Company	Number	Page	Reference	E/T	Comment	Additional Comment	Disposition
HPQ	1	1		E	Replace with 'Working Draft' on two lines.		Accepted
HPQ	2	1		E	Replace with 'T10 Project 1557-D' on two lines with the line break after T10		Accepted
HPQ	3	1		E	Replace with 'InterNational'.		Accepted
IBM	1	2	Points of contact	E	My E-mail address should be changed from << gpenokie@tivoli.com >> to <<gop@us.ibm.com >>		Accepted
ADIC	1	2		E	I believe George has a different e-mail address	RW	Accepted
ADIC	2	2		E	The even numbered roman numeral page numbers are right-facing instead of left (through TOC section)	RW	
HPQ	4	2		E	Change to IBM.		Accepted
HPQ	5	2		E	Change to 'gop@us.ibm.com'.		Accepted
HPQ	6	2		E	Change to 'INCITS'.		Accepted
HPQ	7	2		E	Change IINCITS to INCITS. Bold the first line.		Accepted
HPQ	8	2		E	Bold and underline.		Accepted
HPQ	9	2		E	SeeSAM3r13. Below Document Distribution add: INCITS Online Store<next column>http://www.techstreet.com/INCITS.html managed by Techstreet<next column>Telephone: 1-734-302-7801 or 1327 Jones Drive<next column>1-800-699-9277 Ann Arbor, MI 48105<next column>Facsimile: 1-734-302-7811		Accepted
HPQ	10	2		E	Add http://global.ihs.com/ and move all telephone numbers down one line.		Accepted
HPQ	11	2		E	Delete footer here and other pages.		Accepted
HPQ	12	2		E	Make page number show up in Acrobat page field on status bar, e.g., ii (2 of 111) instead of 2 of 111.		
IBM	2	3	Revision information	E	The revision history needs to be removed before this standard can go to letter ballot.	(conflicts with HPQ-13)	
ADIC	3	3		E	The revision history shouldn't be included in te ballot draft	RW (conflicts with HPQ-13)	
HPQ	13	3		E	Move Revision Information to after List of Figures and before Forward.	(conflicts with ADIC-3 and IBM-2)	

HPQ	14	3		E	Add Approved Documents Included section. See SAM3r13.		
HPQ	15	3		E	Change to 'ESC'.		Accepted
HPQ	16	3		E	Change to 'subclause' here and 11 other places.		Accepted
HPQ	17	4		E	Change to 'it'.		Accepted
HPQ	18	5		E	Change to '5d'.		Accepted
HPQ	19	5		E	Change to '5f'.		Accepted
HPQ	20	6		E	Change to 'changes'.		Accepted
HPQ	21	7		E	Change to 'definitions'.		Accepted
ADIC	4	8	1st P	E	"standards" s/b "standard"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	5	8	2nd P	E	"which is used" s/b "that is used"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	6	8	2nd P, last sentence	E	I would suggest the reference just be to ADC. This standard is the transport doc.	RW	Accepted
HPQ	25	8	Abstract, 2nd P	E	delete "or transport".		Accepted
HPQ	26	8	Abstract, 2nd P	E	delete "and transports".		Accepted
HPQ	27	8	Abstract, 2nd P	E	delete "and transport".		Accepted, see ADIC-6
HPQ	22	8		E	Change to 'InterNational' and bold the entire line.		Accepted
HPQ	23	8		E	Change to 'device' here and in the next sentence. SPC-x defines Device Type as a field in the standard INQUIRY data. We don't want to refer to that field here.		Accepted
HPQ	24	8		E	Singular-plural mis-match. Either use 'device' and 'its use' or 'devices' and 'their use'.		Accepted. Used "devices"
HPQ	28	8		E	center "Draft" on page.		Accepted
HPQ	29	9		E	Change to '2004'.		Accepted
HPQ	30	9		E	Center "Draft" on page.		Accepted
HPQ	31	10		E	align with page numbers below.		Accepted
HPQ	32	11		E	Incorrect capitalization, "overview" in 4.5.1.		Accepted
HPQ	33	11		E	'Retryable' is not a word in the English language. Replace with 'Rectifiable' meaning 'to make right, correct, or amend'.		
ADIC	227	17	2nd P	E	"address" s/b "addresses"	CP	See Brocade-1
HPQ	34	17	Foreword (and global)	E	IINCITS should be INCITS. Do a case-insensitive search.		Accepted
Brocade	1	17	Forward, 2nd para	E	group address s/b "group addressed" or "group addresses"		Accepted. Used "addressed"

ADIC	7	17	last P, last sentence	E	"At the time of it" s/b "At the time it" (if we need to keep this list)	RW	Accepted.
HPQ	35	18	Foreword	E	Fix Vit's name		Accepted
ADIC	8	19	Clause 4 desc.	E	"It also describe" s/b "It also describes"	RW	Accepted
IBM	3	19	Introduction	T	Does this standard reference << SAM-2. >> as stated or should it reference <<SAM-3>>. Unless it this standard has a need to address functions that are only in SAM-2 (e.g., parallel) then all the references to SAM-2 should be changed to SAM-3.		
Quantum	1	20	Blank page	E	Remove blank page (PGE)		
HPQ	36	21	1 Scope (and global)	E	Change to a) ; b) ; and c) format with: semicolons at the end of most lines "; and" or "; or" at the end of the second to last line		Accepted
IBM	4	21	1 Scope, item a)	E	The statement << generic system hardware. >> should be << generic system hardware; and >>		Accepted
IBM	5	21	1 Scope, item b)	E	The statement << Provision is made for the addition >> should be << To provide for the addition >>		Accepted
IBM	6	21	1st paragraph above figure 1	E	The statement << The figure is not >> should be << Figure 1 is not >>.		Accepted
TI	1	21	figure 1	E	SPI-5 is the approved standard		Accepted

ADIC	9	21	item a	T	This seems to be describing a model of a media changer that contains something called a library controller and data transport [sic] devices. Where is this model defined?	RW	Replace 1st sentence of item a) with: To provide a low cost interconnect method between an automation device and the data transfer devices that reside within the media changer (see SMC-2). Replace "libraries" with "media changers" in second sentence of the same paragraph.
ADIC	228	21	item b)	E	"Provision is made" s/b "To provide"	CP	Accepted
ADIC	10	21		E	three occurrences of "data transport devices" on this page s/b "DT device" Note however that throughout the standard, there is inconcsisten use of "data transfer device" and "DTD" that also need correcting.	RW	
HPQ	37	22	1 Scope	E	Delete the list of other standards that is immediately out of date and incomplete.	Contradicts TI-2 and IBM-7	
IBM	7	22	1 Scope		The information below figure 1 should all be deleted and replaced with the statement << These standards specify the interfaces, functions and operations necessary to ensure interoperability between conforming implementations. This standard is a functional description. Conforming implementations may employ any design technique that does not violate interoperability. >>	Contradicts HPQ-37 and TI-2	
TI	2	22		E	Approved standards needs to be updated	Contradicts HPQ-37 and IBM-7	

TI	3	24	2.2	E	Approved reference standards needs to be updated.		
HPQ	39	24	2.3	T	Change 1476 to 14776 (twice on page)		Accepted, updated numbers from SPC-3
HPQ	38	24	2.3	E	Future ISO numbers are available in T10/03-146		Accepted
ADIC	229	24	header 2	E	"References" s/b "references" for consistency	CP	Accepted
ADIC	11	24	subclause 2.3	E	Add ADC	RW	Accepted
IBM	8	25	2.3	E	Standard Test Methods for Electrical Performance Properties of Insulations and Jackets for Telecommunications Wire and Cable >> is in italics. Either all the standards in section 2 are placed in italics (which is the correct ISO format) or they are not. But in any case they all have to be the same.		Accepted, removed the italics
ADIC	52	26	3.1	T	Need a definition for a "data transfer device port" (an ADT port on a data transfer device).	RW	Accepted, added defintion modeled after 3.1.9 (automation device port)
ADIC	12	26	3.1	E	Add definition for information unit (IU) by itself, then throughout the standard use "IU" for information unit (several places)	RW	Needs discussion. SAS and FCP have significantly different definitions.
IBM	9	26	3.1.1	E	The statement << or NAK IU. See 6.5.3.>> should be << or NAK IU (see 6.5.3). >>		Accepted

IBM	10	26	3.1.1	E	There are more than one way of formatting the cross references used in this section. They all have to be the same. Some examples that are used: << See x.x.x. >>, << (See ADC) >>, << See ADC. >>, << See xxx for a detailed definition of xxx >>, etc. They should all be one format. I would pick either: << sentence. See xxx. >> or << sentence (see xxx)>. In any case they all have to have the same format. For the rest of my comments on this section I will pick the one I like which is << sentence (see xxx). >>		Accepted
ADIC	13	26	3.1.10	E	s/b "…within an automation device (see ADC)."	RW	Accepted
IBM	14	26	3.1.12	E	The statement << management as described in SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard. >> should be << management (see SAM-2). >>		Accepted
ADIC	14	26	3.1.13	E	s/b "…device server (see ADC)."	RW	Accepted
ADIC	15	26	3.1.14	E	s/b "The basic mechanism that transfers information consisting of one or more related information units that may flow in the same or opposite directions. An exhanage is identified by its X_Origin and Exchange ID (see 6.3).	RW	
IBM	15	26	3.1.14	E	The statement << Exchange ID. See 6.3. >> should be << Exchange ID (see 6.3). >>		Accepted
Quantum	6	26	3.1.14	E	Put "See 6.3" in parenthesis as part of the previous sentence. (PGE)		Accepted
IBM	11	26	3.1.6	E	The statement << commands. Further definition of an application client is found in SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard >> should be << commands (see SAM-2). >>		Accepted
Quantum	2	26	3.1.6	E	Replace "SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard" with "SAM-2" (PGE).		Accepted
IBM	12	26	3.1.7	E	The statement << status. See SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard for a detailed definition of auto-contingent allegiance. >> should be << status (see SAM-2). >>		Accepted
Quantum	3	26	3.1.7	E	missing period (SG)		Accepted

IBM	13	26	3.1.8	E	The statement << device primary ports (See ADC). >> should be << device primary ports (see ADC). >>		Accepted
Quantum	4	26	3.1.8	E	Replace "SCSI Architecture Model-2 standard" with "SAM-2" (PGE).		Accepted
Quantum	5	26	3.1.8	E	“See” should be lower case. (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	16	27	3.1.19	E	Delete the last sentence.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	17	27	3.1.20	E	Delete the last sentence.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	18	27	3.1.25	E	s/b "…using Port Login Ius (see 4.3.3).	RW	Accepted
IBM	16	27	3.1.25	E	The statement << Port Login IUs. See 4.3.3. >> should be << Port Login IUs (see 4.3.3). >>		Accepted
ADIC	19	27	3.1.32	E	s/b "…described in 4.7."	RW	See IBM-17
IBM	17	27	3.1.32	E	The statement << from a device as described in clause 4.7. >> should be << from a device (see 4.7). >>		Accepted
ADIC	230	27	3.1.34	E	"When used this" s/b "When used, this"	CP	Accepted
ADIC	20	27	3.1.35	E	missing period at end of last sentence.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	231	27	3.1.35	E	Need a comma either after "In all cases" or after "term is used"	CP	Accepted, comma added after "used"
ADIC	23	28	3.2	E	delete unused symbols (plus or minus, AWG)	RW	Accepted
ADIC	24	28	3.2	E	add symbols (ADC, IU, AER)	RW	Accepted
IBM	19	28	3.2	E	DTD should be added to the definitions list with a reference to a place either in this standard or another standard as to where it is defined in detail.		
Quantum	8	28	3.2	E	Add abbreviations ADT, ADC, CDB, and CRN. (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	232	28	3.1.37	E	"When used this" s/b "When used, this"	CP	Accepted
ADIC	21	28	3.1.41	E	"Symbol" s/b "symbol"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	22	28	3.1.46	E	s/b "…transport layer (see 4.6)."	RW	Accepted
ADIC	233	28	3.1.46	E	s/b "An error"	CP	Accepted
IBM	18	28	3.1.46	E	The statement << the transport layer. See 4.6. >> should be << the transport layer (see 4.6). >>		Accepted
Quantum	7	28	3.1.46	E	Don't believe transmission error is used anywhere. (SG)		Accepted. Removed

Seagate	58	28	Multiple	E	Please check the font size of small caps field names. E.g., FRAME SIZE in 4.3.6.4.1 seems very small.		
HPQ	40	29	3.3.6	E	Delete extra space		Accepted
ADIC	25	29	3.3.7	E	"standards" s/b "standard"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	234	30	3.4	E	s/b "An alphanumeric list…of items indicates the items…"	CP	Accepted
IBM	20	30	3.4, 9th paragraph	E	The statement << item 1 must occur or complete >> should be << item 1 shall occur or complete >>		Accepted
ADIC	215	32	3.6.1	E	Would it be clearer if the state transition diagram included the input causing the transition?	DB	
IBM	21	32	3.6.1 figure 2	E	The font size in this figure in not 10 point. All text in the standard should be 10 point except inline notes which is 9 point. This needs to be fixed.		Accepted
Quantum	9	32	figure 2	E	The picture could be cleaned up. The small gray box in the bottom right should completely cover the white state machine box in the corner. (SG)		
ADIC	26	34	4.1	E	"2" s/b "two"	RW	Accepted
HPQ	41	34	4.1	E	After "Data Transfer Devices" add "(DTDs)".	Contradicts IBM-22	
Seagate	1	34	4.1 first sentence	E	Numeral "2" should be spelled out	Change to "two"	Accepted
Quantum	10	34	4.1, 1st P	E	Replace “2” with “two”. (SG)		Accepted
IBM	22	34	4.1, 1st paragraph	E	The statement << media changer containing 2 Data Transfer Devices. >> should be << media changer containing two DTDs. >> as that is the way it is referenced in the reset of this standard.	Contradicts HPQ-41	
Quantum	11	34	figure 3	E	Figure captions go below the figure. (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	235	35	4.2	T	Why use such a slow default baud rate? Isn't 19 200 better?	CP	Rejected. Current devices use 9600 baud by default.
ADIC	27	35	4.2	E	The lettered list should be of the form: a) an item; b) another item; and c) last item.	RW	Accepted
HPQ	42	35	4.2	E	ISO-ize 9600.		Accepted

HPQ	43	35	4.2	E	Define "link" before use, either here or in 4.1 - perhaps label the links in the figure. Add to 3.1 too. Mention that it's full duplex (aka dual simplex), and what communication rates it supports.		
IBM	23	35	4.2, item a)	E	The statement << shall be set to 9600. >> should be << shall be set to 9600; >>		Accepted
IBM	24	35	4.2. Item b)	E	The statement << shall be set to 1. >> should be << shall be set to 1; and >>		Accepted
ADIC	28	35	4.3.1	E	s/b "The port state machine is the primary state machine and always active. The others…"	RW	Accepted in principle. Changed to "The port state machine is the primary machine and always active. The other state machines are only active to manage specific operations (i.e they are sub-state machines of a state in the port state machine)."
Brocade	2	35	4.3.1	E	while and the others s/b "while the others"		See ADIC-28
Iomega	2	35	4.3.1	E	the sentence "These state machines reside in ADC devices." seems unnecesary. The last sentence should be split into the following two sentences: "The port state machine is the primary machine and is always active. The other state machines are only active to manage specific operations."		See ADIC-28

Seagate	2	35	4.3.1 last sentence	E	Grammar: "The port state machine is the primary machine and always active while and the others are sub-state machines and only active to manage specific operations."	Change to "The port state machine is the primary machine and is always active, while the others are sub-state machines and are only active to manage specific operations."	See ADIC-28
Quantum	12	35	4.3.1, 1st P	E	These state machines reside in ADC devices. makes no sense. Remove. (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	216	35	4.3.2.1	E	need reference after "Port Login IU"	KK	Accepted in principle. Sentence removed per IBM-25. Cross reference added to similar sentence in 4.3.2.2.2.
IBM	25	35	4.3.2.1 3rd para	E	The statement << The port shall transition to P1:Login after receiving a Port Login IU. >> should be in the description of the P0 state not here. If it already is then deleted in if not move it.		Accepted, removed the sentence.
Seagate	3	35	4.3.2.1 last sentence	E	Why is the P0:P1 transition condition described here?	Either delete the sentence or add the second condition that causes the transition: "The port shall transition to P1:Login after receiving either an Initiate Login request or a Port Login IU."	See IBM-25
IBM	26	36	4.3.2.1 figure 4	E	The statement << to any state, causing transition >> should be << to all states, causing transition >>. This is in two places.		

IBM	27	36	4.3.2.1, figure 4	T	(KB)It is very difficult to follow the state machine since there are actions are different depending on if the device is Automation or DTD, Split the state machine into one for automation and one for DTD		Kevin Butt will investigate writing a proposal against this comment.
Quantum	13	36	figure 4	T	Why does the Initiate Login message only go to P0 and not all states? (SG)		Rejected. Because we want it that way.
ADIC	29	37	2nd P	E	"automation port" s/b "automation device port" This is a global change throughout the draft. There are also references to "ADT port on an automation device". These should all be "automation device port" since this is defined to be an ADT port.	RW	Accepted. Changed 7 occurances.
ADIC	30	37	2nd P	E	There are two "can" words in this sentence. Are these "shall" or "may"? (I think they are both "shall").	RW	Accepted
HPQ	44	37	4.3.2.2.1	E	Not clear at this stage there are more than one. Change "or acknowledgement IU" to "acknowledgement IU (e.g., ACK IU or NAK IU)."		Rejected. Acknowledgement IU is defined in 3.1.1.
HPQ	45	37	4.3.2.2.1	E	Change "are" to "shall be"		Accepted
HPQ	48	37	4.3.2.2.1	E	Change value to code		
IBM	28	37	4.3.2.2.1 last paragraph	E	The statement << can transition >> should be << is allowed to transition >>.		Accepted
IBM	29	37	4.3.2.2.3	T	(KB) This needs to indicate it only applies to DTD, If the state machines are not split by automation vs. DTD add a parenthetical here indicating DTD only		
HPQ	47	37	4.3.2.3.1	E	Change PROCESS to PROGRESS to match 6.5.3.3		Accepted

IBM	30	37	4.3.2.3.1	T	(KB) Last sentence of last paragraph talks about AOE bit related to exchanges, but no mention is made of what happens to the state machines when AOE bit is set, Add a statement in the appropriate place to indicate that when the AOE is set the state machines are reset		Accepted in principle. Remove item 3) and the phrase "and the ACCEPT bit set to zero" from item 1) in 4.5.2. Add subclause: 3.6.? sub-state machines Some states have sub-state machines associated with them. A sub-state machine only exists while the associated super-state is active. Activation of an associated super-state shall cause all sub-state machines of that state to enter their inital states.
Seagate	4	37	4.3.2.3.1 4th P	E	"…it sends an…"	Change to "…it shall send an…"	Accepted
ADIC	31	37	4.3.2.3.1, 1st P	E	What is a "Port Logout condition"?	RW	
ADIC	32	37	4.3.2.3.1, 1st P	E	"information units" s/b "IUs" (this should be a global change)	RW	
Quantum	14	37	4.3.2.3.1, 1st P	E	The same X-Origin and Exchange ID values are used in all information units throughout the process (see 6.3). Since this sentence is synonymous with the last phrase in the previous sentence, it should be converted to an (i.e.) phrase. (PGE)		Accepted

HPQ	46	37	4.3.2.3.4	T	Without splitting hairs, this statement appears to contradict 6.5.5 Port Logout Information Unit which states, 'Only automation ports may send this IU.' The problem being that 4.3.2.3.4 places a 'shall' clause on every port regardless of whether it belongs to automation or DT. Of course since since 4.3.2.3.4 goes on to state, 'and sends the corresponding ACK IU' and since an automation port should never respond to a Port Logout IU with an ACK, one can argue that the 'shall' clause only applies to DT device ports. However I don't know of a place in the text that actually states that an automation port shall respond to receipt of a Port Logout IU with a NAK IU.		Add to section 6.5.5: An automation port that receives a Port Logout IU shall respond by sending a NAK IU with status code of UNSUPPORTED FRAME TYPE FOR SELECTED PROTOCOL. Add cross reference to section 6.5.5 in section 4.3.2.5.1.
IBM	31	37	4.3.2.3.1 last paragraph	E	A reference to the AOE bit should be added to this statement << setting of the AOE bit in the Port Login IU (see x.x.x). >>		Accepted
Iomega	18	38	4.3.2.4.1	E	the sentence containing "...the ports permission..." should be "...the port's permission...".		Accepted
Seagate	5	38	4.3.2.4.1 fifth paragraph	E	"Initiate Recovery IU received" needs capitalization	Change to "Initiate Recovery IU Received"	Accepted
Seagate	6	38	4.3.2.4.1 first sentence	E	"ports" is not possessive	Change to "port's"	Accepted
ADIC	33	38	4.3.2.4.1, 1st P	E	"ports" s/b "port's"	RW	Accepted
Quantum	15	38	4.3.2.4.1, 1st P	E	“ports” SB “port's”. (PGE)		Accepted
Quantum	16	38	4.3.2.4.1, 1st P	E	“state” SB “sub-state”. (SG)		Accepted, 9 places in this subclause (is this what we want?)
ADIC	34	38	4.3.2.4.1, 7th P	T	R0:Idle s/b TE0:Idle	RW	Accepted
Quantum	17	38	4.3.2.4.1, 7th P	T	“R0:Idle” SB “TE0:Idle”. (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	35	38	4.3.2.4.3	E	It shall also transition to P1 on receipt of a Port Login IU	RW	Accepted
Seagate	7	38	4.3.2.4.3	E	The Recovery Failed message is not mentioned in the cross-referenced location (4.6.2.4.4)	Change to 4.3.5.4.2, where transmission of the message is described.	Accepted

ADIC	36	38	4.3.2.5.1	E	"drive port" s/b "DT device port" (also needed as global change)	RW	Accepted, used "DTD port"
ADIC	37	38	4.3.2.5.1	E	both occurrences of "can" s/b "shall"	RW	Accepted, used "is allowed to"
HPQ	49	38	4.3.2.5.1	E	Change value to code		I found cases of "code", "value", and even "code value". We need to pick one and use it consistently.
IBM	32	38	4.3.2.5.1	E	The statement << port can receive a Logout IU, only a drive port can transition to this state after >> should be << port is able to receive a Logout IU, only a drive port transitions to this state after >>		Accepted in principle, see ADIC-37
Quantum	18	38	4.3.2.5.1, 2nd P	E	"drive" SB "DTD" or "DT Device" (2 places) (PGE)		
HPQ	50	39	4.3.2.5.1	E	Change value to code		See HPQ-49
IBM	33	39	4.3.3	T	(KB) General to all Negotiation States, No statement is made with respect to receiving ACCEPT bit and parameters do not match, Add statement to each state saying - if a Port Login IU is received with the ACCEPT bit set and the parameters do not match your last parameters sent NAK and transition to N1.		Add paragraph to 4.3.3.1: If a port receives a Port Login IU with the ACCEPT bit set to one and with parameter values that are different from the last Port Login IU sent, the port shall send a NAK IU with a status value of NEGOTIATION ERROR and transition to N1:Negotiating to initiate a new login exchange.

HPQ	51	39	4.3.3.2	E	After IU add .		Accepted
IBM	35	40	4.3.3.1 figure 3	E	The statement << (from any state >> should be << (from all states >>.		
IBM	34	40	4.3.3.1 figure 5	E	The statement << (to any state) >> should be << (to all states) >> in three places.		
IBM	36	40	4.3.3.2 item b)	E	The statement << exchange that has not yet completed; or >> should be << exchange that has not yet completed; >>		Accepted
Quantum	19	40	4.3.3.2, 1st P	E	"shall:" SB "shall perform one of the following actions:" (MB)		Accepted
Seagate	8	40	Figure 5	E	Incorrect state cited for origination of Send Acknowledgement IU: "(from any state except N3:Accept Sent"	Change to "(from any state except N3:Accept ACK Sent"	
ADIC	38	41	1st P	E	"Data Transfer Device" s/b "DT device" (global)	RW	
ADIC	39	41	1st P	E	missing period at end of first sentence.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	40	41	4.3.3.3.1	E	"states" s/b "state"	RW	Accepted
IBM	37	41	4.3.3.3.1	E	(KB) The second paragraph is incorrect, Remove the paragraph since the referred to states now transition to the login complete state		Accepted
Seagate	9	41	4.3.3.3.1 first sentence	E	"states" should not be plural: "The N0:Idle states waits"	Change to "The N0:Idle state waits"	Accepted
Quantum	21	41	4.3.3.3.1, 2nd P	T	This sentence should have been deleted when N5 state was added. (SB)		Accepted
IBM	40	41	4.3.3.3.2 1st P	E	This transition list two ways it can occur. They should be stated as an a, b list with an << or >> between them. It should be stated as << This transition shall occur when: a) xxxxxxx; or b) xxxxxxx. >>	Conflicts with ADIC-39	
Iomega	3	41	4.3.3.3.2 and 4.3.3.4.1	T	the Port Login IU is being sent on both the N0 to N1 transition and on arriving at state N1.		
ADIC	43	41	4.3.3.3.2 P	T	What are "starting parameters?" Need definition.	RW	Rejected. See definitions clause.
ADIC	41	41	4.3.3.3.2, 1st P	E	s/b "…are unacceptable. The port shall…" (break into two sentences).	RW. Conflicts with IBM-40	

IBM	39	41	4.3.3.3.2, 1st P	E	The term << unacceptable, >> is unacceptable because there is no clear definition of what is unacceptable. A clear list of the unacceptable things needs to be here or a reference to were those unacceptable things are listed.		
ADIC	42	41	4.3.3.3.2, 2nd P	E	Suggest starting this para with "Additionally, this transition…"	RW	
ADIC	44	41	4.3.3.3.3	E	s/b "...ACCEPT bit set to zero…" (delete "is")	RW	Accepted
IBM	41	41	4.3.3.3.3	E	The term << acceptable, >> is unacceptable because there is no clear definition of what is acceptable. A clear list of the acceptable things needs to be here or a reference to were those acceptable things are listed.		
ADIC	217	41	4.3.3.4.1, last P, 2nd S	E	suggest that "It" be "The port" for clarity.	KK	Accepted
Quantum	23	41	4.3.3.4.1	T	There is no explanation of what to do if the parameters are acceptable. (PGE)		Rejected
IBM	42	41	4.3.3.4.1 1st P	E	The statement << to this state due to an Initiate Login message, >> should be << to this state as the result of an Initiate Login message, >>		Accepted
IBM	43	41	4.3.3.4.1 1st P	E	The statement << If the AOE bit is set, the Port Login >> is not clear as there is no indication as to what the AOE bit needs to be set to. If set to one or if set to zero which is it? This needs to be fixed.		Overtaken by events. See ADIC-45
IBM	44	41	4.3.3.4.1 2nd P	E	The statement << to this state due to a negotiation error, >> should be << to this state as a result of a negotiation error, >>		Accepted
IBM	45	41	4.3.3.4.1 4th P	E	Again with the acceptable and unacceptable with no indication as to what it means to be acceptable or unacceptable. This needs to be fixed.		

Seagate	10	41	4.3.3.4.1 first and second sentences	E	These two cases need to clarify that ACCEPT bit is zero.	Add text in red:"If the port transitioned to this state due to an Initiate Login message, the port shall send a Port Login IU in a new exchange. The ACCEPT bit shall be set to zero. If the AOE bit is set, the Port Login IU shall contain starting parameters. If the port transitioned to this state due to a negotiation error, the port shall send a Port Login IU in a new exchange. The Port Login IU shall contain starting parameters and the ACCEPT bit shall be set to zero."	Accepted
ADIC	45	41	4.3.3.4.1, 1st P	T	If the AOE bit is set to what? (one). What if it is set to zero?	RW	Accepted in principle. Remove 2nd sentence in 1st paragraph of 4.3.3.4.1
Quantum	22	41	4.3.3.4.1, 3rd and 4th P	E	Combine these paragraphs into one paragraph		Accepted
ADIC	46	41	4.3.3.4.1, 4th P	E	delete "down"	RW	Accepted

ADIC	47	41	4.3.3.4.2	T	This is ambiguous. What has the resource limitation error? The Port Login IU or the receiving port? Suggest "receives a Port Login IU protocol error or the port has a resource limitation error."	RW	Accepted in principle. Reword sentence in question: If a port sends a NAK IU in response to a Port Login IU it shall transition to N0:Idle.
Quantum	20	41	1st P	E	missing period (SG)		Accepted
Seagate	11	41	First sentence on page	E	Missing period	Add period to end of sentence	Accepted
IBM	38	41	global	E	When describing transitions 99% of the time when a << when >> is used it would be better stated as << if >>. That change should be made throughout this standard.		
IBM	46	42	4.3.3.4.3	E	The term << acceptable, >> is unacceptable because there is no clear definition of what is acceptable. A clear list of the acceptable things needs to be here or a reference to were those acceptable things are listed.		
ADIC	48	42	4.3.3.5.1	E	"and unchanged parameters" s/b "and with parameters unchanged" (I think it sounds better). Three additional occurrences on this page.	RW	
ADIC	49	42	4.3.3.5.1	E	s/b "(i.e., "	RW	Accepted
ADIC	50	42	4.3.3.5.2	T	same issue as to what has the resource limitation error.	RW	Accepted in priciple. Same change as ADIC-47
HPQ	52	42	4.3.3.5.3	E	Change value to code		See HPQ-49
ADIC	51	42	4.3.3.6	T	Do we really need the N3:Accept ACK Sent state? Couldn't N2 transition directly to N5? It's clear what the value of this state is.	RW	Rejected, we need this state to know when we can change the operating parameters.

ADIC	53	42	4.3.3.6.1	E	If we keep this, then I would suggest the wording be "…ACCEPT bit set to one and with parameters unchanged, and has received…"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	218	42	4.3.3.7	E	"Agree" s/b "Agreed"	KK	Accepted
Iomega	4	42	4.3.3.7	E	the title should be N4:Agreed state.		Accepted
ADIC	54	42	4.3.3.7.1	E	"and then sent" s/b "and then has sent". "In other words" s/b "… set to one (i.e., it is the second…"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	236	42	4.3.3.7.1	E	The wording in the first sentence of this paragraph is very awkward.	CP	
ADIC	214	42	last P	E	add reference to table 14 following "HEADER RESERVED BIT SET" (global request for all status code mentions).	DB	
ADIC	219	43	4.3.3.7.2	E	suggest "After receiving an ACK IU for the Port Login IU the port sent, it shall…"	KK	Overtaken by events. See IBM-47
IBM	47	43	4.3.3.7.2	T	(KB) This transition no longer exists with addition of 4.3.3.7.4, Remove this clause.		Accepted
Quantum	24	43	4.3.3.7.2	T	This section should have been removed when N5 was added. (SG)		Accepted
Seagate	12	43	4.3.3.7.2	E	Description is for a non-existent transition	Delete entire sub-clause	Accepted
Iomega	5	43	4.3.3.7.2 and 4.3.3.7.4	T	both transitions have the same condition: "After receiving an ACK IU for the Port Login IU it sent...".		Overtaken by events. See IBM-47
IBM	48	43	4.3.3.8	T	(KB) The delay indicated in item 2 of the numbered list is incorrect, Move the delay from item 2 of the numbered list to a delay on entry into P2:Logged-In state after allowing receive but before allowing send. This would add an additional state to the transmitter state machine that is turn on receiver then delay time then transition to T0:Active.		Kevin Butt will write a proposal to cover this item.
Seagate	13	43	4.3.3.8	T	Need to specify how & when we leave this state. It says "While in this state, a port shall not transmit."	No suggestion at this time.	Rejected. The sub-state machine goes way when the port state transitions tp P2.

IBM	50	43	4.3.3.8 ietm 2)	E	The statement << 100 milliseconds, and >> should be << 100 milliseconds; and >>		Accepted
IBM	49	43	4.3.3.8 item 1	E	The statement << negotiated values, >> should be << negotiated values; >>		Accepted
ADIC	55	43	4.3.4.1	E	"ports" s/b "port's"	RW	Accepted
Seagate	14	43	4.3.4.1	E	Possessive needed: "manages the ports permission"	Change to "manages the port's permission"	Accepted
Seagate	15	43	4.3.4.1	E	Do we need to clarify that ports in automation devices can never enter T1:Paused?	Add a sentence.	
IBM	51	44	4.3.4.1 figure 6	E	The statement << (to any state) >> should be << (to all states) >>		
ADIC	56	44	4.3.4.2.1	E	"information units" s/b "IUs" (this should be a global change)	RW	
Seagate	16	45	Figure 7	E	Capitalize first letter each word of Retryable error detected message in upper left corner.	"Retryable Error Detected"	
ADIC	220	45	4.3.5.1	E	second sentence, this is a sub-state machine of the port state machine's P2:Logged-In state.	KK	
IBM	53	45	4.3.5.1 figure 7	E	The statement << (to any state) >> should be << (to all states) >>		
Seagate	17	45	4.3.5.1 list item b)	E	Capitalize first letter each word of state name	Change to "TE1:Initiating Recovery"	Accepted
ADIC	57	45	4.3.5.2.1	E	"states" s/b "state"	RW	Accepted
Iomega	6	45	4.3.5.2.1 and 4.3.6.2.1	E	'states' should be 'state'.		Accepted
Quantum	25	45	4.3.5.2.2	E	Should these phrases be reversed? (i.e. transition and then send IU) (SG)		
Seagate	18	46	4.3.5.3.1	E	Pluralization needed: "..., NOP IU, Pause IU or ..."	Change to "…, NOP IUs, Pause IUs or ..."	Accepted
ADIC	58	46	4.3.5.3.2	E	s/b "…shall send a Recovery Succeeded message to the port state machine and…"	RW	Accepted
IBM	54	46	4.3.5.3.2	T	(KB) It is not clear that this causes the transmission of the frame that failed, Add in << This shall cause the transmission of the frame that had failed. >>		
Quantum	26	46	4.3.5.3.2	E	Should these phrases be reversed? (i.e. transition and then send IU) (figure may need to be modified as well) (SG)		

Quantum	27	46	4.3.5.3.3	E	Should these phrases be reversed? (i.e. transition and then send IU) (SG)		
Seagate	19	46	4.3.5.4.1	E	Pluralization needed: "..., NOP IU, Pause IU or ..."	Change to "…, NOP IUs, Pause IUs or ..."	Accepted
IBM	55	46	4.3.5.4.2	T	(KB) It is not clear that this causes the transmission of the frame that failed, Add in << This shall cause the transmission of the frame that had failed. >>		
Quantum	28	46	4.3.5.4.2, 1st P	E	Should these phrases be reversed? (i.e. transition and then send IU) (SG)		
ADIC	221	46	4.3.6.1	E	This state machine becomes active when the port state machine enter P2:Logged-In state.	KK	
Seagate	20	46	4.3.6.1 list item b)	E	Capitalize first letter each word of state name	Change to "R1:Pending Recovery"	Accepted
Quantum	29	47	4.3.5.4.2, 2nd P	E	Should these phrases be reversed? (i.e. transition and then send IU) (SG)		
ADIC	59	47	4.3.6.2.1	E	"states" s/b "state"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	60	47	4.3.6.2.3	E	s/b "an Initiate Recovery IU Received"	RW	Accepted
Iomega	7	47	4.3.6.2.3	E	'a' should be 'an' and 'received' should be capitilized.		Accepted
Seagate	21	47	4.3.6.2.3 first sentence	E	Wrong article: "...receiving a Initiate Recovery…"	Change to: "...receiving an Initiate Recovery…"	Accepted
HPQ	54	47	4.3.6.3.1	T	ACK and NAK frames should also be allowed		Accepted. Add Acknowledgement IUs to the list.
HPQ	53	47	4.3.6.3.1	E	Change status to status code		See HPQ-49
ADIC	62	47	4.3.6.3.1, 1st P	T	This seems to be more R0:Idle than R1 (the message is received and NAK sent from R0)	RW	
Quantum	30	47	4.3.6.3.1, 1st S	E	Should this be here or in the description for P2? (SG)		
ADIC	61	47	4.3.6.3.1, 2nd P	E	s/b "R1:Pending Recovery state"	RW	Accepted
Quantum	31	47	4.3.6.3.1, 2nd P	E	Is PR in the right font? If not, fix throughout whole document. (SG)		Accepted

IBM	56	48	4.3.6.4	E	The statement << the R0:Idle state and continue with normal operations. >> should be << he R0:Idle state. >> as I'm sure the device would not continue with abnormal operations.		Accepted
IBM	57	48	4.4 1st P	T	The statement << By default, the link operates such that a port must wait for an acknowledgement IU for every frame >> should be << By default, the link operates such that a port shall wait for an acknowledgement IU for every frame >>. The term << must >> shall not be used in this standard.		Accepted in principle. Change "must wait" to "waits"
Seagate	22	48	4.4 third paragraph	E	Should this paragraph be saying "unacknowledged frame count" or "Unacknowledged Frame Counter?"	If it's describing a count, then it's okay as written. If it's describing the counter that contains the count, then change.	Accepted. Changed to "Unacknowledged Frame Counter"
ADIC	63	48	4.4, 1st P	T	What is the "ADT link?"	RW	Accepted. Remove the phrases "On the ADT link" and "the link operates such that"..
ADIC	64	48	4.4, 1st P	E	"must" s/b "shall"	RW	Overtaken by events. See IBM-57
ADIC	65	48	4.4, 1st P	E	Delete last two sentences (starting with "This mode…"). They don't specify anything.	RW	
Quantum	32	48	4.4, 3rd P	E	This paragraph describes a software counter. Should this counter be in 4.5 as another frame counter? (SG)		
ADIC	66	48	4.4, last P, last sentence	E	s/b "…successfully complete the Port Login process…"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	67	48	4.5.1	E	The lettered list should be of the form: a) an item; b) another item; and c) last item.	RW	Accepted
HPQ	55	48	4.5.1	E	change to a) ; b) ; and c) . format		Accepted
IBM	58	48	4.5.1 item a)	E	The statement << with a specific frame. >> should be << with a specific frame; >>		Accepted
IBM	59	48	4.5.1 item b)	E	The statement << detect missing frames. >> should be << detect missing frames; and >>		Accepted

IBM	60	49	4.5.1 last P	T	The statement << To accomplish all of this, each port must keep two counters, >> should be << To accomplish this, each port shall keep two counters, >>		Accepted.
ADIC	69	49	4.5.2	E	Four occurrences of "AOE" on this page s/b small caps(?)	RW	Accepted.
HPQ	56	49	4.5.3	E	format frame number with smallcaps		Accepted.
HPQ	57	49	4.5.3	E	Make frame number smallcaps		Accepted.
IBM	52	49	4.5.3	T	(KB) Incorrect states are listed due to the recent state modifications (P5 and P2), Change the states from P5:Recovering to R2 and P2:Active to P2:Logged-In. The entire document needs to be swept for these old state numbers and names and updated to current.		Accepted.
Seagate	23	49	4.5.3 list item 1)	T	After sending a Logout, then the port will still be in P2:Logged In, pending receipt of the ACK for the Login. If EFS is set to one immediately, then IUs received before the Logout ACK may enter error recovery.	Two approaches: A) Change 4.3.2.4.2 to perform transition P2:P0 after sending the Logout IU, which means that received IUs will be discarded by the port; or B) Split list item 1) in 4.5.3 into three parts as follows: "1) It shall be set to one after sending or receiving a Port Login IU with the AOE bit set to one; 2) It shall be set to one after receiving a Port Logout IU; 3) It shall be set to one after receiving an ACK IU for a Port Logout IU;" The result of 3) will be to pass received IUs to the upper layer for discarding.	Paul Suhler will write a proposal.

Seagate	24	49	4.5.3 list item 3)	E	P5:Recovering	Change to R2:Recovering	Accepted.
Seagate	25	49	4.5.3 list item 4)	E	P2:Active	Change to R0:Idle	Rejected, see Quantum-34
ADIC	237	49	4.5.3, 4b	E	s/b "counter shall be incremented by one" (missing "be")	CP	Accepted.
Quantum	33	49	4.5.3, item 3)	T	"P5:Recovering" SB "R2:Recovering". (PGE)		Accepted.
Quantum	34	49	4.5.3, item 4)	T	"P2:Active" SB "P2:Logged-In" (PGE)		Accepted.
ADIC	70	49	4.6.1.1	E	s/b "the sender of a frame, the receiver of a frame"	RW	Accepted.
ADIC	68	49	first sentence after c)	E	s/b "To accomplish these, each port shall keep two counters: one to track the frame number in the next frame to send, and one to track the frame number in the next frame to receive."	RW	Accepted.
IBM	61	50	4.6.1.2.1	T	(KB) There is no description of Retryable Error, Add a clause describing Retryable Error.		Accepted in principle. Change "Retryable errors are detected" to "Retryable errors are defined as errors detected"
IBM	62	50	4.6.1.2.1	T	(KB) All retryable errors are not listed, Add << c) ACK received out of order and add recovery action (see 4.6.2.4.4). >>		
ADIC	71	50	4.6.1.2.2	E	"…EOF of the frame is sent." s/b "…of the frame has been sent."	RW	Accepted.
ADIC	73	50	4.6.1.2.3	E	delete "also"	RW	Accepted.
ADIC	74	50	4.6.1.3	E	The first sentence s/b restructured as a lettered list: "..by the frame receiver: a)…"	RW	Accepted.
IBM	63	50	4.6.1.3	T	(KB) There is no description of Symbol Framing Error, Add a description for Symbol framing Error.		Rejected. Sysmbol framing error is defined in 3.1.41
Seagate	26	50	4.6.1.3	E	Incorrect use of semicolon: "There are four types of errors detectable by the frame receiver; corrupted frame,…"	Change to colon: "There are four types of errors detectable by the frame receiver: corrupted frame,…"	Overtaken by events. See ADIC-74

ADIC	72	50	Figure 9	E	last sentence "For example" s/b "e.g.,"	RW	
ADIC	75	51	1st P	E	s/b "Protocol errors are detectable errors for which no rety process is defined by this standard."	RW	
ADIC	76	51	2nd P	E	s/b "Resource limitation errors are due to lack of resources sufficient to process the request, and retransmission may succeed when resource usage has changed."	RW	
ADIC	77	51	3rd P	E	s/b "Recoverable errors are those that…" (note also that "e.g." s/b "e.g.,")	RW	
ADIC	78	51	4.6.2.2	E	"AOE" s/b small caps?	RW	
Quantum	35	51	4.6.2.2	E	The term “symbol framing error” should be defined in 4.6.1 (error detection). (SG)		Rejected. See IBM-63
ADIC	222	51	4.6.2.3	T	Item c), what happens if a frame never comes having a frame number that matches the Expected Frame Number counter.	KK	
ADIC	79	51	4.6.2.3	E	s/b "…and the PR bit set to one so that the port that sent the frame in error can initiate recovery." (PR in small caps?)	RW	Accepted
ADIC	223	51	4.6.2.3	E	"Expected Frame Number" s/b "expected frame number" (global, several)	RW	
IBM	64	51	4.6.2.3	E	The statement << the port that sent the frame in error can initiate recovery steps. >> should be << the port that sent the frame in error is able to initiate recovery steps. >>		Accepted
IBM	66	51	4.6.2.3	E	The statement << accommodate the recovery process. >> should be << accommodate the recovery process: >>		Accepted
Iomega	8	51	4.6.2.3	E	in the sentence "...recoverable error on a frame...", 'on' should be 'with' to match other occurrences.		
Seagate	27	51	4.6.2.3	E	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "see Table 14"	Rejected
IBM	65	51	4.6.2.3 1st P	T	(KB) Incorrect state name is used, Change P3:Pending Recovery to R1:Pending Recovery.		Accepted
IBM	67	51	4.6.2.3 item a)	E	The statement << receipt of the Initiate Recovery IU. >> should be << receipt of the Initiate Recovery IU; >>		Accepted

IBM	68	51	4.6.2.3 item b)	E	The statement << with normal operations. >> should be << with normal operations; and >>		Accepted
Seagate	28	51	4.6.2.3 list item b)	E	P2:Active (twice) and P3:Pending Recovery	Change to R0:Idle and R1:Pending Recovery, respectively.	Accepted
Seagate	29	51	4.6.2.3 list item c)	E	P5:Recovering and P2:Active	Change to R2:Recovering and R0:Idle, respectively.	Accepted
Quantum	36	51	4.6.2.3, 1st P	T	"P3:Pending" SB "R1:Pending Recovery". (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	80	51	4.6.2.3, 2nd P	T	Should "…attempting to recover from a retyable error." actually be "…from a recoverable error."?	RW	Rejected. The IR IU is sent after a transmitting port detects a retryable error.
Quantum	37	51	4.6.2.3, a,b,c list	T	"P2:Active" SB "R1:Idle" (3 places) "P3:Pending Recovery" SB "R1:Pending Recovery". "P5:Recovering" SB "R2:Recovering" (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	81	51	4.6.2.3, list	T	Should this be a numbered list?	RW	
Quantum	38	51	4.6.2.3. Item 2)	T	The state machine is already in P2. It is no longer a transition since the recovery is a sub state machine. (SG)		Accepted
Quantum	41	52	4.6.2.4. Item 4)	T	"shall re-send" SB "transition to TE2:Retry Initiate Recovery state and re-send". (MB)		Accepted
Quantum	40	52	4.6.2.4.4 item 3)	T	"P2:Active" SB "TE0:Idle" (PGE)		Accepted
Quantum	42	52	4.6.2.4.4 item 5)	T	There is no description of the state changes for this step. (SG)		
IBM	69	52	4.6.2.4.4 list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last (item 4) should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
Seagate	30	52	4.6.2.4.4 list item 3)	E	P2:Active	Change to R0:Idle	Accepted
Seagate	31	52	4.6.2.4.4 list items 1) and 2)	E	P4:Initiating Recovery	Change to TE1:Initiating Recovery	Accepted
Quantum	39	52	4.6.2.4.4, a,b,c list	T	"P4:Initiating Recovery" SB "TE1:Initiating Recovery", (2 places) (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	82	52	4.6.2.4.4, item 1	E	last sentence s/b "…IU contains the Next…"	RW	Accepted

ADIC	238	52	4.6.2.4.4, item 4	E	s/b "or a NAK IU"	CP	Accepted
HPQ	59	52	4.6.2.5.1	E	Change "and transition to P1:Login, sub state N0:Idle." to ", the Port state machine shall transition to P1:Login, and the Link negotiation state machine shall transition to N0:Idle." (if this is the correct place for such rules the state machines should themselves describe that).		Accepted
Seagate	32	52	4.6.2.5.1	T	Need to specify the NAK status code	Add text in red: "...the port shall send a NAK IU with STATUS CODE of NEGOTIATION ERROR,..."	
ADIC	83	52	4.6.2.5.2	E	"PR" s/b small caps? Would also suggest reference to table 14 after "appropriate status codes." (also delete "codes", and add reference to other places where this statement is made.)	RW	
IBM	70	52	4.6.2.5.2	E	The statement << zero and appropriate status code and discard the frame. >> should be << zero and appropriate status code then discard the frame. >>		Accepted
Seagate	33	52	4.6.2.5.2	E	Cross reference needed to table	Add text in red: "...appropriate status code (see table 14) and discard…"	Accepted
ADIC	84	52	4.6.2.5.3	E	delete "Pending Recovery" and just leave PR (small caps?).	RW	Accepted
HPQ	58	52	4.6.2.5.3	E	Make frame number smallcaps		Accepted
Seagate	34	52	4.6.2.5.3	E	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "see Table 14"	Rejected
Quantum	43	52	various	E	Sections 4.6.2.5.1, .2, .3 and 4.6.2.6.1, .2 and .3 all say "send NAK IU" in a slightly different way. Make them all the same (SG)		
HPQ	60	53	4.7	E	Change "described SAM-2" to "described in SAM-2"		Accepted
HPQ	61	53	4.7	E	After SAM-2 add .		Accepted
Iomega	9	53	4.7	E	...described SAM-2. should be "...described in SAM-2.".		Accepted

ADIC	87	53	4.8	E	The lettered list should be of the form: a) an item; b) another item; or c) last item.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	88	53	4.8	E	"DTD port" s/b "DT device port"	RW	
HPQ	63	53	4.8	E	Change to a) ; b) ; and c) . format		Accepted
HPQ	62	53	4.6.2.6.1	E	Change "and transition to P1:Login, sub state N0:Idle." to ", the Port state machine shall transition to P1:Login, and the Link negotiation state machine shall transition to N0:Idle." (if this is the correct place for such rules the state machines should themselves describe that).		Accepted
ADIC	85	53	4.6.2.6.2	E	same comment as ADIC 83.	RW	
IBM	71	53	4.6.2.6.2 1st P	E	The statement << bit set to zero and discard the frame. >> should be << bit set to zero then discard the frame. >>		Accepted
ADIC	86	53	4.6.2.6.3	E	first sentence, "is" s/b "it", delete "codes", PR smal caps.	RW	Accepted, except the code part for now
Seagate	35	53	4.6.2.6.3	E	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "see Table 14"	Rejected
Quantum	44	53	4.6.2.6.3, 1st P	E	“The port” SB “The initiator port”. (SG)		
IBM	72	53	4.8 a,b,c list	E	All the items in the list except the last need to end in << ; >> not << , >>.		Accepted
IBM	73	53	4.8 item c)	E	The statement << absence (Sensea for DTD port and Senseb for automation port), >> should be << absence (i.e., Sensea for DTD port and Senseb for automation port), >>		Accepted
Quantum	45	53	4.8, item c)	E	Add cross reference to 5.2 (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	239	53	4.8, item d	E	Add reference to table 7 after Reset line	CP	Accepted
IBM	74	54	4.9 2nd P	E	The statement << One of the intended uses for the ADT transport protocol involves bridging SCSI traffic from the primary interface of the data transfer device to the automation device. To facilitate this function, the data transfer >> should be << The ADT transport protocol involves bridging SCSI traffic from the primary interface of the data transfer device to the automation device. To facilitate this function, the data transfer >>		Accepted in principle. "The ADT transport protocol provides the capability of bridging SCSI traffic from the primary interface of the data transfer device to the automation device"

IBM	75	54	4.9 5th P	E	The statement << An application client that does wish to make use of the transport protocol service extensions may >> should be << An application client that does make use of the transport protocol service extensions may >>		Accepted in principle. "An application client that makes use…"
ADIC	89	54	4.9, 2nd P	E	"data transfer device" s/b "DT device". "(See ADC)" s/b "(see ADC)"	RW	
ADIC	90	56	5.1.3	E	The lettered list items should all start lower case; each list item should end in a semi-colon.	RW	Accepted
HPQ	64	56	5.1.3	T	Definition of asserted state missing.		
HPQ	65	56	5.1.3	E	Change to a) ; b) ; and c) . format		Accepted
IBM	76	56	5.1.3 a,b,c list	E	All the items in the list except the last need to end in << ; >> not << , >>.		Accepted
ADIC	91	57	5.1.4	E	The lettered list items should all start lower case; each list item should end in a semi-colon.	RW	Accepted
HPQ	66	57	5.1.4	E	Change to a) ; b) ; and c) . format		Accepted
ADIC	92	57	5.1.4	E	"single ended" s/b "single-ended" (twice)	RW	Accepted
IBM	78	57	5.1.4 3rd P	E	The statement << A device that negates a signal shall refrain from driving the signal to either state. >> should be << A device that negates a signal shall not drive the signal to either state. >>		Accepted
IBM	77	57	5.1.4 a,b,c list	E	All the items in the list except the last need to end in << ; >> not << , >>.		Accepted
IBM	79	57	5.1.4 table 5	T	The is no header row on this table. That needs to be fixed.		
ADIC	211	57	Table 3	T	There is no minimum Negated Output signal voltage level. Note a minimum valve IS given in Table 4 for the Negated Input signal voltage level.	DB	Rejected. See paragraph above the table.
IBM	80	58	5.1.4 figure 10	E	The figure title goes under the figure not on top of the figure. This needs to be fixed.		Accepted
IBM	81	58	5.1.4 figure 10	E	The text in this figure in not the same font type as is used in the reset of the standard (i.e., Arial). This needs to be fixed.		
ADIC	93	58	5.1.5	E	The lettered list items should all start lower case; each list item should end in a semi-colon.	RW	Accepted

IBM	82	58	5.1.5 a,b,c list	E	All the items in the list except the last need to end in << ; >> not << , >>.		Accepted
Quantum	46	58	figure 10	E	Figure caption should be below the figure. (PGE)		Accepted
IBM	83	59	5.1.5 figure 11	E	The figure title goes under the figure not on top of the figure. This needs to be fixed.		Accepted
IBM	84	59	5.2 table 7	E	The << O >> and << M >> are not defined in this table. Add a footer that tells what that are.		Accepted
IBM	85	59	5.2 table 7	E	The statement << A Vendor Unique sense connection. >> is redundant with the statement << This standard does not define the use of this connection. >> one of those statements has to be removed.		Accepted. Removed "A Vendor Unique sense connection"
IBM	86	59	5.2 table 7	E	The statement << A Vendor Unique sense connection. >> is redundant with the statement << This standard does not define the use of this connection. >> one of those statements has to be removed.		Accepted. Removed "A Vendor Unique sense connection"
ADIC	94	59	5.2, table 7	E	Define "O/M"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	95	59	5.2, table 7	E	"automation port" s/b "automation device port"; "data transfer device" s/b "DT device"; "DTD port" s/b "DT device port"	RW	Accepted. Pending DTD versus DT Device discussion
Quantum	47	59	table 7	E	"O/M" is not defined. (SG)		Accepted
Seagate	36	59	Table 7	E	Are "automation port" and "DTD port" consistent with the final terminology?	Change if necessary	
ADIC	212	60	5.3	T	Where is the SFF-8054 document referenced? (source location of document)	DB	Rejected. See subclause 2.4
ADIC	96	60	5.3	E	"Data Transfer Device" s/b "DT device" (also in table 8 header - DTD s/b DT Device)	RW	
IBM	87	60	5.3 1st P		The term << ADT device >> is not defined in this standard. It needs to be defined or a pointer to a place where it is defined or deleted.		
ADIC	97	61	6.1	E	"a frame header, the frame payload" s/b "a frame header, a frame payload"	RW	Accepted
Iomega	10	61	6.1	E	...layout of the ADT frame... should be "...layout of an ADT frame...".		Accepted
ADIC	98	61	6.2	E	remove quotations; "outside of" s/b "other than"	RW	Accepted

IBM	89	61	6.1 figure 12	E	The figure title goes under the figure not on top of the figure. This needs to be fixed.		Accepted
IBM	90	61	6.2 1st P	E	The term << byte stuffing >> and << escape >> should be not in quote. Remove the quotes.		Accepted
ADIC	99	61	6.2, 2nd P	E	an example of byte stuffing would be very helpful I think.	RW	
Quantum	48	61	figure 12	E	Figure caption should be below the figure. (PGE)		Accepted
IBM	88	61	global		When figure x and table x are used within a sentence they should not be capitalized. This needs to be fixed.		Accepted
HPQ	67	62	6.3	T	Change may not to shall not		Accepted
HPQ	69	62	6.3	T	Describe that recipients shall NAK frames with PAYLOAD SIZE mismatches with OVER-LENGTH or UNDER-LENGTH status codes. Describe the precedence of		
HPQ	70	62	6.3	T	Describe returning NAK (UNEXPECTED PROTOCOL)		
HPQ	68	62	6.3	E	Format "2 - 3 PAYLOAD SIZE" as two rows with an (MSB) and (LSB)		Accepted
IBM	91	62	6.3	T	(KB) here is no description of what the response should be if Exchange IDs overlap, 1-Add a NAK code for overlapped Exchange; 2-Abort all processes with Exchange ID and respond to the 2nd command with the new NAK code. An examination of what happens if one or both of the exchanges is a SCSI command needs to be made and the exchange lifetimes in this scenario needs to be clarified.		
Seagate	37	62	6.2 second paragraph after Table 11, third sentence	E	"...associated in these sequences…" is vague	Change to "…associated with the same exchange…"	Accepted

IBM	92	62	6.3 2nd P below table 11	E	(KB) This uses may instead of shall, Change << An originator of an exchange may not re-use an exchange ID value during the lifetime of that exchange >> to << << An originator of an exchange shall not re-use an exchange ID value during the lifetime of that exchange >>		Accepted
ADIC	100	62	6.3, 1st P	E	"Frame Header" s/b "frame header"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	102	62	6.3, 2nd P	E	"See the individual…" should list the actual subclauses by number instead.	RW	
Quantum	49	62	6.3, 2nd P after table 11	E	devices SB ports (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	103	62	6.3, 4th P	E	"…frame that they are acknowledging." s/b "…frame they acknowldege."	RW	Accepted
ADIC	104	62	6.3, 4th P	E	delete "independent of the traffic the port is receiving"	RW	
ADIC	105	62	6.3, 6th P	E	"Automation" s/b "automation"; "Data Transfer Device" s/b "DT device"	RW	
ADIC	106	62	6.3, 7th P	E	lower case Frame, Header, Checksum, and Escape	RW	Accepted
ADIC	107	62	6.3, 8th P	E	s/b "A receiving port shall send a NAK IU for any frame, except an acknowledgement IU, that contains a reserved bit equal to one in the frame header."	RW	
ADIC	101	62	table 10	E	Payload size does not indicate MSB/LSB	RW	Accepted
Iomega	16	62	table 10	E	PAYLOAD SIZE should be split into two rows like table 15 so (MSB) and (LSB) markers can be shown.		Accepted
Seagate	38	62	Table 11	E	Capitalization is inconsistent	Should it be "Link Service", Fast Access", and "Vendor Specific" or "Link service", Fast access", and "Vendor specific" ?	
ADIC	108	63	6.4	E	The lettered list items should end in semi-colons	RW	Accepted
HPQ	71	63	6.4, note 5	E	Change CRC to checksum		Accepted
IBM	93	63	6.4 a,b,c list	E	All the items in the list except the last need to end in << ; >> not << , >>.		Accepted

ADIC	110	63	6.5.1	E	s/b "Table 12 defines the values for the FRAME TYPE field in the ADT…"	RW	Accepted
HPQ	73	63	6.5.1 and global	E	What is the difference between a frame and an IU? Use terms like NAK IU or NAK frame consistently.		
ADIC	111	63	6.5.2	E	"information units" s/b "IUs" (this should be a global change)	RW	
ADIC	112	63	6.5.2, last sentence	T	What should the receiver do for non-missing fields? Change them?	RW	
ADIC	113	63	6.5.3, 6.5.3.1	E	"information units" s/b "IUs" (this should be a global change)	RW	
ADIC	213	63	6.5.3.1	E	delete "clause"	RW	Accepted
HPQ	72	63	6.5.3.1	E	Change "a valid SOF and EOF character" to "valid SOF and EOF characters"		Accepted
IBM	94	63	6.5.3.1	E	The statement << See clause 4.4 for other rules governing >> should be << See 4.4 for other rules governing >>		Accepted
ADIC	109	63	Note 5	E	"CRC" s/b "checksum"	RW	Accepted
Quamtum	53	64	1st P after table 13	T	"P3:Pending Recovery" SB "R1:Pending Recovery" (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	115	64	6.5.3.2	E	"acknowledge" s/b "acknowledgement"; "0 bytes" s/b "zero bytes"	RW	Accepted
HPQ	77	64	6.5.3.2	E	Change 0 to zero.		Accepted
Quantum	50	64	6.5.3.2	E	"is sent by the transport layer to indicate that the port" SB "shall be sent by a port that" (PGE)		Accepted
Seagate	39	64	6.5.3.2	E	Spell out numeral in "...contain 0 bytes of payload."	Change to "...contain zero bytes of payload."	Accepted
ADIC	114	64	6.5.3.2, 6.5.3.3	E	"information units" s/b "IUs" (this should be a global change)	RW	
ADIC	116	64	6.5.3.3	E	"…in the ADT Header" s/b "in the ADT frame header"; also s/b "set to the value" (same sentence)	RW	Accepted
ADIC	117	64	6.5.3.3	E	I think the PR bit should be small caps.	RW	Accepted

ADIC	118	64	6.5.3.3	E	The order of describing the payload fields is reversed from the order used for table 10. Since all other tables seem to be described in the same order as table 13, it might be easier to change the description order for table 10, but either way they should be consistent.	RW	
ADIC	119	64	6.5.3.3	E	period missing after "Table 14"	RW	Accepted
HPQ	75	64	6.5.3.3	T	Describe the precedence of these when multiple conditions can exist: e.g. OVER-LENGTH vs MAXIMUM PAYLOAD SIZE EXCEEDED vs UNEXPECTED PROTOCL		
HPQ	76	64	6.5.3.3	T	When is OUT OF RESOURCES returned? Describe in the appropriate section elsewhere in the document Note b seems a bit redundant		
Iomega	11	64	6.5.3.3	T	the text states that "...a port shall send a NAK IU for every frame that it receives in error." This contradicts section 4.6.2.3, which states that corrupted frames are not NAK'ed.		
Seagate	40	64	6.5.3.3 first paragraph after Table 13	E	P3:Pending Recovery	Change to R1:Pending Recovery	Accepted
Seagate	41	64	6.5.3.3 first paragraph, third sentence	E	Missing article: "...set to value in the…"	Change to: "...set to the value in the…"	Accepted
IBM	95	64	6.5.3.3 table 14	E	Because table 14 is split across multiple page it need to have the << (x of x) >> notation on the table title. This can be set up to automatically generate in frame.		Accepted
IBM	96	64	6.5.3.3 table 14	E	The statement << OVER-LENGTH (more bytes received than PAYLOAD SIZE field indicated) >> should be << OVER-LENGTH (i.e., more bytes received than PAYLOAD SIZE field indicated) >>		Accepted
IBM	97	64	6.5.3.3 table 14	E	The statement << UNDER-LENGTH (fewer bytes received than PAYLOAD SIZE field indicated) >> should be << UNDER-LENGTH (i.e., fewer bytes received than PAYLOAD SIZE field indicated) >>		Accepted

IBM	98	64	6.5.3.3 table 14	E	The statement << HEADER RESERVED BIT SET (for the version of ADT that the receiving port supports) >> should be << HEADER RESERVED BIT SET. Applies to the version of ADT that the receiving port supports. >>		Accepted
Quantum	51	64	6.5.3.3, 1st P	E	"is sent by the transport layer to indicate that the port" SB "shall be sent by a port that" (PGE)		Accepted
Quantum	52	64	6.5.3.3, 1st P	E	Not EVERY frame shall cause a NAK to be sent. No NAK is sent for corrupted frames. (SG)		
HPQ	74	64	6.5.3.3, Table 14	E	After "value" add autoincrementing "(part n of n)"		Accepted
ADIC	120	64	Table 14	E	I suggest deleting footnote b altogether, and change the sentence following "OUT OF RESOURCES" into a paranthetical, like those preceeding.	RW	
HPQ	78	65	6.5.3.3	T	When is ILLEGAL OPERATION FOR CURRENT OPERATING PARAMETERS returned? Describe in the appropriate section elsewhere in the document		
HPQ	80	65	6.5.3.3	T	When is MAXIMUM OFFSET EXCEEDED returned? Describe in the appropriate section elsewhere in the document		
HPQ	81	65	6.5.3.3	T	When is MAXIMUM PAYLOAD SIZE EXCEEDED returned? Describe in the appropriate section elsewhere in the document		
HPQ	82	65	6.5.3.3	T	Define terminate. Does this mean add the checksum first or just send EOF?		
HPQ	79	65	6.5.3.3 Table 14	T	Note b does not seem correct for MAXIMUM ACK OFFSET. I assume this is sent if a port advertised N but N+m arrive, but is not returned if only N frames arrive.		
IBM	99	65	6.5.3.3 table 14	T	(KB) Code 44h is not understood, Please give some examples of what this would be.		
IBM	100	65	6.5.3.3 table 14	T	(KB) Code 4Ah-Invalid Buffer Offset does not belong here but in upper layer, Remove it from table		

ADIC	124	65	6.5.3.4	T	The exception for Port Login, Port Logout, or Pause is for acknowledging them or for starting transmission of them? (i.e., it may not ack these, or it may start transmission of them before acking all frames?)	RW	
ADIC	122	65	6.5.3.4	E	delete "or it may complete the transmission" (implicit in "may terminate").	RW	
ADIC	123	65	6.5.3.4	E	last sentence, "frame type" s/b "frame"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	125	65	6.5.4	E	s/b "See 4.3.3 for a description of the use of the Port Login IU."	RW	Accepted
ADIC	121	65	table 14, 46h	E	I don't think max ack offset exceeded is due to lack of resources. Recommend dropping footnote.	RW	
ADIC	128	66	3rd P	E	There are three "can" words in this para. Suggest "it can support" s/b "it supports" and "can not support" s/b "does not support"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	224	66	3rd P	E	"Port claiming" s/b "Ports claiming"	KK	Accepted
Quantum	54	66	3rd P after table 15	E	Port s/b ports. (SG)		Accepted
ADIC	129	66	4th P	E	item a) "can support" s/b "it supports"; lettered list items should end in semi-colons, "; and" at end of item a).	RW	Accepted
HPQ	83	66	6.5.4	T	Ports claiming compliance with this standard at draft revision shall set the MAJOR REVISION field to 0. Ports claiming compliance with this standard at INCITS approved version shall set the MAJOR REVISION field to 1. Could you just use the version descriptor as defined by SPC-3? That will track draft versions, ANSI versions, and ISO versions. I don't think the above statement will make it through ISO standardization.		
IBM	107	66	6.5.4 1st item a) under table 15	E	The statement << highest it can support that is lower >> should be << highest it is able to support that is lower >>		Accepted
IBM	108	66	6.5.4 1st item a) under table 15	E	The statement << the major revision level. >> should be << he major revision level; and >>		Accepted

IBM	101	66	6.5.4 1st P	E	The statement << Clause 4.3.3 describes the use of the Port Login IU. >> should be << See 4.3.3 for a description of the Port Login IU. >>		Accepted
IBM	103	66	6.5.4 2nd P under table 15	E	The statement << Ports claiming compliance with this standard at draft revision shall set the MAJOR REVISION field to 0. >> does not make good English sense. This needs to be fixed.		
IBM	104	66	6.5.4 3rd P under table 15	E	The statement << value it can support and >> should be << value it is able to support and >>		Accepted in principle. See ADIC-128
IBM	105	66	6.5.4 3rd P under table 15	E	The statement << revision it can support for >> should be << revision it is able to support for >>		Accepted in principle. See ADIC-128
IBM	106	66	6.5.4 3rd P under table 15	E	The statement << a port that can not support the revision >> should be << a port that is not able to support the revision >>		Accepted in principle. See ADIC-128
IBM	102	66	6.5.4 table 15	T	Putting revision level in standards never works therefore the MAJOR REVISION and MINOR REVISION fields should be deleted from this standard.		
HPQ	84	66	6.5.4, last paragraph on page	E	Delete "value"		
ADIC	127	66	Table 15	E	"AOE" s/b small caps?	RW	Accepted
ADIC	126	66	Table 15 header	E	s/b "Login"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	130	67	1st-4th Ps	E	AOE s/b small caps?	RW	Accepted
ADIC	132	67	2nd P	E	delete "subclause"	RW	Accepted. Also fixed the cross reference to 4.3.3.2.
ADIC	133	67	4th P	T	The first sentence appears to contradict 6.5.3.4 by saying "shall suspend transmission". 6.5.3.4 says may terminate (thus may not)	RW	
HPQ	88	67	6.5.4	T	What if the frame is received with a Maximum Ack Offset of 0?		
HPQ	89	67	6.5.4	T	What if the frame is received with a Maximum Payload Size smaller than 256?		

HPQ	90	67	6.5.4	T	What if the frame is received with a Baud Rate of 0?		
HPQ	91	67	6.5.4	T	Is it safe to allow all baud rates in increments of 100 Baud? Some UARTs cannot run (or run as reliably) at certain baud rates, depending on their clock and clock divisor implementation. This seems to let one port request 19200 and the other reply with 19100, when the first might only support fallback to 9600. Consider just supporting the common baud rates (multiples of 9600 rather than 100). 5.1.5 implies a set of preferred rates at the physical layer.		
HPQ	86	67	6.5.4	E	A port shall be capable of supporting a frame payload size of 256 bytes to "The maximum payload size shall be at least 256."		Accepted
HPQ	87	67	6.5.4	E	Reword "All ports shall be capable of supporting a Maximum Ack Offset value of one." as "The MAXIMUM ACK OFFSET field shall be set to at least one."		
IBM	111	67	6.5.4 1st P under 2nd a,b,c list	E	The statement << See subclause 6.5.4 for Port Login exchange >> should be << See 6.5.4 for Port Login exchange >>		Accepted. Also fixed the cross reference to 4.3.3.2.
IBM	109	67	6.5.4 2nd item a) under table 15	E	The statement << hard reset condition. >> should be << hard reset condition; >>		Accepted
IBM	110	67	6.5.4 2nd item b) under table 15	E	The statement << one or more exchanges. >> should be << one or more exchanges; and >>		Rejected. This is an "or" case, changed the end of the line to "; or"
IBM	112	67	6.5.4 2nd to last P	E	The statement << payload of a frame that the port can accommodate. >> should be << payload of a frame that the port is able to accommodate. >>		Accepted
IBM	113	67	6.5.4 last P	E	The statement << default to operating at 9600 Baud at power-up >> should be default to operating at 9 600 Baud at power-up >>		Accepted
ADIC	137	67	6.5.5	T	s/b "Only automation device ports shall send…"	RW	

ADIC	139	67	6.5.5	T	the lettered list should be a numbered list; it also needs to conform to the standard list format (semi-colons, "; and" after third item).	RW	
ADIC	140	67	6.5.5	T	Item d) cannot be done, since it received a Port Logout IU ("Upon receiving a Port Logout IU…" above), thus won't receive an ACK. This item is actually covered instead in the last paragraph on this page.	RW	
ADIC	138	67	6.5.5	E	"the device" s/b "the DT device"	RW	Accepted
HPQ	85	67	6.5.5	T	Change P7:Logged-out to P3:Logged-Out state		Accepted
Iomega	12	67	6.5.5	T	list item d) should be 'transmission' instead of 'receipt'. Also, list item d) and the first sentence of the last paragraph of the section repeat the same point.		
IBM	115	67	6.5.5 2nd P	E	The statement << may be volatile, so a hard reset condition >> should be << may be volatile, as a result a hard reset condition >>		Accepted
IBM	116	67	6.5.5 4th P	E	The statement << See clause 4.3 for a definition of the port states. >> should be << See 4.3 for a definition of the port states. >>		Accepted
IBM	114	67	6.5.5 a,b,c list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	141	67	6.5.5, 2nd P	E	"automation port" s/b "automation device port"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	142	67	6.5.5, last P	E	"P7" s/b "P3"; delete "clause"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	134	67	6th P	E	"that the port can accommodate." s/b "that the port accommodates."	RW	Accepted
ADIC	135	67	6th P	E	What is "autosense?" (needs reference).	RW	Accepted in principle. Changed to "sense" and added a cross reference to 7.1.4
ADIC	146	67	7th P	E	s/b "indicates the speed at which the port"	RW	Contradicts Seagate-44

Seagate	42	67	Fifth paragraph, third sentence on page	T	Contradictory rule for incrementing ACK Offset: "Link service IUs are not counted in the offset (see 4.4)." 4.4 says: "The counter shall be incremented by one for each frame that is sent except acknowledgement frames."	Fix page 67: "Acknowledgement IUs are not counted in the offset (see 4.4)"	
ADIC	131	67	first list	E	The lettered list items should start lower case; each item should end with a semi-colon; item b) should end "; or"	RW	Accepted
Quantum	55	67	last P on page	T	"P7:Logged-out" SB "P3:Logged-out" (PGE)		Accepted
Quantum	56	67	last P on page	E	Remove the word “clause” from the last sentence. (PGE)		Accepted
Seagate	43	67	Last paragraph on page	E	P7:Logged-out	P3:Logged-Out	Accepted
Seagate	44	67	Seventh paragraph, first sentence on page	E	Incoherent sentence: "The BAUD RATE field indicates the speed that the port is negotiating the physical interface shall run."	Change to: "The BAUD RATE field indicates the speed that the port's physical interface shall run after completion of negotiation."	Contradicts ADIC-146
ADIC	144	68	6.5.6	T	last sentence of main para; So the automation device port shall not be capable of receiving frames if it has placed the attached ADT port into paused state? Shouldn't this be "placed DT device port" (for starters), but what has the DT device being paused have to do with the automation device port "capability"?	RW	
ADIC	143	68	6.5.6	E	"Data transfer" s/b "DT"; "an ADT port on a DTD device" s/b "a DT device port"; "and ADT port on an automation device" s/b "an automation device port" (there are several other instances of this style too, so consider this a global change.	RW	
IBM	118	68	6.5.6	T	(KB) It is not clear when automation can consider DTD paused, Add a statement indicating that the Automation shall not consider the DTD Paused until it has received an ACK IU for the Pause IU.		

IBM	121	68	6.5.6	T	(KB) It is not clear what occurs to error recovery related to a Pause, Add a statement clarifying that a Pause can occur at nay point during error recovery and that the error recovery will resume @ point where it was Paused when DTD is unpaused.		
Quantum	57	68	6.5.6	T	Question: What the effect of pause is on ACK timeouts. Should it pause the timers? Should the timers be reset after being unpaused? (MB)		
IBM	117	68	6.5.6 1st P	T	(KB) << When a data transfer device port receives a Pause IU, it shall acknowledge the frame and then temporarily discontinue>> to << When a data transfer device port receives a Pause IU, it shall acknowledge the frame and if the acknowledge is an ACK temporarily discontinue>>		
IBM	120	68	6.5.6 1st P	T	The statement << must always be capable of receiving frames. >> should be << shall always be capable of receiving frames. >>		
IBM	119	68	6.5.6 1st P	E	The term << DTD device >> in all cases is just << DTD >> this needs to be fixed.		
ADIC	145	68	6.5.7	E	s/b "A NOP IU may be sent by a port to cause the other device's port to transition from the paused state." or something like it.	RW	
HPQ	92	68	6.5.7	T	Define that other than un-pausing, this performs no operation.		
IBM	122	68	6.5.7	T	(KB)NOP information unit does not provide for a test payload, Either add an optional payload to the NOP IU or add another IU to be used for a test payload. I suggest a TEST IU.		
ADIC	146	68	6.5.8	E	s/b "when it detects that and error"; "Frame Header" s/b lowercase; delete "clause"	RW	
IBM	123	68	6.5.8	E	The statement << See clause 4.6 for a full explanation of the error recovery process. >> should be << See 4.6 for a full explanation of the error recovery process. >>		Accepted

Quantum	58	68	6.5.8	E	Remove the word “clause” from the last sentence. (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	147	68	6.5.9.2	E	"ACK IU or NAK IU" s/b "acknowledgement IU". There are several instances of this style, so consider this a global change.	RW	Rejected. The NAK IU must have the PR bit set to one to qualify.
ADIC	148	68	6.5.9.2	E	PR s/b small caps?	RW	Accepted
ADIC	149	68	6.5.9.3	E	list items should all start lowercase.	RW	Accepted
Quantum	59	68	6.5.9.3, item a)	T	"and receives a Login IU with the ACCEPT bit set to one;" SB "and receives a Login IU with the ACCEPT bit sent to one and sends an ACK IU in response to it;" (MB)		
Quantum	60	68	6.5.9.3, item b)	T	"sends a Login IU with the ACCEPT bit set to one" SB "sends a Login IU with the ACCEPT bit set to one and receives and ACK IU in response to it" (MB)		
HPQ	94	70	7.1	T	Add a section detailing allowable IU sequences. For example, it appears that ADT requires a Transfer Ready be received before Data is sent (for both data-in and data-out). This is not obvious, though, since it differs from FCP and SAS.		
IBM	124	70	7.1	T	(KB) There is no indication of expected behavior related to payload size consistency, Add a << Payload size - type consistency >> clause for each IU - define if there is a minimum or if an exact match is needed.		
ADIC	150	70	7.1.1	E	"information units" s/b "IUs" (this should be a global change)	RW	
ADIC	151	70	7.1.1	E	"Frame Header" s/b "frame header" (consider as global change)	RW	
ADIC	152	70	7.1.1	E	"implies" s/b "conveys" perhaps?	RW	
IBM	125	70	7.1.1 1st P	T	The statement << Frame Header takes on the role of the Queue Tag from SAM-2. >> is not correct as there is no such thing as a queue tag in SAM-2. This needs to be fixed.		Accepted. See HPQ-93

HPQ	93	70	7.1.1 and global	E	Change Queue Tag to task tag		Accepted
Quantum	61	70	7.1.1, 1st P	E	Remove the second sentence. (PGE)		
Quantum	62	70	7.1.1, 1st P	E	"headers" SB "contents" (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	153	70	7.1.2	E	"information unit" s/b "IU" (this should be a global change)	RW	
ADIC	154	70	7.1.2	E	s/b "…shall contain the information…"	RW	Accepted
IBM	126	70	7.1.2	T	(KB) The behavior specified seems to contradict SPC with relation to standard inquiry, Add a statement describing the behavior of standard inquiry to an invalid LUN - should match SPC		
IBM	127	70	7.1.2	T	(KB) No description of receiver behavior if FIRST BURST LENGTH does not contain zero on non-data commands, Suggest we add statement to the effect that the receiver shall ignore this field in these cases.		
Quantum	63	70	7.1.2, 1st P after table 17	T	Remove "or task management function" (PGE)		Accepted
ADIC	155	70	7.1.2, 2nd P	E	s/b "The LUN field indicates to which Logical Unit Number the command or task management function shall be routed within the SCSI target device."	RW	
Quantum	64	71	1st P after table 18	T	Remove "for the first SCSI Data IU" (PGE)		
HPQ	95	71	7.1.2	E	Rename "FIRST BURST LENGTH field" to "FIRST READ BURST LENGTH field" to avoid confusion with the SAM-3 "first burst"		
IBM	128	71	7.1.2 last P	E	The statement << the FIRST BURST LENGTH field shall contain zero. >> should be << the FIRST BURST LENGTH field shall be set to zero. >>		Accepted
ADIC	157	71	7.1.3	E	s/b IU	RW	
IBM	129	71	7.1.3	T	(KB) For TASK MANAGEMENT FUNCTION as written will search other protocols than SCSI, Specify that only Exchange ID's for the SCSI protocol shall be searched.		

ADIC	156	71	P below table 18	E	The wording in the first sentence of this paragraph is very awkward.	RW	
ADIC	158	71	table 19	T	"TAG OF TASK TO BE MANAGED" s/b "TASKTAG" instead (or something reasonable!)	RW	
ADIC	159	72	2nd P	E	name of tag field would also change here. "checked" s/b "queried"	RW	
ADIC	160	72	2nd P	E	"information unit" s/b "IU" (this should be a global change)	RW	
HPQ	96	72	7.1.3	T	and may perform a hard reset. Either mandate that this generate a hard reset or drop TARGET RESET. If it's just a shortcut for running LOGICAL UNIT RESETs, let those be done one at a time.		
IBM	130	72	7.1.3 P above table 20	E	(KB) The Reference to SAM-2 is incorrect since QUERY TASK is not part of SAM-2, Change SAM-2 to SAM-3. (GOP note\		
IBM	131	72	7.1.3 table 20	T	If you switch to SAM-3 the TARGET RESET task management function is deleted.		
Seagate	45	72	Table 20 and following paragraph. Also Table 26.	T	Delete QUERY TASK function?	Consider discussions in CAP working group.	
Quantum	65	73	1st P after table 22	E	“Additionally, the data cached…” SB “Additionally, any data cached…”. (PGE)		Accepted
IBM	136	73	3rd P under table 22	E	The statement << This field shall be set to 0 if the response >> should be << This field shall be set to zero if the response >>		Accepted

HPQ	100	73	7.1.4	T	Response code 05h is troublesome, because most places that refer to value 00h also need to refer to 05h since they both mean command complete. Consider a) dropping it. Define that a value 00h plus a non-zero sense length has the additional meaning. b) dropping it but adding an extra bit to communicate the additional meaning c) changing the encoding so it's somehow related to 00h (e.g. 00h - 0Fh for the command complete responses, 10h-FFh for the rest)		
IBM	132	73	7.1.4	T	(KB) There is behavior specified for when sense length doesn't match length of Autosense Data, Specify the behavior - Suggest Protocol error NAK.		
IBM	133	73	7.1.4	T	(KB) There is no description of the sense data if RESPONSE CODE is 06h, specify what is returned if RESPONSE CODE is 06h.		
IBM	134	73	7.1.4 1st P under table 22	E	The statement << GOOD that will generate a unit attention to initiator ports other >> should be << GOOD that generates a unit attention to initiator ports other >>. Will is one of the forbidden words.		
HPQ	99	73	7.1.4 2nd paragraph after table 22	T	After 00h add "or 05h". Better yet, use their names.		
IBM	135	73	7.1.4 3rd P under table 22	E	The statement << The SENSE LENGTH field indicates how many bytes of sense data can be found in the IU. >> should be << The SENSE LENGTH field indicates the number of bytes of sense data in the SCSI Response IU. >>		Accept
HPQ	98	73	7.1.4 last paragraph on the page	T	00h or 06h should be "00h or 05h". Better yet, use the names.		
HPQ	97	73	7.1.4 Table 22	E	response code should be small caps		Accept

ADIC	161	73	last P	T	"sense data can be found" s/b "sense data shall be found"	RW	Accept in principle
Quantum	66	73	last P on page	T	Response code 06h is listed, it should be 05h. We should probably switch from code values to code names. (MB)		
Seagate	46	73	Table 22 caption	E	"response code" should be small caps	"RESPONSE CODE"	Accept
Seagate	47	73	Third paragraph after Table 22	E	Wrong response code: "This field shall be set to 0 if the response code is not 00h or 06h"	Change to: "This field shall be set to 0 if the response code is not 00h or 05h" or change to the names of the codes, "...COMMAND OR TASK MANAGEMENT FUNCTION COMPLETE or COMMAND COMPLETE WITH GOOD STATUS AND SENSE DATA VALID…"	
Iomega	14	73		T	the last paragraph should state codes "00h and 05h", not "00h and 06h".		
ADIC	172	74	7.1.5	E	"within the exchange context to request the data a little bit at a time." s/b "within the same exchange to request the data."	RW	Accepted
HPQ	101	74	7.1.5	T	Is it not too burdensome to support offsets that are not 4-byte aligned and lengths for other than the last Transfer Ready of each exchange that are not 4-byte aligned? Other transport protocols shy away from this since it tends to requires barrel shifters in hardware.		
IBM	137	74	7.1.6	T	(KB) No behavior specified for Data > Burst length, Specify the behavior when [buffer offset+data length]>[xfer_rdy buffer offset + xfer_rdy burst length] - Suggest a NAK because this is a protocol error		
ADIC	171	74	headers	E	s/b IU	RW	

HPQ	102	75	7.1.6	T	This section needs to mention that Data is never sent unless a Transfer Ready was previously received.		
ADIC	174	75	7.1.7	E	"ACK IU or NAK IU" s/b "acknowledgement IU". There are several instances of this style, so consider this a global change.	RW	Rejected. The NAK IU must have the PR bit set to zero to qualify.
ADIC	175	75	7.1.7	E	PR s/b small caps?	RW	Accept
HPQ	103	75	7.1.7	E	Change nexus loss to I_T nexus loss (twice on page)		Accept
IBM	138	75	7.1.7 1st item a)	E	The statement << set to zero in response to it; >> should be << set to zero in response; >>		Accept
IBM	139	75	7.1.7 2nd item a)	E	The statement << set to zero in response to it; >> should be << set to zero in response; >>		Accept
ADIC	176	75	7.1.7, second list	E	item a), delete "to it", change comma to semi-colon.	RW	Accept
ADIC	173	75	7.1.7,first list	E	item a) should start lowercase, delete "to it"	RW	Accept
ADIC	177	75	7.1.8	E	s/b Ius	RW	
IBM	140	75	7.1.8	T	(KB) It is not clear what unexpected is, Specify what unexpected SCSI Data IU and unexpected SCSI Transfer Ready IU are.		
ADIC	178	75	7.2.1	E	Delete entire first sentence (it doesn't specify anything)	RW	
ADIC	179	75	7.2.1	E	the list needs to conform to the proper list format (e.g., semi-colons)	RW	Accept
ADIC	180	75	7.2.1	E	item b), "a device" s/b "a DT device"	RW	Accept
IBM	141	75	7.2.1 2nd P	E	The statement << layer and work around the slower speed of it. >> should be << layer and work around its slower speed. >>		Accept
IBM	142	75	7.2.1 a,b,c list	E	All the items in the list except the last need to end in << ; >> not << , >>.		Accept
ADIC	182	76	7.2.2	E	s/b "a Fast Access"	RW	Accept
Iomega	15	76	7.2.2	E	in the sentence that contains "...receiver of an Fast Access protocol IU...", 'an' should be 'a'.		Accept
ADIC	240	76	7.2.2, last sentence	T	How long to wait for data? How does one know no more data is coming?	CP	

ADIC	183	76	7.2.3	E	s/b "automation devices"	RW	Accepted in principle. Changed to "automation device ports"
ADIC	184	76	7.2.4	E	s/b "DT device" or "DT devices"	RW	Accept
Quantum	68	76	7.2.4	T	Add: "The VHF Data IU shall use the same exchange ID as the Request for VHF Data IU used." (PGE)		
Quantum	67	76	7.2.4	E	Replace the last sentence with “The payload of the VHF Data IU shall contain the VHF data as defined in ADC.” (similar to the wording in 7.2.5) (SG)		Accept
ADIC	185	76	7.2.5	E	Need a definition for AER.	RW	
ADIC	186	76	7.2.5	E	delete "optionally"; delete "that may be of interest."; s/b "DT device"	RW	Accept. Changed "data transfer device" to "DT device port"
ADIC	225	76	7.2.5	E	add "(AER)" after first usage	KK	Accept
ADIC	187	76	7.2.6	E	delete "optionally"; s/b "DT device"; s/b "automation device" (several); s/b "an AER"	RW	Accept
Quantum	70	76	7.2.6	T	Add a sentence "Data Transfer Devices shall only send an AER Control IU in response to receiving an AER Control IU from an automation device." (MB)		
Quantum	69	76	7.2.6	E	Move the third paragraph up and concatenate it with the first paragraph. (PGE)		
IBM	143	76	7.2.6 4th P	E	The statement << Except as noted above, data transfer devices that support AER shall >> should be << Except as noted is this subclause, data transfer devices that support AER shall >>		Accept
ADIC	241	76	7.2.6, 3rd P	T	Having a DT device interpret a reserved bit set to one as set to zero is not good.	CP	
ADIC	242	76	7.2.6, 3rd P	E	"equal" s/b "set"	RW	Accept
ADIC	181	76		E	several s/b "IU" or "IUs"	RW	

ADIC	188	77	1st P	E	"all one bits" s/b "bits set to one."	RW	Accepted in principle. Changed to "have all bits in the field set to one"
IBM	144	77	7.2.6 5th P	E	The statement << by the device shall contain all one bits. >> should be << by the device shall contain all ones. >>		Accepted in principle. See ADIC-188
IBM	145	77	7.2.6 last P	T	(KB) The last paragraph states all AER control fields shall be set to zero at start of port login process, This should state that they are reset only when AOE is set.		
ADIC	192	77	7.2.7.2, 3rd P	E	"in a nonexistant exchange" s/b "for a non existant exchange" (how can one receive something in an exchange if the exchange does not exist?)	RW	
IBM	146	77	7.2.7.3 3rd P	T	(KB) Wrong status code listed, Change << UNSUPPORTED FRAME TYPE FOR SELECTED PROTOCOL >>to << INVALID EXHANGE ID >>.		
Quantum	71	77	7.2.7.4, last P	E	AER Data IU s/b AER IU (2 places) (SG)		Accepted
ADIC	189	77		E	several instances s/b "DT device"; "automation device port"; "DT device port" on this whole page.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	190	77		E	several instances of "ACK IU or NAK IU" s/b "acknowledgement IU" on this page	RW	Rejected. The NAK IU must have the PR bit set to one to qualify.
ADIC	191	77		E	several instances of PR s/b small caps.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	193	78	8.1	E	"See 8.x" both are missing periods following.	RW	Accepted
IBM	147	78	8.1 3rd P	E	The statement << support of this remote procedure call. See 8.2 >> should be << support of this remote procedure call (see 8.2\		Accepted
IBM	148	78	8.1 6th P	E	The statement << support of this remote procedure call. See 8.3 >> should be << support of this remote procedure call (see 8.3\		Accepted

IBM	149	78	8.1 7th P	E	The statement << Refer to Annex A for specific examples >> should be<< See Annex A for specific examples >>		Accepted
HPQ	104	79	8.1 table 26	T	The confirmation for Data-Out Received needs to be receipt of the last data for the Transfer Ready, not receiving the ACK for the Transfer Ready		
HPQ	105	79	8.1 table 26	T	indication to the target port is just the receipt of a valid Command IU. The target chooses to send an ACK at that time, but the ACK is not the indication to the target port. (same comment for all Indications and confirmations in this table)		
HPQ	106	79	8.1 table 26	T	If it remains (not that I'm encouraging that) TARGET RESET must be added to this list		
IBM	150	79	8.1 table 26	E	The << I >> and << T >> have no definition in this table. Add a footer row to the table and list them.		Accepted
IBM	151	79	8.1 table 26	E	The column heading << Clause >> should be << Subclause >>		Accepted
Quantum	72	79	table 26	T	Add TARGET RESET to the list of TMFs. (PGE)		

HPQ	109	80	8.1	T	Rather than adding initiator side protocol services for data transfers, I think ADT is really upgrading the 2-step set of calls in SAM that only involve the target (request/confirmation) into a 4-step set of calls involving both the initiator and target (request/indication/response/confirmation). For Data-In, this should be modeled as 4 steps: 1) Request from initiator port - Receive Data-In - causes Transfer Ready IU to be sent 2) Indication to target port - indicates the device server is free to call Send Data-In 3) Response from target port - Send Data-In - causes Data IUs to be sent 4) Confirmation to initiator port - indicates to the application that all the requested data has arrived. For Data-Out, this should be modeled as 4 steps: 1) Request from target port - Receive Data-Out - causes Transfer Ready IU to be sent 2) Indication to initiator port - indicates the application client is free to call Send Data-In 3) Response from initiator port - Send Data-Out- causes Data IUs to be sent 4) Confirmation to target port - indicates to the device server that all the requested data has arrived.		
HPQ	107	80	8.2	T	Change I_T_L_x to I_T_L_Q throughout the command section. When untagged command support was removed from SAM-3, that eliminated the concept of I_T_L only nexuses for commands.		
HPQ	108	80	8.2	T	Delete [Autosense Request] throughout When SAM-3 mandated autosense, it no longer became necessary to include an Autosense argument in the protocol services. It's always true.		

IBM	152	80	8.1 1st P below table 26	E	The statement << See subclause 4.2.9 for details of the use >> should be << See 4.2.9 for details of the use >>		Accepted. Fixed reference to 4.9.
IBM	153	80	8.1 table 26	E	The << I >> and << T >> have no definition in this table. Add a footer row to the table and list them.		Accepted
IBM	154	80	8.1 table 27	E	The column heading << Clause >> should be << Subclause >>		Accepted
Seagate	48	80	8.2 Heading	E	Should these words all be capitalized?	Maybe not "support"	
HPQ	110	80	8.2.1 and elsewhere	T	The "first [read] burst size" sent in the COMMAND IU needs to be included in the model. Perhaps add an optional argument to Send SCSI Command and SCSI Command Received. In the data-in protocol services, mention that if a non-zero value was delivered, that serves the same role as the initiator sending a Transfer Ready.		
IBM	155	80	8.2.1 table 28	E	This table is split across multiple pages when it will fit on one page. This needs to be fixed. Or the << (x of x) >> needs to be added.		Accepted
IBM	156	80	8.2.1 table 28 a,b,c list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	194	80	table 28	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
IBM	157	81	8.2.2 table 29 a,b,c list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	195	81	table 29	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
HPQ	111	82	8.2.3	T	The RESPONSE CODE value of 05h needs to be included almost everywhere (e.g. table 30 row a and row b) that the value of 00h is referenced		
IBM	158	82	8.2.3 table 30 a,b,c list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted

IBM	159	82	8.2.4 table 31	E	This table is split across multiple pages when it will fit on one page. This needs to be fixed. Or the << (x of x) >> needs to be added.		Accepted
IBM	160	82	8.2.4 table 31 a,b,c list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	196	82	table 30	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
Quantum	73	82	table 30	T	Change I_T_L_x nexus description to: "From the SCSI Command Received transport protocol service call that established the task." (MB)		
ADIC	197	82	table 31	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
HPQ	112	83	8.2.4	T	The RESPONSE CODE value of 05h needs to be included almost everywhere (e.g. table 30 row a and row b) that the value of 00h is referenced		
HPQ	114	83	8.2.5	T	Does this have to wait for the initiator to send a Transfer Ready before sending the data?		
HPQ	113	83	8.2.5	E	After arguments add (part n of n) or keep table on one page		Accepted
Seagate	49	83	8.2.5	E	Inconsistent use of "( )" after function name in the midst of a sentence, when no arguments are present	Remove empty parentheses. Also see 8.2.7, 8.2.9, 8.2.11, & 8.2.12, 8.3.3	
IBM	161	83	8.2.5 table 32	E	This table is split across multiple pages when it will fit on one page. This needs to be fixed. Or the << (x of x) >> needs to be added.		Accepted
IBM	162	83	8.2.5 table 32	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	198	83	table 32	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
Quantum	74	83	table 32	T	Change I_T_L_x nexus description to: "From the SCSI Command Received transport protocol service call that established the task." (MB)		

IBM	163	84	8.2.6 table 33	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	199	84	table 33	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
Quantum	75	84	table 33	T	Change I_T_L_X nexus description to: “I_T_L_x nexus value passed to the Receive Data-Out transport layer protocol service request that initiated the transfer.” (MB)		
IBM	164	85	8.2.7 table 34	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	243	85	8.2.9, 2nd P	E	"received an Command" s/b "received a Command"	CP	Accepted
ADIC	200	85	table 34	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
Quantum	76	85	table 34	T	Change I_T_L_X nexus description to: "From the SCSI Command Recieved transport protocol service call that established the task." (MB)		
IBM	165	87	8.2.11 table 38	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
ADIC	202	87	8.2.12	E	need to correc the font on the last sentence (Times mixed with Helvetica)	RW	Accepted
ADIC	244	87	8.2.12	E	The wording of both paragraphs is very awkward.	CP	
IBM	166	87	8.2.12	E	The statement << request where the Data-In buffer size is non-zero. >> is in a different font than the rest of the standard. This needs to be fixed.		Accepted
ADIC	203	87	8.2.12, 2nd P	E	missing period at end of paragraph.	RW	Accepted
ADIC	201	87	table 38	E	lettered list needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
Quantum	77	87	table 38	T	Change I_T_L_X nexus description to: "Used to set the X_ORIGIN and EXCHANGE ID fields in the frame(s) header." (MB)		

IBM	167	88	8.3.1 table 40	T	The TARGET RESET (Nexus argument specifies an I_T Nexus) entry will go away if SAM-3 is referenced.		
HPQ	115	89	8.3.3 table 42	T	Add INCORRECT LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER service response mapping		
IBM	168	89	8.3.3 table 42 item b)	E	The statement << MANAGEMENT FUNCTION COMPLETE, or >> should be << MANAGEMENT FUNCTION COMPLETE; or >>		Accepted
HPQ	116	89	8.3.4 table 43	E	Keep on one page		
IBM	169	89	8.3.4 table 43	E	This table is split across multiple pages when it will fit on one page. This needs to be fixed. Or the << (x of x) >> needs to be added.		
ADIC	204	89	table 42	E	"ECXLUDES" s/b "EXCLUDES"	RW	Accepted
ADIC	205	89	table 42	E	item b) should end "; or"	RW	Accepted
HPQ	117	90	8.3.4	T	Add INCORRECT LOGICAL UNIT NUMBER service response mapping		
IBM	170	90	8.3.4 table 43 item b)	E	The statement << MANAGEMENT FUNCTION COMPLETE, or >> should be << MANAGEMENT FUNCTION COMPLETE; or >>		Accepted
ADIC	206	90	table 43	E	item b) should end "; or"	RW	Accepted
IBM	172	91	A.1	E	The statement << This informative annex provides specific examples >> should be << This annex provides specific examples >>		Accepted
HPQ	118	91	A.2	T	Change "may be" to "are" since there are no options for this simple sequence		Accepted
IBM	173	91	A.3 1st P	E	The statement << shown in this figure in an effort to make it more readable.>> should be << << shown in figure A.2 in an effort to make it more readable.>>		Accepted
IBM	171	91	Annex A	E	The term << (Informational) >> should be << (informative) >>		Accepted
ADIC	207	91		E	"Informational" s/b "Informative"	RW	Accepted

HPQ	119	91		T	8k to 8 KB and define KB in the list of acronyms. Is it 1000 or 1024 bytes? If it's 1024 bytes you may need to use Ki-Bytes and reference ISO/IEC 60027-2-am2 (1999-01), Letter symbols to be used in electrical technology - Part 2: Telecommunications and electronics (Amendment 2).		
IBM	174	93	A.3 figure A.2	E	(KB) Missing ACK IU's, Add note that only ACK IU's that trigger an action are shown.		
IBM	175	94	A.4 1st P	E	The statement << are not shown in this figure in an effort to make it >> should be << are not shown in figure A.3 in an effort to make it >>		Accepted
IBM	176	94	A.4 note	E	The note in this section needs to be numbered in the same manner as the main body. (e.g., note 23)		
IBM	179	96	Annex B	T	(KB) The states listed are old states, Check all figures for correct state numbers and names.		
IBM	180	96	Annex B	T	(KB) Most diagrams have Retryable Error where it should have Recoverable Error, Clean up diagrams to have correct labels.		
IBM	177	96	Annex B	E	The term << (Informational) >> should be << (informative) >>		Accepted
IBM	178	96	Annex B	E	(KB) All diagrams need clarified, Add Transmitter label and Receiver label		
HPQ	120	96	B.1	E	The red line either does not represent an IU with a checksum error, or figures B.3 and B.4 need to use red lines		
Seagate	50	96	B.1	E	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "Table B.1"	
IBM	182	96	B.1 1st P	T	The term << ADT device >> is not defined in this standard. It needs to be defined or a pointer to a place where it is defined or deleted.		Accepted. Change to "ADT port"
IBM	181	96	B.1 1st P	E	The statement << This informative annex diagrams various >> should be << This annex diagrams various >>		Accepted
IBM	183	96	B.1 table B.1	E	(KB) << NTFS >> should be << NFTS >>.		Accepted
HPQ	121	96	Table B.1	E	Change NTFS to NFTS (to match Next Frame To Send). It's correct in all the figures that follow.		Accepted

HPQ	122	96	Table B.1	E	Add: FN - Frame Number in the IU		
Quantum	78	96	table B.1	E	"NTFS" SB "NFTS" (MB)		Accepted
Seagate	51	96	Table B.1	E	Line 13 (a = b) "Counter a equals expression b" is not correct	Change description to "Counter a is set to expression b"	Accepted
ADIC	208	96		E	"Informational" s/b "Informative"	RW	Accepted
IBM	184	97	B.1 figure B.1	E	(KB) Missing Label, Add << Enter TE1: NFTS = k >>.		
Quantum	79	97	figure B.1	E	Upon receipt of the NAK it would be good to show entering the TE1 state and setting NFTS=k like in figure B.2. (MB)		
Seagate	52	97	Figure B.1	E	Receipt of NAK IU should show transition to TE1	Add description on the left "((PR == 1) && (ACK Offset == 0)) => Enter TE1:Initiating Recovery NFTS = k Send Initiate Recovery"	
Quantum	80	98	figure B.2	T	On the second NAK, Shouldn't PR = 1? (SG)		
ADIC	226	99	B.4	E	"is not further" s/b "is no further"	KK	
Seagate	53	99	Figure B.3	E	Dotted line of timeout is not clear. Also applies to figures B.4, 5, 6, and 8.	Change to larger dots?	
ADIC	245	100	B.5	E	"as the original" s/b "that the original" (or something more readable)	CP	
Seagate	54	100	B.5 first sentence	E	"Acknowledgement IU" should not have the first word capitalized	Change to "acknowledgement IU"	
Quantum	81	101	figure B.5	T	“P3:Pending Recovery” SB “R1:Pending Recovery”, "P4:Initiating Recovery" SB "TE1:Initiating Recovery", and "P2:Active" SB "R0:Idle" (2 places) (MB)		

Seagate	55	101	Figure B.5	E	Incorrect names for states	Change: P3:Pending Recovery to R1:Pending Recovery, (on right) P2:Active to R0:Idle, (on left) P4:Initiating Recovery to TE1:Initiating Recovery, and (on left) P0:Active to TE0:Idle	
IBM	185	102	B.7 1st P	E	The statement << In the example in figure B.6 - unlike the previous ones - the sender does not use >> should be << In the example in figure B.6, unlike the previous ones, the sender does not use >>		Accepted
Seagate	56	102	B.7 first sentence	E	"Acknowledgement IU" should not have the first word capitalized	Change to "acknowledgement IU" (three occurrences)	Accepted
Quantum	82	104	figure B.8	E	On second ACK from the bottom of the figure, Remove "EFN = k+1". (MB)		
ADIC	209	106	C.1	E	"ADT port in the automation device" s/b "automation device port"; "ADT port in the DTD" s/b "DT device port"	RW	
ADIC	210	106	C.1	E	both lettered lists needs to use semi-colons, "; and" format.	RW	Accepted
IBM	186	106	C.1 1st a,b,c list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
IBM	187	106	C.1 1st item c	E	The statement << sizes up to 1024 bytes. >> should be << sizes up to 1 024 bytes. >>		Accepted
IBM	188	106	C.1 1st item d	E	The statement << 115K, 38.4K, 19.2K, and 9600. >> should be << 115K, 38,4K, 19,2K, and 9 600. >>		Accepted
IBM	189	106	C.1 2nc a,b,c list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
IBM	190	106	C.1 2nd a,b,c list	E	The statement << Baud rates of 57.6K, 19.2K, and 9600. >> should be << Baud rates of 57,6K, 19,2K, and 9 600. >>		Accepted

IBM	192	107	C.3 1,2,3 list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		Accepted
IBM	191	107	C.3 item 1	E	The statement << Port Login IU at 9600 Baud with the >> should be << Port Login IU at 9 600 Baud with the >>		Accepted
IBM	194	107	C.3 item 3	E	The statement << Port Login IU at 9600 Baud with a >> should be << Port Login IU at 9 600 Baud with a >>		Accepted
Seagate	57	107	C.3 list item 1)	E	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "in Table C.2" Similarly for references to Tables C.3 - C.9	
IBM	193	107	C.3 table C.2	T	The statement << Must be zero on the first IU of an exchange. >> should be << Is zero on the first IU of an exchange. >> remember there can be no requirements in an informative annex.		Accepted
IBM	195	107	C.3 table C.3	T	The statement << Must be zero on the first IU of an exchange. >> should be << Is zero on the first IU of an exchange. >> remember there can be no requirements in an informative annex.		Accepted
HPQ	123	107	Table C.3	E	maximum to Maximum		Accepted
IBM	198	108	C.4 1,2,3 list	E	All the entries in the list need to end in << ; >> not << . >> except the last. The second to the last should end in << ; and >>.		
IBM	196	108	C.4 item 1	E	The statement << Port Login IU at 9600 Baud with the >> should be << Port Login IU at 9 600 Baud with the >>		Accepted
IBM	197	108	C.4 table C.4	T	The statement << Must be zero on the first IU of an exchange. >> should be << Is zero on the first IU of an exchange. >> remember there can be no requirements in an informative annex.		Accepted
IBM	199	108	C.4 table C.4	E	The term << 1024 >> and << 1152 >> should be << 1 024 >> and << 1 152 >>.		Accepted
IBM	200	109	C.4 table C.6	E	The statement << ADT port can support this value. >> should be << ADT port is able to support this value. >>		Accepted

IBM	201	109	C.4 table C.6	E	The statement << ADT port can support this value. >> should be << ADT port is able to support this value. >>		Accepted
Iomega	13	67, 68		E	after the word 'volatile', the word 'so' should be removed.		Accepted, replace "so" with "as a result"
Iomega	17	various		T	Pages 29, 31, 44 and 47 contain references to incorrect states: respectively, "P5:Recovering", "P2:Active", "P3:Pending Recovery" and "P7:Logged-out".		Accepted
Iomega	1	various		E	the inside solid border should completely encompass the white background of the figures.		
Iomega	19	various		E	Either consistently use "sub-state machine" or drop the "sub". See 4.3.2.4.1 for an example of inconsistent use.		