

**Date:** Friday 2:31:20 am

**To:** Aditya Pandit <adityap@calsoftinc.com>

**From:** "Ralph O. Weber" <roweber@ieee.org>

**Subject:** Re: Additional comments on osd2r00.pdf

Dear Mr. Pandit,

I apologize for not responding to you sooner. Until recently, there have been no plans to prepare an OSD-2 revision 1. It seemed best to warehouse your comments until a revision was being developed to contain them.

My responses to your comments are interspersed with the comments below.

All the best,

.Ralph

Aditya Pandit wrote:

Hi Ralph,

Please see comments and suggestions below which I found in osd2r00.pdf specification. I have arranged it in format:

**Index:** page number or section number for easy searching.

**Existing contents:** The existing contents in osd2r00.pdf

**Comments/Change to:** Suggested changes or comments.

Please let me know your comments on the same.

Regards,  
Aditya Pandit

**1. Index:** Page iv:

**Existing Content:** "Objects are intended to contain operating system and application constructs."

**Comments:** Currently spec does not specify how the Operating system should boot up. The ROOT object can not contain data. It should be specified how to identify the boot object of the partition. My option is that if the ROOT object is allowed to contain data it will help in putting the boot code in the ROOT object and then this code can load OS from the appropriate user object.

Please prepare a detailed proposal for changes to OSD-2 that will instantiate this idea. Use the following link to request a T10 document number for the proposal:

[http://www.t10.org/members/ad\\_nn.htm](http://www.t10.org/members/ad_nn.htm)

**4. Index: 3.1.53 volatile cache:** Storage that **is** lost after a power

**Change to: 3.1.53 volatile cache:** Storage that **is** lost after a power

This change will be made in OSD-2 r01.

**5. Index: 3.3.8 optional:** A keyword that describes features that are not required to be implemented by this standard. However, if any optional feature defined by **this standards** is implemented, then it shall be implemented as defined in this standard.

**Change to: 3.3.8 optional:** A keyword that describes features that are not required to be implemented by this standard. However, if any optional feature defined by **this standard** is implemented, then it shall be implemented as defined in this standard.

This change will be made in OSD-2 r01.

**8. Index: 4.4 Elements of the example configuration**

**Existing Content:** The policy/storage manager and security manager may reside in the OBSDs, in application clients, or as **a** separate entities.

**Change to:** The policy/storage manager and security manager may reside in the OBSDs, in application clients, or as separate entities.

This change will be made in OSD-2 r01.

**13. Index:** Table 10 - permission bit mask

**Change to:** Should the bytes be from **49 to 53** rather than **31 to 35**?

This change will be made in OSD-2 r01.

**14. Index: 4.9.2.2.1 Introduction**

**Existing Contents:** **A** OBJ\_MGMT bit set to zero prohibits such command functions.

**Change to:** **An** OBJ\_MGMT bit set to zero prohibits such command functions.

This change will be made in OSD-2 r01.

**16. Index: 6.15 PERFORM SCSI COMMAND**

**Comments:** It will be good if there is a statement saying that the data will not be accessible using LBA and also give the list of possible SCSI commands or the commands which should return and error.

This is a technical change and cannot be made without approval from the SNIA OSD TWG and T10. Please propose the change to these groups and gain their approval.

**21. Index: 7.1.2.19 Collections attributes page**

**Existing Contents:** If collections are **no** supported, the length of the page identification attribute shall be zero.

**Change to:** If collections are **not** supported, the length of the page identification attribute shall be zero.

This change will be made in OSD-2 r01.