (6) (see 8.3)" descriptions

Note that the operation code must change to 55h for MODE SELECT (10).

comment number 109

Page=59 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

Add a CDB table in 8.6 with "As defined in MODE SENSE (6) (see 8.5)" descriptions.

Note that the OPERATION CODE must change to 5Ah for MODE SENSE (10).

comment number 110

Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

ILLEGIAL

s/b

ILLEGAL

comment number 111

Page=61 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

standby power management state

s/b

Standby mode

when referring to the ATA device state

comment number 112

Page=61 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

Information on sense data contents should be moved into a new clause in chapter 5, since it is equally applicable to both REQUEST SENSE parameter data and autosense data.

comment number 113

Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

FORMAT UNIT in progress

s/b

Format operation in progress

to match terminology in sbc3r15

comment number 114

Page=62 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
(i.e., the ATA device is in the Standby power management state)

ATA Standby can also mean SCSI standby, so this is not a good i.e. It would even be misleading as an e.g.

comment number 115
Page=62 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Keep 8.8.4, 8.8.6, and 8.8.7 together since they're all power conditions. 8.8.5 belongs elsewhere.

comment number 116
Page=63 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
8.9.1 has "hanging paragraphs"

There should be no 8.9.1 if there is no 8.9.2.

If a section has subsections, it cannot have introductory text.

comment number 117
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Security_Protocol

ata8-acis-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 118
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SP_Specific

ata8-acis-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 119
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDLE power condition
s/b
lowercase

comment number 120
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
STANDBY power condition
s/b
lowercase

comment number 121
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
standby power condition
s/b
Standby mode

when referring to the ATA device state. (ATA8-ACS is inconsistent, sometimes using state, power management mode, etc.)

comment number 122
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
power condition field
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 123
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
power condition field
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 124
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
idle power condition
s/b
Idle mode

(or whatever ATA-ACS2 decides is the preferred terminology)

comment number 125
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDLE
s/b
Idle

comment number 126
Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
Standby

comment number 127

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
A2h
s/b
B5h

comment number 128
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=All the 8.9.1.x references in table 23 should be to 8.10.1.x

comment number 129
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Description needs to include TRUSTED NON-DATA too

comment number 130
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
8.10.1 has "hanging paragraphs"

There should be no 8.10.1 if there is no 8.10.2.

If a section has subsections, it cannot have introductory text.

comment number 131
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer_Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 132
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer_Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 133
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SECURITY PROTOCOL
s/b
the SECURITY PROTOCOL field

comment number 134
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
allocation length is zero,

s/b
the ALLOCATION LENGTH field is set to zero, then

comment number 135
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
specified ALLOCATION LENGTH number of bytes
s/b
number of bytes specified by the ALLOCATION LENGTH field

with caution for how INC_512 makes that violate the standard SCSI
definition for ALLOCATION LENGTH (which should never have been done - the
field should have a different name in SPC-4)

comment number 136
Page=64 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
INC_512 was proposed as necessary to ease SAT translations. SAT-2 has no
problem defining that the SATL multiply by 512 when needed, however. I
suggest the SAT WG consider if INC_512 should be dropped from SPC-4.

comment number 137
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
the INC_512 is set
s/b
the INC_512 bit is set

comment number 138
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field

comment number 139
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SECURITY PROTOCOL
s/b
the SECURITY PROTOCOL field

comment number 140
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field

comment number 141
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field

comment number 142
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TRANSFER LENGTH
s/b
lowercase

comment number 143
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ALLOCATION LENGTH (15:0)
s/b
the value of the ALLOCATION LENGTH field.

comment number 144
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
"this field" is overstated

Applies only for these values in this field

comment number 145
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
for...
s/b
for the number of blocks specified by the ATA Trans_Length field

comment number 146
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Security_Protocol

ata8-acis-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 147
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SP_Specific

ata8-acis-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 148
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer_Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 149
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transfer_Length

ata8-acs-r6 doesn't use _

comment number 150
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
transfer length is zero
s/b
the TRANSFER LENGTH field is set to 0000000h, then

comment number 151
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FFFFh
s/b
0000FFFFh

to make it clearer how wide the field is and why it could exceed all Fs

comment number 152
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1FF_FE0h
s/b
01FF_FE0h (i.e., FFFFh x 512)

to make it clear how wide the field is

comment number 153
Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
bytes
s/b
a number of bytes

comment number 154

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SECURITY PROTOCOL field
s/b
TRANSFER LENGTH field

comment number 155
Page=69 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DIAGNOSITC
s/b
DIAGNOSTIC

comment number 156
Page=70 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=delete whitespace above table 27

comment number 157
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
s/b
,

comment number 158
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
convert this sentence into an a)b)c) list like the first row of the table.

comment number 159
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
the the
s/b
the

comment number 160
Page=71 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete:
If the MODE field is set to 02h, the SATL shall send an ATA WRITE BUFFER
command to the ATA device. If the MODE field is set to 05h the SATL shall
send a DOWNLOAD MICROCODE command to the ATA device as specified in table
29.

Those sentences omit 07h, and those rules already fully described by table
29.

comment number 161
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
features register
s/b
ATA Features field

comment number 162
Page=71 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
indicating
downloaded microcode is saved for immediate and future
use (see 8.13.2.3)

Convert to an (i.e.,)

comment number 163
Page=71 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=In 07h row, add reference to 8.13.2.4.

comment number 164
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
s/b
,

comment number 165
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
s/b
,

comment number 166
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
field the
s/b
field, then the

comment number 167
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
MODE
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 168
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
"and then complete the WRITE BUFFER command with GOOD status"

is technically wrong. Two sentences later says the command is terminated with CHECK CONDITION status if there is an error.

comment number 169
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set of WRITE BUFFER commands
s/b
WRITE BUFFER command

There is no "set" with mode 5h.

comment number 170
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
07:00
s/b
7:0

(similarly through table 30 and 8.13.2.4, delete leading 0s in the decimal bit numbers)

comment number 171
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
BUFFER OFFSET
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 172
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 173
Page=73 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
delete the black fill in table 30; straddle cell vertically with Contents

comment number 174
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

Field Name Bits
s/b bold

comment number 175
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
indirect
s/b
indirect

comment number 176
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
mapping
s/b
command mapping

since SBC mode pages, VPD pages, etc. are not described in section 9

comment number 177
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
may implement...

convert into a) b) list

comment number 178
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Size

should probably be lowercase

comment number 179
Page=76 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete blank page above table 31.

If that makes the table wrap pages, add (page 1 of 2) to table title

comment number 180
Page=76 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=The Overlap feature set no longer exists in ATA8-ACS

comment number 181
Page=76 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SATA-2.6 NCQ

s/b
NCQ

because ATA8-ACS defines this feature set, mentioning SATA-2.6 in the name is not necessary (although the details are in SATA-2.6, SAT doesn't need to say that)

comment number 182
Page=76 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DMA is not a "feature set" so doesn't really fit as a column labeled "ATA feature sets required to be supported and enabled"

comment number 183
Page=77 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 184
Page=77 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
The usual sorting of fields in SCSI standards is top-to-bottom,
left-to-right, so this should be:
OPERATION CODE
FMTPIINFO
LONGLIST
FMTDATA
CMPLIST
DEFECT LIST FORMAT

comment number 185
Page=80 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 186
Page=81 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete:
specified by the READ (10) command.

so other command descriptions can refer to this field

comment number 187

Page=82 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Replace RDPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:

As defined in READ (10) (see 9.5)

comment number 188

Page=83 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Replace RDPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:

As defined in READ (10) (see 9.5)

comment number 189

Page=84 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete

specified

for consistency

comment number 190

Page=85 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete

RTO_EN Unspecified (see 3.4.2)

It was merged into P_TYPE

comment number 191

Page=85 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete

specified

for consistency

comment number 192

Page=86 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

The SATL shall emulate the REASSIGN BLOCKS command as defined in table 43.

s/b

Table 41 shows the translation for fields in the REASSIGN BLOCKS CDB.

for consistency. Although this table has no literal translations, it also has no information about emulation.

comment number 193
Page=87 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(see 3.1.17)

Cannot create active cross references to Frame sections inside Visio figures, so better to leave these out.

comment number 194
Page=88 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)

NOFLUSH
s/b
NO_FLUSH

to match SBC-3

comment number 195
Page=88 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
To match the order in SBC-3:
Move POWER CONDITION MODIFIER after IMMED
Move NO_FLUSH after POWER CONDITION

comment number 196
Page=88 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 197
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0
s/b
00h

to match other entries

comment number 198
Page=90 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Make table 45 Descriptor column wider so it doesn't take as much space.

Add (part 1 of 2) to table title if it continues to wrap

Adjust formatting so there is not a page of white space above the table

comment number 199
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
00h - START_VALID
s/b
00h (i.e., START_VALID)

Use uppercase, not smallcaps.

Make similar change in other rows in table 45

comment number 200
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Translation
s/b
field translation

comment number 201
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
POWER CONDITION
s/b
Code

comment number 202
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
stopped power state
s/b
stopped power condition, standby power condition, or idle power condition

since this moves out of any state, not just stopped

comment number 203
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes
s/b
If the ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 204
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b

If the ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 205
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

comment number 206
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA IDLE IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

comment number 207
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
.
s/b
; or

comment number 208
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
.
s/b
;

comment number 209
Page=90 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete (see 9.11.2)

That section is only for errors; this is a GOOD status entry.

comment number 210
Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
zero
s/b
00h

to communicate the field width and better parallel the 44h below

comment number 211
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
03
s/b
03h

comment number 212
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 213
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 214
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

comment number 215
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

comment number 216
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete (see 9.11.2)

since this is for GOOD status

comment number 217
Page=91 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete (see 9.11.2)
since this is for GOOD status

comment number 218
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
ATA STANDBY command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY command in step 4) completes

comment number 219
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY command in step 4) completes

comment number 220
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command was sent (step 2) and completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 221
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 222
Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FORCE_S_0
s/b
FORCE_STANDBY_0

comment number 223
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Comment on Text Author=HPQ-jwolford
Comment=
one
s/b
zero

comment number 224
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
..
s/b
.

comment number 225

Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 226
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA flush command completes
s/b
ATA flush command in step 2) completes

comment number 227
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

comment number 228
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command completes
s/b
ATA STANDBY IMMEDIATE command in step 4) completes

comment number 229
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA MEDIA EJECT command completes
s/b
ATA MEDIA EJECT command in step 2) completes

comment number 230
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA MEDIA EJECT command completes
s/b
ATA MEDIA EJECT command in step 2) completes

comment number 231
Page=93 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace SYNC_NV, IMMED, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and NUMBER OF
BLOCKS descriptions with:
As defined in SYNCHRONIZE (10) (see 9.12)

comment number 232
Page=93 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 233
Page=93 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 234
Page=93 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
If the NOFLUSH bit is set to one, the SATL shall not send an ATA flush
command. If the NOFLUSH bit is set to zero, the SATL shall send an ATA
flush command.

Really, this field is just used in table 45 while interpreting certain
POWER CONDITION values; these statements don't make sense on their own.

Reword to something generic like:
The NOFLUSH bit specifies whether the SATL sends an ATA flush condition
while processing certain power condition requests (see table 45 in 9.11.2).

comment number 235
Page=94 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
describes
s/b
shows

for consistency

comment number 236
Page=95 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace VRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and
VERIFICATION LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in VERIFY (10) (see 9.14)

comment number 237
Page=95 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
describes

s/b
shows

for consistency

comment number 238
Page=95 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=In VERIFY (12), GROUP NUMBER belongs after VERIFICATION LENGTH

comment number 239
Page=96 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace VRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and
VERIFICATION LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in VERIFY (10) (see 9.14)

comment number 240
Page=96 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
describes
s/b
shows

for consistency

comment number 241
Page=96 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=In VERIFY (16), GROUP NUMBER belongs after VERIFICATION LENGTH

comment number 242
Page=97 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
For consistency, add:
9.xx VERIFY commands overview
9.xx WRITE LONG commands overview
9.xx WRITE SAME commands overview

comment number 243
Page=98 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 244
Page=99 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 245
Page=100 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER,
and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE (10) (see 9.19)

comment number 246
Page=100 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 247
Page=100 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE (12), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

comment number 248
Page=101 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FUA-NV
s/b
FUA_NV

comment number 249
Page=101 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
As appropriate, replace WRPROTECT, DPO, FUA, FUA_NV, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS,
GROUP NUMBER, and TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE (10) (see 9.19)

Note that this table is not literally the same (unlike WRITE (12)). WRITE (10) has a NOTE 1 inside the FUA_NV description, while this table has a similar footnote a. These discrepancies are why it is better to only have the rules one place.

comment number 250
Page=101 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 251
Page=101 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE (16), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

comment number 252
Page=102 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 253
Page=103 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and
TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE AND VERIFY (10) (see 9.23)

comment number 254
Page=103 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 255
Page=103 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE AND VERIFY (12), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

comment number 256
Page=104 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
mappingthe
s/b
mapping the

comment number 257
Page=104 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, DPO, BYTCHK, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and
TRANSFER LENGTH descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE AND VERIFY (10) (see 9.23)

comment number 258
Page=104 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 259
Page=104 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 260
Page=104 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=For WRITE AND VERIFY (16), GROUP NUMBER goes after TRANSFER LENGTH

comment number 261
Page=105 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=delete whitespace above table 60

comment number 262
Page=105 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Field Translations
s/b
lowercase

comment number 263
Page=106 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
psical
s/b
physical

comment number 264
Page=106 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
specified

for consistency

comment number 265
Page=106 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
Field Translations
s/b
lowercase

comment number 266
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
clientand
s/b
client and

comment number 267
Page=107 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add "shows" sentence for consistency

comment number 268
Page=107 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=PBDATA goes ahead of LBDATA

comment number 269
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

comment number 270
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

comment number 271
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

comment number 272
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

comment number 273
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
in
s/b
in the

comment number 274
Page=108 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
and
s/b
and the

comment number 275
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
clientand
s/b
client and

comment number 276
Page=109 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Replace WRPROTECT, LBDATA, PBDATA, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS, GROUP NUMBER, and
NUMBER OF BLOCKS descriptions with:
As defined in WRITE SAME (10) (see 9.28)

comment number 277
Page=109 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add "shows" sentence for consistency

comment number 278
Page=109 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
NUMBER OF BLOCKS
s/b
NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

comment number 279
Page=109 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
For WRITE SAME (16), GROUP NUMBER goes after NUMBER OF LOGICAL BLOCKS

comment number 280
Page=110 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

while
s/b
and

comment number 281
Page=111 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace below table 66

comment number 282
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Unspecified (see 3.4.2)
s/b
Shall be set to zero

for SPF

comment number 283
Page=113 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=This field

comment number 284
Page=113 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=TAS should be after ATO

comment number 285
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
UA_INTLCK_CTRL
no
Shall be set to 00b

I think this should be Unspecified (see 3.4.2). SATL should be allowed to implement unit attention interlock if it wants.

comment number 286
Page=113 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
n/a
s/b
no

for SPF

comment number 287
Page=114 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete blank row in table 70, or (more likely) add the missing SPF row:

SPF no Shall be set to zero (see SBC-3)

comment number 288
Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
00h
s/b
0000h

comment number 289
Page=114 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
; and

comment number 290
Page=114 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
.

comment number 291
Page=114 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
;

comment number 292
Page=115 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add SPF row

SPF no Shall be set to zero

comment number 293
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
,
s/b
;

comment number 294
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set zero
s/b
set to zero

comment number 295
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set zero
s/b
set to zero

comment number 296
Page=116 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set zero
s/b
set to zero

comment number 297
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Pages
s/b
lowercase

comment number 298
Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Pages Overview
s/b
lowercase

comment number 299
Page=117 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Add EBACKERR bit above LOGERR

comment number 300
Page=118 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Move table 74 intro paragraph directly above table 74.

Move table 75 intro paragraph directly above table 75.

comment number 301
Page=118 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Page
s/b
lowercase

comment number 302
Page=118 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Page
s/b
lowercase

comment number 303
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Changable
s/b
Changeable

comment number 304
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Page Fields
s/b
lowercase

comment number 305
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
seto
s/b
set

comment number 306
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
the STANDBY CONDITION TIMER shall return zero
s/b
this field shall be set to zero

comment number 307
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
STANDBY
s/b
the STANDBY bit

comment number 308
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
COUNT field
s/b
the Count field

comment number 309
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
STANDBY CONDITION TIMER field
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 310
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
:
s/b
,

and join the paragraphs

comment number 311
Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
:
s/b
,

and join the paragraphs

comment number 312
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Log pages
s/b
Log parameters

comment number 313
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Log pages
s/b
Log parameters

comment number 314
Page=120 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
I recommend sorting table 74 by the left column's values, not the right
column's values

comment number 315
Page=120 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Show what happens to value 0 in table 75

comment number 316
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
After
F1h

add (i.e., 30 minutes)

[or whatever is correct]

comment number 317
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
power condition mode page
s/b
Power Condition mode page

comment number 318
Page=120 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Mode Page
s/b
lowercase

comment number 319
Page=120 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
Supported Log Pages and Subpages (00h / FFh)

Most of the description can reference Supported Log Pages (00h / 00h)

comment number 320
Page=120 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add subpage codes after each log page code (these pages are all xxh / 00h)

comment number 321
Page=121 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=delete whitespace above table 77

comment number 322
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
table 2
is incorrect; probably mean table 78.

comment number 323
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to

comment number 324
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to

comment number 325
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to

comment number 326
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to

comment number 327
Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Shall be
s/b
Shall be set to

comment number 328
Page=121 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=left justify Description or Reference in table 77

comment number 329
Page=121 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Decide if all log pages should describe the log page header fields (DS,
SPF, PAGE CODE, SUBPAGE CODE, PAGE LENGTH) or not and make them consistent.

Right now, 10.2.2 shows none of them, 10.2.4 shows two of the fields, ...

comment number 330
Page=122 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Table 2
s/b
table 78 (see 10.2.2.2)

comment number 331
Page=123 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
table 81.1).
s/b
table 81).

comment number 332
Page=123 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SUPPORTED PAGE LIST
s/b
Supported pages

comment number 333
Page=123 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
DS Shall be set to zero

comment number 334
Page=123 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Combine LBIN and LP into FORMAT AND LINKING 2-bit field

comment number 335
Page=125 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
TIMESTAMP
s/b
ACCUMULATED POWER ON HOURS

comment number 336
Page=128 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DS
Shall be set to zero

comment number 337
Page=128 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Combine LBIN and LP into FORMAT AND LINKING (2 bit field)

comment number 338
Page=128 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Vendor Specific
s/v
Vendor specific

comment number 339
Page=129 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Make the left column of table 86 wider to avoid wrapping the B1h row

comment number 340
Page=129 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Put PERIPHERAL QUALIFIER first

comment number 341
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SUPPORTED VPD LIST
s/b
Supported VPD page list

comment number 342
Page=129 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
This list shall contain the page codes of the pages supported by the SATL
in ascending order of page codes beginning with page code 00h.
s/b
Unspecified (see 3.4.3)

comment number 343
Page=130 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
80h
s/b
the value defined in table 88

comment number 344
Page=130 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
14h
s/b
the value defined in table 88

comment number 345
Page=131 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
83h
s/b
the value defined in table 90

comment number 346
Page=131 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Change "identification descriptor" to "designation descriptor" throughout
10.3.4

comment number 347
Page=131 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
Designation descriptor list
with horizontal double lines
between 3-4

comment number 348
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0b
s/b
the value defined in table 91

comment number 349
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
00b
s/b
the value defined in table 91

comment number 350
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
3h
s/b
the value defined in table 91

comment number 351
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0h
s/b
the value defined in table 91

comment number 352

Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1h
s/b
the value defined in table 91

comment number 353
Page=132 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
The IDENTIFIER LENGTH field shall be set to the value defined in table 91.

comment number 354
Page=132 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
After table 91 and 93, change the "shall be" verbs to "is" to match wording
after table 95.

comment number 355
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

comment number 356
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER LENGTH
s/b
DESIGNATOR LENGTH

comment number 357
Page=132 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

comment number 358
Page=132 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
The DESIGNATOR LENGTH field shall be set to the value defined in table 91.

comment number 359
Page=133 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

Add

The DESIGNATOR LENGTH field shall be set to the value defined in table 93.

comment number 360

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

0h

s/b

the value defined in table 93

comment number 361

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

2h

s/b

the value defined in table 93

comment number 362

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

0b

s/b

the value defined in table 93

comment number 363

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

00b

s/b

the value defined in table 93

comment number 364

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

1h

s/b

the value defined in table 93

comment number 365

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

contains the string 'ATA-----'

s/b

shall be set to the value defined in table 93

comment number 366

Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=

IDENTIFIER LENGTH
s/b
DESIGNATOR LENGTH

comment number 367
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

comment number 368
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

comment number 369
Page=133 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
all be
s/b
shall be

comment number 370
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1h
s/b
the value defined in table 95

comment number 371
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
one
s/b
the value defined in table 95

comment number 372
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
01b
s/b
the value defined in table 95

comment number 373
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
3h
s/b
the value defined in table 95

comment number 374
Page=135 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Add
The DESIGNATOR LENGTH field is set to the value defined in table 95.

comment number 375
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

comment number 376
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER TYPE
s/b
DESIGNATOR TYPE

comment number 377
Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
IDENTIFIER LENGTH
s/b
DESIGNATOR LENGTH

comment number 378
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
block device characteristics
s/b
mixed case

comment number 379
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
87h
s/b
the value defined in table 96

comment number 380
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
FIELD
s/b
lowercase

comment number 381
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
peripheral device type
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 382
Page=136 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FIELD
s/b
lowercase

comment number 383
Page=137 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PERHIPHERAL
s/b
PERIPHERAL

comment number 384
Page=137 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PERIPHERAL DEVICE type
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 385
Page=137 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Field Translation
s/b
lowercase and plural

comment number 386
Page=137 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
The medium rotation rate needs to be treated as a 16-bit value and have its
endianness converted (bytes swapped). SBC-3 revision 16 incorrectly omits
the (MSB)/(LSB) labels, which might lead someone into byte preserving
rather than byte swapping.

To avoid endianness confusion, I recommend a table like table 94 be added,

specifying exactly where each byte goes.

SCSI byte 4 = ATA word 217 bits 15:8

SCSI byte 5 = ATA word 217 bits 7:0

comment number 387

Page=138 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Delete the level

11.1 Error translation - ATA device error to SCSI error map

since there is no 11.2

comment number 388

Page=138 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Change:

Error and sense reporting

to:

Translation of ATA errors to SCSI errors

comment number 389

Page=138 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=Consider moving 11 into 5.xx, since it is only one page long.

comment number 390

Page=139 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

mode pages and VPD pages

add "security protocols" to cover 12.5.

Add an introductory paragraph for security protocols after the VPD paragraph.

comment number 391

Page=139 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

In the mode page list, add ATA Power Condition mode page to cover 12.3.3.

comment number 392

Page=139 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=

Consider moving 12.2 (SAT-specific SCSI commands) into its own top level section (after 9), and moving 12.3 (mode pages), 12.4 (VPD pages), and 12.5 (security protocols) into section 10.xx.

comment number 393
Page=139 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Incorporate:
08-344r0 SAT-2 ATA PASS-THROUGH sense data format

to stop returning descriptor format sense data to applications expecting fixed format sense data.

comment number 394
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
DEVICE RESET
s/b
Device Reset

to match capitalization in ata8-acs-r6.

To match terminology in ata8-aam-r3, though, this should be Non-data Command - DEVICE RESET

comment number 395
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Device Diagnostic
s/b
Execute Device Diagnostic

to match ata8-acs-r6

comment number 396
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
FPDMA

ata8-acs defines no such protocol; it lumps the FPDMA commands into the "DMA Queued" protocol. Mark as obsolete?

comment number 397
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
UDMA Data In
UDMA Data Out

ata8-acs-r6 and ata8-aam-r3 define no such protocols. Mark as obsolete?

comment number 398
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Non-data

s/b
Non-Data

to match capitalization in ata8-ac-s-r6. However, ata8-aam-r3 uses "Non-data".

comment number 399
Page=140 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ata8-ac-s-r6 and ata8-aam-r3 add the word "Command" to the end of:
PIO Data-In
PIO Data-Out
DMA
DMA Queued
Non-data

comment number 400
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA hardware reset
s/b
Device Management - ATA hardware reset

to match terminology in ata8-aam-r3

comment number 401
Page=140 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
SRST
s/b
Device Management - ATA software reset

to match terminology in ata8-aam-r3

comment number 402
Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=ATA Status Return Descriptor

comment number 403
Page=141 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
value in the

comment number 404
Page=141 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete
value in the

comment number 405
Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
format
s/b
the format

comment number 406
Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
;
s/b
,

comment number 407
Page=146 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PASSTHROUGH
s/b
PASS-THROUGH

comment number 408
Page=147 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
one to access this mode page
s/b
the value defined in table 110

comment number 409
Page=148 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace below table 111

comment number 410
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
shown
s/b
shown in

comment number 411
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
OAh
s/b
the value defined in table 110

comment number 412
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
0004h
s/b
the value defined in table 110

comment number 413
Page=148 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
F1h
s/b
the value defined in table 110

comment number 414
Page=149 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Trnasfer
s/b
Transfer

comment number 415
Page=151 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Delete whitespace above table 115

comment number 416
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
1Ah
s/b
the value defined in table 115

comment number 417
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
F1h
s/b
the value defined in table 115

comment number 418
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PAGE CODE
s/b
The PAGE CODE field

comment number 419
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott

Comment=
SUBPAGE CODE
s/b
The SUBPAGE CODE field

comment number 420
Page=151 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
one to access this page
s/b
the value defined in table 115

comment number 421
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATA device signature

Since ata8-acis-r6 uses the terms "ATA device signature" and "ATAPI device signature", it may be best to rename this field to plain "device signature"

comment number 422
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
89h
s/b
the value defined in table 116

comment number 423
Page=153 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
238h
s/b
the value defined in table 116

comment number 424
Page=155 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Footnote b is not consistent with field names ending with EXP any more, as ata8-acis-r6 does not use those names. It uses names like LBA LOW (7:0) and LBA LOW (15:8).

Rename the fields to match the ata8-acis-r6 terminology.

comment number 425
Page=155 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
may contain the values shown in table 118
s/b
is defined in table 118

comment number 426
Page=155 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=values

comment number 427
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Security Protocols
s/b
lowercase and singular

and add "parameters" to match spc4 wording

comment number 428
Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Security Protocol
s/b
lowercase

comment number 429
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
in response to for the
s/b
??

comment number 430
Page=157 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete:

The INC_512 bit shall be set to zero. If a SECURITY PROTOCOL IN command is received with the INC_512 bit is set to one, then the SECURITY PROTOCOL IN command shall be terminated with CHECK CONDITION status, with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB.

This is unnecessary. A SATL should be allowed to return 512 byte chunks of data with padding. Ease of mapping into ATA was touted as the reason the INC_512 bit was proposed.

comment number 431
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
PARAMETER LIST LENGTH
s/b
The PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field

comment number 432
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
LENGTH
s/b
LENGTH (13)

since it is known.
(assuming the paragraph below is accurate)

comment number 433
Page=157 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)

SAT-2 needs to define specifically how to translate ATA information into these SCSI fields. What IDENTIFY DEVICE data word and bit cause S_SUPRT to be set to one and zero?

comment number 434
Page=157 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Field definition paragraphs should be top-to-bottom, left-to-right.

comment number 435
Page=157 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=10-15 should be one straddled Reserved field

comment number 436
Page=157 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
set password function

The "set password function" has not been defined for SP IN (unlike SP OUT). This should probably be "for the ATA Device Server Password security protocol" since there are no subfunctions defined.

comment number 437
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
of the , then
s/b
??

comment number 438
Page=158 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
The SATL needs to snoop the current security mode to implement table 123.

What it is expected to snoop to do that should be defined.

comment number 439
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Table footnotes 1 and 2 should be a and b

comment number 440
Page=159 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Define what shading means in a table footnote.

comment number 441
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Fix ??

comment number 442
Page=159 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Rather than try to list each mode page, combine all the entries into one
row:
"All other mode pages"

comment number 443
Page=160 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Rather than try to list each security protocol, combine into one row:
"All other security protocols"

comment number 444
Page=161 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=fix double line on page 161

comment number 445
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=Table footnotes in table 123 should be a b not 1 2

comment number 446
Page=162 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete:

The INC_512 bit shall be set to zero. If a SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command is received with the INC_512 bit is set to one, then the SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT command shall be terminated with CHECK CONDITION status, with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB

This is unnecessary. A SATL should be allowed to accept 512 byte chunks of

data with padding. Ease of mapping into ATA was touted as the reason the INC_512 bit was proposed.

comment number 447
 Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 (global)
 "The PASSWORD field contains a 32-byte binary value."
 and the (MSB) and (LSB) labels.

That's an awful large number. This means the SATL converts:
 SCSI byte 2 (with the MSB) to ATA word 16 bits 15:8 (the MSB in
 little-endian)
 SCSI byte 3 to ATA word 16 bits 7:0
 SCSI byte 32 to ATA word 1 bits 15:8
 SCSI byte 33 (with the LSB) to ATA word 1 bits 7:0 (the LSB in
 little-endian)

I suspect the intend was that the PASSWORD field to be passed along
 preserving the byte order.

SCSI byte 2 to ATA word 1 bits 7:0 (i.e. ATA byte 2)
 SCSI byte 3 to ATA word 1 bits 15:8 (i.e., ATA byte 3)

...

SCSI byte 32 to ATA word 16 bits 7:0 (i.e. ATA byte 32)
 SCSI byte 33 to ATA word 16 bits 15:8 (i.e. ATA byte 33)

The fix is to simply remove the (MSB) and (LSB) labels. A table showing
 the desired mapping is highly advisable as well.

Check the other PASSWORD fields as well.

comment number 448
 Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 shall be set to 24h

Weaken this rule to allow INC_512 to be used, and also to allow padding
 even if the extra bytes are not used. If ATA adds some more fields in that
 area, SATL should just pass them through.

comment number 449
 Page=163 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
 Comment=
 (global)

SAT-2 should not try to define the functionality of any of the bits in the
 parameter lists/parameter data. That functionality is defined by ATA8-ACS;
 if ACS adds more fields or modifies the definitions, there's no point in
 SAT trying to keep up. The SAT-2 standard cannot say "the ATA device
 shall" do anything - that's outside of its control. The SATL can hope that
 the ATA device will work as documented in ATA8-ACS, but that's about all.

If this were a command defined in SPC-4 or SBC-3 that native SCSI device servers could implement, then a functional definition would be appropriate (and SAT-2 would define how to translate each SCSI field to the corresponding ATA field).

For table 125, just define that the parameter list is passed along byte-by-byte to the ATA device as the SECURITY SET PASSWORD data content. Apply this same concept to the other definitions.

The SATL does need to snoop the current security mode to implement table 123. What it is expected to snoop to do that should be defined.

comment number 450
Page=163 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(global)

parameter data
s/b
parameter list

(data-out uses "parameter list", data-in uses "parameter data")

comment number 451
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Command Transmission
s/b
lowercase

comment number 452
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATAPI device
should not be bold

comment number 453
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Device Model
s/b
lowercase

comment number 454
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Transmission
s/b
lowercase

comment number 455
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
operates by using an ATA command, the PACKET command, in order to transmit
a SCSI CDB to
the device
s/b
accepts a SCSI CDB using the ATA PACKET command (see ATA8-ACS)

comment number 456
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
(e.g., read or write operations)

move this earlier, after "primary function"

comment number 457
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
peripheral device type
s/b
smallcaps

comment number 458
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
INQUIRY command
s/b
standard INQUIRY data

comment number 459
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
A packet device
s/b
An ATAPI device

to match term defined in ata8-acs-r6

comment number 460
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATAPI devices may be identified through the issuance of the IDENTIFY DEVICE
command. If the device is an ATAPI device, the device aborts the IDENTIFY
DEVICE command and returns a specific signature in the ATA register set.
The SATL can then obtain the correct identification information about the
ATA specific configuration of the ATAPI device by issuing an IDENTIFY
PACKET DEVICE command.

Rewrite as:

To detect whether an attached device is an ATA device or an ATAPI device, the SATL may issue an IDENTIFY DEVICE command. If the device is an ATAPI device, the device aborts the IDENTIFY DEVICE command and returns a specific signature in the ATA register set.

comment number 461

Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
CDB

add .

comment number 462

Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
INQUIRY
s/b
INQUIRY

comment number 463

Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
error
s/b
CHECK CONDITION status

comment number 464

Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Command Management
s/b
lowercase

comment number 465

Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Implementations
s/b
lowercase

comment number 466

Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Logical Unit Numbers
s/b
lowercase

comment number 467
Page=166 Subtype=StrikeOut Subj=Cross-Out Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
Delete

elsewhere

comment number 468
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
ATAPI protocol
s/b
PACKET Command Protocol

comment number 469
Page=166 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
This is incorrect.

A SATL shall intercept INQUIRY commands requesting the ATA Information VPD page 89h and return the data for that page directly. If it does so, it must also intercept the Supported VPD pages VPD page 00h and add page 83h to the list.

comment number 470
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Subj=Highlight Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
command
s/b
command as required by SPC-4.

(provide a little more info)

comment number 471
Page=166 Subtype=Text Subj=Note Author=HPQ-RElliott
Comment=
I suggest deleting A.6. How is a SATL supposed to know that it needs to do this? Only a SATL that only supports a specific ATAPI device could do so; generic SATLs might make things worse by trying to implement REPORT LUNS if the ATAPI device does indeed implement it.

Comments attached to Abs ballot from Kevin Butt of IBM Corp.:

Not materially effected

Comments attached to No ballot from John Lohmeyer of LSI Corp.:

LSI comment number 1

Page=1 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=Should all SBC-2 be SBC-3 instead?

LSI comment number 2

Page=3 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This should be << SCSI Block Commands-3 (SBC-3) and SCSI Primary Commands-4 (SPC-4) standards >>

LSI comment number 3

Page=14 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The revision history needs to be removed in the final version.

LSI comment number 4

Page=16 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Mark Evans, Vice-Chair

LSI comment number 5

Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SCSI Primary Commands-4 a

LSI comment number 6

Page=18 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SCSI Block Commands-3

LSI comment number 7

Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SPC-4, and SBC-3 standards

LSI comment number 8

Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
It looks like there is no space between the I and the /. This needs to be fixed.

LSI comment number 9

Page=19 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=Marked set by bbesmer

LSI comment number 10

Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Replace all references to SPC-3 with SPC-4 within this standard.

LSI comment number 11

Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Replace all references to SBC-2 with SBC-3 within this standard.

LSI comment number 12

Page=22 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=Replace all references to SAS-1.1 with SAS-2 within this standard.

LSI comment number 13

Page=22 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=SAS-2 needs to be added to this list.

LSI comment number 14

Page=23 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer

Comment=Do we have any references to the USB-BOT standard?

LSI comment number 15

Page=24 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

All of this << calculated as two times the value returned in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data words 118:117 (see ATA8-ACS) if the ATA device returns a value of one in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 106 bit 12 (i.e., the ATA device supports the Long Logical Sector feature set). The size of an ATA Logical Sector is 512 bytes if the ATA device returns a value of zero in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 106 bit 12 (i.e., the ATA device does not support the Long Logical Sector feature set). >>should be describe in the main body of the text not part of the definition.

LSI comment number 16

Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This note << NOTE 1 - The Logical Sector >> should be describe in the main body of the text not part of the definition.

LSI comment number 17

Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This << represented in words; therefore, the number >> should be << represented in words, therefore, the number >>. The semicolon is changed to a comma.

LSI comment number 18

Page=25 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

All of this << returned in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data words (103:100) minus one if the ATA device returns a value of one in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 86 bit 10 (i.e., the ATA device supports the 48-bit address feature set), or the total number of user addressable sectors returned in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data words (61:60) minus one if the ATA device returns a value of zero in ATA IDENTIFY DEVICE data word 86 bit 10 (i.e., the ATA device does not support the 48-bit address feature set) (see ATA8-ACS), >>should be describe in the main body of the text not part of the definition.

LSI comment number 19

Page=28 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

It appears that the READ (32), WRITE (32), VERIFY (32), WRITE AND VERIFY (32) are not here. Is that intentional or should they be added.

LSI comment number 20

Page=29 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

The abbreviations list needs to be scrubbed as the list of standards is not consistent with the normative references.

LSI comment number 21

Page=29 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer

Comment=

no definition for "dword"

From SAS-2:

dword: A sequence of four contiguous bytes or four contiguous characters considered as a unit. The meaning depends on the context (e.g., when discussing the bits being transmitted over a physical link, dword represents four characters (i.e., 40 bits). When discussing the contents of a frame before 8b10b encoding (see 3.1.2) or after 10b8b decoding (see 3.1.3), dword represents four bytes (i.e., 32 bits)).

LSI comment number 22

Page=29 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer

Comment=is TCQ obsolete?

LSI comment number 23

Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

<< expected >> is not defined a SCSI keyword and should not be in this list.

LSI comment number 24

Page=30 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This section should be removed and the two entries should be moved to the definitions section.

LSI comment number 25

Page=31 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer

Comment=

This text (from sas-2) should be added to this specification:

In the event of conflicting information the precedence for requirements defined in this standard is:

- 1) text;
- 2) tables; and
- 3) figures.

Notes do not constitute any requirements for implementers.

LSI comment number 26

Page=35 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer

Comment=

oterwise

s/b
otherwise

LSI comment number 27
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << I_T nexuses are partially specified in this >>

LSI comment number 28
Page=37 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
With the previous change this << (e.g., interactions of START STOP UNIT, REQUEST SENSE). >> may have to be modified.

LSI comment number 29
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This is not a ")" on this e.g. << (e.g., using cold presence detect, >>

LSI comment number 30
Page=38 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note should be changed to normative text.

LSI comment number 31
Page=38 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=
ASCQ "DRIVE NOT PRESENT" does not exist, perhaps "MEDIUM NOT PRESENT".

LSI comment number 32
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This font is wrong

LSI comment number 33
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
You have to put the name of these annexs or you have to delete the references.

LSI comment number 34
Page=39 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
Table 5 - text in this table is too close to the column lines. This needs to be fixed.

LSI comment number 35
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << 117-118 >> is the not correct as it is not the 117 minus 118. It should be changed to 117..118 or 117 through 118.

LSI comment number 36
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << It is important to note that >> should be << Further relationships between SCSI and ATA follow: >>

LSI comment number 37
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << words. >> should be << words; >>

LSI comment number 38
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << valid. >> should be << valid; and >

LSI comment number 39
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This should not be a << x >> as it can be easily confused with the multiplication symbol. Either change to an different variable or just replace the << x >> with << logical sectors per physical sector >> and remove the where statement.

LSI comment number 40
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Needs to have a space between << ALIGNMENT >> and << field >>.

LSI comment number 41
Page=40 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << (part 1) >> should be << (part 1 of 3)

LSI comment number 42
Page=41 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << (part 2) >> should be << (part 2 of 3)

LSI comment number 43
Page=42 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << (part 3) >> should be << (part 3 of 3)

LSI comment number 44
Page=43 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << SATA native command queueing (NCQ) or the ATA Tagged Command Queuing (TCQ) feature set. >> should be << SATA NCQ or the ATA TCQ feature set. >> as the acronyms have already been defined.

LSI comment number 45
Page=44 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << Some differences >> should be << Examples of the differences >> or delete << some >>.

LSI comment number 46
Page=45 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=
This statement is over-reaching "shall use the maximum queue depth".

LSI comment number 47
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << 16 priorities (0-15), >> should be << 16 priorities (i.e., 0..15), >>

LSI comment number 48
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=1..3

LSI comment number 49
Page=46 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=4..15

LSI comment number 50
Page=47 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
Which of the 300 subclauses in this standard is being referenced here?

LSI comment number 51
Page=47 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=Is it always possible to send this?

LSI comment number 52
Page=48 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << terminate >> as the command ends with at CC.

LSI comment number 53
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << Obsolete >> should be deleted.

LSI comment number 54
Page=49 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << obsolete TARGET RESET task management function >> should be << TARGET RESET task management function (see SAM-2)>>

LSI comment number 55
Page=50 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=How is this different from section 5.5?

LSI comment number 56
Page=51 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=
Missing:
- SECURITY PROTOCOL IN
- SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT

LSI comment number 57
Page=51 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=
Missing from Start/Stop Unit:

IDLE IMMEDIATE
STANDBY IMMEDIATE
READ VERIFY SECTOR(S) EXT

LSI comment number 58
Page=62 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=

What happens if the SMART feature set is enabled and MRIE or DExcpt are some other value?

LSI comment number 59

Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << IDLE), then the SATL >>

LSI comment number 60

Page=63 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << STANDBY), then the S >>

LSI comment number 61

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should be not be small caps here

LSI comment number 62

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 63

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 64

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 65

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 66

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 67

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=(ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 68

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << specified ALLOCATION LENGTH number of bytes >> should be << number of bytes specified in the ALLOCATION LENGTH field. >>

LSI comment number 69

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to one: >>

LSI comment number 70

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to zero: >>

LSI comment number 71

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 72

Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

Should be << translation of the SECURITY PROTOCOL field is unspecified >>

LSI comment number 73

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 74

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 75

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 76

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 77

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=ALLOCATION LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 78

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 79

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=TRANSFER LENGTH should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 80

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=SECURITY PROTOCOL should not be small caps here.

LSI comment number 81

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to one: >>

LSI comment number 82

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=Should be << If the INC_512 bit is set to zero: >>

LSI comment number 83

Page=65 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

Should be << translation of the SECURITY PROTOCOL field is unspecified >>

LSI comment number 84

Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This << performing >> should be << processing >>

LSI comment number 85
Page=70 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << 1 through 6 exist >> should be << 1 through 6 are valid >>

LSI comment number 86
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << set to 512; >> should be << set to 512; >> i.e. semicolon replaced with comma.

LSI comment number 87
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << other than 512; >> should be << other than 512; >> i.e. semicolon replaced with comma.

LSI comment number 88
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << when the SATL receives >>

LSI comment number 89
Page=72 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << when the SATL receives >>

LSI comment number 90
Page=73 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This << BUFFER OFFSET and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field >> should be << BUFFER OFFSET field and PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field >>
Also, both field names should be in small caps.

LSI comment number 91
Page=74 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS field and >>

LSI comment number 92
Page=75 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Get rid of this blank page.

LSI comment number 93
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << one), then the >>

LSI comment number 94
Page=77 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Should be << format (110b), then the defect >>

LSI comment number 95
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note << NOTE 10 - The SATL should >> should be made normative.

LSI comment number 96
Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=

Change to << READ(6) command, READ(10) command, READ(12) command, and READ(16) command.

LSI comment number 97

Page=79 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This should be << the READ (10) command, READ (12) command, or READ (16) command

LSI comment number 98

Page=81 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 99

Page=82 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 100

Page=83 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 101

Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=Change this to << Otherwise, this >>

LSI comment number 102

Page=90 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

In table 45 the 1st column should be subdivided into code and name columns. The code column would contain the number (e.g., 01h) and the name column would contain the name (e.g., active). Also the names are not in small caps but should be just caps.

LSI comment number 103

Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << ERROR; and >>

LSI comment number 104

Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This needs a hypertext link to the referenced step.

LSI comment number 105

Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << zero; or >>

LSI comment number 106

Page=90 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

Table 45 title should have << (part 1 of x) at the end of the title.

LSI comment number 107

Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This needs a hypertext link to the referenced step.

LSI comment number 108

Page=91 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This needs a hypertext link to the referenced step.

LSI comment number 109
Page=92 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Remove one of the extra periods at the end of this sentence.

LSI comment number 110
Page=93 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Besmer
Comment=Extra space prior to Unspecified

LSI comment number 111
Page=97 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This should be << of WRITE(6) command, WRITE(10) command, WRITE(12)
command, and WRITE(16) command.

LSI comment number 112
Page=97 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This should be << WRITE (10) command, WRITE (12) command, and WRITE (16)
command >>

LSI comment number 113
Page=97 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << a) the following ATA commands: >>

LSI comment number 114
Page=99 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 115
Page=100 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This note should not be numbered. Change to << Note - Some... >>

LSI comment number 116
Page=101 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
This should be << WRITE AND VERIFY (10) command, WRITE AND VERIFY (12)
command, and WRITE AND VERIFY (16) command. >>

LSI comment number 117
Page=107 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=There is a missing space between << client >> and << and >>.

LSI comment number 118
Page=110 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << set to 00b (i.e., shared) for >>

LSI comment number 119
Page=111 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This << than 00h, then the>>

LSI comment number 120
Page=111 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << block descriptors as follows: >>

LSI comment number 121

Page=111 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << descriptor is eight bytes long; or >>

LSI comment number 122

Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << command, then the SATL shall >>

LSI comment number 123

Page=114 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

I do not know what the information that should be cached the cache this information

LSI comment number 124

Page=117 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << exceeded condition, then the SATL shall >>

LSI comment number 125

Page=117 Subtype=StrikeOut Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This has to be deleted or rewritten. I say delete as it has nothing to do with the mode page.

LSI comment number 126

Page=119 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << PARAMETER LIST; and >>

LSI comment number 127

Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be <<log pages, >>

LSI comment number 128

Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=This should be << then the SATL >>

LSI comment number 129

Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This should be << address (e.g., parameter code 0000h is stored at offset 0 of the first 512-byte block of data at log address 90h and parameter code 0001h is stored at offset 256 in the first 512-byte block of data at log address 90h). >>

LSI comment number 130

Page=121 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This should be << a SMART WRITE LOG command, WRITE LOG EXT command, or WRITE LOG DMA EXT command >>

LSI comment number 131

Page=122 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie

Comment=

This should be << SMART READ LOG command, READ LOG EXT command, or READ LOG DMA EXT command >>

LSI comment number 132

Page=124 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=

This is missing a space between the <<returned. >> and the << If >>.

LSI comment number 133

Page=134 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << SATA bridge) that contain: >>

LSI comment number 134

Page=135 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=

The sentence leading into the a,b,c list has no lead into the a.b.c list and I can't figure out how to change it to make it read correctly. This needs to be fixed.

LSI comment number 135

Page=139 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << This clause defines additional >>

LSI comment number 136

Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << device processes the command >>

LSI comment number 137

Page=141 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=

This should be << If the PROTOCOL field contains 15 (i.e., Return Response Information) and return the contents in the ATA Status Return Descriptor as defined in 12.2.6, then the SATL shall:

- a) if the transport is SATA, read the current Shadow Command Block registers; or
- b) if the transport is PATA, read the current Command Block registers. >>

LSI comment number 138

Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=

This should be << See 12.2.4 for a description of the mapping from >>

LSI comment number 139

Page=143 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << See 12.2.4 for a description of the mapping >>

LSI comment number 140

Page=149 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The 1,2,3 list needs to be indented.

LSI comment number 141

Page=149 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=The 1,2 list needs to be indented.

LSI comment number 142

Page=156 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << defined in this standard >>..

LSI comment number 143
Page=158 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << mode setting, then the SATL shall

LSI comment number 144
Page=159 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This needs to be replaced with conflict or allowed.

LSI comment number 145
Page=159 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Table 122 footnotes need to be a and b not 1 and 2.

LSI comment number 146
Page=161 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=Table 122 footnotes need to be a and b not 1 and 2.

LSI comment number 147
Page=162 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << defined in this standard >>..

LSI comment number 148
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << the INQUIRY command >>

LSI comment number 149
Page=165 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should not be bolded.

LSI comment number 150
Page=165 Subtype=Text Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=
The first word in each item in this 1,2,3 list should not be capitalized.

LSI comment number 151
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << REQUEST SENSE >>

LSI comment number 152
Page=166 Subtype=Highlight Author=LSI-Penokie
Comment=This should be << translation specified in this standard >>

Comments attached to Abs ballot from Gregory Tabor of
Maxim Integrated Products:

Maxim has no expertise in this topic and defers to those with informed
opinions.

Comments attached to No ballot from Mark Overby of
Nvidia Corp.:

Comments provided to editor and to chair in separate form.

Comments attached to No ballot from Gerald Houlder of
Seagate Technology:

Seagate comment number 1
Page=19 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
SPC-3, and SBC-2
s/b
SPC-4 and SBC-3

Seagate comment number 2
Page=39 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
ATA hardware reset

This does not account for SATA Software Settings Preservations.
Should there be additional text to talk about SSP ?

Seagate comment number 3
Page=64 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
A2h
s/b
B5h

Seagate comment number 4
Page=73 Subtype=Text Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
(formatting)
What is this blacked-out cell ?

Seagate comment number 5
Page=84 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
SBC-2
s/b
SBC-3

Seagate comment number 6
Page=85 Subtype=Highlight Author=STX-Hatfield
Comment=
RTO_EN

this was obsoleted by SBC-3

Please remove this row.

Comments attached to Abs ballot from Michael Fogg of TycoElectronics:

Tyco Electronics is only involved in the physical layer implementation. Protocol and software issues are beyond the scope of our involvement.

***** End of Ballot Report *****