ADT Letter Ballot Comments

Company	Number	Page	E/T	Location	Comment	Suggestion
Seagate	2	34	E	4.1 first sentence	Numeral "2" should be spelled out	Change to "two"
Seagate	3	35	E	4.3.1 last sentence	Grammar: "The port state machine is the primary machine and always active while and the others are sub-state machines and only active to manage specific operations."	Change to "The port state machine is the primary machine and is always active, while the others are sub-state machines and are only active to manage specific operations."
Seagate	4	35	E	4.3.2.1 last sentence	Why is the P0:P1 transition condition described here?	Either delete the sentence or add the second condition that causes the transition: "The port shall transition to P1:Login after receiving either an Initiate Login request or a Port Login IU."
Seagate	5	37	E	4.3.2.3.1 fourth paragraph	"…it sends an…"	Change to "…it shall send an…"
Seagate	6	38	E	4.3.2.4.1 fifth paragraph	"Initiate Recovery IU received" needs capitalization	Change to "Initiate Recovery IU Received"
Seagate	7	38	E	4.3.2.4.1 first sentence	"ports" is not possessive	Change to "port's"
Seagate	8	38	E	4.3.2.4.3	The Recovery Failed message is not mentioned in the cross-referenced location (4.6.2.4.4)	Change to 4.3.5.4.2, where transmission of the message is described.
Seagate	9	40	E	Figure 5	Incorrect state cited for origination of Send Acknowledgement IU: "(from any state except N3:Accept Sent"	Change to ""(from any state except N3:Accept ACK Sent"
Seagate	10	41	E	4.3.3.3.1 first sentence	"states" should not be plural: "The N0:Idle states waits"	Change to "The N0:Idle state waits"
Seagate	11	41	E	4.3.3.4.1 first and second sentences	These two cases need to clarify that ACCEPT bit is zero.	Add text in red:"If the port transitioned to this state due to an Initiate Login message, the port shall send a Port Login IU in a new exchange. The ACCEPT bit shall be set to zero. If the AOE bit is set, the Port Login IU shall contain starting parameters. If the port transitioned to this state due to a negotiation error, the port shall send a Port Login IU in a new exchange. The Port Login IU shall contain starting parameters and the ACCEPT bit shall be set to zero."

Seagate	12	41	E	First sentence on page	Missing period	Add period to end of sentence
Seagate	13	43	E	4.3.3.7.2	Description is for a non-existent transition	Delete entire sub-clause
Seagate	14	43	T	4.3.3.8	Need to specify how & when we leave this state. It says "While in this state, a port shall not transmit."	No suggestion at this time.
Seagate	15	43	E	4.3.4.1	Possessive needed: "manages the ports permission"	Change to "manages the port's permission"
Seagate	16	43	E	4.3.4.1	Do we need to clarify that ports in automation devices can never enter T1:Paused?	Add a sentence.
Seagate	17	44	E	Figure 6	Capitalize first letter each word of Retryable error detected message in upper left corner.	"Retryable Error Detected"
Seagate	18	45	E	4.3.5.1 list item b)	Capitalize first letter each word of state name	Change to "TE1:Initiating Recovery"
Seagate	19	46	E	4.3.5.3.1	Pluralization needed: "..., NOP IU, Pause IU or ..."	Change to "…, NOP IUs, Pause IUs or ..."
Seagate	20	46	E	4.3.5.4.1	Pluralization needed: "..., NOP IU, Pause IU or ..."	Change to "…, NOP IUs, Pause IUs or ..."
Seagate	21	46	E	4.3.6.1 list item b)	Capitalize first letter each word of state name	Change to "R1:Pending Recovery"
Seagate	22	47	E	4.3.6.2.3 first sentence	Wrong article: "...receiving a Initiate Recovery…"	Change to: "...receiving an Initiate Recovery…"
Seagate	23	48	E	4.4 third paragraph	Should this paragraph be saying "unacknowledged frame count" or "Unacknowledged Frame Counter?"	If it's describing a count, then it's okay as written. If it's describing the counter that contains the count, then change.
Seagate	24	49	T	4.5.3 list item 1)	After sending a Logout, then the port will still be in P2:Logged In, pending receipt of the ACK for the Login. If EFS is set to one immediately, then IUs received before the Logout ACK may enter error recovery.	Two approaches: A) Change 4.3.2.4.2 to perform transition P2:P0 after sending the Logout IU, which means that received IUs will be discarded by the port; or B) Split list item 1) in 4.5.3 into three parts as follows: "1) It shall be set to one after sending or receiving a Port Login IU with the AOE bit set to one; 2) It shall be set to one after receiving a Port Logout IU; 3) It shall be set to one after receiving an ACK IU for a Port Logout IU;" The result of 3) will be to pass

Seagate	25	49	E	4.5.3 list item 3)	P5:Recovering	Change to R2:Recovering
Seagate	26	49	E	4.5.3 list item 4)	P2:Active	Change to R0:Idle
Seagate	27	50	E	4.6.1.3	Incorrect use of semicolon: "There are four types of errors detectable by the frame receiver; corrupted frame,…"	Change to colon: "There are four types of errors detectable by the frame receiver: corrupted frame,…"
Seagate	28	51	E	4.6.2.3	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "see Table 14"
Seagate	29	51	E	4.6.2.3 list item b)	P2:Active (twice) and P3:Pending Recovery	Change to R0:Idle and R1:Pending Recovery, respectively.
Seagate	30	51	E	4.6.2.3 list item c)	P5:Recovering and P2:Active	Change to R2:Recovering and R0:Idle, respectively.
Seagate	31	52	E	4.6.2.4.4 list item 3)	P2:Active	Change to R0:Idle
Seagate	32	52	E	4.6.2.4.4 list items 1) and 2)	P4:Initiating Recovery	Change to TE1:Initiating Recovery
Seagate	33	52	T	4.6.2.5.1	Need to specify the NAK status code	Add text in red: "...the port shall send a NAK IU with STATUS CODE of NEGOTIATION ERROR,…"
Seagate	34	52	E	4.6.2.5.2	Cross reference needed to table	Add text in red: "...appropriate status code (see table 14) and discard…"
Seagate	35	52	E	4.6.2.5.3	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "see Table 14"
Seagate	36	53	E	4.6.2.6.3	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "see Table 14"
Seagate	37	59	E	Table 7	Are "automation port" and "DTD port" consistent with the final terminology?	Change if necessary
Seagate	38	62	E	6.2 second paragraph after Table 11, third sentence	"...associated in these sequences…" is vague	Change to "…associated with the same exchange…"
Seagate	39	62	E	Table 11	Capitalization is inconsistent	Should it be "Link Service", Fast Access", and "Vendor Specific" or "Link service", Fast access", and "Vendor specific" ?
Seagate	40	64	E	6.5.3.2	Spell out numeral in "...contain 0 bytes of payload."	Change to "...contain zero bytes of payload."
Seagate	41	64	E	6.5.3.3 first paragraph after Table 13	P3:Pending Recovery	Change to R1:Pending Recovery
Seagate	42	64	E	6.5.3.3 first paragraph, third sentence	Missing article: "...set to value in the…"	Change to: "...set to the value in the…"

Seagate	43	67	T	Fifth paragraph, third sentence on page	Contradictory rule for incrementing ACK Offset: "Link service IUs are not counted in the offset (see 4.4)." 4.4 says: "The counter shall be incremented by one for each frame that is sent except acknowledgement frames."	Fix page 67: "Acknowledgement IUs are not counted in the offset (see 4.4)"
Seagate	44	67	E	Last paragraph on page	P7:Logged-out	P3:Logged-Out
Seagate	45	67	E	Seventh paragraph, first sentence on page	Incoherent sentence: "The BAUD RATE field indicates the speed that the port is negotiating the physical interface shall run."	Change to: "The BAUD RATE field indicates the speed that the port's physical interface shall run after completion of negotiation."
Seagate	46	72	T	Table 20 and following paragraph. Also Table 26.	Delete QUERY TASK function?	Consider discussions in CAP working group.
Seagate	47	73	E	Table 22 caption	"response code" should be small caps	"RESPONSE CODE"
Seagate	48	73	E	Third paragraph after Table 22	Wrong response code: "This field shall be set to 0 if the response code is not 00h or 06h"	Change to: "This field shall be set to 0 if the response code is not 00h or 05h" or change to the names of the codes, "...COMMAND OR TASK MANAGEMENT FUNCTION COMPLETE or COMMAND COMPLETE WITH GOOD STATUS AND SENSE DATA VALID…"
Seagate	49	80	E	8.2 Heading	Should these words all be capitalized?	Maybe not "support"
Seagate	50	83	E	8.2.5	Inconsistent use of "( )" after function name in the midst of a sentence, when no arguments are present	Remove empty parentheses. Also see 8.2.7, 8.2.9, 8.2.11, & 8.2.12, 8.3.3
Seagate	51	96	E	B.1	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "Table B.1"
Seagate	52	96	E	Table B.1	Line 13 (a = b) "Counter a equals expression b" is not correct	Change description to "Counter a is set to expression b"
Seagate	53	97	E	Figure B.1	Receipt of NAK IU should show transition to TE1	Add description on the left "((PR == 1) && (ACK Offset == 0)) => Enter TE1:Initiating Recovery NFTS = k Send Initiate Recovery"
Seagate	54	99	E	Figure B.3	Dotted line of timeout is not clear. Also applies to figures B.4, 5, 6, and 8.	Change to larger dots?
Seagate	55	100	E	B.5 first sentence	"Acknowledgement IU" should not have the first word capitalized	Change to "acknowledgement IU"

Seagate	56	101	E	Figure B.5	Incorrect names for states	Change: P3:Pending Recovery to R1:Pending Recovery, (on right) P2:Active to R0:Idle, (on left) P4:Initiating Recovery to TE1:Initiating Recovery, and
Seagate	57	102	E	B.7 first sentence	"Acknowledgement IU" should not have the first word capitalized	Change to "acknowledgement IU" (three occurrences)
Seagate	58	107	E	C.3 list item 1)	Capitalize "Table"	Change to "in Table C.2" Similarly for references to Tables C.3 - C.9
Seagate	59	*	E	Multiple	Please check the font size of small caps field names. E.g., FRAME SIZE in 4.3.6.4.1 seems very small.	