

To: T10 Technical Committee
 From: Bill McFerrin (billmc37@ctesc.net)
 Date: 4 August 2006

Subject: 06-367r0 Errata Suggestions for MMC-5

MMC-5 Draft Revision 3b represents the letter ballot comment corrected version, but it has imperfections - primarily typographical (i.e. editor error). There are also suggestions for better description and complaints of omitted detail. The MMC WG shall address this list during the September MMC WG meeting and shall decide on severity and propose a list of errata to be published and posted on the T10 website.

The following are descriptions of the errors/shortcomings of MMC-5 draft revision 3b:

1. Mike Berhan (mikeb@bustrace.com):
 For the commands READ (10), READ (12), READ CAPACITY, SYNCHRONIZE CACHE, VERIFY (10), WRITE AND VERIFY (10), WRITE (10), and WRITE (12), CDB bit 0 of byte 1 is labeled "Obsolete" in SBC-2. In order to have compatibility with SBC-2, MMC-5 has labeled that bit as Obsolete. Unfortunately, WRITE (10) was missed. The WRITE (10) still has bit 0 of byte 1 marked as "Reserved".
2. Mike Berhan (mikeb@bustrace.com):
 In WRITE (10) and WRITE (12), the DPO bit has been removed and labeled "Restricted for [SBC-2]" in order to have informal compatibility with SBC-2. For the commands READ (10), READ (12), and VERIFY (10) "DPO" (bit 4 of byte 1) is described in such a way that it should be treated as reserved. READ (10), READ (12), and VERIFY (10) should be changed to be like WRITE (10) and WRITE (12).
3. Mike Berhan (mikeb@bustrace.com)
 There is a typographical error in the CDB for READ (12). MMC-5 describes the "Streaming" bit in 6.16.2.6, but the bit is not specified in the READ (12) CDB.
4. Jan-Eric Duden, ashampoo Technology GmbH & Co. KG
 The CLOSE TRACK SESSION CDB was correct in MMC-5 draft revision 3, but the CDB was changed and is no longer correct in MMC-5 draft revision 3a (and 3b).
5. Norichika Mine, (norichika.mine@sonynec-optiarc.com)
 The version number of the DVD+RW Feature (002Ah) is shown as 0001b. The Feature has not changed from MMC-4 where the version number was set to 0000b.
6. David Burg (davidburg@windows.microsoft.com)
 There is a typographical error in the description of Free Blocks in READ TRACK INFORMATION (6.27.3.15.1). The following text is extraneous and appears to be a left-over from when DDCCD was made Legacy:
 "For the invisible/incomplete track, $ATS = (StartTimeofLastPossibleLead-out) - NWA + 4$.
 For a reserved track, $ATS = (PMAStopTime) - NWA + 4$."
 These 2 lines should be removed.
7. David Burg (davidburg@windows.microsoft.com) and
 Keiji Katata (keiji.katata@post.pioneer.com)
 In the CLOSE TRACK SESSION description of closing a CD-R/RW track (6.3.3.1.2) there is no specification for what to do in the case that the invisible track is closed. It is suggested to either treat the case as a no-operation (i.e. do nothing and terminate the command with GOOD status), or terminate with CHECK CONDITION status and set sense to ILLEGAL REQUEST/INVALID FIELD IN CDB.

8. Takaharu Ai (ai.takaharu@jp.panasonic.com)

In the READ TRACK INFORMATION command, the reporting of RT varies according to media type and situation. It would be better to clearly show the variations as in this table:

Track Type		Media	TIB Data					Free Blocks
			RT	Blank	Inc	LRA_V	NWA_V	
Not Closed	Reserved Blank	DVD-R	1	1	1	0	0	>0
		BD-R	1	1	1	0	0	>0
	Reserved, partially recorded	DVD-R	1	0	1	1	1*	>0
		BD-R	1	0	1	1	1*	>0
	Invisible	DVD-R	0	1	1	0	0	>0
		BD-R	0	1	1	0	0	>0
	Incomplete	DVD-R	0	0	1	1	1*	>0
		BD-R	0	0	1	1	1*	>0
Reserved, fully recorded, but not closed	DVD-R	1	0	1	1	0	=0	
	BD-R	N/A						
Closed	Closed reserved	DVD-R	0	0	1	1	0	=0
		BD-R	1	0	1	1	0	=0
	Closed Incomplete (Invisible track exists next to this track)	DVD-R	0	0	1	1	0	=0
		BD-R	1	0	1	1	0	=0
	Fully recorded Incomplete (Invisible track does not exist)	DVD-R	?	0	1	1	0	=0
		BD-R	1	0	1	1	0	=0

This above list will be expanded as new suggestions come in.

Kind Regards,
Bill McFerrin