

T10/07-407r0: Minutes
SCSI Media Changer (SMC) Working Group
for Sept 17, 2007, 3:30 PM - 7:00 PM PDT

1. Introductions **Group**

Michael Banther called the meeting to order at 3:40 PM PDT. He thanked PMC-Sierra for hosting the meeting. Kevin Butt is serving as the secretary of this meeting.

2. Approval of the Agenda **Michael Banther**

Michael Banther presented the agenda. Paul Suhler made a motion to accept the agenda. Kevin Butt seconded the motion. The group passed the motion unanimously.

3. Attendance and Membership **Michael Banther**

Michael Banther reviewed the T10 attendance rules with the group and directed prospective new members to John Lohmeyer. The attendance report appears below.

SMC-3 Working Group Attendance Report - September 2007

Name	S	Organization
Mr. Curtis Ballard	V	Hewlett Packard Co.
Mr. Michael Banther	A	Hewlett Packard Co.
Mr. Kevin Butt	A	IBM Corp.
Mr. Robert Payne	P	Iomega Corp.
Mr. Geoffrey Barton	V	Overland Storage
Dr. Paul Suhler	A	Quantum Corp.
Mr. Erich Oetting	P	Sun Microsystems, Inc.
Mr. Roger Cummings	P	Symantec
Mr. Georg Boasson	V	Tandberg Storage

9 People Present

Status Key: P - Principal
A,A# - Alternate
AV - Advisory Member
E - Emeritus
L - Liaison
V - Visitor

4. INCITS Patent Policy **Michael Banther**

Michael pointed to the T10 website (<http://www.t10.org/patpol.htm>).

5. Approval of Previous Minutes **Group**

Michael Banther asked for any problems with the minutes of the July meeting (07-324r0) meeting. Kevin Butt made a motion to approve the minutes. Michael Banther seconded. Voting was unanimous.

6. Review of Action Items

Kevin Butt

Kevin Butt reviewed the outstanding action items, and the status of each item was reported as listed below:

- 06-020 [Robert Payne] Define a philosophy for Write Exclusive Persistent Reservations in SMC.
Carry-Over
- 06-044 [Roger Cummings] Solicit additional vendor-specific sense codes from library vendors per June discussion item 4.4.
Carry-Over
- 06-063 [Noud Snelder] Investigate use of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, INITIALIZING COMMAND REQUIRED error code.
Carry-Over
- 07-003 [Curtis Ballard] Create a proposal to define the usage of the “Cleaning Requested” and “Cleaning Failure” error codes.
Carry-Over
- 07-004 [Kevin Butt] Create a proposal for the “Medium Magazine” error codes.
07-372r0
- 07-006 [Rod Wideman] Define a new ASC/ASCQ for “Logical Unit Not Ready – Robotics Disabled”.
Carry-Over
- 07-017 [Group] Make sure the all the functionality of Read Element Status is covered by the Report Element Information command (06-272) and the Report Volume Information command and examine if an informative annex to map the RES command onto these is appropriate.
[Reminder to do as final step]
Carry-Over
- 07-027 [Rod Wideman] Revise and post SMC-3 New Additional Sense Codes Usage (07-018r0) as 07-018r1.
Carry-Over
- 07-041 [Noud Snelder] Incorporate SMC-3: Diagnostics Data log page (06-395r5) into SMC-3
SMC-3r9
- 07-042 [Paul Entzel] Write a proposal for the commands which the cached ready state in ADC may be used.
Carry-Over
- 07-043 [Noud Snelder] Revise SMC-3, POSITION TO ELEMENT command clarification (07-199r0) and post as 07-199r1.
Complete
- 07-044 [Noud Snelder] Incorporate SMC-3, POSITION TO ELEMENT command clarification (07-199r1) into SMC-3.

SMC-3r9

07-045 [Noud Snelder] Revise SMC-3 Additional sense code for incompatible destination element (07-222r0) and post as 07-222r1

Complete

07-046 [Noud Snelder] Revise SMC-3, READ ATTRIBUTE and WRITE ATTRIBUTE command clarification (07-244r0) and post as 07-244r1

Complete

07-047 [Curtis Ballard] Revise SMC-3, Report Element Information (06-272r5) and post as 06-272r6

Complete

7. Old Business Group

7.1 Working List for ISV feedback (SMC/SSC/ADC/SPC) (07-131r0) [Butt]

Deferred

7.2 SMC-3 Error codes overview (06-397r2) [Snelder]

7.3 SMC-3, Report Element Information (06-272r6) [Ballard]

Curtis mentioned that we have discussed this many times. However, section 6.x.5 has probably received the least review so he started at 6.x.5.

Element Static Information

Kevin asked why the Element Static page was not a new Inquiry vital product page. Curtis pointed out that this covers many elements - perhaps thousands and that does not seem to fit the Inquiry command. Inquiry pages seem to be for top level requirements not for elements. People are used to using Read Element Status so this is similar to that.

The exp and cod bits show what upgrades are available for upgrade, either by buying and installing a new module or enabled by a license.

The cnxp bit specifies that the volume cannot be exported. It really talks to virtual devices. Kevin asked if this mechanism is really needed or is this just standards lets try to cover everything possible? We don't want to create complexity for something that won't be used.

Curtis said he has heard of people talking about mixed devices (i.e., real and virtual).

Erich asked if there was need for a model clause to be added related to reconfiguring the personality of an element.

Element State

volume index to be used because barcode does not fit into the CDB.

Time was called on this discussion.

7.4 SMC-3 TapeAlert Enhancements (06-420r1) [Banther]

AI: Michael Banther - Send Kevin the statement from the HP Trademark lawyers about HP

willing to not enforce the TradeMark it holds on "TAPEALERT"

Michael discussed Table x+1 and how SMC-3 and SSC-3 are inconsistent in the severity explanations of tapealert and asked for direction on how to make them consistent. He compared this to the tables in 06-138r5.

Michael asked Kevin to bring a companion to 06-138 into SMC-3 once it has been accepted in SSC-3.

The question was asked if we should define activation conditions for specific flags. Roger Cummings stated that they have made recommendations that have not been included (e.g., 05-339r0). Roger said it would be very useful to do so. Michael thinks activated when this event occurs. Roger would prefer this event and only this event. Michael doesn't want exclusive. Roger views SMC TapeAlerts are less useful than SSC TapeAlerts. Roger wants to check with his company to see if SMC TapeAlerts are useful enough to keep.

Several individuals were given action items to investigate if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.

AI: Michael Banther - Revise SMC-3 TapeAlert Enhancements (06-420r1) and post as 06-420r2

All should think about what deactivation conditions should be specified and what activation conditions should be specified.

7.5 SMC-3 New Additional Sense Codes Usage (07-018r0) [Wideman]
Deferred.

7.6 SMC-3 Additional sense code for incompatible destination element (07-222r1) [Snelder]
Michael Banther presented and tried to cover the changes.
Some changes were made. Michael will send comments to Noud for review.

AI: Noud Snelder Revise SMC-3 Additional sense code for incompatible destination element (07-222r1) and post.

7.7 SMC-3, READ ATTRIBUTE and WRITE ATTRIBUTE command clarification (07-244r1) [Snelder]

8. New Business

8.1 SMC-3: Medium Magazine Error Codes (07-372r0) [Butt]
Kevin was told that the proposal needs to contain more text about when to use. Additional feedback was taken.

AI: Kevin Butt Revise SMC-3: Medium Magazine Error Codes (07-372r0) and post.

8.2 Discussion of facilitator position [Banther]
Michael announced that he will no longer be doing T10 duties as of January.
Michael took a straw poll:
Curtis act as Facilitator [9:0:0]

8.3 Maintenance review of SMC [Banther]

Micheal told John Lohmeyer that we should reaffirm SMC. He asked if there were any objections. There were none.

9. Next Meeting Requirements Michael Banther

Request same meeting time for Nov meeting Cycle.

10. Review New and Outstanding Action Items Kevin Butt

Kevin Butt reviewed the following items with the meeting:

- 06-020 [Robert Payne] Define a philosophy for Write Exclusive Persistent Reservations in SMC.
- 06-044 [Roger Cummings] Solicit additional vendor-specific sense codes from library vendors per June discussion item 4.4.
- 06-063 [Noud Snelder] Investigate use of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, INITIALIZING COMMAND REQUIRED error code.
- 07-003 [Curtis Ballard] Create a proposal to define the usage of the “Cleaning Requested” and “Cleaning Failure” error codes.
- 07-006 [Rod Wideman] Define a new ASC/ASCQ for “Logical Unit Not Ready – Robotics Disabled”.
- 07-017 [Group] Make sure the all the functionality of Read Element Status is covered by the Report Element Information command (06-272) and the Report Volume Information command and examine if an informative annex to map the RES command onto these is appropriate. [Reminder to do as final step]
- 07-027 [Rod Wideman] Revise and post SMC-3 New Additional Sense Codes Usage (07-018r0) as 07-018r1.
- 07-042 [Paul Entzel] Write a proposal for the commands which the cached ready state in ADC may be used.
==== NEW ACTION ITEMS ====
- 07-048 [Michael Banther] Send Kevin the statement from the HP Trademark lawyers about HP willing to not enforce the TradeMark it holds on “TAPEALERT”.
- 07-049 [Roger Cummings] Invistigate Symantec position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.
- 07-050 [Kevin Butt] Invistigate IBM position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.
- 07-051 [Curtis Ballard] Invistigate HP position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.
- 07-052 [Rod Wideman] Invistigate ISV’s position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.

- 07-053 [Kevin Butt - Secretary] Investigate ISV's position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.
- 07-054 [Geoff Barton] Investigate ISV's position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.
- 07-055 [Erich Oetting] Investigate ISV's position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.
- 07-056 [Georg Boasson] Investigate ISV's position of if we should improve SMC TapeAlerts or obsolete them.
- 07-057 [Michael Banther] Revise SMC-3 TapeAlert Enhancements (06-420r1) and post as 06-420r2.
- 07-058 [Kevin Butt] Revise SMC-3: Medium Magazine Error Codes (07-372r0) and post.
- 07-059 [Noud Snelder] Noud Snelder Revise SMC-3 Additional sense code for incompatible destination element (07-222r1) and post.

11. Adjournment

Group

Kevin Butt made a motion for adjournment. Paul Suhler seconded the motion. The group passed the motion unanimously. Michael Banther adjourned the group at 7:02 PM PDT.