

Draft Minutes

T10 FCP-3 Ad Hoc Meeting

9 November 2004 - 9 AM to 1 PM

Austin TX

An Ad Hoc Meeting of work group FCP-3 of INCITS Technical Committee T10 was held at Austin TX on 9 November 2004, hosted by Crossroads. Attendance at this Ad Hoc Meeting was 13 people from 12 companies and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T10 reflector at t10@t10.org.

1 Opening remarks and introductions

Dave Peterson

Chairperson Dave Peterson opened the meeting Tuesday, 9 November 2004 at 9:00 AM. He thanked our host company, Crossroads, and led a round of introductions.

2 Approval of Agenda

04-388r0

All

It was requested in behalf of Ralph Weber to add discussion of 04-294r1, FCP-3 & Optional Headers.

It was moved by Dave Peterson and seconded by Bob Nixon to accept 04-388r0 with the changes noted above as the agenda for this meeting. Approved unanimously.

3 Review of Minutes and Action Items

All

3.1 Approval of Minutes of Prior Meetings

04-309r0

It was moved by Dave Peterson and seconded by Bob Nixon to accept 04-309r0 as the minutes of the FCP-3 ad hoc meeting on 9 November 2004. Approved unanimously.

3.2 Review of Old Action Items

- AI 4 Kevin Butt. Investigate clarification of target initiated REC behavior.
(opened 11/04/03) (CLOSED, no publication needed)
- AI 13 Erich Oetting to revise 03-393r0 to reflect discussion today and pursue it in CAP.
(opened 13 July 2004)(CLOSED, taken to CAP)
- AI 16 Dave Peterson to publish 04-292r2, reflecting 04-292r1 and the agreements at the FCP-3 meeting 9 November 2004.
(opened 14 September 2004) (Closed by 04-292r2)
- AI 17 FCP-3 facilitator to recommend to T10 to incorporate 04-292r2 into FCP-3.
(opened 14 September 2004) (Closed at T10 Plenary 16 September 2004)

- AI 18 Ralph Weber to publish 04-294r1, reflecting 04-294r0 and the agreements at the FCP-3 meeting 9 November 2004.
(opened 14 September 2004) (Closed by 04-294r1)
- AI 19 Dave Peterson to propose changes to make all references to RR_TOV in FCP-3 consistent with 04-293r1.
(opened 14 September 2004)(CLOSED by next revision of FCP-3)
- AI 20 FCP-3 facilitator to recommend to T10 to incorporate 04-293r1 into FCP-3.
(opened 14 September 2004) (Closed at T10 Plenary 16 September 2004)

4 Old Business

4.1 Check Condition when FCP_DL too small 04-393r3 Dave Peterson/Erich Oetting

Related to this proposal, a T10 reflector suggestion to obsolete FCP_DL received almost universal negative feedback.

Many at the meeting were uncomfortable with unconditionally changing the current behavior when FCP_DL is smaller than the CDB data transfer length. Some alternatives for selecting current or new behavior of the device were suggested, as well as simply making it a vendor-specific choice of the device.

It was understood that a major motivation for this proposal was an extant driver/HBA that does not pass underrun condition up to its OS. No one was able to identify the faulty combination.

Agreed that both the current behavior and the proposed check condition/no transfer behavior will be documented, with no preference.

Objection was raised to using the ASC/ASCQ to point into the transport header, on the grounds that it violated SCSI/transport layering.

It was agreed that the ASC/ASCQ will simply identify that a transport failure has occurred rather than point to the failure.

Dave will modify the proposal and bring it to CAP for further consideration.

5 New Business

5.1 FCP-3 & Optional Headers 04-294r1 Ralph Weber)

This is a minor revision to a proposal from the prior meeting. The intent is to allow FCP-3 to use the new FC-SP security header (see T11 FC-FS-2 and FC-SP).

It was moved by Dave Peterson and seconded by Bob Nixon to recommend to the T10 plenary to incorporate 04-294r1 into FCP-3. Approved unanimously.

ACTION: FCP-3 facilitator to recommend to the T10 plenary to incorporate 04-294r1 into FCP-3.

5.2 FCP-3 Clarification to TPRLO 04-383r0 Michael Banther

It was unclear to the presenter whether the presentation reflected the latest position of the writer of the presentation.

The proposal will be reviewed with the writer and possibly a revision will be brought back.

5.3 FCP-3 FCP_DATA IU Clarification

04-387r0

Dave Peterson

This presentation identifies several places in FCP that restrict to one FCP_DATA_IU following each FCP_XFER_RDY. It poses that other standards language and certain FC trace products imply multiple IUs per XFER_RDY are possible.

The validity of the evidence of multiple IUs per XFER_RDY was questioned.

It was agreed that standards assert an FCP_DATA_IU is a single sequence, and that only a single FCP_DATA_IU may be sent in reply to an FCP_XFER_RDY.

Dave will review and maybe bring back a revision.

6 Review of Action Items

Bob Nixon

AI 21 FCP-3 facilitator to recommend to the T10 plenary to incorporate 04-294r1 into FCP-3.
(Opened 9 November 2004)

AI 22 Next AI

7 Meeting Schedule

Dave Peterson

Request 4 hours at the T11 Plenary Week the week of 17 January 2005 in Las Vegas NV, preferably in the same time slot.

8 Adjournment

It was moved by Paul Suhler and seconded by Bob Nixon to adjourn. Approved unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:40 AM on 9 November 2004.

9 Actions on Proposals at This Meeting

Document Title	Number	Disposition
FCP-3: RR_TOV Timer(s)	<u>04-293r1</u>	Close. See next revision of FCP-3.
An issue with lost FCP_RSP	nodoc	Document(s) will be provided. CARRY.
Check Condition when FCP_DL too small	<u>04-393r3</u>	Close. It will be carried in CAP.
FCP-3 & Optional Headers	<u>04-294r1</u>	Close. Approved.
FCP-3 Clarification to TPRLO	<u>04-383r0</u>	Close. Reopen at presenter's discretion.
FCP-3 FCP_DATA IU Clarification	<u>04-387r0</u>	Close. Reopen at presenter's discretion.

10 Attendance

Name	Company
George O. Penokie	IBM / Tivoli Systems
Noud Snelder	BDT
Robert Snively	Brocade Comm. Systems, Inc.
David Peterson	CNT
Robert H. Nixon	Emulex
Ralph O. Weber	ENDL Texas
Michael Banther	Hewlett Packard Co
Kevin Butt	IBM Corp.
Paul Entzel	Quantum Corp
Jim Coomes	Seagate Technology
Paul Suhler	Seagate Technology
William Martin	Sierra Logic
Erich Oetting	Storage Technology Corp.