#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 1	1		E	NCITS [s/b] INCITS [Global]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 2	3	Abstract, p1, s2	E	This standards permits the SCSI automation/drive interface device type to attach to application clients and provides the definitions for their use. [s/b] This standards permits the SCSI automation/drive interface device type communicate with application clients and defines the commands and data exchanged in such communications.	Accpeted	7a	added "to" between "device type" and "communicate"
ENDL 3	3	Abstract, p2, s1	E	any service delivery subsystem [s/b] the service delivery subsystem	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 4	3	Abstract, p2, s2	T	RE: For reference to delivery subsystems and transports, refer to the Automation/Drive Interface - Transport Protocol standard. [I was under the impression that ADC-2 commands could be carried by any SCSI Transport. Maybe this statement should be removed.]			
HPQ-1	3	Abstract	T	Add something like: This standard maintains a high degree of compatibility with the Automation/Drive Interface Commands (ADC) command set, INCITS xxx-xxxx, and while providing additional functions, is not intended to require changes to presently installed devices or existing software. (if that is true)			ER: accept
HPQ-2	4	ANSI page	E	2003 s/b 2006	Accepted	7a	QTM-1
QTM-1	4	Copyright date.	E	Should be 2006?	Accepted	7a	HPQ-2
Dell-1	5	1 Revision History	E	Remove Revision History prior to forwarding	Accepted	7a	ENDL-5, IBM-1, QTM-2
ENDL 5	5		E	Revision History should be removed from dpANS	Accepted	7a	Dell-1, IBM-1, QTM-2
IBM 1	5		E	The revision information needs to be removed before letter ballot	Accepted	7a	Dell-1, ENDL-5, QTM-2
QTM-2	5	Revision clause	E	This section needs to be removed for letter ballot	Accepted	7a	Dell-1, ENDL-5, IBM-1
QTM-3	8	TOC	E	The revision clause needs to be removed for letter ballot.	Accepted	7a	QTM-2
HPQ-3	10	Table of Tables	E	Fix FrameMaker character tag usage so the field name small caps usage is retained in the table of tables	Accepted	7a	IBM-2, QTM-4
IBM 2	10	Tables	E	(KB) Field names in Titles that are small caps in the text do not show small caps in the Table Title name. Tables (11, 12, 17, 18, 36, 40, 41, 44, 46, 49, 50, 54)	Accepted	7a	HPQ-3, QTM-4
QTM-4	10	TOC	E	Field names in this table are rendered in lower case, not in small caps as they are in the actual table captions.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-3, IBM-2
ENDL 6	13	Foreword, p2, s1	E	the INQUIRY command response data [s/b] the standard INQUIRY data [this is the term used in SPC-3]	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 7	13	Foreword, p2, s2	E	SCSI Architecture Model - 2 standard [s/b] SCSI Architecture Model - 3 standard [unless ADC-2 prohibits autosense, in which case we have bigger issues]	Overtaken by events		see HPQ-5
HPQ-4	13	Foreward	E	While I'm not 100% sure, I believe that IHS have changed the name of their Global Engineering business.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-5	13	Forward	E	Do not state conformance here. Clause 2 provides a single location for such statements.	Accepted	7a	Remove sentence (ENDL-7, IBM-3, QTM-5)
HPQ-6	13	Foreword	E	INCITS.***:200x s/b INCITS xxx-2006	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-7	13	Foreword	E	NCITS.***:200x s/b INCITS xxx-2006	Accepted	7a	
IBM 3	13	Foreword, 2nd paragraph	E	The reference to SAM-2 seems dated should it be referencing SAM-3.	Accepted	7a	ENDL-3, HPQ-5, QTM-5
QTM-5	13	2nd paragraph	E	Does the standard conform to SAM-2 or SAM-3 now?	Accpeted	7a	ENDL-3, HPQ-5, IBM-3
ENDL 8	14	Foreword	E	Sierra Logic has been purchased by Emulex. This membership list will be out of date after the November meeting.			
IBM 4	15	Foreword	E	(KB) Quantum should also list Rod Wideman in member list.			
HPQ-8	16	Clause 3 sentence	E	StrikeOut "and"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-9	16	Introduction	E	abbreviations s/b "abbreviations and conventions"	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 9	17	Foreword	E	Remove this blank page			
ENDL 10	18	Clause 1, p1, s2	E	fully specify [s/b] fully specifies	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 11	18	Clause 1, a,b,c list, entry 2	E	INQUIRY command response data [s/b] standard INQUIRY data [this is the term used in SPC-3]	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-10	18	first paragraph	T	StrikeOut "and SPC-2"			We need SPC-2 for CA and classic reservations.
HPQ-11	18	a) list entry	E	Insert a paragraph after the lettered list and before the paragraph that begins, 'Figure 1 shows ....' The new paragraph follows the format of a similar paragraph in SPC3r23, and it reads: The following commands, parameter data, and features defined in previous versions of this standard are made obsolete by this standard: Linked commands.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-12	18	Table 1	E	FCP-3 shows the top two boxes of Figure 1 side-by-side. We should match that example.			
HPQ-13	18	Page 1	E	INCITS.***:200x s/b INCITS ***-200x	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-14	18	Table 1	E	Change Transport Protocols to SCSI Transport Protocols	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-15	18	Table 1	E	SPC-3 uses the term 'Primary' instead of 'Shared'. We should follow that example.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-16	18	Table 1	E	Both SPC-3 and SSC-3 use only the word 'Interconnects'. We should follow that example.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-17	18	c)	T	add "and the operation of logical units of other specific device types that are present in the same device as the automation/drive interface logical unit."	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-18	18	a)	E	device type should be "PERIPHERAL DEVICE TYPE" in small caps	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 12	19	2.2	E	(SPC-3) [ANSI INCITS 405-2005] [s/b] (SPC-3) [ANSI INCITS 408-2005]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 13	19	2.2	E	ANSI INCITS 403-2005, Automation/Drive Interface, Transport Protocol (ADT) [s/b] ISO/IEC 14776-191, Automation/Drive Interface, Transport Protocol (ADT), ANSI INCITS 406-2005 [N.B. BSR number corrected too]			HPQ-20
HPQ-19	19	2.2 FCP-2	T	Only one cross reference to FCP-2 exists (on PDF page 55). I believe that reference should change to FCP-3, and I've submitted a separate comment to that effect. If the group changes the reference from FCP-2 to FCP-3, then it should also remove FCP-2 from the list of approved references.	Accepted	7b	QTM-6
HPQ-20	19	2.2 "ANSI INCITS 403-2005"	E	Use the ISO/IEC number and format like other references			ENDL-13
QTM-6	19	FCP-2	T	Remove this reference after changing the one occurrence in the standard to use FCP-3 instead.	Accepted	7b	HPQ-19
Dell-2	20	2.3	E	There are no references to SAS-2, and SPC-4 so why are they referenced?	Accepted	7c	HPQ-21, HPQ-22, kept SPC-4, see HPQ-21
ENDL 14	20	2.3	E	T10/1742-D, Automation/Drive Interface, Transport Protocol - 2 (ADT-2) [s/b] ISO/IEC 14776-192, Automation/Drive Interface, Transport Protocol - 2 (ADT-2), T10/1742-D			
ENDL 15	20	2.3	T	Should FCP-4 be added to this list?	Rejecetd		no references
HPQ-21	20	2.3	E	In this revision of ADC-2, no references exist to SPC-4. Consider removing SPC-4 from the list of references under development.	Rejected		Dell-2, references added with SPIN and SPOUT commands (see HOQ-137)

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-22	20	2.3	E	In this revision of ADC-2, no references exist to SAS-2. Consider removing SAS-2 from the list of references under development.	Accepted	7c	Dell-2
HPQ-23	20	2.3 "T10/1742-D"	E	Use the ISO/IEC number and format like other references			ENDL-13, HPQ-20
Dell-3	21	3.1.15	E	change "3.1.15 data transfer device:" to "3.1.15 data transfer (DT) device:"			
Dell-4	21	3.1.1	E	change "3.1.1 accessible state: The state of a device server in which it is capable of responding to a command with any combination of status and sense key other than CHECK CONDITION and NOT READY." to "3.1.1 accessible state: The state of a device server in which it is capable of responding to a command with any combination other than CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to NOT READY."	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 16	21	3.1	E	[insert a new glossary entry] 3.1.2 additional sense data: The combination of values in an ASC field and an ASCQ field to produce an additional sense code (see SPC-3). [to support the nomenclature in 5.2 and elsewhere]			or, change 5.2 to use "additional sense code data"
HPQ-24	21	3.1.13	E	delete "Indicates"			or, perhaps we should update to the SPC-3 and SPC-4 definition of "byte".
HPQ-25	21	3.1.2	E	automation device and a data transfer device. s/b automation device (see 3.1.9) and a DT device (see 3.1.15)	Accepted	7b	HPQ-25, HPQ-28, HPQ-29, HPQ-31, IBM-5, QTM-7, QTM-8
HPQ-26	21	3.1.15	E	data transfer device: s/b data transfer (DT) device:	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-27	21	3.1.16	E	data transfer device primary port: s/b data transfer (DT) device primary port:	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-28	21	3.1.2	E	data transfer device primary port s/b DT device primary port (see 3.1.16)	Accepted	7b	HPQ-25, HPQ-28, HPQ-29, HPQ-31, IBM-5, QTM-7, QTM-8
HPQ-29	21	3.1.2	E	automation device primary port s/b automation device primary port (see 3.1.10)	Accepted	7b	HPQ-25, HPQ-28, HPQ-29, HPQ-31, IBM-5, QTM-7, QTM-8
HPQ-30	21	3.1.x	T	Add definitions for: ADC device server, RMC device server, and SMC device server			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-31	21	3.1.2 (and global)	T	Add "ADI initiator port" and "ADI target port" and use them throughout as appropriate (comments are provided with those suggestions - there are not many changes required)			HPQ-25, HPQ-28, HPQ-29, HPQ-31, IBM-5, QTM-7, QTM-8
HPQ-32	21	3.1.16	E	after device add "(see 3.1.15)"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-33	21	3.1.10	E	after device add "(see 3.1.9)"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-34	21	3.1.7	T	s/b '... creates application client tasks each of which issues a single command or a task management function.' SAM-3, 4.3 describes the relationship between an application client, an application client task, and a command or task management function.	Accepted in principle	7b	used the definition directly from SAM-3 which exactly matches the definition in SAM-4.
HPQ-35	21	3.1.8	T	s/b '... creates application client tasks each of which issues a single command or a task management request to ....' SAM-3, 4.3 describes the relationship between an application client, an application client task, and a command or task management function.	Accepted in principle	7b	Replaced the phrase in question with the definition of application client above.
HPQ-36	21	3.1.11	E	s/b task management requests	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-37	21	3.1.12	T	'...entity that performs invocations of commands or requests on..." s/b '... application client that creates application client tasks for issuing commands and task management requests to ....'			HPQ-34, HPQ-35, and IBM-9
HPQ-38	21	3.1.3	E	Delete the unused "ADT initiator port: A SCSI initiator port that implements ADT."	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-39	21	3.1.5	E	Delete the unused "ADT target port: A SCSI target port that implements ADT."	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-40	21	3.1.6	E	Delete the unused "ADT target/initiator port: A port that has all the characteristics of an ADT target port and an ADT initiator port."	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-41	21	3.1.4	T	Change "An ADT initiator port, ADT target port, or ADT target/initiator port." which relied on otherwise unused terms to: "An ADI port that implements ADT."	Accepted	7b	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
IBM 5	21	3.1.2	E	(KB) Comment - ADI Port: It is not clear from the first sentence structure that the clause begining with 'used to connect...' is not part of the 'not an automation device primary port' Solution - ADI port: A port used to connect an automation device and a data transfer device that is not a data transfer device primary port and is not an automation device primary port.	Accepted	7b	HPQ-25, HPQ-28, HPQ-29, HPQ-31, IBM-5, QTM-7, QTM-8
IBM 6	21	3.1.9	T	(KB) - Comment - the (e.g., an ADT port) implies it must be ADT. Solution - Change (e.g., an ADT port) to (e.g., an ADI port)	Accepted	7b	Also 3.1.16
IBM 7	21	3.1.9	T	There is no definition of what a DT device is. A definition needs to be added.	Accepted	7a	see HPQ-26
IBM 8	21	3.1.11	T	There is no definition of what a DT device is. A definition needs to be added.	Accepted	7a	see HPQ-26
IBM 9	21	3.1.12	T	This looks like a DT device is it? If so then define the DT device and then change this name to DT device for consistency.	Rejected		see HPQ-26
QTM-7	21	3.1.2	E	Should "supports a transport" be "transport layer" or "transport protocol"?	Accepted	7b	HPQ-25, HPQ-28, HPQ-29, HPQ-31, IBM-5, QTM-7, QTM-8
QTM-8	21	3.1.2	E	A port that is not a data transfer device primary port and not an automation device primary port used to connect an automation device and a data transfer device. Reword for less ambiguity: A port used to connect an automation device and a data transfer device, that is not a data transfer device primary port and not an automation device primary port.	Accepted	7b	HPQ-25, HPQ-28, HPQ-29, HPQ-31, IBM-5, QTM-7, QTM-8
Dell-5	22	3.1.21	T	remove "This relationship extends the prior I_T nexus or I_T_L nexus." from definition, provides no value.	Accepted	7a	Removed th entire definition since "I_T_L_Q nexus" is not used in ADC-2
Dell-6	22	3.1.24	E	change "3.1.24 logical unit number: An identifier for a logical unit." to "3.1.24 logical unit number (LUN): An identifier for a logical unit."	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-7	22	3.1.29	T	change "3.1.29 not accessible state: The state of a device server in which it is capable of responding to a command with a status of CHECK CONDITION and sense key of NOT READY." to "3.1.29 not accessible state: The state of a device server in which it is only capable of responding to a command with a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to NOT READY."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-8	22	3.1.31	E	change "3.1.31 ready state: A state where a logical unit is able to accept an appropriate medium-access command without returning CHECK CONDITION status." to "3.1.31 ready state: A state where a logical unit is able to process an appropriate medium-access command without returning CHECK CONDITION status."	Accepted	7a	HPQ-46, IBM-10. Modified to match style of Dell-7
HPQ-42	22	3.1.34	T	Update to SAM-3 definition.	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-43	22	3.1.37	T	Update to SAM-4 definition.	Rejected		see IBM-11
HPQ-44	22	3.1.36	T	Update to SAM-3 definition.	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-45	22	3.1.35	T	Update to SAM-4 definition.	Rejected		see IBM-11
HPQ-46	22	3.1.31	T	'...CHECK CONDITION STATUS.' s/b '...status and sense key of CHECK CONDITION and NOT READY.'	Accepted	7a	Dell-8, IBM-10. Modified to match style of Dell-7
IBM 10	22	3.1.31 (actual comment was 3.1.16)	E	What is an << appropriate medium-access command >>? as apposed to an in-appropriate medium-access command. I would delete the term << appropriate >>.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-46, Dell-8
IBM 11	22	3.1.37	E	(KB) - Comment - SCSI target port references SAM-4 instead of SAM-3 Solution - Change reference to SAM-3	Accepted	7b	HPQ-43, HPQ-45, also 3.1.35. Also remove SAM-4 reference and acronym since there are no remaining references.
QTM-9	22	3.1.33	E	MMC-4 is not listed in the references (2.2). Suggest: Add to references.			What is the ISO number for MMC-4?
Dell-10	23	3.2 2nd Sentence	E	Add ADC-2 and ADT-2	Accepted	7a	HPQ-48
Dell-9	23	3.1.42	E	change "3.1.42 vendor-specific:" to "3.1.42 vendor-specific (VS):"	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 17	23	3.2	E	MAM Medium Auxiliary Memory [s/b] MAM Medium Auxiliary Memory (see SPC-3)	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-47	23	3.1.41	T	SAM-3 has made contingent allegiance obsolete. Either remove it here or change the reference to SAM-2.	Accepted	7c	ER: change to SAM-2 - WG: use SAM-2 for CA and SAM-3 for the other 2 concepts.
HPQ-48	23	3.2	E	Add latest standard TLA's: ADC-2, ADT-2, SAM-4, and SPC-4.	Accepted	7a	Dell-10
HPQ-49	23	3.2	E	Add 'VHF Very High Frequency (e.g., VHF data)'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-50	23	3.2	E	'Removable Medium Commands' s/b 'removable medium commands (see 3.1.33)'	Accepted	7a	HPQ-51
HPQ-51	23	3.2	E	In the acronyms, only use capital letters when appropriate. For example, Data transfer s/b data transfer Most significant bit s/b most significant bit etc.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-50
HPQ-52	23	3.1.x	T	Add: storage element (used several times in 4.2.1)			
HPQ-53	23	3.2	E	After "value" in SM_TOV add "(see 4.2.5)"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-10	23	3.2	E	If MMC-4 is added as a reference, add MMC-4 to abbreviations list.			QTM-9
QTM-11	23	3.2	E	Remove FCP-2 abbreviation after changing the one occurrence in the standard to use FCP-3 instead.	Accepted	7b	Added FCP-3
Dell-11	24	3.3.7	E	change "...implemented, it shall..." to "...implemented, then it shall..."	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-54	24	3.3.10	E	". s/b ."	Accepted	7a	
IBM 12	24	3.3.1 expected:	T	This is not a keyword as it is not in the T10 style guides list of authorized keywords. If it needs to be defined for this standard then it should be added to the list of definitions.	Accepted	7a	Not used anywhere in ADC-2
IBM 13	24	3.3.9 shall:	E	(KB) - should 'interpretability' really be 'interoperability'?	Accepted	7a	
QTM-12	24	3.4	E	Might be nice to use an example from this standard instead of "state of spare"			
Dell-12	25	3.4 2nd Paragraph after Table 1, 1st sentence	E	change "...figures, the order..." to "...figures, then the order..."	Rejected		The sentence in question matches eactly the same sentence in the T0 style guide.
QTM-13	25	4th paragraph	E	I think the "e.g." s/b an "i.e."			currently matches SPC-3

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-13	26	4.2.1 2nd Paragraph, d) in a,b,c list.	T	d) An ADI port (see 3.1.2), through which the automation application client transmits SCSI requests to and receives SCSI responses from the ADC device server in the DT device. Figure 2 implies that the ADI Port is optional, but this shows it as required? Additionally make first word in a),b) and c) lower case.	Accepted	7b	Changed "An ADI port (see 3.1.2)," with "one or more ports". See HPQ-59, QTM-18
Dell-14	26	4.2.1 3nd Paragraph, c) in a,b,c list.	T	change "c) An optional SMC device server and bridging manager (see 4.2.3);" to "c) Zero or one SMC device server and bridging manager (see 4.2.3);" Additionally make first word in a),b) and d) lower case.			
Dell-15	26	4.2.1 4th Paragraph,) in a,b,c, d list.	E	Make first word in a),b),c),d) lower case	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 18	26	4.1, p1	T	This overview conflicts with the Abstract and the contents of clause 1. Make the three consistent. Perhaps this can be accomplished by identifying the application client and device server in the 4.1 text.			
ENDL 19	26	4.2.1, a,b,c list for DT device, entry c	T	I see an application client listed as a constituent of an automation device. I see device servers listed as constituents of a DT device. What I do not see is a specific identification of the 'application client contained within the DT device'. This phrase makes no sense.	Accepted	7c	HPQ-56, QTM-16, ER: change "the application client" to "any application clients" - WG: in d), change "the application client" to "bridging manager"
HPQ-55	26	4.2.1 (and global)	T	A device server does not receive or process a task management request. That job belongs to the task manager within the logical unit (see SAM-3, 4.8). Switch from 'device server' to 'logical unit' where necessary.			
HPQ-56	26	4.2.1	T	The DT device only contains an application client if bridging is enabled. Is that the application client that this sentence mentions? If it is, include some text making it clear that the application client may or may not exist, e.g. change '... the application client contained ...' to '... the application client possibly contained ....' If the application client mentioned in this sentence isn't the bridging manager, then change the sentence to eliminate it.	Accepted	7c	ENDL-19, QTM-16, ER: change "the application client" to "any application clients" - WG: Change c) to "an optional SMC device manager and corresponding bridging manager".

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-57	26	4.2.1 (and global)	T	Another example where the text mentions a device server processing task management requests. Change 'device server' to 'logical unit' if the thing referenced has to process both commands and TMF's.			
HPQ-58	26	4.2	E	Get rid of nesting level 4.2 - upgrade 4.2.xx to 4.xx	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-59	26	4.2.1	T	DT device contains ... [row] d) at end, add "One of these ports shall be an ADI port (see 3.1.2)."	Rejected	7b	see Dell-13
HPQ-60	26	4.2.1 DT device row d)	E	data transfer device s/b DT device	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-61	26	4.2.1	E	Figures showing automation device and DT device contents (pictorial view of the a)b)c)d) lists) right above those lists would be helpful.			
HPQ-62	26	4.2.1, 1st a),b),c) list, item b)	E	Change "may receive" to "receives" (original comment by Michael, explanation by Rob) The term "may" means permission is being granted. However, that's not the meaning of this sentence. If there is an automation device primary port, the SMP device server must accept commands through it.	Accepted	7a	Perhaps we should remove the entire second phrase
HPQ-63	26	4.2.1	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI initiator port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-64	26	4.2.1, 3rd a),b),c) list, item b)	E	'DT device's primary ports' s/b 'DT device primary ports' (since this is a defined term)	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-65	26	4.1	E	Since the sentence introduces the two possibilities with 'either', this word should be 'or'.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-66	26	4.1	E	The standard is called "automation/drive interface commands". Automation device is used everywhere. However, "drive" is used only 3 times, and seems to have been overtaken by the "DT device" term. In 4.1, some sentence should equate the two terms. For example, say "and a data transfer (DT) device (e.g., a removable medium device such as a tape drive)."			
IBM 14	26	4.1, 1st paragraph	E	The term << data transfer device >> should be <<DT device >> ??	Accepted	7a	
IBM 15	26	4.2.1 1st paragraph	E	This << data transfer (DT) device >> should be << DT device >>.	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
IBM 16	26	4.2.1 2nd a,b,c list	E	Item c << c) An optional SMC device server and bridging manager (see 4.2.3); >> should have an << and >> after the semicolon.	Accepted	7a	
QTM-14	26	4.2.1, first b)	E	s/b "SCSI commands or task"?			may eliminate the phrase, see HPQ-62
QTM-15	26	4.2.1, second c)	E	Add an "and" after this list item	Accepted	7a	
QTM-16	26	4.2.1, second d)	T	the application client contained Which client is this?	Accepted	7c	ENDL-19, HPQ-56, ER: change "the application client" to "any application clients" - WG: see ENDL-19.
QTM-17	26	4.2.1, second d)	T	Can we say at least one port may/should be an ADI port?			
QTM-18	26	4.2.1, first d)	T	Because ADI ports exclude primary ports, this prevents the ADI-port-less model we were trying for in 06-061r3. How about changing to: A SCSI initiator port through which the automation application client transmits SCSI requests to and receives SCSI responses from the ADC device server in the DT device. This may be an automation device primary port.	Accepted in principle	7b	See Dell-13 and HPQ-59
QTM-19	26	last paragraph	E	Is "processing" needed here? These operations are performed by invoking various SCSI commands and processing task management requests on the ADC device server.	Accepted	7a	
Dell-16	27	4.2.2 2nd Paragraph, 2nd Sentence	T	change "If the DT device contains an ADI port, then the RMC device server should be accessible as a logical unit through an ADI port, and may be an asymmetric logical unit (see SAM-3)." to "If the DT device contains an ADI port, then the RMC device server should be accessible as a logical unit through an ADI port, and may support asymmetric logical unit access (see SPC-3)" SAM-3 does not define an asymmetric logical unit. My understanding of this is that you may have different LUN presented on different target ports.	Accepted	7c	ER: accept - WG:Accept
Dell-17	27	4.2.2 2nd Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	change "...6.2.2.4.2), the..." to "...6.2.2.4.2), then the..."	Accepted	7b	
ENDL 20	27	Figure 2	E	A gray line is missing on the right-hand side of figure 2. The line should connect the two Primary Port(s) to the Automation Device Primary Port.	Rejected		They are not required to be in the same domain.

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-67	27	Figure 2	T	Change 'ADI Port' to 'ADI initiator port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-68	27	Figure 2	T	Change 'ADI Port' to 'ADI initiator port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-69	27	Figure 2	T	Change 'ADI Port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-70	27	Figure 2	T	Change 'ADI Port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-71	27	4.2.2, last paragraph, first instance	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-72	27	4.2.2, last paragraph, second instance	T	Change 'an ADI port' to 'the ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
IBM 17	27	Figure 2 caption	E	This << Automation device and DT device relationship >> should be << Example of an automation device and DT device relationship >>	Accepted	7a	
IBM 18	27	4.2.2 1st paragraph	E	This << Figure 3 shows an automation device with an automation application client and a remote SMC device server, and a DT device with an RMC device server, an ADC device server, and an optional local SMC device server (see 4.2.3). >> should be made into an a,b,c list.	Accepted	7a	
QTM-20	27	4.2.2 first paragraph	T	We don't have a definition for "physical device"; do we need one?			
Dell-18	28	4.2.2 6th Paragraph, 2nd Sentence	T	(e.g., pressing an eject button on the physical device). This e.g. does not seem like the best example considering this is an automation device standard?	Rejected		ER: reject - WG - reject

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 21	28	3rd p on pg, s2	E	RE: The NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command (see 5.2) provides a mechanism for the application client to indicate that the load attempt has ended in a failure, such that the RMC device server that was masking sense data changes shall resume reporting sense data for the failure. [is another way to say this?] The NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command (see 5.2) provides a mechanism for the application client to indicate that the load attempt has ended in a failure and the RMC device server that was masking sense data changes has resumed reporting sense data for the failure.			
HPQ-73	28	4.2.2	T	PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL commands (see SPC-3) The PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL command was booted from SPC-4 into individual command set standards, so SPC-n is not a good reference any more.			It is as long as we reference SPC-3
HPQ-74	28	4.2.2 2nd to last paragraph, 1st sentence	T	Delete may. The ADC mode pages either do or do not override; there is no granting of permission here.	Accepted	7c	ER: accept- WG: accept
HPQ-75	28	4.2.2 2nd to last paragraph, 2nd sentence	T	Delete may. The ADC mode pages either do or do not override; there is no granting of permission here.	Accepted	7c	ER: accept - WG: accept
HPQ-76	28	4.2.2, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-77	28	4.2.2, 1st paragraph, 3rd sentence	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-78	28	4.2.2, 1st paragraph, 3rd sentence	T	Change 'an ADI port' to 'the ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
IBM 19	28	2nd paragraph after figure 3	E	The statement << This approach allows the automation application client to interact with the physical device via the ADC device server without a conflict due to reservations on other device servers >> should be deleted as it contains no information that is relevant to the standard. It only, needlessly, justifies the requirement in the previous sentence.			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-21	28	third paragraph	E	mechanism for the application client s/b "automation application client"			
QTM-22	28	last paragraph	E	change to "A response to a TEST UNIT READY"			should this be "The response to a TEST UNIT READY…"?
Dell-19	29	4.2.3.1 1st Paragraph, 4th sentence	T	change "The local SMC device server may be accessible as a logical unit through the DT device ADI port, and may be an asymmetric logical unit (see SAM-3)." to "The local SMC device server may be accessible as a logical unit through the DT device ADI port, and may support asymmetric logical unit access (see SPC-3)". SAM-3 does not define an asymmetric logical unit.	Accepted	7c	ER: accept - WG: accept
Dell-20	29	4.2.2 9th Paragraph,3rd Sentence	T	change "...additional sense code of NOT READY TO READY TRANSITION based on the readiness of the removable medium." to "...additional sense code of NOT READY TO READY TRANSITION based on the transition from not ready to ready of the removable medium."			
Dell-21	29	4.2.3.1 3rd Paragraph, 2nd Sentence	T	remove "low-cost"	Accepted	7c	IBM-24, ER: accept - WG: see IBM-24
Dell-22	29	4.2.3.2 2nd Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	Changer to "changer"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-23	29	4.2.3.2 Local SMC device server operation 2nd Paragraph, 2nd Sentence	E	Because the transport protocol connecting the bridging manager and the remote SMC device server may not carry information about which initiator port originated a command or task management request, the remote SMC device server is not able to implement the complete set of commands. to "If the transport protocol connecting the bridging manager and the remote SMC device server does not carry information about which initiator port originated a command or task management request, then the remote SMC device server is not able to implement the complete set of commands."			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 22	29	1st line on pg	T	NOT READY TO READY TRANSITION [is not an additional sense code listed in SPC-4 ... maybe this s/b] NOT READY TO READY CHANGE, MEDIUM MAY HAVE CHANGED	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 23	29	2nd p on pg, s2 & s4	T	establish appropriate unit attention conditions [s/b] establish appropriate unit attention condition [unless it is intended that one LOAD UNLOAD command shall result in the establishment of multiple unit attention conditions] [twice in cited paragraph]			There may be more than one UA due to MAM readiness changes.
HPQ-79	29	4.2.3.1, 1st paragraph	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-80	29	4.2.3.1, 1st paragraph, last sentence	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-81	29	4.2.3.1, 3rd paragraph	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI initiator port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-82	29	4.2.3.2	T	Expand the details about "shall not respond to". If an INQUIRY command is sent to the LUN, should it return a Peripheral Qualifier of 001b (not there now) or 011b (never there)? Since bridging can be enabled/disabled at will, 001b seems appropriate.			
HPQ-83	29	4.2.3.2	T	Because the transport protocol connecting the bridging manager and the remote SMC device server may not carry information about which initiator port originated a command or task management request, Does the transport protocol always carry information about which target port received said commands? If not, then this needs to be worded in I_T nexus terms, not just initiator port terms.			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
IBM 20	29	4.2.2 3rd paragraph from end	E	This<< A LOAD UNLOAD command (see SSC-2) processed by the ADC device server may affect the ready state of the RMC device server. This shall cause the RMC device server to establish appropriate unit attention conditions. >> should be << A LOAD UNLOAD command (see SSC-2) processed by the ADC device server may affect the ready state of the RMC device server and shall cause the RMC device server to establish appropriate unit attention conditions. >>	Accepted	7a	
IBM 21	29	4.2.2	E	A LOAD UNLOAD command (see SSC-2) processed by the ADC device server may affect the ready state of the RMC device server. This shall cause the RMC device server to establish appropriate unit attention conditions. A			Incomplete letter ballot comment
IBM 22	29	4.2.2 3rd paragraph from end	E	This<< A LOAD UNLOAD command processed by the RMC device server may affect the ready state of the ADC device server. This shall cause the ADC device server to establish appropriate unit attention conditions. >> should be << A LOAD UNLOAD command processed by the RMC device server may affect the ready state of the ADC device server and shall cause the ADC device server to establish appropriate unit attention conditions. >>	Accepted	7a	
IBM 23	29	4.2.3.1 (comment says 4.2.2) Last paragraph	E	This << The effect is that some or all commands and task management requests >> should be << As a result some or all commands and task management requests >>	Accpeted	7a	
IBM 24	29	4.2.2 last paragraph	E	The statement << This may be used in low-cost automation devices that do not have automation device primary ports. >> Should be deleted a it does not belong in a standard because a standard cannot determine what implementations can or do cost.	Accepted	7c	Dell-21 - WG: accept
IBM 25	29	4.2.3.2 2nd paragraph	E	This statement << Thus, the local SMC device server shall service >> should be << As a result, the local SMC device server shall service >>	Accepted	7a	
QTM-23	29	4.2.3.1 first paragraph	T	It says "the automation device shall report a logical unit to the automation device ADI port" but Figure 2 says they are optional.			Does bridging make sense without ADI ports?

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-24	29	4.2.3.1 second paragraph	E	Should "command or task management" be "SCSI command or task management" (appears several places).	Accepted in principle	7b	Remove "SCSI" from "SCSI command" in several places for consistency
QTM-25	29	4.2.3.1 second paragraph	T	Using the ADI ports, These are optional per figures 2 and 3.			
QTM-26	29	last paragraph	E	s/b "SCSI commands and task"?			
QTM-27	29	4.2.3.2 first paragraph	T	change "...reported to a REPORT LUNS command (see SPC-3)." to "...included in the logical unit inventory (see SPC-4)."	Accepted	7c	ER: accept - WG: accept
QTM-28	29	second paragraph	E	ready state (see 3.1.31)	Accepted	7a	
Dell-24	30	4.2.3.2 5th Paragraph, 1st Sentence in c) of a,b,c list	E	c) When a DT device primary port uses contingent allegiance (see SAM-2), save sense data on a per initiator port basis. to "c) save sense data on a per initiator port basis, if a DT device primary port uses contingent allegiance (see SAM-2)"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-25	30	4.2.3.4 2nd Paragraph	E	change "If the bridging manager receives a response from the remote SMC device server with a status of CHECK CONDITION and sense key of UNIT ATTENTION, the bridging manager shall discard the response and reissue the command. All other responses with a status of CHECK CONDITION, including those with a sense key of NOT READY, shall be returned to the local SMC device server for subsequent return via the DT device primary port. This shall have no effect on the cached NOT READY sense keys (see 4.2.3.5)." to "If the bridging manager receives a response from the remote SMC device server with a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to UNIT ATTENTION, then the bridging manager shall discard the response and reissue the command. All other responses with a CHECK CONDITION status, including those with a sense key set to NOT READY, shall be returned to the local SMC device server for subsequent return via the DT device primary port. This shall have no effect on the cached NOT READY sense keys (see 4.2.3.5)."	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-26	30	5th Paragraph, 1st Sentence in a) of a,b,c list	E	change "a) Check for reservation conflicts on all commands. Return RESERVATION CONFLICT on all commands that violate reservation rules (see SPC-3);" to "a) check for reservation conflicts on all commands. Return RESERVATION CONFLICT status on all commands that violate reservation rules (see SPC-3);"	Accepted	7a	ENDL-25
Dell-27	30	4.2.3.2 5th Paragraph, 1st Sentence in b) of a,b,c list	E	change "b) Manage unit attention conditions generated for multiple initiator ports. If the local SMC device server detects that a unit attention condition is pending for an initiator port when a new command is received, the local SMC device server shall return CHECK CONDITION for the command; and" to "b) manage unit attention conditions generated for multiple initiator ports. If the local SMC device server detects that a unit attention condition is pending for an initiator port when a new command is received, then the local SMC device server shall return CHECK CONDITION status for the command; and"	Accepted	7a	ENDL-26
Dell-28	30	4.2.3.2 3rd Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	change "...supported, they shall..." to "...supported, then they shall..."	Accepted	7b	
ENDL 24	30	4.2.3.2, 1st p after 1st a,b,c list, s2	T	RE: The local SMC device server shall not support the ELEMENT_SCOPE in the PERSISTENT RESERVE IN and PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT commands. [The reference for PERSISTENT RESERVE IN/OUT is SPC-3. SPC-3 does not define ELEMENT_SCOPE. If this sentence is not removed, it will be necessary to insert a '(see SPC-2)' in it somewhere.]	Accepted	7c	HPQ-90, ER: remove sentence - WG: accept
ENDL 25	30	4.2.3.2, 2nd a,b,c list, entry a	E	RESERVATION CONFLICT [s/b] RESERVATION CONFLICT status	Accepted	7a	Dell-26
ENDL 26	30	4.2.3.2, 2nd a,b,c list, entry b	E	CHECK CONDITION [s/b] CHECK CONDITION status	Accepted	7a	Dell-27
ENDL 27	30	4.2.3.3, p3, s1	T	RE: The remote SMC device server shall report unit attention conditions for all initiator ports to the ADC device server using the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command (see 5.2). [As written, this sentence tells me that the device server sends a NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command to an initiator port. This is bass ackwards from the SCSI I know.]			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-84	30	4.2.3.2	T	Consider creating a list of commands that may be processed by the local SMC device server and add REPORT SUPPORTED OPERATION CODES and REPORT SUPPORTED TASK MANAGEMENT FUNCTIONS to that list. Although these commands do not require knowledge of the initiator port, we have found them useful to implement in the local SMC device server for performance reasons.			ER: reject unless HP has a proposal - WG: HP will consider writing a proposal
HPQ-85	30	4.2.3.4, 2nd paragraph	T	via the DT device primary port. First paragraph in 4.2.3.1 states that SMC may be an asymmetrical logical unit. Therefore the initiator is not necessarily on the DT primary port.			
HPQ-86	30	4.2.3.4, 2nd paragraph	T	NOT READY sense keys. Clarification require: Does this mean the ASC/ASCQ doesn't replace the cache NRSC ASC/ASCQ? Or does it mean it doesn't affect the cached Ready state, i.e. does the local SMC device server assume the remote SMC device server remains ready until a Notify Data Transfer Device with the NRSC set arrives?	Accepted	7c	ER: change to "ready state or assocaited additional sense code" - WG: remove the sentence.
HPQ-87	30	4.2.3.4, 3rd paragraph, 2nd sentence	T	This sentence presents some difficulties. 1. How does the queue mentioned interact with the local SMC logical unit's task set? I would much prefer seeing this concept expressed in the language of task sets and tasks as those are well defined entities. 2. Although one can infer that the commands mentioned by this sentence are only those commands that result in a task routed to the local SMC logical unit, the sentence doesn't actually say that. The sentence only qualifies 'commands' with 'received via the DT device primary port.' Changing the sentence to include the task concept allows the inclusion of text limiting the sentence to tasks routed to the local SMC device server.			
HPQ-88	30	4.2.3.2, last paragraph	E	association value of 01b s/b ASSOCIATION field set to 01b (i.e., target port)	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-89	30	4.2.3.3, 2nd paragraph	E	association value of 01b s/b ASSOCIATION field set to 01b (i.e., target port)	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-90	30	4.2.3.2	T	ELEMENT_SCOPE did not survive in SPC-3, so if SPC-3 or SPC-4 is the reference, this sentence is not needed. It is an SPC-2 feature only.	Accepted	7c	ENDL-24, ER: remove the sentence - WG: remove the sentence

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-91	30	4.2.3.2	T	If bridging is enabled, then the remote SMC device server needs to have its automation device primary port disabled. If some application client makes a reservation directly on the remote SMC device server, the local SMC device server and remote SMC device server will not be in agreement about the state of the logical unit. The local SMC device server could try to make a reservation of its own on behalf of its application client, but that would be difficult to implement correctly.	Rejected		ER: been there, done that, not going there again… - WG: deferred to ADC-3
HPQ-92	30	4.2.3.2 2nd list, item c)	T	initiator port s/b I_T nexus	Accepted	7c	ER: accept - WG: accept
HPQ-93	30	4.2.3.4	T	If the bridging manager receives a CHECK CONDITION/UNIT ATTENTION/<one of the types of resets occurred>, it should clear all cached SMC data and status. If it receives INQUIRY DATA HAS CHANGED, it should clear cached standard INQUIRY and VPD data. If it receives MODE PARAMETER DATA CHANGED, it should clear cached mode parameters. For the latter two, a NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command might show up from the automation device to the DT device, but why wait and continue to present staledata?			
IBM 26	30	4.2.3.2 Last a,b,c list item a	E	This << commands. Return RESERVATION CONFLICT on all commands that violate reservation rules (see SPC-3); >> should be << commands; b) Return RESERVATION CONFLICT on all commands that violate reservation rules (see SPC-3); >>	Rejected		See QTM-29
IBM 27	30	4.2.3.4 3rd paragraph	E	Delete the term << Moreover, >> as it has no value.	Accepted	7a	
QTM-29	30	second a)	E	s.b. "...on all commands and return..."	Accepted	7a	IBM-26
QTM-30	30	second b)	E	generated s/b "established"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-31	30	4.2.3.4 second paragraph	E	References to "the DT device primary port" s/b "a DT device primary port" to be consistent with 4.2.1	Accepted	7a	
QTM-32	30	4.2.3.4 third paragraph	E	References to "the DT device primary port" s/b "a DT device primary port" to be consistent with 4.2.1	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
BDT-1	31	Last paragraph, 5th sentence	T	The specification 'commands requiring that the remote SMC device server be accessible' is vague because no specification defines (yet) for SMC devices which commands are processed during the not ready state. Leaving this unspecified causes implementation differences in the field. We would prefer the spec specifies on which commands the local device server may return the cached not ready state.			
Dell-29	31	4.2.3.5 2nd Paragraph, 3rd Sentence	E	change "If caching is enabled, the automation..." to "If caching is enabled, then the automation..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-30	31	4.2.3.5 4th Paragraph, 2nd Sentence	E	change "The remote SMC device server is not accessible if it would respond to a command with a status of CHECK CONDITION and report a sense key of NOT READY." to "The remote SMC device server is not accessible if it responds to a command with a CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key set to NOT READY."	Accepted	7a	Changes "...a sense key set to…" to "…the sense key set to…"
Dell-31	31	4.2.3.5 4th Paragraph, 4th Sentence	E	change "If the ready state indicates not accessible, the local SMC device server shall report a status of CHECK CONDITION to commands requiring that the remote SMC device server be accessible, including TEST UNIT READY." to "If the ready state indicates not accessible, then the local SMC device server shall report a CHECK CONDITION status to commands requiring that the remote SMC device server be accessible, including the TEST UNIT READY command."	Almost Accepted	7b	see HPQ-95
Dell-32	31	4.2.3.5 2nd Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	change "...INQUIRY data, VPD, mode data,..." to "...INQUIRY data, VPD data, mode data,..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-33	31	4.2.3.5 2nd Paragraph, Last Sentence	E	change "...of the MDC, IDC, NRSC, and SOCC bits." to "...of the MDC bit, IDC bit, NRSC bit and SOCC bit."	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-34	31	4.2.3.5 3rd Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	change "If caching is disabled, then the ADC device server shall ignore the MDC, IDC, NSRC, and socc bits (see 5.2) in the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command." to "If caching is disabled, then the ADC device server shall ignore the MDC bit, IDC bit, NSRC bit and SOCC bit (see 5.2) in the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command." Note: the socc in the sentence is not in SMALL CAPS	Accepted	7a	
Dell-35	31	cache.	T	Is this the asc from the last NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command?	Rejected		WG: reject
ENDL 28	31	4.2.3.5, p1, s1	E	standard INQUIRY data [s/b] standard INQUIRY data (see SPC-3)	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 29	31	4.2.3.5, p3, s3	T	the DT device [s/b] the ADC device server [lest a reader think the command could be sent to the RMC device server or SMC device server located in the DT device]	Accepted	7c	ER: accept - WG: accept
HPQ-94	31	4.2.3.5	T	Include a table of everything that may be cached. Include a column indicating whether caching of each such item is controlled by the SMC Logical Unit descriptor. Consider including supported task management functions.			
HPQ-95	31	4.2.3.5	E	Change: "the local SMC device server shall report a status of CHECK CONDITION to commands requiring that the remote SMC device server be accessible, including TEST UNIT READY. The local SMC device server shall set the sense key to NOT READY and the additional sense code to that contained in the cache." to: "the local SMC device server shall terminate commands that require the remote SMC device server to be accessible with CHECK CONDITION status, with the sense key set to NOT READY, and the additional sense code set to the additional sense code contained in the cache."	Accepted	7b	Dell-31, IBM-29, QTM-36
HPQ-96	31	4.2.3.5, 2nd paragraph	E	may have s/b has	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-97	31	4.2.3.5	T	What in SPC-3 indicates that supported operation codes might change? There is no unit attention condition additional sense code defined for it. CHANGED OPERATING DEFINITION might be interpreted that way, but that was last referenced by the CHANGE DEFINITION command, made obsolete in SPC-2.			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-98	31	4.2.3.5	E	Change 'the command' to 'the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command'	Accepted	7a	Used "…a NOTIFY…" instead of "…the NOTIFY…"
IBM 28	31	4.2.3.5 3rd paragraph	E	This << Thus the automation application client is not required >> should be << As a result the automation application client is not required >>	Accepted	7a	Added a comma
IBM 29	31	4.2.3.5 4th paragraph	E	This << not accessible if it would respond to a command with a status >> should be << not accessible if it responds to a command with a status >>	Accepted	7b	Dell-31, HPQ-95, QTM-36
QTM-33	31	4.2.3.5 second paragraph	T	before issuing any commands s/b "before processing any commands"	Accepted in principle	7c	WG: remove the sentence instead.
QTM-34	31	4.2.3.5 second paragraph	E	change to "... SOCC bits (see 5.2)."	Accepted	7a	
QTM-35	31	4.2.3.5 third paragraph	E	Remove "(see 5.2)"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-36	31	last paragraph	E	change to "TEST UNIT READY (See SPC-3)."	Overtaken by events		The phrase "TEST UNIT READY command" was removed, see HPQ-95
ENDL 30	32	1st p after table 2, s2	E	States (b) through (h) should [s/b] States (b) through (h) (i.e., all other states) should	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-100	32	Table 2	E	Very high frequency data log parameter field s/b "Bit in the VHF data descriptor"	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-101	32	4.2.4.1	E	very high frequency data log parameter s/b "VHF data descriptor"	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-99	32	4.2.4.1, 1st paragraph	E	in the very high frequency data log parameter in the DT Device Status log page during load operations (see 6.1.2.2) s/b "in the VHF data descriptor (see 6.1.2.2) during load operations"	Accepted	7b	
QTM-37	32	third paragraph after table 2	E	Add a space between "state. The"	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 31	33	2nd p on pg, 2	E	(see SSC) [s/b] (see SSC-2) [SSC is not a normative reference in this standard]			HPQ-103, QTM-38
ENDL 32	33	Table 3, title	E	Load example [s/b] Load states example	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-102	33	Table 3	E	Very high frequency data log parameter field s/b "Bit in VHF data descriptor"	Accepted	7b	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-103	33	4.2.4.1	E	SSC s/b SSC-2			ENDL-31, QTN-38
QTM-38	33	second paragraph	E	Remove "(see SSC)"			ENDL-31, HPQ-103
ENDL 33	34	4.2.4.1, 1,2,3 list, entry 4	E	has some final microcode preparations to make [s/b] makes final microcode preparations to access the medium	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 34	34	1st p after table 4, s2	E	States (b) through (h) should [s/b] States (b) through (h) (i.e., all other states) should	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-104	34	Table 4	T	Looks like states (d) and (e) are in the reverse order since the MSTD is set in (c), cleared in (d) and set again in (e). It also implies there's no transition period going from seated to unseated, which is also resolved by swaping (d) and (e).			
HPQ-105	34	4.2.4.2	E	in the very high frequency data log parameter in the DT Device Status log page during unload operations (see 6.1.2.2) s/b "in the VHF data descriptor (see 6.1.2.2) during unload operations"	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-106	34	Table 4	E	Very high frequency data log parameter field s/b "Bit in the VHF data descriptor"	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-107	34	4.2.4.2	T	VHF data descriptor s/b "VHF log parameter" (if change in 6.1.2.2 is accepted)	Rejected		standardizing on the term "VHF data descriptor"
HPQ-108	34	4.2.4.2	T	Add "Unload states may not be reported in the order listed in table 4." since a similar sentence appears after table 2.			
HPQ-109	34	Table 2/4	T	Table 4 state a) and table 2 state i) should have the same name. Table 4 state h) and table 2 state a) should have the same name.			
HPQ-110	34	Page 17 and global	E	I recommend using ragged right edges, so text is not stretched like in the Unload state (c) paragraph compared to its peers.			
Dell-36	35	4.2.5 1st Paragraph, 3rd Sentence	E	change "...server, the application..." to "...server, then the application..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-37	35	4.2.5 2nd Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	change "...loads, the automation..." to "...loads, then the automation..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-38	35	4.2.5 3rd Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	change "...enabled, the RMC..." to "...enabled, then the RMC..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-39	35	4.2.5 4th Paragraph, 1st Sentence	E	change "...implemented, the..." to "...sense data masking is implemented, then the..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-40	35	4.2.5 4th Paragraph, a),b),c) list	E	Make first word in a),b),c) low case	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 35	35	4.2.5, p2	E	[Readers become confused when the most important statement in a paragraph is presented last.] If the RMC device server's true status is not reported to the application client during automation device-initiated loads, the automation device may retry the load operation while the RMC device server reports that the load operation is still in progress to application clients. This behavior is termed sense data masking and its implementation is optional. [s/b] If the optional sense data masking feature is implemented, the RMC device server's true status may not be reported to the application client during automation device-initiated loads. Instead, the automation device may retry the load operation while the RMC device server continues to report that the load operation is still in progress to application clients.			
ENDL 36	35	4.2.5, a,b,c list, entry b	E	time of [s/b] time equal to	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-111	35	4.2.5, paragraph after lettered list, last sentence	E	Consider moving this sentence into the lettered list above. They both discuss when to disable sense data masking.			
HPQ-112	35	4.2.6	T	The ADC device server also provides a mechanism to notify an ADC application client whenever a TapeAlert flag changes value Could this be rewritten to refer to the specific bit name?	Accepted in principle	7c	WG: Remove the sentence.
HPQ-113	35	4.2.5, 1st paragraph	E	operation s/b load operation	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-114	35	4.2.5, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence	E	'This..' s/b 'Retrying the load operation...'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-115	35	4.2.5, 3rd paragraph	E	'If...' s/b 'While...'			
HPQ-116	35	4.2.5, 3rd paragraph	T	consistent with a normal loading operation is a bit confusing. Perhaps reword as: "indicating the load is in progress, and not report any failure that is encountered."			
HPQ-117	35	4.2.5	Q	Does sense data masking apply to loads only, or does it also apply to unloads?			
HPQ-118	35	4.2.5, 4th paragraph	E	Move the "if implemented" paragraph above the "if sense data masking is enabled" paragraph.			
HPQ-119	35	4.2.6	E	'TapeAlert Response log page' s/b 'TapeAlert Response log page (see 6.1.3)'	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-120	35	4.2.6 (throughout)	T	Since there seem to be two sets of TapeAlert flags - RMC ones and ADC ones - giving them separate names: RMC TapeAlert flags and ADC TapeAlert flags might be helpful.			
Dell-41	36	4.2.6 2nd paragraph, 2nd sentence	T	port events (e.g., port logins). Is a HARD RESET not a port event? Would this then clear the flags as it implies a logical unit reset?			
ENDL 37	36	3rd p on pg, s2	E	time; application [s/b] time. Application	Accepted	7a	IBM-31
HPQ-121	36	3rd paragraph	T	'VHF data descriptor' s/b 'VHF log parameter' (if change in 6.1.2.2 is accepted)	Rejected		standardizing on the term "VHF data descriptor"
HPQ-122	36	3rd paragraph, 2nd instance	T	'VHF data descriptor' s/b 'VHF log parameter' (if change in 6.1.2.2 is accepted)	Rejected		standardizing on the term "VHF data descriptor"
HPQ-123	36	1st paragraph	T	'initiator port' s/b 'I_T nexus'	Accepted	7c	WG: Accepted
HPQ-124	36	1st paragraph	T	Does "port events (e.g., port logins)" or simply mean "I_T nexus loss"?			
HPQ-125	36	3rd paragraph	T	when the device server sets is worded from the device server perspective, but the sentence is a rule for the application client. Reword in terms of it receiving a DT Device VHF Data log parameter with the TAFC bit set to one.			
IBM 30	36	4.2.6 2nd paragarph	E	This << This approach facilitates accurate reporting of the conditions encountered by the DT device and allows the automation device to manage the information directly. >> should be deleted as it contains no information that is useful in a standard. If you really want it then put in at the beginning of the first paragraph as << To facilitate accurate reporting of the conditions encountered by the DT device and allow the automation device to manage the information directly the ADC device server ...>>	Accepted	7a	
IBM 31	36	4.2.6 4th paragraph	E	This << TapeAlert state flags at any time; application clients should retrieve TapeAlert state flags when the ADC >> should be << TapeAlert state flags at any time. Application clients should retrieve TapeAlert state flags when the ADC >> should be. Get rid of the semicolon.	Accepted	7a	ENDL-37

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
IBM 32	36	Table 5	T	(KB) - Comment - TapeAlerts 19h and 20h specify 'Interface'. It is not clear what 'interface' refers to Solution - Clarify what each 'interface' refers to			
QTM-39	36	fifth paragraph	E	that clear state flags.. s/b "that cause state flags to be set to zero"	Accepted	7a	Changed to "that case TapeAlert state flags to be set to zero"
QTM-40	36	table 5 caption	E	s/b "Additional conditions that cause TapeAlert state flags to be set to zero"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-42	38	4.2.7 1st Paragraph, 2nd sentence	E	change "...attributes, the automation..." to "...attributes, then the automation..."	Rejected		Not an if…then format sentence.
Dell-43	38	4.2.7 1st Paragraph, 2nd sentence	E	change "the command (see SPC-3, WRITE ATTRIBUTE) to the" to "the WRITE ATRIBUTE command (see SPC-3) to the" or "a command (e.g., WRITE ATTRIBUTE (See SPC-3)) to the"	Accepted	7a	Dell-43, ENDL-39, HPQ-130, QTM-38
Dell-44	38	4.2.8 2nd paragraph	T	What does "accept" mean. It this transport dependent, i.e. in pSCSI would not allow selection? In SAS, disable the phy, so OPEN_REJECT(NO DESTINATION) is returned? Or it this at the SCSI level, where is would return BUSY or NOT READY?			
Dell-45	38	4.2.9	E	Make first word in 1)-5) list lower case	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 38	38	1st p after table 5	E	Since the paragraph is discussing load operations, it is not clear whether the reference to table 4 (i.e., the unload states table) is correct. Should the last '(see table 4)' in the paragraph be changed to '(see table 1)'?	Accepted (table 2)	7a	HPQ-126
ENDL 39	38	4.2.7, p1, s2	E	issue the command (see SPC-3, WRITE ATTRIBUTE) [s/b] send a WRITE ATTRIBUTE command (see SPC-3)	Accepted	7a	Dell-43, ENDL-39, HPQ-130, QTM-38
ENDL 40	38	4.2.8, p2, s1	E	task management requests [s/b] task management functions [or] SCSI command requests and task management function requests	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 41	38	4.2.8, p3, s1	E	primary port, as specified in SAM-3 [s/b] primary port (see SAM-3)			should the reference be moved next to "I_T nexus loss"?
ENDL 42	38	4.2.8, p3, s1-s2	E	Insert a paragraph break before 'If the command disabling...' This is a totally new thought, not a continuation of the topic previously discussed in this paragraph.			
ENDL 43	38	4.2.9, p1, s3	E	A typical sequence of operations follows: [s/b] A typical sequence of operations is:	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-126	38	1st paragraph after table 5	E	see table 1 is not a hyperlink and is the wrong table number	Accepted (table 2)	7a	ENDL-38
HPQ-127	38	4.2.7	T	'...the automation device shall issue...' s/b '...the automation application client shall issue...'	Accepted	7c	WG: Accepted
HPQ-128	38	4.2.8, 3rd paragraph	T	Change "return command completion status" to "send a SCSI transport protocol service response of TASK COMPLETE for the associated task (see SAM-3)" [additional comment by Rob: use "for the MODE SELECT command"]			
HPQ-129	38	4.2.7	E	is required' s/b 'needs'. or change "If the automation device is required to change these attributes," to "To change these attributes, "	Accepted	7a	Second option
HPQ-130	38	4.2.7	E	'see SPC-3, WRITE ATTRIBUTE' s/b 'see the WRITE ATTRIBUTE command in SPC-3'	Accepted	7a	Dell-43, ENDL-39, HPQ-130, QTM-38
HPQ-131	38	4.2.8, 1st paragraph	E	'An ADC device server...via MODE SELECT commands...' s/b 'A DT device...via MODE SELECT commands to the ADC device server...'	Accepted	7a	
IBM 33	38	4.2.6 2nd to last paragraph	T	This statement << Many of the state flags are set to zero at the start of the next medium load, >> is not accurate enough. How many is many? Five, ten, 20, 30, how is anyone supposed to know.? This needs to be more percise.			
IBM 34	38	4.2.6 last paragraph	T	This statement << Other state flags are set to zero following resolution through service intervention. >> is not precise enough. Which other? This needs to be made clearer.			
IBM 35	38	4.2.7	T	(KB) - Comment - This clause should contain text explaining that the ADC device server may set the VOLUME IDENTIFIER attribute of the Device Attributes of MAM Solution - Add this paragraph: ADC device servers may modify the VOLUME IDENTIFIER attributes of type Device.			
QTM-41	38	4.2.7	E	change "...command (see SPC-3, WRITE ATTRIBUTE) to..." to "...WRITE ATTRIBUTE command (see SPC-3) to..."	Accepted	7a	Dell-43, ENDL-39, HPQ-130, QTM-38
QTM-42	38	4.2.7	T	Should "RMC logical unit" be "RMC device server"?	Accepted	7c	WG: accept

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-43	38	4.2.9, item 1)	T	s/b "processes a LOAD UNLOAD command (see SSC-2) requesting the medium be unloaded;"	Accepted in principle	7c	WG: accept in princile, change to "process a command that requests the medium be unloaded".
HPQ-132	39	4.2.9	T	'VHF data descriptor' s/b 'VHF log parameter' (if change in 6.1.2.2 is accepted)	Rejected		standardizing on the term "VHF data descriptor"
IBM 36	39	4.2.9 last paragarph	E	This << medium in step 2 above.>> should be << medium in step 2 of the sequence of operation shown in this subclause.>> It would also be a good idea to do a cross-reference to item 2 in the list.	Accepted	7a	
Dell-46	40	Table 6	E	in Table 6 - Command set for automation/drive interface (part 1 of 2) In table note b change "accept" to "process"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-47	40	Table 6	E	in Table 6 - Command set for automation/drive interface (part 1 of 2) row LOAD UNLOAD change reference "SSC" to "SSC-2" or add SSC as reference in section 2.	Accepted	7a	Dell-47, ENDL-47, QTM-45
Dell-48	40	Table 6	E	in Table 6 - Command set for automation/drive interface (part 1 of 2) Why is Table Note a missing from: CHANGE ALIASES, READ MEDIA SERIAL NUMBER, REPORT ALIASES: a This command is defined by a combination of operation code and service action. The operation code value is shown preceding the slash and the service action value is shown after the slash.	Accepted	7a	Dell-48, ENDL-46, ENDL-48, ENDL-49, QTM-44
Dell-49	40	1st Paragraph, 1st Sentence	T	The sentence below, implies to me that these are the only commands that can be implement, which blocks an ADI device from implement other commands such as vendor specific commands. Is this what was intended? change "The command set for automation/drive interface devices shall be as shown in table 6." to "The command set for automation/drive interface devices is shown in table 6., Commands specified as mandatory in table 6 shall be implemented by automation/drive interface devices.	Accepted	7c	(the suggested wording is almost identical to SSC-3) WG: accept
Dell-50	40	Table 6 note b	T	StrikeOut "these identified"	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 44	40	Table 6, heading	E	Command name (part 1 of 2) [s/b] Command name	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 45	40	Table 6, heading	E	Required [s/b] Support requirement	Rejected		see QTM-46

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 46	40	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on CHANGE ALIASES operation code	Accepted	7a	Dell-48, ENDL-46, ENDL-48, ENDL-49, QTM-44
ENDL 47	40	Table 6, LOAD UNLOAD reference	E	SSC [s/b] SSC-2 [SSC is not a normative reference for this standard]	Accepted	7a	Dell-47, ENDL-47, QTM-45
ENDL 48	40	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on READ MEDIA SERIAL NUMBER operation code	Accepted	7a	Dell-48, ENDL-46, ENDL-48, ENDL-49, QTM-44
ENDL 49	40	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on REPORT ALIASES operation codE	Accepted	7a	Dell-48, ENDL-46, ENDL-48, ENDL-49, QTM-44
ENDL 50	40	Table 6, table footnote c	T	Spellout what 'Same as (b)' means. [FYI - This comment is a reason for the ENDL No vote.]	Accepted	7b	Changed the offending phrase to "This command is subject to the readiness of the removable medium..."
ENDL 51	40	Table 6, table footnote d	E	See SSC-3 to provide support for medium types. [s/b] See SSC-3 for information about supported medium types. [Alternatively, chance the reference column for REPORT DENSITY SUPPORT to SSC-3 and remove this table footnote entirely]	Accepted	7b	Changed reference to SSC-3 and removed the footnote. Also see QTM-49.
HPQ-133	40	Table 6	E	ACCESS CONTROLS IN s/b ACCESS CONTROL IN	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-134	40	Table 6	E	ACCESS CONTROLS OUT s/b ACCESS CONTROL OUT	Accepted	7a	
QTM-44	40	table 6	E	Add superscript "a" to the codes A4h/0Bh, ABh/01h, and A3h/0Bh.	Accepted	7a	Dell-48, ENDL-46, ENDL-48, ENDL-49, QTM-44
QTM-45	40	LOAD UNLOAD reference	E	SSC-2 (?)	Accepted	7a	Dell-47, ENDL-47, QTM-45
QTM-46	40	table 6 Required column	E	SPC-3 and -4 title this column "Type" and use {O, M, Z}. Do we want to adopt that convention?	Accepted	7b	ENDL-45
Dell-51	41	Table 6	E	in Table 6 - Command set for automation/drive interface (part 2 of 2) In table note b change "accept" to "process" Is TEST UNIT READY really a medium-access command?	Accepted	7a	Dell-46
Dell-52	41	Table 6	E	in Table 6 - Command set for automation/drive interface (part 2 of 2) row REPORT DENSITY SUPPORT change reference "SSC" to "SSC-2" or add SSC as reference in section 2.	Accepted	7a	ENDL-52, QTM-50

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-53	41	Table 6	E	in Table 6 - Command set for automation/drive interface (part 1 of 2) Why is Table Note a missing from: REPORT PRIORITY, SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE, REPORT TIMESTAMP, SET PRIORITY: a This command is defined by a combination of operation code and service action. The operation code value is shown preceding the slash and the service action value is shown after the slash.	Accepted	7a	Dell-53, ENDL-53, ENDL-54, ENDL-56, ENDL-57, ENDL-58, QTM-47
Dell-54	41	Table 6 note b	E	StrikeOut "these identified:	Accepted	7a	Dell-50
ENDL 52	41	Table 6, REPORT DENSITY SUPPORT reference	E	SSC [s/b] SSC-2 [SSC is not a normative reference for this standard]	Accepted	7a	Dell-52, QTM-50
ENDL 53	41	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on REPORT PRIORITY operation code	Accepted	7a	Dell-53, ENDL-53, ENDL-54, ENDL-56, ENDL-57, ENDL-58, QTM-47
ENDL 54	41	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on REPORT TIMESTAMP operation code	Accepted	7a	Dell-53, ENDL-53, ENDL-54, ENDL-56, ENDL-57, ENDL-58, QTM-47
ENDL 55	41	Table 6, SEND DIAGNOSTIC row	E	Move table footnote e reference to Support requirement column because it modifies Mandatory not the command name.	Accepted	7a	may be overtaken, see QTM-46
ENDL 56	41	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE operation code	Accepted	7a	Dell-53, ENDL-53, ENDL-54, ENDL-56, ENDL-57, ENDL-58, QTM-47
ENDL 57	41	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on SET PRIORITY operation code	Accepted	7a	Dell-53, ENDL-53, ENDL-54, ENDL-56, ENDL-57, ENDL-58, QTM-47
ENDL 58	41	Table 6	E	Add table footnote a reference on SET TIMESTAMP operation code	Accepted	7a	Dell-53, ENDL-53, ENDL-54, ENDL-56, ENDL-57, ENDL-58, QTM-47

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-135	41	Table 6	T	In the SPC-4 opcode table, A9h needs to be marked optional for ADC-2			This comment is against SPC-4, not ADC-2.
HPQ-136	41	Table 6	E	REPORT DEVICE IDENTIFIER is changing names in SPC-4 to REPORT IDENTIFYING INFORMATION			
HPQ-137	41	Table 6	T	How about SECURITY PROTOCOL IN and OUT?	Accepted	7c	QTM-48, WG: Add the commands as optional.
QTM-47	41	table 6	E	Add superscript "a" to the codes A3h/0Eh, A3h/0Fh, A9h/1Fh, A4h/0Eh, and A4f/0Fh.	Accepted	7a	Dell-53, ENDL-53, ENDL-54, ENDL-56, ENDL-57, ENDL-58, QTM-47
QTM-48	41	table 6	T	Add to table 6 SECURITY PROTOCOL IN as optional and SECURITY PROTOCOL OUT as optional. Reference SPC-4 for both commands.	Accepted	7c	HPQ-137, WG: Add the commands as optional.
QTM-49	41	table 6 REPORT DENSITY SUPPORT	T	This command should not be mandatory unless the RMC is of type SSC. Add a footnote explaining this.	Accepted	7b	
QTM-50	41	table 6 REPORT DENSITY SUPPORT	E	SSC-2 (?)	Accepted	7a	Dell-52, ENDL-52
Dell-55	42	2nd Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 7	E	change "The MDC, IDC, NRSC, and SOCC bits in byte 3 are used to indicate that cached SMC data may require refreshing (see 4.2.3.5)." to "The MDC bit, IDC bit, NRSC bit, and SOCC bit in byte 3 are used to indicate that cached SMC data may require refreshing by the local SMC device server (see 4.2.3.5)."	Accepted	7a	IBM-37
Dell-56	42	4th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 7	E	change "An INQUIRY data changed (IDC) bit set to one indicates that the contents of the standard INQUIRY data or of any VPD page reported by the remote SMC device server have changed." to "An INQUIRY data changed (IDC) bit set to one indicates that the contents of the standard INQUIRY data or any VPD page data reported by the remote SMC device server have changed."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-57	42	2nd to last paragraph, 2nd sentence	T	StrikeOut "or pages"	Accepted	7b	
Dell-58	42	last paragraph	E	StrikeOut ", per the description of caching SMC data and status"	Accepted	7a	ENDL-65

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-59	42	last paragraph	E	change "An NSRC bit set to zero…" to "A NSRC bit set to zero…"	Accepted	7b	QTM-*
ENDL 59	42	5.2, p1, s1	E	is used to notify [s/b] notifies	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 60	42	1st p after table 7, s1	E	[The current wording places a requirement on an application client] The load failed (LDFAIL) bit shall be set to one if... [s/b] A load failed (LDFAIL) bit set to one indicates that	Accepted	7b	
ENDL 61	42	2nd p after table 7, s1	E	Delete 'in byte 3' since this information is communicated by table 7.	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 62	42	3rd, 4th, & 5th paragraphs after table 7, various sentences	E	Upon receipt of this notification [s/b] Upon receipt of this command [three times on this page]			Should we use "processing" instead of receipt"?
ENDL 63	42	3rd p after table 7, s4	E	SMC Logical Unit descriptor is set to one [s/b] SMC Logical Unit descriptor is set to one (see 6.2.2.4.3)	Accepted	7a	QTM-51
ENDL 64	42	5th p after table 7, s1	E	remote SMC device server has entered the not accessible state [s/b] remote SMC device server ready state has transition to indicate not accessible [for consistency with the wording in 4.2.3.5]			
ENDL 65	42	5th p after table 7, s1	E	per the description of caching SMC data and status (see 4.2.3.5) [s/b] (see 4.2.3.5)	Accepted		Dell-58
ENDL 66	42	5th p after table 7, s2	E	remote SMC device server was already in the not accessible state [s/b] remote SMC device server ready state has already transitioned to indicate not accessible [for consistency with the wording in 4.2.3.5]			
ENDL 67	42	5th p after table 7, s3	E	ASC and ASCQ fields [s/b] ASC field and ASCQ field	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 68	42	5th p after table 7, s3	E	shall contain [s/b] contain	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 69	42	5th p after table 7, s5	E	remote SMC device server has not entered the not accessible state [s/b] remote SMC device sever ready state has not transitioned to indicate not accessible [for consistency with the wording in 4.2.3.5]			
ENDL 70	42	5th p after table 7, s5	E	nor has the additional sense data changed [s/b] or the additional sense data has not changed			I think it should be "and" if we add the "not"
ENDL 71	42	5th p after table 7, s5	E	if already in the not accessible state [s/b] if the remote SMC device sever ready state has already transitioned to indicate not accessible [for consistency with the wording in 4.2.3.5]			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-138	42	1st paragraph after table 7	T	'VHF data descriptor' s/b 'VHF log parameter' (if change in 6.1.2.2 is accepted)	Rejected		standardizing on the term "VHF data descriptor"
HPQ-139	42	1st paragraph after table 7	E	indicates s/b specifies	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-140	42	2nd paragraph after table 7	E	indicate s/b specify	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-141	42	3rd paragraph after table 7	E	indicates s/b specifies	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-142	42	4th paragraph after table 7	E	indicates s/b specifies	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-143	42	5th paragraph after table 7	E	indicates s/b specifies	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-144	42	3rd paragraph after table 7	T	Add a MDC bit set to zero sentence			
HPQ-145	42	4th paragraph after table 7	T	Add an IDC bit set to zero sentence			
HPQ-146	42	5th paragraph after table 7	T	Add a NRSC bit set to zero sentence			
HPQ-147	42	5.2 (and global)	E	Refer to bits/fields in left-to-right, top-to-bottom order	Accepted	7c	
HPQ-148	42	3rd paragraph after table 7	T	'may' s/b 'shall'. may implies there is permission to do something else - e.g. return CHECK CONDITION? If the bit is ignored while caching is disabled, then it should be ignored while enabled but irrelevant.	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
HPQ-149	42	4th paragraph after table 7	T	'may' s/b 'shall'. may implies there is permission to do something else - e.g. return CHECK CONDITION? If the bit is ignored while caching is disabled, then it should be ignored while enabled but irrelevant.	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
IBM 37	42	5.2 3rd paragraph	E	This << The MDC, IDC, NRSC, and SOCC bits in byte 3 are used to indicate that cached SMC >> should be << The MDC bit, IDC bit, NRSC bit , and SOCC bit in byte 3 are used to indicate that cached SMC >>	Accepted	7a	Dell-55
QTM-51	42	third paragraph below table 7	E	Add a reference (see 6.2.2.4.3) after "Logical unit descriptor"	Accepted	7a	ENDL-63

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-52	42	third paragraph below table 7	E	change to "An MDC bit..."	Rejected		MDC stands for "mode data changed"
QTM-53	42	last paragraph	E	change to "An NRSC bit..."	Rejected		NRSC stands for "not ready status changed"
Dell-60	43	7th Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 7	E	change "...resources, the device..." to "...resources, then the device..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-61	43	11th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 7	E	change "...CHECK CONDITION status), the ADC..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status), then the ADC..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-62	43	7th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 7	E	change "...asc and ascq..." to "...ASC and ASCQ..." in SMALL CAPS	Accepted	7a	Dell-62, ENDL-73, HPQ-150, IBM-39, QTM-63, QTM-64
Dell-63	43	7th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 7	T	change "...its..." to "...the..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-64	43	7th Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 7	E	change "...Unit Attention..." to "...unit attention..."	Accepted	7a	IBM-40, QTM-54
Dell-65	43	7th Paragraph, 3rd Sentence after Table 7	E	change "When the additional sense data is NOT READY TO READY..." to "When the additional sense data is set to NOT READY TO READY..."	Accepted	7a	ENDL-76 (used "If" instead of "When" per ENDL-76)
Dell-66	43	NOTE 1	E	BUA bit does not appear to be in SMALL CAPS	Accepted	7a	Dell-66, HPQ-152, QTM-57
Dell-67	43	8th Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 7	T	What does "not valid" mean?	Overtaken by events	7b	ENDL-80 was accepted which caused the sentence to be removed
Dell-68	43	9th Paragraph, 3rd Sentence after Table 7	E	SOCC Does not appear to be in SMALL CAPS.	Accepted	7a	Dell-68, ENDL-82, HPQ-158, QTM-65
ENDL 72	43	1st p on pg, s1	E	if ready state [s/b] if the ready state [or] if ready state information	Accepted	7a	Used "the ready state"
ENDL 73	43	2nd p on pg, s1	E	asc and ascq fields shall contain [s/b] <smallcaps>asc</smallcaps> field and <smallcaps>ascq</smallcaps> field contain	Accepted	7a	Dell-62, HPQ-150, IBM-39, QTM-63, QTM-64

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 74	43	2nd p on pg, s1	T	to be used [s/b] shall be used	Accepted	7a	"that shall be used"
ENDL 75	43	2nd p on pg, last s in p	E	the additional sense data is [s/b] the additional sense data in the <smallcaps>ASC</smallcaps> field and <smallcaps>ASCQ</smallcaps> field is			
ENDL 76	43	2nd p on pg, last s in p	E	When the additional sense data is NOT READY TO READY CHANGE, MEDIUM MAY HAVE CHANGED, it indicates that the remote SMC device server [s/b] If the additional sense data is set to NOT READY TO READY CHANGE, MEDIUM MAY HAVE CHANGED, then the remote SMC device server	Accepted	7a	Dell-65
ENDL 77	43	2nd p on pg, last s in p	E	the remote SMC device server has entered the accessible state [s/b] the remote SMC device sever ready state has transitioned to indicate accessible [for consistency with the wording in 4.2.3.5]			
ENDL 78	43	Note 1, s1	E	A device server responding to a NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command with the BUA bit set to one with GOOD status [s/b] The return of GOOD status for a NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command with the BUA bit set to one	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 79	43	1st p after note 1, s3	E	ASCQ field is not zero [s/b] ASCQ field is not set to zero	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 80	43	1st p after note 1, s1 & s2	E	The first two sentences in this paragraph should be deleted because the replicate information that is more clearly stated in the third sentence.	Accepted	7b	Dell-67, IBM-41
ENDL 81	43	2nd p after note 1, s2	E	Upon receipt of this notification [s/b] Upon receipt of this command			ENDL-62
ENDL 82	43	2nd p after note 1, s3	E	A SOCC bit set to zero indicates [s/b] A <smallcaps>socc</smallcaps> bit set to zero indicates	Accepted	7a	Dell-68, ENDL-82, HPQ-158, QTM-65
ENDL 83	43	2nd p after note 1, last s in p	E	is not cached [s/b] are not cached	Accepted	7a	HPQ-165
ENDL 84	43	4th p after note 1	T	Is this requirement different than those specified for unit attention handling in SAM-3? If yes, justify the difference. If no, remove the paragraph. [N.B. Satisfactory resolution of this comment is required to change the ENDL No vote to Yes.]			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 85	43	5th p after note 1, s1	T	[requirements on application clients should be stated in terms of device server responses] The automation application client shall send the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command when any of the events that the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command reports have occurred. [s/b] The automation application client should send the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command when any of the events that the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command reports have occurred. If the ADC device server does not return GOOD status for all such NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE commands, there is a high probability of errors occurring in information reported by the local SMC device server, RMC device server, and ADC device server.			
HPQ-150	43	2nd paragraph	E	asc and ascq fields should use smallcaps	Accepted	7a	Dell-62, ENDL-73, HPQ-150, IBM-39, QTM-63, QTM-64
HPQ-151	43	NOTE 1	E	is not using the Note paragraph tag	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-152	43	Note 1	E	BUA s/b smallcaps			Dell-66, HPQ-152, QTM-57
HPQ-153	43	Note 1	T	'initiator' s/b 'initiator port' (or maybe I_T nexus?)	Accepted	7c	WG: use "I_T nexus".
HPQ-154	43	2nd paragraph	E	indicates s/b specifies	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-155	43	2nd paragraph	E	remove 'shall' from '...ASC and ASQC fields shall contain...'	Accepted	7a	ENDL-73
HPQ-156	43	5th paragraph	E	indicates s/b specifies	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-157	43	5th paragraph	E	indicates s/b specifies	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-158	43	5th paragraph	E	SOCC should use smallcaps	Accepted	7a	Dell-68, ENDL-82, HPQ-158, QTM-65
HPQ-159	43	2nd paragraph	T	Add a BUA bit set to zero sentence			
HPQ-160	43	2nd paragraph	E	If none of the known I_T nexus is able... s/b "If none of the known I_T nexus are able..."	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-161	43	last 2 paragraph	E	move the last two paragraphs ahead of the table, since they're not related to any of the fields	Accepted	7c	
HPQ-162	43		E	Delete "See SAM-3 for a description of the CONTROL byte." as command descriptions typically never mention that. (or, add it to SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTES so this standard is consistent)	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-163	43	1st paragraph	T	'may' s/b 'shall'. may implies there is permission to do something else - e.g. return CHECK CONDITION? If the bit is ignored while caching is disabled, then it should be ignored while enabled but irrelevant.	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
HPQ-164	43	5th paragraph	T	'may' s/b 'shall'. may implies there is permission to do something else - e.g. return CHECK CONDITION? If the bit is ignored while caching is disabled, then it should be ignored while enabled but irrelevant.	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
HPQ-165	43	5th paragraph	E	'...the remote SMC device server is not cached.' sb '...the remote SMC device server are not cached.'	Accepted	7a	ENDL-83
IBM 38	43	5.2 6th paragraph	E	This << but may ignore the bit if ready state is not cached. >> should be << but may ignore the <<insert name of bit >> bit if ready state is not cached. >>			
IBM 39	43	5.2 7th paragraph	E	The << asc and ascq fields >> are not in small caps and should be << asc field and ascq field >>	Accepted	7a	Dell-62, ENDL-73, HPQ-150, IBM-39, QTM-63, QTM-64
IBM 40	43	5.2 7th paragraph	E	In this statement << able to have a Unit Attention condition established by the device serve >> the unit attention should be not capitalized.	Accepted	7a	Dell-64, QTM-54
IBM 41	43	5.2 1st paragraph	E	after note, This << are both set to one, or if both bits are set to zero and either the ASC field or the ASCQ field is not zero, >> should be << are both set to one or zero and either the ASC field or the ASCQ field is not zero, >>	Rejected		
QTM-54	43	second paragraph	E	Unit Attention s/b unit attention	Accepted	7a	Dell-64, IBM-40
QTM-55	43	second paragraph	E	might help clarify to say "shall terminate the NOTIFY DATA TRANSFER DEVICE command"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-56	43	second paragraph	T	Is ILLEGAL REQUEST right? Wouldn't it be ABORTED?	Rejected		WG: reject
QTM-57	43	third paragraph	E	BUA needs to be small caps	Accepted	7a	Dell-66, HPQ-152, QTM-57
QTM-58	43	second to last paragraph	E	perform s/b "process"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-59	43	second to last paragraph	T	initiator port should be "I_T nexus"	Accepted	7c	WG: accept

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-60	43	second paragraph	E	Change "...indicates that the asc and ascq fields shall contain..." to "...specifies that the ASC field and ASCQ field contain..."			
QTM-61	43	second paragraph	T	change "initiator ports" to "I_T nexus"	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
QTM-62	43	fifth paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "denotes" (2 places)	Rejected		Use "specifies" instead, see HPQ-156 and HPQ-157
QTM-63	43	second paragraph	E	asc -- small caps	Accepted	7a	Dell-62, ENDL-73, HPQ-150, IBM-39, QTM-63, QTM-64
QTM-64	43	second paragraph	E	ascq -- small caps	Accepted	7a	Dell-62, ENDL-73, HPQ-150, IBM-39, QTM-63, QTM-64
QTM-65	43	fifth paragraph	E	SOCC -- small caps, not all caps	Accepted	7a	Dell-68, ENDL-82, HPQ-158, QTM-65
QTM-66	43	fifth paragraph	E	change to "An SOCC bit..."	Rejected		SOCC stands for "supported operation codes changed"
Dell-69	44	Table 8 Byte 1	T	Aren't bit 7-5 reserved and not part of the SERVICE ACTION (1Fh) field?	Accepted	7c	ENDL-89. WG: accept
Dell-70	44	1st Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 8	T	change "The PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field specifies the length in bytes of parameter data contained in the Data-Out Buffer. A parameter list length value of zero indicates that the Data-Out Buffer is empty." to "The PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field specifies the length in bytes of parameter data that shall be transferred from the application client to the device server. A parameter list length value of zero specifies that no data shall be transferred. This shall not be considered and error.." Unless you want to add Data-Out buffer to the definitions.			
Dell-71	44	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 8	T	Remove "This shall cause the attribute specified to be cleared in the device server." If the PARAMETER LIST LENGTH is zero, then what attribute is supposed to be cleared. I assume this was supposed to be the ATTRIBUTE LENGTH as stated in the next section.	Accepted	7c	ENDL-90. WG: remove the sentence.

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-72	44	1st Paragraph, 3rd sentence after Table 8	T	table Y for the attribute specified, Based on the original proposal 05-015r2 this should be Table 12, however since the PARAMETER LIST LENGTH is a defining the length of a list of attributes may be longer that that of one attribute. I suggest removing the sentence or rewording it to say that if the PARAMETER LIST LENGTH exceeds the length of all attributes then CHECK CONDITION	Accepted	7c	Dell-72, ENDL-91, ENDL-92, HPQ-166, IBM-44, QTM-70. WG: remove the sentence and add a sentence that says "A value of zero shall not be considered an error" or something like that.
ENDL 86	44	5.3.1, p1, s1	E	the DT Device [s/b] the ADC device server [unless the intent is to allow SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE to be sent to RMC device servers and/or local SMC device servers, in which case listing the allowed device servers is strongly urged]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 87	44	5.3.1, a,b,c list, entry c	E	to application clients via SCSI commands [s/b] to application clients in response to SCSI commands	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 88	44	5.3.1, a,b,c list, entry d	E	insert a period at the end of this list.	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 89	44	Table 8, byte 1	T	Bits 5,6, and 7 of byte 1 should be reserved. The service action field occupies only bytes 0-4.	Accepted	7c	Dell-69. WG: accept
ENDL 90	44	1st p after table 8, s3	T	This shall cause the attribute specified to be cleared in the device server. [Delete this sentence or clearly demonstrate where the attribute specified is specified, because it is not specified in the CDB and it is not specified in the non-existent parameter data.] [Changing the ENDL No vote to Yes is conditional on the resolution to this comment.]	Accepted	7c	Dell-71. WG: remove the sentence.
ENDL 91	44	1st p after table 8, s4	T	table Y [s/b] table 11 [I guess]	Accepted	7c	Dell-72, ENDL-91, ENDL-92, HPQ-166, IBM-44, QTM-70. WG: remove the sentence.
ENDL 92	44	1st p after table 8, s4	T	[delete]for the attribute specified[because there is no attribute specification except in the parameter data itself]	Accepted	7c	Dell-72, ENDL-91, ENDL-92, HPQ-166, IBM-44, QTM-70. WG: remove the sentence.

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 93	44	1st p after table 8	T	It appears that the intent of this paragraph is to limit the parameter list length to that allowed for a single attribute. If this is truly the intent, then the first sentence of this subclause should have 'attributes' changed to 'an attribute'.	Rejected	7c	WG: remove the 3rd sentence in the paragraph.
HPQ-166	44	1st paragraph after tabel 8	T	table Y s/b something else	Accepted	7c	Dell-72, ENDL-91, ENDL-92, HPQ-166, IBM-44, QTM-70. WG: remove the sentence.
HPQ-167	44	lettered list after table 8	E	in b), delete 'condition'			QTM-71 (contradicts)
IBM 42	44	5.3.1	T	(KB) - Comment - The SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE command should state that host type attributes shall not be modified by this command Solution - Add as paragraph number 2: The SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE command shall not be used to set any of the following attributes: a) host type attributes b) medium type attributes, etc.			
IBM 43	44	5.3.1 1st abc list - item a	E	This << add the attribute to log entries it creates; >> should be << add the attribute to log entries DT device creates; >>	Accepted	7a	Changed to "…to log entries the DT device creates;"
IBM 44	44	1st paragraph after table 8	T	This in statement << If the parameter list length exceeds the maximum length value from table Y for the attribute specified, then >> what is table Y and were is it? Change to a number and crossreference the real table.	Accepted	7c	Dell-72, ENDL-91, HPQ-166, IBM-44, QTM-70. WG: remove the sentence.
QTM-67	44	5.3.1 first paragraph	E	"DT Device" s/b "DT device"	Rejected	7a	Overtaken by ENDL-86
QTM-68	44	5.3.1 item d)	E	Needs a period at end of item.	Accepted	7a	ENDL-88
QTM-69	44	first paragraph after table 8	E	Data-Out Buffer needs a reference (see SAM-3); I think "Buffer" s/b "buffer".			Dell-70
QTM-70	44	first paragraph after table 8	T	table Y s/b "table 11".	Accepted	7c	Dell-72, ENDL-91, HPQ-166, IBM-44, QTM-70. WG: remove the sentence.
QTM-71	44	item b) after table 8	E	s/b "a logical unit reset condition occurs."			HPQ-167 (contradicts)
QTM-72	44	first paragraph after table 8	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-73	45	5.3.2 1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence	E	change "Attributes should be sent in ascending numerical order." to "Medium attributes should be sent in ascending numerical order based on the ATTRIBUTE IDENTIFER field (see 5.3.3)."	Accepted	7a	ENDL-94
Dell-74	45	Table 9	E	change "Medium attribute (first)" to "Medium attribute (first) (see 5.3.3)"			
Dell-75	45	Table 9	E	change "Medium attribute (last)" to "Medium attribute (last) (see 5.3.3)"			
Dell-76	45	1st Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 9	E	change "The PARAMETER DATA LENGTH field should contain the number of bytes of attribute data and shall be ignored by the device server." to "The PARAMETER LIST LENGTH field should contain the number of bytes of attribute data that follow and shall be ignored by the device server." Or change table field to DATA instead of LIST.	Accepted per ENDL-95	7a	Dell-76, ENDL-95, HPQ-169, QTM-73 (change field name in table to match text)
Dell-77	45	2nd Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 9	E	change "The format of the attributes is described in 5.3.3." to "The format of the medium attributes is described in 5.3.3."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-78	45	3rd Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 9	E	change "No attributes shall be changed, the SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE..." to "No medium attributes shall be changed and the SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-79	45	3rd paragraph after table 9	E	LIST, if (add the comma)	Accepted	7a	
Dell-80	45	3rd Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 9, a),b,)c) list	E	change "a) an attribute with incorrect ATTRIBUTE LENGTH field (see 5.3.3) contents; b) an attribute with an unsupported or reserved FORMAT field (see 5.3.3) value; or c) an attribute with unsupported ATTRIBUTE VALUE field (see 5.3.3) contents and a non-zero ATTRIBUTE LENGTH field value." to a) a medium attribute with incorrect ATTRIBUTE LENGTH field (see 5.3.3) contents; b) a medium attribute with an unsupported or reserved FORMAT field (see 5.3.3) value; or c) a medium attribute with unsupported ATTRIBUTE VALUE field (see 5.3.3) contents and a non-zero ATTRIBUTE LENGTH field value."	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-81	45	4th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 9	E	change "If the SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE command parameter data contains an attribute with an ATTRIBUTE LENGTH field (see 5.3.3) set to zero, then one of the following actions shall occur: a) If the attribute is supported, the attribute's value shall be cleared; or b) If the attribute is not supported, the attribute shall be ignored; this shall not be considered an error." to "If the SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE command parameter data contains a medium attribute with an ATTRIBUTE LENGTH field (see 5.3.3) set to zero, then one of the following actions shall occur: a) the medium attribute's value shall be cleared, if the medium attribute is supported;or b) the medium attribute shall be ignored and this shall not be considered an error, if the attribute is not supported.			IBM-45
ENDL 100	45	5.3.2, 1st a,b,c list, entry a	T	an attribute with incorrect ATTRIBUTE LENGTH field (see 5.3.3) contents [s/b] an attribute length that exceeds the value shown in table 11 [5.3.3 does not define an incorrect attribute length.]	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
ENDL 94	45	5.3.2, p1, s1	E	should be sent [s/b] should be listed	Accepted	7a	Dell-73
ENDL 95	45	Table 9, bytes 0-3	E	PARAMETER LIST LENGTH [s/b] PARAMETER DATA LENGTH [to match the descriptive text and avoid name conflicts with the CDB field]	Accepted	7a	Dell-76, ENDL-95, HPQ-169, QTM-73
ENDL 96	45	Table 9, bytes 0-3	T	(n-4) [s/b] (n-3)	Accepted	7a	HPQ-168
ENDL 97	45	1st p after table 9, s1	E	of attribute data [s/b] of attribute data that follow [or] of medium attributes that follow	Accepted	7a	of attributre data that follow
ENDL 98	45	2nd p after table 9	E	the attributes [s/b] each medium attribute	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 99	45	5.3.2	E	All of the references to 5.3.3 on this page are hardcoded. None are electronic cross references. This should be corrected to avoid future errors.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-168	45	Table 9	T	n-4 s/b n-3	Accepted	7a	ENDL-96
HPQ-169	45	1st paragraph after table 9	E	DATA s/b LIST	Accepted per ENDL-95	7a	Dell-76, ENDL-95, HPQ-169, QTM-73
HPQ-170	45	1st paragraph after table 9	T	Delete "and shall be ignored by the device server." It is very important that the device server only parse the data received up to this limit. If the transport protocol delivered more data than requested, it shouldn't be interpreting the excess.	Accepted	7c	QTM-76. WG: accept

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
IBM 45	45	5.3.2 Last a.b.c, list item b	E	This << the attribute shall be ignored; this shall not be considered an error. >> should be << the attribute shall be ignored and shall not be considered an error. >>			Dell-81
QTM-73	45	table 9	E	The table has "parameter list length" as the field, but the paragraph has "parameter data length". Which is it?	Accepted per ENDL-95	7a	Dell-76, ENDL-95, HPQ-169, QTM-73
QTM-74	45	third paragraph after table 9	E	remove the second and third commas	Accepted	7a	
QTM-75	45	last paragraph	E	remove "(see 5.3.3)" as the reference was already provided in list item a) above.	Accepted	7a	
QTM-76	45	first paragraph after table 9	T	Why'd we put in a field and require that it be ignored? [rehetorical question]	Rejected	7c	HPQ-170, WG: accept HPQ-170.
Dell-82	46	1st Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 10	E	change "The ATTRIBUTE IDENTIFIER indicates the medium attribute to be set." to "The ATTRIBUTE IDENTIFIER field specifies the medium attribute to be set."	Accepted	7a	HPQ-177, QTM-77
Dell-83	46	Table 11	T	change "Attribute identifier" to "Code" And this is a 2 byte field, so below make 0000h - FFFFh.	Accepted	7c	HPQ-172, WG: accept, make VS range FF80h to FFFFh
Dell-84	46	1st Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 12	E	change "The ATTRIBUTE VALUE field contains the intended value of the attribute." to "The ATTRIBUTE VALUE field contains the intended value of the medium attribute."	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 101	46	1st p after table 10, s2	E	can [s/b] may	Accepted	7a	IBM-46
HPQ-171	46	Table 12	E	Format s/b Code	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-172	46	Table 11	E	Attribute identifier s/b Code	Accepted	7a	Dell-83
HPQ-173	46	Table 12 caption	E	remove 'values'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-174	46	Table 11 caption	E	remove 'values'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-175	46	Table 11	E	use horizontal double line after header	Accepted	7a	IBM-47
HPQ-176	46	Table 12	E	use horizontal double line after header	Accepted	7a	IBM-48
HPQ-177	46	1st paragraph after tabel 10	E	'ATTRIBUTE IDENTIFIER indicates' s/b 'ATTRIBUTE IDENTIFIER field indicates'	Accepted	7a	Dell-82, QTM-77
IBM 46	46	5.3.3 2nd paragraph	T	This << Table 11 describes the attributes that can be set by the SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE command. >> should be << Table 11 describes the attributes that may be set by the SET MEDIUM ATTRIBUTE command. >>	Accepted	7a	ENDL-101

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
IBM 47	46	Table 11	E	There needs to be a double line between the heading and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-175
IBM 48	46	Table 12	E	There needs to be a double line between the heading and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-176
QTM-77	46	first paragraph after table 10	E	s/b "The ATTRIBUTE IDENTIFIER field specifies the medium attribute (see table 11) to be set."			Dell-82, HPQ-177
QTM-78	46	first paragraph after table 11	E	s/b "The FORMAT field specifies the format (see table 12) of the data in the attribute value field."			
QTM-79	46		T	What happens if I set the attribute identifier to 00h (i.e., volume identifier) and the format to 00b (i.e., binary)? Table 11 specifies that the format is ASCII.	Accepted	7c	WG: add to the first list on page 45 "d) an attribute with a value in the FORMAT field that does not match the value specified in table 11 for the attribute identifier".
QTM-80	46	first paragraph after table 10	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7a	Dell-82, HPQ-177
Dell-85	47		E	Remove extra space between Section 6 header and 6.1 header	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 102	47	Table 13, heading	E	Page Code [s/b] Page code [for consistency with table 6]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 103	47	Table 13, heading	E	Required [s/b] Support requirement	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-178	47	Table 13	T	SPC-4 log page code list needs to mark ADC as supporting pages 01h+ that are defined in SPC-4. Currently it only lists page 00h and the ADC-specific pages.			This comment is requesting a change to SPC-4, not ADC-2.
HPQ-179	47	Table 13	E	Self-test s/b Self-Test	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-180	47	Table 13	E	Supported log pages s/b Supported Log Pages log page	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-181	47	Table 13	T	Add a subpage column	Rejected		log subpages were introduced in SPC-4. WG: reject
Dell-86	48	Table 13 row "15h Service Buffers Information log page Optional"	T	Make Reference column 6.1.5	Accepted	7a	ENDL-105, HPQ-183, QTM-81

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-87	48	1st Paragraph after Table 13	E	The paragraph contains an i.e. that is a sentence and 1/2?			
Dell-88	48	1st Sentence after Table 14	E	change "See SPC-3 for a description of the PAGE CODE and PAGE LENGTH fields." to "See SPC-3 for a description of the PAGE CODE field and PAGE LENGTH field."	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 104	48	Table 13, page 2 of 2	E	Column headers should appear on every page. [Changing the ENDL No vote to Yes is contingent on this correction.]	Accepted	7a	HPQ-182, QTM-82
ENDL 105	48	6.1.1, Service Buffers Information row	E	Insert 6.1.5 in the Reference column	Accepted	7a	Dell-86, HPQ-183, QTM-81
HPQ-182	48	Table 13	E	Include table header on each page	Accepted	7a	ENDL-104, QTM-82
HPQ-183	48	Table 13	T	add 6.1.5 in references column for row 15h	Accepted	7a	Dell-86, ENDL-105, QTM-81
HPQ-184	48	Table 14	T	Byte 0 bit 7 is DS. Byte 0 bit 6 is SPF (0). Byte 1 is SUBPAGE CODE (00h).	Rejected		log subpages were introduced in SPC-4. WG: reject.
HPQ-185	48	Table 13	T	How about the General Statistics and Performance log pages 19h/00h-1Fh from SPC-4?	Rejected		log subpages were introduced in SPC-4. WG: reject.
HPQ-186	48	Table 13	T	How about Protocol Specific Port log page 18h?	Accepted	7c	WG: accept.
QTM-81	48	table 13 page 15h	E	Needs reference for this log page. Add reference 6.1.5	Accepted	7a	Dell-86, ENDL-105, HPQ-183
QTM-82	48	table 13	E	Should we repeat the column titles here?	Accepted	7a	ENDL-104, HPQ-182
Dell-89	49	Table 16	E	change "TMC (0)" to "TMC (00)"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-90	49	5th Paragraph after Table 16	E	Move this paragraph below after Table 17. "A DT device initialized (DINIT) bit set to one indicates that the DT device is able to return valid very high frequency data. A DINIT bit set to zero indicates DT device initialization is required or incomplete. The DINIT bit should be set to one before relying on any other bits in the very high frequency data log parameter."	Accepted	7a	QTM-83
Dell-91	49	Table 15	T	Row "0100h - 0200h" Should this not be 0101h-200h?	Accepted	7c	WG: accepted, make 100h "obsolete".
ENDL 106	49	3rd p after table 16, s1	E	The PARAMETER LENGTH field shall be set to 04h to allow transfer of the complete parameter. [s/b] The PARAMETER LENGTH field shall be set to 04h.	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 107	49	4th p after table 16, s2	E	the DT device initialized [s/b] the DT device was initialized			I don't think so
ENDL 108	49	4th p after table 16, s2	T	RE: Returned data shall reflect the last known values since the DT device initialized. I do not understand the relationship between the 'last known values' and DT device initialization. It seems like the last known values are invariant with respect to initialization (i.e., last known is last known is last known). This might intend to say the last known values before the last DT device initialization, but that seem weird. This might intend to say that if the values are not known since DT device initialization, then the last known values prior to initialization are used. In any case, some clarification is needed.	Accepted	7c	WG: remove the sentence.
ENDL 109	49	1st p after note 2, last s in p	T	The DINIT bit should be set to one before relying on any other bits in the very high frequency data log parameter. [s/b] If the DINIT bit is set to zero, then the values of other bits in the very high frequency data log parameter are indeterminate. [Alternatively, explain how the DINIT bit can before ...]	Accepted	7c	WG: accept, but run this together with the existing second sentence.
HPQ-187	49	Table 16/17	T	Move all the bits in table 17 into table 16 and get rid of the "VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR field" level. Just treat the bits as being the log parameter.	Rejected		We need the VHF data descriptor to be in a separate table so it can be referenced by ADT
OVRL-1	49	Table 15	E	5th entry under Parameter code <0201h-07FFFH> sb <0201h-07FFFh>	Accepted	7b	
QTM-83	49	last paragraph	E	This paragraph should appear below table 17.	Accepted	7a	Dell-90
Dell-92	50	5th Paragraph, 3rd Sentence after Table 17	E	change "...one, the ADC..." to "...one, then the ADC..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-93	50	5th Paragraph, 4th Sentence after Table 17	E	change "supported the MACC" to "supported, then the MACC"	Accepted	7b	
Dell-94	50	2nd to last paragraph	E	change "PREVENT/ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL" to "PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL"	Accepted	7a	HPQ-189
Dell-95	50	2nd to last paragraph	E	change "PREVENT/ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL" to "PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL"	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-96	50	8th Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 17	E	change "with a status of GOOD, however" to "with a GOOD status, however"	Accepted	7a	Changed to "with GOOD status, however"
ENDL 110	50	1st p after table 17, s3	T	RE: The CRQRD bit shall take priority over the CRQST bit. [Clarify 'shall take priority over'. Priority for whom (device server or application client)? Priority in what sense (beyond the 'normal operation may not be possible' situation already stated)? Since other statements in this paragraph make it clear that both bits may be set, the intent of this 'priority' is unfathomable.	Accepted	7c	WG: remove the sentence.
ENDL 111	50	3rd p after table 17, s1 & s2	E	any currently present medium [s/b] the current medium [two instances in this paragraph]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 112	50	2nd p after note 3, s1	E	Medium Auxiliary Memory (MAM) [s/b] MAM [because MAM is defined in 3.2]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 113	50	1st p after note 4, s1	E	command set standard [s/b] command standard	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-188	50	2nd to last paragraph	T	PREVENT/ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL command (see SPC-3 or the relevant command set standard). The PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL command was booted from SPC-4 into individual command set standards, so SPC-n is not a good reference any more.	Rejected		HPQ-195, WG: We are OK for now referenceing SPC-3, this is preferable to changing the referene SSC-3 which carries with it a specific RMC.
HPQ-189	50	2nd to last paragraph	E	PREVENT/ALLOW s/b PREVENT ALLOW	Accepted	7a	Dell-94
HPQ-190	50	6.1.2.2 (and global)	E	Refer to bits/fields in left-to-right, top-to-bottom order	Accepted	7c	
HPQ-191	50	HIU paragraph, 1st sentence	E	drive s/b DT device	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-192	50	HIU paragraph, 2nd sentence	E	drive s/b DT device	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-193	50	MACC paragraph	E	drives s/b DT devices	Accepted	7a	
Dell-97	51	5th Paragraph, 4th Sentence after Table 17	E	change "with a CHECK CONDITON with the" to "with a CHECK CONDITON status with the"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-98	51	NOTE 6	E	change "PREVENT/ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL" to "PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL"	Accepted	7a	HPQ-196
Dell-99	51	NOTE 5	E	change "...with a status of GOOD to a" to "...with GOOD status to a"	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 114	51	1st p after note 6	T	What does 'the remaining bits within byte 1' mean? All other bits in byte 1? All the bits to the left in byte 1, to the right? This statement is open to any convenient interpretation by the reader. It would be best to create a name for the bits as a collection, explicitly identify each bit in the collection and use the collective name thereafter.	Accepted	7c	WG: change to "all other bits in byte 1".
HPQ-194	51	Note 6	E	RAA should be in smallcaps	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-195	51	Note 6	T	The PREVENT ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL command was booted from SPC-4 into individual command set standards, so SPC-n is not a good reference any more.	Rejected		HPQ-188, WG: reject.
HPQ-196	51	Note 6	E	PREVENT/ALLOW s/b PREVENT ALLOW	Accepted	7a	Dell-98
QTM-84	51	second paragraph	E	change to "An MTHRD bit..."	Rejected		MTHRD stands for "medium threaded"
QTM-85	51	forth paragraph	E	change to "An MSTD bit..."	Rejected		MSTD stands for "medium seated"
QTM-86	51	fifth paragraph	E	change to "An MPRSNT bit..."	Rejected		MPRSNT stands for "medium present"
QTM-87	51	sixth paragraph	E	change to "An RAA bit..."	Rejected		RAA stands for "robotics access allowed"
ADI-1	52	Table 18	T	Add information about the encryption status of the data flowing to or from the medium to the DT DEVICE ACTIVITY field	Accepted	7c	Proposal T10/06-226r1
HPQ-197	52	TAFC paragraph, 6th sentence	T	I'm not sure what this sentence means. Who does the processing, the ADC device server or the automation application client? If it's the ADC device server, then this sentence contradicts the first sentence in the paragraph which limits setting TAFC to one when 'at least one TapeAlert state flag has changed ... since the last retrieval of the ... log page ....'	Accepted	7c	WG: remove the sentence.
HPQ-198	52	INTFC paragraph, 1st sentence	Q	Does this mean the INTFC bit should not be set until after the I_T nexus has retrieved the DT device primary port status log page for the first time?			
HPQ-199	52	Table 18	E	Value s/b Code	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-200	52	Table 18 caption	E	Delete "values"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-201	52	TAFC paragraph, last sentence	T	VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR s/b VHF log parameter (if change in 6.1.2.2 is accepted)	Accepted mostly	7b	"VHF data descriptor (see 6.1.2.2)"

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-202	52		E	Capitalization of "DT device primary port status log parameters" is inconsistent	Accepted	7a	lower case used
WG-1	52	Table 18	T	Add Encrypting field in VHF data	Accepted	7c	T10/06-226r1
Dell-100	53	NOTE 8	T	...(see ADT-2) the... to "...(see ADT-2), then the..." Additionally NOTE 8 makes no sense to me, as indicates that vendor-specific log parameters or formats may be available?			IBM-49
Dell-101	53	Table 19	E	change "TMC (0)" to "TMC (00)"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-203	53	last sentence	T	automation device s/b automation application client	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
HPQ-204	53	last sentence	E	'another' s/b 'the... again.'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-205	53	6.12.3	T	There should be some mention in the model clause (4.xx) that application clients should use the polling delay log parameter.			
IBM 49	53	6.1.2.2	T	(KB) - Comment - VS (in VHF data)? I do not see much explanation other than in Note 8. Solution - Explain this in greater detail. I interpret this as a static condition.			Dell-100
IBM 50	53	NOTE 8	T	This note << When the VS bit is set to one, vendor-specific log parameters may appear in a standard log page (e.g. the vendor-specific parameters in the Error Counter log pages, see SPC-3) or in a vendor-specific log page. If the device includes an ADT port (see ADT-2) the application client may be able to retrieve vendor-specific log parameters using the vendor-specific protocol of ADT-2. >> should be normative text not a note.			May need to remove this sentence now that ADT port is no longer defined.
QTM-88	53	note 8	E	(e.g. the... s/b "(e.g., the..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-102	54	Table 20	E	change "TMC (0)" to "TMC(00)"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-103	54	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 20	E	change "...port, the PARAMETER CODE value..." to "...port, the parameter code value..."	Accepted	7a	also in the 3rd sentence in that paragraph

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
ENDL 115	54	6.1.2.4.1	T	Other than parameter length, how does the application client differentiate between the various DT device primary port status data options that might appear in a DT device primary port status log parameter? Whatever mechanism is used needs to be documented. [This comment must be satisfactorily resolved before the ENDL No vote will change to Yes.]	Accepted	7c	WG: add a sentence to the last paragraph in 6.1.2.4.1 "The DT device primary port status data is determined by the protocol of the port with which the parameter is associated. The protocol for each port is reported in the PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field in the DT Device Primary Port mode subpage (see 6.2.2.3) by relative target port value. Based on the reported protocol for each relative target port, the DT device primary port status data shall be determined by table X" Add a table with 3 columns, one with the protocol values, one with a description, and one with a reference to the subclause describing the log parameter for that protocol.
HPQ-206	54	Table 21	T	Since there is a length field covering this structure, expand it to include the Node_Name and Port_Name as well.			ER: accepting proposals for this
HPQ-207	54	6.1.2.4.1 last paragraph	E	are s/b is	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-208	54	6.1.2.4.1	T	The PARAMETER CODE numbering rules imply that relative ports must be numbered from 01h to FFh. SCSI architecture defines the relative port identifier as being 2 bytes long, however. ADC ought to avoid placing artificial restrictions. The full range could be accommodated by defining a new page (subpage format is fine) just for DT Device Status, and letting the parameter code be equal to the relative port identifier.			ER: this might not be a bad idea because it would also allow us to add a protocol type field to the structure, see ENDL-115.
QTM-89	54	third paragraph below table 20	E	Change "specifies" to "contains"	Accepted	7b	
Dell-104	55		E	...CURRENT SPEED... to "...CURRENT SPEED field..."	Accepted	7a	HPQ-209
HPQ-209	55	5th paragraph	E	'...values for CURRENT SPEED.' s/b '...values for the CURRENT SPEED field.'	Accepted	7a	Dell-89
HPQ-210	55	4th paragraph	T	FCP-2 s/b FCP-3	Accepted	7b	QTM-90
HPQ-211	55	5th paragraph	E	'...bit rate in which...' s/b '...bit rate at which...'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-212	55	5th paragraph	E	operating currently' s/b 'currently operating'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-213	55	6th paragraph	E	indicates s/b indicates that (2 places)	Accepted	7a	
QTM-90	55	forth paragraph	T	Change "...process login (PRLI) with the DT device (see FCP-2)..." to "... Process Login (see FCP-3) with the DT device..."	Accepted	7b	HPQ-210
QTM-91	55	forth paragraph	E	change to "An LC bit..."			
HPQ-214	56	6.1.2.4.4	T	In SAS, "ports" don't perform link reset sequences and have negotiated physical link rates - phys do. A port is a group of phys that all have the same SAS address (e.g. A) and are attached to another set of phys that all have the same SAS address (e.g. B).			
HPQ-215	56	SIGNAL paragraph	T	I don't think this bit belongs here. SAS OOB signals are not long-lived; the chances are low that this log parameter would be read while the OOB signal is being received. If this is persistent after reception, then what is the purpose of it? SAS state machines are not architected to pass "COMINIT detected" up to the management application layer for use in this manner.			
HPQ-216	56	6.1.2.4.4 (and global)	E	Field/bit paragraphs should be presented in order of their positions in the table: left-to-right, top-to-bottom.	Accepted	7c	
HPQ-217	56	PIC paragraph	T	speed negotiation and the identification sequence s/b "the link reset sequence"			

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-218	56	PIC paragraph	T	receive an Open address frame. s/b "accept connection requests"			
HPQ-219	56	4th paragraph after table 23	T	hashed version of the SAS address There is a length field covering this data structure so it need not be crammed into 4 bytes. Use the complete 8-byte SAS address, not the hashed version.	Accept	7c	WG: add an 8 byte field after the HASHED SAS ADDRESS field to contain the SAS ADDRESS.
QTM-92	56	second paragraph below table 23	T	Need a reference for COMINIT. Is this really an example, or should it be an "i.e.,"?			
QTM-93	56	forth paragraph below table 23	E	Move reference to SAS-1.1 to after "SAS address"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-105	57	Table 24	E	change "TMC (0)" to "TMC (00)"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-220	57	Table 24	T	Byte 0 bit 7 is DS, Byte 0 bit 6 is SPF (0), Byte 1 is SUBPAGE CODE (00h)	Rejected		log subpages were introduced in SPC-4. WG: reject.
QTM-94	57	6.1.3	T	Should there be a reference to SSC-2 for a description of the TapeAlert flags?	Rejected		WG: reject.
QTM-95	57	last paragraph	E	Change "specifies" to "indicates" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
Dell-106	58	6.1.4.2	E	Move text below to after Table 27 "See SPC-3 for descriptions of the DU bit, DS bit, TSD bit, ETC bit, TMC field, LBIN bit, and LP bit. These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown in table 27. The PARAMETER LENGTH field indicates the number of recovery procedure bytes that follow. The PARAMETER CODE field shall be set to 0000h to indicate the recovery procedures log parameter. The recovery procedures specify a list of recovery procedures (see table 28) listed in order from the most preferred to the least preferred procedure. When multiple recovery procedures are available, the most preferred procedure shall be the first in the list (i.e., in byte 4), and the other procedures listed in decreasing order of preference. The automation device may select any recovery procedure, regardless of position in the list."	Accepted	7a	QTM-96, HPQ-221
HPQ-221	58	6.1.4.2	E	Table 27 should be after the first sentence in 6.1.4.2, not at the top of the next page.	Accepted	7a	QTM-96, Dell-106

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-222	58	Table 25	T	Byte 0 bit 7 is DS, Byte 0 bit 6 is SPF (0), Byte 1 is SUBPAGE CODE (00h)	Rejected		log subpages were introduced in SPC-4. WG: reject.
QTM-96	58		E	The last 4 paragraphs belong below table 27	Accepted	7a	Dell-106, HPQ-221
QTM-97	58	last paragraph	E	Change "specify" to "indicate"	Almost accepted	7a	The recovery procedures list contain recovery…
Dell-107	59	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after table 27	E	change "...procedure, an appropriate..." to "...procedure, then an appropriate..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-108	59	Table 27	E	change "TMC (0)" to "TMC (00)"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-223	59	1st paragraph after table 27	E	of the VHF DATA DESCRIPTOR field' s/b 'in the VHF data descriptor' or, if change in 6.1.2.2 is accepted, in the VHF log parameter	Accepted	7b	"in the VHF data descriptor (see 6.1.2.2)"
Dell-109	60	2nd Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 28	E	change "...medium, the automation..." to "...medium, then the automation..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-110	60	5th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 28	E	change "...(i.e., Do not insert medium), a non-recoverable..." to "...(i.e., Do not insert medium), then a non-recoverable..."	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-224	60	1st paragraph after table 28	E	'bit' s/b 'bit in the VHF data descriptor' or, if the 6.1.2.2 change is accepted, 'bit in the VHF log parameter'	Accepted	7b	"in the VHF data descriptor (see 6.1.2.2)"
HPQ-225	60	last paragraph	E	'bit' s/b 'bit in the VHF data descriptor' or, if the 6.1.2.2 change is accepted, 'bit in the VHF log parameter'	Accepted	7b	"in the VHF data descriptor"
HPQ-226	60	2nd paragraph after table 28	E	'may cause' s/b 'causes'. There is no granting of permission here.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-227	60	Table 28	T	Change 'Logical Unit Reset request' to 'LOGICAL UNIT RESET task management function' if that's what it means	Accetped	7a	
QTM-98	60	table 28 row 04h	E	Should all the LOAD and UNLOAD statements really be LOAD UNLOAD command with the load bit set to zero (or one)? Also appears in the text below the table. Would also need a reference to SSC-2 somewhere.			
Dell-111	61	6th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after table 28	E	change "...organization), a non-recoverable..." to "...organization), then a non-recoverable..."	Accepted	7b	
HPQ-228	61	Table 29	E	use horizontal double line after header	Accepted	7a	IBM-53

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-229	61	1st paragraph	E	'bit' s/b 'bit in the VHF data descriptor' or, if the 6.1.2.2 change is accepted, 'bit in the VHF log parameter'	Accepted	7b	"bit in the VHF data descriptor (see 6.1.2.2)"
IBM 51	61	6.1.4.2 Last paragraph	E	The term << subsequently >> is not needed and should be deleted.	Accepted	7a	
IBM 52	61	6.1.5	T	(KB) - Comment - Not sure the intent of Service Buffers. Also, are Service Buffers provided by the remote or local device server. Solution - Explain the a) intent and b) life cycle of the service buffer. This should link to Recovery Procedure 0Eh (retrieve a DT device error log)			
IBM 53	61	Table 29	E	There needs to be a double line between the heading and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-228
QTM-100	61	table 29	E	bytes 4-n s/b "Service buffers information log parameters"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-101	61	6.1.5 first paragraph	E	The second sentence is incomplete. Fix this by concatenating the two sentences as follows: "The Service Buffers Information log page (see table 29) describes the service buffers that are available from the device server that may be retrieved via a READ BUFFER command (see SPC-3)."	Accepted	7a	
QTM-99	61	6.1.5 second paragraph	E	Service buffers Information s/b "Service Buffers Information"	Rejected		QTM-100 contradicts
Dell-112	62	Table 30	E	change "TMC (0)" to "TMC (00)"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-113	62		E	Should the buffer ID in this subclause be changed to "...identified by the contents of the BUFFER ID field..."	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
HPQ-230	62	Table 31	E	use horizontal double line after header	Accepted	7a	
QTM-102	62	third from last paragraph	E	This paragraph reads very awkwardly. Suggest rewording to "A no medium present (NMP) bit set to one indicates that the device server is unable to retrieve the service buffer identified by the buffer ID when medium is present in the DT device (see 4.2.4). A NMP bit set to zero indicates that the device server is able to retrieve the service buffer identified by the buffer ID when medium is present in the DT device."			
QTM-103	62	second from last paragraph	E	Same suggested re-wording as for the NMP paragraph.			
QTM-104	62	last paragraph	E	Same suggested re-wording as for the NMP paragraph.			
QTM-105	62	second paragraph after table 31	E	Change "specifies" to "contains"	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-106	62	third from last paragraph	E	change to "An NMP bit..."	Rejected		NMP stands for "no medium present"
QTM-107	62	second from last paragraph	E	change to "An NMM bit..."	Rejected		NMM stands for "no medium mounted"
QTM-108	63	third paragraph	E	concerning s/b "describing"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-109	63	first paragraph	E	Same suggested re-wording as for the NMP paragraph.			
ENDL 116	64	Table 32, heading	E	Page Code [s/b] Page code [for consistency with table 6]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 117	64	Table 32, heading	E	Mode Page Name [s/b] Description [left aligned] [for consistency with table 13]	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-231	64	Table 32	T	Add column for sub-pages.	Accepted	7c	QTM-111, WG: accept
HPQ-232	64	Table 32	T	Add the Control Extension mode sub-page to the list of pages. Consider adding the Power Condition mode page to the list of supported pages. SPC-3 defines both of these pages as common to all device types.	Accepted	7c	QTM-112, WG: accept
HPQ-233	64	Table 32	E	Add "mode page" after each mode page name in this table	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-234	64	6.2 subclause heading	E	Parameters s/b parameters	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-235	64	Table 32	T	Mark mode page 15h/00h as restricted and 15h/01h-FFh as reserved	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
HPQ-236	64	Table 32	E	(valid only for the MODE SENSE command) Convert into a table footnote	Accepted	7a	
QTM-110	64	table 32 last row	E	need ref to SPC-3 after MODE SENSE command	Accepted	7a	moved to footnote per HPQ-236
QTM-111	64	table 32	T	Reformat this table to include a Subpage Code column (see table 244 in SPC3r23).	Accepted	7c	HPQ-231, WG: accept
QTM-112	64	table 32	T	Add Control extension (0Ah/01h) page from SPC-3	Accepted	7c	HPQ-232, WG: accepted
QTM-113	64	table 32	E	Border lines look inconsistent, i.e., thin-thin on left, thick-thick on bottom, thick-thin on top and right.	Rejected		source file is OK
Dell-114	65	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 33.	E	change "These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown table 33." to "The SPF bit and PAGE CODE field shall be set to the values shown table 33."	Accepted	7a	QTM-116
HPQ-237	65	Table 34	T	Include 00h and All others in the table if it remains	Overtaken by events		QTM-114, WG: remove the table per HPQ-238.

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-238	65	6.2.2 (and global change to align with the new names)	T	Get rid of the ADC Device Server Configuration mode page level. Don't refer to the subpages as such; promote them to be referred to as mode pages in their own right. 0Eh/00h Reserved (only mentioned in 6.2.1). 0Eh/01h DT Device Target Device mode page. 0Eh/02h DT Device Primary Port mode page. 0Eh/03h DT Device Logical Unit mode page. 0Eh/04h DT Device Target Device Serial Number mode page. 0Eh/05h-FFh Reserved (only mentioned in 6.2.1).	Accepted	7c	QTM-117, QTM-118, WG: remove the subclasue (6.2.2.1). Move the paragraph immediately following table 34 to a footnote in table 32 and apply it to the 4 subpages currently defined in table 34.
QTM-114	65	table 34	T	Need table entries for code values 00h and 05h-FFh.	Overtaken by events		HPQ-237, WG: remove table per HPQ-238
QTM-115	65	last paragraph	E	Need ref to SPC-3 after MODE SELECT command	Accepted	7a	
QTM-116	65	first paragraph after table 33	T	The PS bit in table 33 does not have a value shown, but the paragraph below the table states that it shall be set to the value shown in the table.	Accepted	7a	Dell-114
QTM-117	65	table 34	T	After converting table 32 to include a subpage column, this table can be merged into it.	Accetped	7c	HPQ-231, QTM-111, WG: see HPQ-238
QTM-118	65	6.2.2.1	T	After converting table 32 to include a subpage column, this subclause can be eliminated.	Accepted	7c	HPQ-231, HPQ-238, QTM-111, WG: see HPQ-238
QTM-119	65	table 33	E	Border lines	Rejected		
QTM-120	65	table 34	E	Border lines	Rejected		
Dell-115	66	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 35	E	change "These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown table 35." to "The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to the values shown table 35."	Accepted	7a	QTM-121
HPQ-239	66	first paragraph after table 35	E	'shown' s/b 'shown in'	Accepted	7a	
QTM-121	66	first paragraph after table 35	T	The PS bit in table 35 does not have a value shown, but the paragraph below the table states that it shall be set to the value shown in the table.	Accepted	7a	Dell-115

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-116	67	Table 36 - MTDN field Row 01b for MODE SELECT	T	Use the logical unit identifier for logical unit 0 as the DT device SCSI target device name. The identification descriptors shall be ignored. The text above would conflict with SAS, in that the DEVICE NAME shall be unique from the SAS PORT ID and LOGICAL UNIT name?			
ENDL 118	67	Table 36	E	Add a period at the end of table footnote a.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-240	67	Table 36	T	"The MTDN field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE command." Not if the MODE SENSE command is for changeable value!			
HPQ-241	67	Table 36	E	use horizontal double line before footer	Accepted	7a	IBM-54
HPQ-242	67	1st paragraph after table 36	E	'ASSOCIATION field set to 10b' s/b 'ASSOCIATION field set to 10b (i.e., target device)'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-243	67	Table 36	E	Combine common cells	Accepted	7c	
HPQ-244	67	Table 36	T	Delete "Use the logical unit identifier for logical unit 0 as the DT device SCSI target device name. The identification descriptors shall be ignored." Per SAM, a multi-ported device might need to have separate device names per transport protocol. This would let that rule be violated. Per SAM, a transport protocol may demand a certain format for "its" device name. This would let that rule be violated.			IBM-55
HPQ-245	67	6.2.2.2	T	Add: "For the MODE SELECT command, if the identification descriptor list does not include the same number of identification descriptors with the same set of protocol identifiers as reported in the Device Identification VPD page, the device server shall terminate the command with CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST."			
IBM 54	67	Table 36	E	There needs to be a double line between the footing and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-241
IBM 55	67	Table 36 row 2	E	This << Use the logical unit identifier for logical unit 0 as the DT device SCSI target device name. >> should be << Use the logical unit identifier for LUN zero as the DT device SCSI target device name. >>			HPQ-244

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-117	68	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 37	E	change "These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown table 37." to "The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field and SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to the values shown table 37."	Accepted	7a	QTM-122
Dell-118	68	Table 38	T	change "RELATIVE TARGET PORT" to "RELATIVE TARGET PORT IDENTIFER" if you are going to reference SPC-3.			Dell-120, HPQ-248
Dell-119	68	Table 38	T	Why is the PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field a byte instead of a nibble?	Accepted	7c	QTM-124, WG: convert to 4 bits, make upper 4 bits reserved.
HPQ-246	68	1st paragraph after table 37	E	'shown' s/b 'shown in'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-247	68	1st paragraph	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-248	68	6.2.2.3.2	T	RELATIVE TARGET PORT field. SCSI architecture defines a two-byte relative target port value, not one-byte. ADC ought to avoid imposing artificial restrictions. I suggest increasing this to two bytes (make the header 8 bytes long).			Dell-118, Dell-120
QTM-122	68	first paragraph after table 37	T	The PS bit in table 37 does not have a value shown, but the paragraph below the table states that it shall be set to the value shown in the table.	Accepted	7a	Dell-117
Dell-120	69	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 38	T	change "RELATIVE TARGET PORT field" to "RELATIVE TARGET PORT IDENTIFIER field"			Dell-118, HPQ-248

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-121	69	1st Paragraph after Table 39	E	change "A DT device receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled DT device primary port, where the command attempts to change the value of the MPN, LIV, RHA, TOPLOCK, P2P, SPEED, SPDLOCK, FC-AL LOOP ID, or PORT NAME fields, shall return CHECK CONDITION. The sense key shall be ILLEGAL REQUEST, and the additional sense code shall be INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST. If the DT device primary port is disabled, the DT device may change the MPN, LIV, RHA, TOPLOCK, P2P, SPEED, SPDLOCK, FC-AL LOOP ID, or PORT NAME fields and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command." to "A DT device receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled DT device primary port, where the command attempts to change the value of the MPN field, LIV bit, RHA bit, TOPLOCK bit , P2P bit, SPEED field, SPDLOCK bit, FC-AL LOOP ID field, or PORT NAME field, shall return CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST. If the DT device primary port is disabled, then the DT device may change the MPN field, LIV bit, RH	Accepted	7a	IBM-56
HPQ-249	69	2nd paragraph	T	Add: "For the MODE SELECT command, if the protocol identifier specified by the PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field does not match the protocol of the target port specified by the RELATIVE TARGET PORT field, the device server shall terminate the command with CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST."	Accepted	7c	WG: agree
IBM 56	69	6.2.2.3.3 2nd paragraph	E	This << attempts to change the value of the MPN, LIV, RHA, TOPLOCK, P2P, SPEED, SPDLOCK, FC-AL LOOP ID, or PORT NAME fields, shall return CHECK CONDITION. >> should be << attempts to change the value of the MPN field, LIV bit, RHA bit, TOPLOCK bit, P2P bit, SPEED field, SPDLOCK bit, FC-AL LOOP ID field, or PORT NAME field, shall return CHECK CONDITION. >>	Accepted	7a	Dell-121

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
IBM 57	69	6.2.2.3.3 2nd paragarph	E	This << the DT device may change the MPN, LIV, RHA, TOPLOCK, P2P, SPEED, SPDLOCK, FC-AL LOOP ID, or PORT NAME fields and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command. >> should be << the DT device may change the MPN field, LIV bit, RHA bit, TOPLOCK bit, P2P bit, SPEED field, SPDLOCK bit, FC-AL LOOP ID field, or PORT NAME field and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command. >>	Accepted	7a	Dell-121
QTM-123	69	first paragraph	E	The reference to SPC-3 is for what? None of the terms appear in SPC-3. The closest is relative target port, but SPC-3 has a relative target port identifier (which is a two-byte field).			
QTM-124	69	second paragraph	T	(also table 38). This one-byte field doesn't match SPC-3 (which is defined as the high-order nibble only).	Accepted	7c	Dell-119, WG: see Dell-119
QTM-125	69	first paragraph after table 39	E	need a reference after MODE SELECT command. (see SPC-3)	Accepted	7a	
QTM-126	69	second paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"			
QTM-127	69	third paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"			
QTM-128	69	forth paragraph	T	Replace this sentence with a paragraph that says: "The DT device primary port descriptors vary based on the value in the PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field (see table X)." Add a table X that has a column for the PROTOCOL IDENTIFIER field value, the descriptor name, and a reference to a subclause.	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
Dell-122	70	Table 41 - Effect of LIV and RHA bits Row 1b	E	change "...initialization, the DT device..." to "...initialization, then the DT device..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-123	70	Table 41 - Effect of LIV and RHA bits Row 1b	E	change "...nonparticipating state, the DT device..." to "...nonparticipating state, then the DT device..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-124	70	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 41	E	change "...(see SPC-3), the P2P..." to "...(see SPC-3), then the P2P..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-125	70	2nd Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 41	E	change "...set to one, the RHA bit,..." to "...set to one, then the RHA bit,..."	Accepted	7b	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-126	70	3rd Paragraph after Table 39	E	change "The modify port name (MPN) and PORT NAME fields are used to modify and report modifications to the DT device primary port's name identifier (see FC-FS), as defined in table 40." to "The modify port name (MPN) field and PORT NAME field are used to modify and report modifications to the DT device primary port's name identifier (see FC-FS), as defined in table 40."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-127	70	Table 40	T	Invalid value for a MODE SENSE command. Why is this not just set to "Reserved"?	Accepted in principle	7c	Also table 36. WG: Instead, replace the sentence with "Invalid"
Dell-128	70	1st Paragraph after Table 40	E	change "The loop ID valid (LIV) and require hard address (RHA) bits are described in table 41." to "The loop ID valid (LIV) bit and require hard address (RHA) bit are described in table 41."	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 119	70	Table 40	E	Add a period at the end of table footnote a.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-250	70	Table 40	T	"The MPN field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE command…" Not if the MODE SENSE is for changeable values!			
HPQ-251	70	Table 40	E	Value s/b Code	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-252	70	Table 40	E	use horizontal double line before footer	Accepted	7a	IBM-58
IBM 58	70	Table 40	E	There needs to be a double line between the footing and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-252
IBM 66	70	6.2.2.3.3	T	(KB) Add a method to select order of totology negotiation when it is not locked.	Accepted	7c	proposal T10/06-468r2
QTM-129	70	second to last paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	
QTM-130	70	last paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	3 places

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-129	71	1st Paragraph after Table 43	E	change "A DT device receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled DT device primary port, where the command attempts to change the value of the BUS MODE, BMQ, MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR, or SCSI ADDRESS fields, shall return CHECK CONDITION. The sense key shall be ILLEGAL REQUEST, and the additional sense code shall be INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST. If the DT device primary port is disabled, the DT device may change the BUS MODE, BMQ, MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR, or SCSI ADDRESS fields and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command." to "A DT device receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled DT device primary port, where the command attempts to change the value of the BUS MODE field, BMQ field, MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR field, or SCSI ADDRESS field, shall return CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST. If the DT device primary port is disabled, then the DT device may change the BUS MODE field, BMQ field, MINIMU	Accepted	7a	IBM-59, IBM-60
HPQ-253	71	Table 42	E	Value s/b Code	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-254	71	Table 42	E	'Speed Values' s/b 'SPEED field'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-255	71	Table 42	E	Delete periods in the speed column	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-256	71	Table 42	E	'10Gb' s/b '10 Gb'	Accepted	7a	
IBM 59	71	6.2.2.3.4 2nd paragraph	E	This << value of the BUS MODE, BMQ, MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR, or SCSI ADDRESS fields, shall return CHECK CONDITION. >> should be << value of the BUS MODE field, BMQ field, MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR field, or SCSI ADDRESS field, shall return CHECK CONDITION. >>	Accetped	7a	Dell-129
IBM 60	71	6.2.2.3.4 2nd paragraph	E	This << change the BUS MODE, BMQ, MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR, or SCSI ADDRESS fields and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command. >> should be << change the BUS MODE field, BMQ field, MINIMUM TRANSFER PERIOD FACTOR field, or SCSI ADDRESS field and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command. >>	Accetped	7a	Dell-129

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-131	71	fifth paragraph	E	When the MPN field is set to 11b, s/b "When the MPN field is set to 11b (see table 40), "	Accepted	7a	
QTM-132	71	fifth paragraph	E	Add a period after "(see SPC-3)"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-133	71	last paragraph	E	need a reference after MODE SELECT command. (see SPC-3)	Accepted	7a	
QTM-134	71	first paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	
QTM-135	71	second paragraph	E	Change "indicates" to "contains"	Accepted	7b	
Dell-130	72	3rd Paragraph after Table 43	E	change "...identifies..." to "...Indicates..."			
Dell-131	72	1st Paragraph after Table 44	E	change "...identifies..." to "...Indicates..."			
Dell-132	72	1st Paragraph after Table 45	E	Change "A DT device receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled DT device primary port, where the command attempts to change the value of the MPI field, shall return CHECK CONDITION. The sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST with the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST. If the DT device..." to "A DT device receiving a MODE SELECT command for an enabled DT device primary port, where the command attempts to change the value of the MPI field, shall return CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST. If the DT device..."	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-257	72	Table 44	E	'Value' s/b 'Code' and should be centered	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-258	72	Table 44 caption	E	Delete "Effect of"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-259	72	paragraph above table 44	E	'qualifies the effect (see table 44) that' s/b '(see table 44) qualifies the effect that'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-260	72	Table 45 caption	E	SCISI s/b SCSI	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-261	72	Table 45	E	Delete (MSB) in byte 4	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-262	72	Table 45	E	Delete (LSB) in byte 11	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-263	72	1st paragraph after tabel 45	T	where the command attempts to change the value of the MPI field, The MPI field value itself not at issue; the fact that it is trying to change the SAS address of a port that is enabled is the issue. Although the MPI field always reads back as 00b and thus any write to change the SAS address sets the MPI field to non-00b to do so, that doesn't count as trying to change the valid of the MPI field (because it always reads back as zero).			
QTM-136	72	last paragraph	E	need a reference after MODE SELECT command. (see SPC-3)	Accepted	7a	
QTM-137	72	last paragraph	T	Should a CHECK CONDITION also be returned if the port identifier field is changed in the command?			
QTM-138	72	last paragraph	E	second sentence s/b "..REQUEST and the additional sense code shall be set to"	Accepted	7a	Dell132
QTM-139	72	6.2.2.3.4 last paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	
Dell-133	73	1st Paragraph continued after Table 45	E	Change "primary port is disabled, the DT device may change the MPI field or PORT IDENTIFER field and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command." to "primary port is disabled, then the DT device may change the MPI field or PORT IDENTIFER field and enable the DT device primary port with the same MODE SELECT command."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-134	73	Table 46	T	Invalid value for a MODE SENSE command. Why is this not just set to"Reserved"?	Accepted	7c	WG: see Dell 127
Dell-135	73	6.2.2.4.1 3rd Paragraph	E	Move text below to after Table 47. See SPC-3 for a description of the PS bit, SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, SUBPAGE CODE field, and PAGE LENGTH field. and change "These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown table 47. " to "The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, and SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to the values shown table 47. "	Accepted	7a	QTM-145
ENDL 120	73	Table 46	E	Add a period at the end of table footnote a.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-264	73	Table 46	T	The MPI field shall be set to zero for a MODE SENSE command. Not if the MODE SENSE is for changeable values.			
HPQ-265	73	Table 46	E	Value s/b Code	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-266	73	2nd to last paragraph	E	shown s/b shown in	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-267	73	Table 46	E	use horizontal double line before footer	Accepted	7a	IBM-61
HPQ-268	73	Table 46	E	Join common cells	Accepted	7c	WG accept
HPQ-269	73	1st paragraph	T	... with the same MODE SELECT command Since the MPI field is always 00b, this is the ONLY way to change the port identifier field. This probably is intended to say the port identifier may be changed simultaneously with enabling the port.			QTM-140, HP will write a proposal
HPQ-270	73	1st paragraph after table 46	T	'SPC-3' s/b 'SAS-1.1'. Any reference to SAS address format should only be to SAS itself. SAS can then point to SPC-3 if it needs to.	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
IBM 61	73	Table 46	E	There needs to be a double line between the footing and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-267
QTM-140	73	first paragraph	T	I don't think the DT device changes the MPI field, nor may it "...change the MPI field or port identifier field" I think we mean just the port identifier field here.			HPQ-269
QTM-141	73	second paragraph	E	Port Enable s/b "port enable"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-142	73	table 46	E	remove the period after Reserved (or make consistent with others, e.g., table 44).	Accepted	7a	
QTM-143	73	6.2.2.4.1 first paragraph	E	s/b "variable-length"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-144	73	6.2.2.4.1 first paragraph	E	Add references after MODE SELECT command and MODE SENSE command, i.e., "(see SPC-3)"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-145	73	last 2 paragraphs	E	Both of these paragraphs need to move to below table 47.	Accepted	7a	Dell-135
QTM-146	73	second to last paragraph	T	The PS bit in table 47 does not have a value shown, but the paragraph states that it shall be set to the value shown in the table.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-271	74	Table 47, logical unit descriptor field	E	Add: "(see table 48 in 6.2.2.4.1, table 51 in 6.2.2.4.2, or table 52 in 6.2.2.4.4)	Rejected		WG: reject
HPQ-272	75	Table 48	T	There should be an Identification descriptor list length or Number Of Identification Descriptors field above the list. If all that is available is the Additional Descriptor Length in bytes 2-3, this descriptor could never be extended to end with anything else than the identification descriptor list.	Rejected		WG: Reject. This change would be incompatible with existing implementations.
HPQ-273	75	Table 48	T	Logical Unit Index should be the same size as the Logical Unit Number	Rejected		WG: Reject.

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-147	75	6.2.2.4.2 first paragraph	E	s/b "(e.g., DEVICE TYPE field contains a value of 01h in the case of a sequential-access device (see SPC-3))" (with small caps of course - note this in other comments too)	Accepted	7a	
QTM-148	75	second to last paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "contains"	Accepted	7b	used "defines" instead
QTM-149	75	last paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	
Dell-136	76	6.2.2.4.2 5th Paragraph, 3rd Sentence	E	change "...a CHECK CONDITION to a..." to "...a CHECK CONDITION status to a..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-137	76	6.2.2.4.2 4th Paragraph, a) in a),b) list	E	change "a) The LUN..." to "a) the LUN..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-138	76	6.2.2.4.2 4th Paragraph, b) in a),b) list	E	change "b) The default..." to "b) the default..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-139	76	6.2.2.4.2 RMC logical unit descriptor format 7th Paragraph	E	change "If the OFFLINE bit is set to one, the RMC device server shall return CHECK CONDITION to all commands that require the RMC logical unit to be in the ready state. The sense key shall be NOT READY. The additional sense code shall be LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OFFLINE. If the OFFLINE bit is set to zero, the RMC device server shall respond normally to commands." to "If the OFFLINE bit is set to one, then the RMC device server shall returnCHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to NOT READY and the additional sense code set to LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OFFLINE to all commands that require the RMC logical unit to be in the ready state. If the OFFLINE bit is set to zero, then the RMC device server shall respond normally to commands."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-140	76	Table 49	T	Invalid value for a MODE SENSE command. Why is this not just set to"Reserved"?	Accepted in principle	7c	ER: Accept, WG: see Dell 127
ENDL 121	76	Table 49	E	Add a period at the end of table footnote a.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-274	76	Table 49	E	'Value' s/b 'Code' and centered	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-275	76	Table 49	E	use horizontal double line before footer	Accepted	7a	IBM-62

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-276	76	ENABLE bit paragraph	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
IBM 62	76	Table 49	E	There needs to be a double line between the footing and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-275
QTM-150	76	second paragraph	E	The MODE SELECT command needs "(see SPC-3)" added following.	Accepted	7a	
QTM-151	76	third paragraph	E	The REPORT LUNS command needs "(see SPC-3)" added following.	Overtaken by events		see QTM-153
QTM-152	76	table 49	E	remove period after Reserved (or make others consistent).	Accepted	7a	
QTM-153	76	third paragraph	T	Change "... reported in any REPORT LUNS command." to "...included in the logical unit inventory (see SPC-3) for all I_T nexus associated with a DT device primary port."	Accepted	7c	WG: Accept
QTM-154	76	third paragraph	E	change "indicates" to "specifies" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
QTM-155	76	third paragraph	T	...that DT device primary port... sounds like the LU can be associated with a subset of the primary ports, and we have no way to do that.	Accepted	7c	WG: change to "the" (2 places)
Dell-141	77	1st Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 49	E	change "...zero the AUTOLOAD MODE..." to "...zero, then the AUTOLOAD MODE..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-142	77	2nd paragraph after table 50	E	Change "...SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command…" to "...LOAD UNLOAD command…"	Accepted	7a	
Dell-143	77	2nd paragraph after table 50	E	Change "...SCSI LOAD UNLOAD command…" to "...LOAD UNLOAD command…"	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-277	77	Table 50	E	Value s/b Code	Accepted		
IBM 63	77	6.2.2.4.2 5th paragraph from end	E	The statement << mode upon detection of a vendor specific event. >> should be << mode upon detection of a vendor-specific event. >>. (i.e. there should be a dash between vendor and specific to be consistent with the rest of the standard.	Accepted	7a	
QTM-156	77	first paragraph	T	...specifies action to be taken... by whom/what? The RMC logical unit, device server, or DT device?	Accepted	7c	WG: add "by the DT device"
QTM-157	77	fifth paragraph	T	Do we need "A wp bit set to zero shall not write protect the medium."? Do we need to specify then that it has no bearing on media that are physically write-protected?			Rod will write a proposal
QTM-158	77	sixth paragraph	E	s/b "shall not operate in disaster recovery mode."	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-159	77	last paragraph	T	Do we need "A MUE bit set to zero may not allow a DT device to prepare"?			Rod will write a proposal
QTM-160	77	second paragrpah	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
QTM-161	77	third paragrpah	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
QTM-162	77	sixth paragrpah	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
QTM-163	77	seventh paragrpah	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
Dell-144	78	4th Paragraph after Table 51 in a) or a),b) list	E	change "a) The LUN..." to "a) the LUN..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-145	78	4th Paragraph after Table 51 in b) or a),b) list	E	change "b) The default..." to "b) the default..."	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-278	78	2nd paragraph	E	'ASSOCIATION field set to 00bh' s/b 'ASSOCIATION field set to 00b (i.e., logical unit0'	Accepted	7a	QTM-164
HPQ-279	78	Table 51	T	Logical Unit Index should be the same size as the Logical Unit Number	Rejected		ER: Reject. WG: reject
QTM-164	78	second paragraph	E	00bh s/b "00b"	Accepted	7a	HPQ-278
QTM-165	78	second paragraph	E	status, setting s/b "status. The sense key shall be set to" and "additional sense code shall be set to"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-166	78	second paragraph after table 51	E	s/b "(i.e., 08h, a medium changer device (see SPC-3))"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-167	78	first paragraph	E	change "indicating" to "associated with"	Accepted	7b	
QTM-168	78	third paragraph after table 51	E	Change "indicates" to "contains"	Accepted	7b	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-146	79	5th Paragraph, 3rd Sentence after Table 51	E	change "The ADC device server shall return a CHECK CONDITION to a MODE SELECT command when multiple descriptors with the ENABLE bit set to one have the same value in the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field. The sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code shall be set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST." to "The ADC device server shall return a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST to a MODE SELECT command when multiple descriptors with the ENABLE bit set to one have the same value in the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field. "	Accepted	7a	
Dell-147	79	7th Paragraph, 1st Sentence after Table 51	E	change "If the ENABLE bit is changed from one to zero, the local SMC device server shall implicitly abort all commands in its task set and shall report a status of CHECK CONDITION with a sense key of COMMAND ABORTED and an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT COMMUNICATION FAILURE for each command." to "If the ENABLE bit is changed from one to zero, then the local SMC device server shall implicitly abort all commands in its task set and report a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to COMMAND ABORTED and the additional sense code set to LOGICAL UNIT COMMUNICATION FAILURE for each command."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-148	79	8th Paragraph, 2nd Sentence after Table 51	E	change "...return CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST." to "...return CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST."	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-280	79	2nd parageaph	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
HPQ-281	79	Table 52	T	Logical Unit Index should be the same size as the Logical Unit Number	Rejected		ER: Reject
QTM-169	79	first paragraph	E	"field contain the first" s/b "field each contain the first"	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-170	79	first paragraph	E	add (see SPC-3) reference after MODE SELECT command	Accepted	7a	
QTM-171	79	second paragraph	E	add (see SPC-3) reference after REPORT LUNS command	Rejected		see QTM-173
QTM-172	79	third paragraph	E	might be nice to say "All remaining device servers (i.e., ADC device server and RMC device server) in..."	Accepted	7c	WG: accept but use e.g instead and replace "and" with a comma
QTM-173	79	second paragraph	T	Change "...reported in any REPORT LUNS command." to "...included in the logical unit inventory (see SPC-3) for all I_T nexus associated with a DT device primary port."	Accepted	7c	QTM-171, WG: see QTM-153
QTM-174	79	second paragraph	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
QTM-175	79	forth paragraph	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	
QTM-176	79	forth paragraph	T	I'm not sure "shall" is correct here, maybe "may" instead?	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
QTM-177	79	forth paragraph	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies"	Accepted	7b	
QTM-178	79	second paragraph	T	Change "...that DT device primary port(s)." to "...the DT device primary port(s)."	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
Dell-149	80	6.2.2.4.4 4th Paragraph, a) in a),b) list	E	change "a) The LUN..." to "a) the LUN..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-150	80	6.2.2.4.4 4th Paragraph, b) in a),b) list	E	change "b) The default..." to "b) the default..."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-151	80	6.2.2.4.4 5th Paragraph, 3rd Sentence	E	change "The ADC device server shall return a CHECK CONDITION to a MODE SELECT command when multiple descriptors with the ENABLE bit set to one have the same value in the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field. The sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code shall be set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST." to "The ADC device server shall return a CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST to a MODE SELECT command when multiple descriptors with the ENABLE bit set to one have the same value in the LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER field."	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
Dell-152	80	6.2.2.5 2nd Paragraph	E	Move text below to after Table 53. "See SPC-3 for a description of the PS bit, SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, SUBPAGE CODE field, and PAGE LENGTH field." and change "These bits and fields shall be set to the values shown table 53." to The SPF bit, PAGE CODE field, and SUBPAGE CODE field shall be set to the values shown in table 53."	Accetped	7a	QTM-186
HPQ-282	80	last paragraph	E	'shown' s/b 'shown in'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-283	80	ENABLE bit paragraph	T	Change 'ADI port' to 'ADI target port'	Rejected		The ADI working group prefers the generic "ADI port".
QTM-179	80	first paragraph	T	When it says once assigned the logical unit index value shall not be changed, does that mean that the device server should respond with a CHECK CONDITION if an attempt is made to change it? Does it mean it can not be changed after a reset event or power on? What is the duration of "shall not be changed"? (Also applies to the RMC and SMC logical unit index values).	Accepted	7c	WG: In first sentence, change to "…assigned by the DT device at power on that…" Replace 2nd sentence to "This field shall not be changeable. The ADC device server shall terminate a MODE SELECT command that attempts to change the value in the LOGICAL UNIT INDEX field...". Also fix similar text in subclauses 6.2.2.4.2 and 6.2.2.4.3.
QTM-180	80	second paragraph	E	s/b "(i.e., 12h, an Automation/Drive Interface device (see SPC-3))"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-181	80	forth paragraph	E	add (see SPC-3) reference after MODE SELECT command	Accepted	7a	
QTM-182	80	sixth paragraph	E	add (see SPC-3) reference after REPORT LUNS command	Rejected		see QTM-188

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-183	80	sixth paragraph	T	There is no statement on what happens when the enable bit is changed from one to zero. Do we need the same paragraph as in the SMC logical unit, whereby all commands are aborted and the remaining device servers report a change in logical unit inventory? (Probably also applies to the RMC logical unit subpage).			WG: Rod will write a proposal
QTM-184	80	6.2.2.5 first paragraph	E	s/b "variable-length"	Accepted	7a	
QTM-185	80	6.2.2.5 first paragraph	E	s/b "...and the ADC device..."	Accepted	7a	
QTM-186	80	last paragraph	E	move this paragraph to below table 53.	Accepted	7a	Dell-152
QTM-187	80	last paragraph	T	The PS bit in table 53 does not have a value shown, but the paragraph states that it shall be set to the value shown in the table.	Accepted	7a	
QTM-188	80	sixth paragraph	T	Change "...reported in any REPORT LUNS command." to "...included in the logical unit inventory (see SPC-3) for all I_T nexus associated with a DT device primary port."	Accepted	7c	QTM-182
QTM-189	80	third paragraph	E	Change "indicates" to "contains"	Accepted	7b	
QTM-190	80	sixth paragraph	E	Change "indicates" to "specifies" (2 places)	Accepted	7b	
QTM-191	80	sixth paragraph	E	Change "...that DT device primary port(s)." to "...the DT device primary port(s)."	Accepted	7a	
Dell-153	81	Table 54	T	Invalid value for a MODE SENSE command. Why is this not just set to "Reserved"?	Accepted in principle	7c	WG: Change to just Invalid
Dell-154	81	1st Paragraph after table 53.	E	change "The modify product serial number (MPSN) and PRODUCT SERIAL NUMBER fields are..." to "The modify product serial number (MPSN) bit and PRODUCT SERIAL NUMBER field are..."	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 122	81	Table 54	E	Add a period at the end of table footnote a.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-284	81	Table 54	E	Value s/b Code	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-285	81	Table 54	E	use horizontal double line after header	Accepted	7a	IBM-64
HPQ-286	81	Table 54	E	use horizontal double line before footer	Accepted	7a	IBM-64
HPQ-287	81	Table 54	E	Merge common cells	Accepted	7c	WG: accept
IBM 64	81	Table 54	E	There needs to be a double line between the heading and the body and a double line between the footing and the body in this table.	Accepted	7a	HPQ-285, HPQ-286

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
QTM-192	81	table 54	E	remove period after Reserved (or make others consistent).	Accepted	7a	
Dell-155	82	2nd Paragraph, 2nd sentence after Table 56	E	change "...not available, the ADC..." to "...not available, then the ADC..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-156	82	2nd Paragraph, 3rd sentence after Table 56	E	change "...field (see SPC-3), the manufacturer-assigned..." to "...field (see SPC-3), then the manufacturer-assigned..."	Accepted	7b	
Dell-157	82	1st Paragraph, 2nd sentence after Table 56. WG: agree	T	Remove "The PAGE LENGTH field shall be set to the value shown in table 56." Table 56 does not show page length	Accepted	7c	ER: Change the first first sentence in the paragraph to include "PAGE CODE field," and change "PAGE LENGTH" in the 2nd sentence to "PAGE CODE".
ENDL 123	82	Table 55	T	Because the Log Page and Mode Page tables list SPC-3 pages, the VPD Page table should follow that example. This is especially important because 6.3.2 references a VPD page which is otherwise defined in SPC-3. [This change needs to be made before the ENDL No vote will change to Yes.]	Accepted	7c	WG: Include all of the page code defined in table 292 in SPC3r23 with M/O from that table, include page 80h as mandatory.
ENDL 124	82	Table 55, heading	E	VPD Page Name [s/b] Description [left aligned] [for consistency with table 13]	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 125	82	Table 55, heading	E	Support [s/b] Support requirement	Accepted	7a	
ENDL 126	82	Table 55	E	The Reference column is on the right-hand edge in the Log page and Mode page tables. This table should have the same format.	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-288	82	6.3.3 heading	E	'Manufacturer-assign serial number' s/b 'Manufacturer-assigned Serial Number'	Accepted	7a	IBM-65
HPQ-289	82	6.3.3 1st paragraph	E	'manufacturer-assigned serial number' s/b 'Manufacturer-assigned Serial Number'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-290	82	Table 56 caption	E	'Manufacturer-assigned serial number' s/b 'Manufacturer-assigned Serial Number'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-291	82	Table 55	E	use horizontal double line after header	Accepted	7a	

#	PDF	Reference	T/E	Comment	Resolution	Rev	Other comments
HPQ-292	82	6.3.2 a)	E	'association value of 00b' s/b 'ASSOCIATION field set to 00b (i.e., logical unit)'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-293	82	6.3.2 b)	E	'association value of 00b' s/b 'ASSOCIATION field set to 00b (i.e., logical unit)'	Accepted	7a	
HPQ-294	82	6.3.2	E	Provide more background in 6.3.2 - something like "The Device Identification VPD page is defined in SPC-4."	Accepted	7c	WG: added to table by ENDL-123
IBM 65	82	6.3.3 Section title	E	(KB) - Manufacturer-assign should be Manufacturer-assigned	Accepted	7a	HPQ-288
		Unresolved comments	153				
		Resolved comments	686				
		Total comments	839				
		Color Code:					
		Unresolved Editorial					
		Unresolved Editorial with editor's recommendation (ER)					
		Unresolved Techinical					
		Unresolved Technical with editor's recommendation (ER)					