IT/02-0661

Accredited Standards Committee, INCITS, Information Technology
INCITS Secretariat, Information Technology Industry Council (ITI)
1250 Eye St. NW, Suite 200, Washington, DC 20005
Telephone 202-737-8888; Fax 202-638-4922; Email: incits@itic.org

Date:	July 8, 2002
Project:	None
Ref. Doc:	ITLB 4450
Reply to:	Deborah J. Donovan, INCITS Secretariat
Phone:	202/626-5746
Email:	ddonovan@itic.org

To: INCITS/T10- **FOR ACTION**

cc: INCITS Executive Board

Subject: Transmittal of Negatives Votes and all Comments received for ITLB 4450, "Approval to Forward INCITS 350, Information Technology - Fibre Channel Protocol for SCSI, Second Version (FCP-2) for final approval as an American National Standard"

Attached are the negative votes and all comments received for ITLB 4450, "Approval to Forward INCITS 350, Information Technology - Fibre Channel Protocol for SCSI, Second Version (FCP-2) for final approval as an American National Standard".

Please add this action item to the next INCITS/T10 agenda for review and discussion.

Please respond to the INCITS negative as soon as possible, copying the INCITS Secretariat on all correspondence.   Also, please reference the ITLB 4450 and the subject matter.

Vote for ITLB4450 by IBM Corp

Below is the response of IBM Corp to Letter Ballot ITLB4450.

Response: No

Comments:

In reviewing the response to Veritas's FCP-2 Public Review comments concerning the clearing actions of link related functions, I do not believe that the proposed solution fully addresses the issues.   1) The solutions presented to the T10 only address the case of error recovery and reauthentication. It fails to address the issue of device discovery. During FCP-2 recommended device discovery process, any new initiator on the SAN issues INQUIRY commands to all visible targets of interest. Issuing this command requires a PLOGI, because it will be the first time that the new initiator port has communicated with the target. Many devices implement shared mode pages, so it is not possible to reset only the mode pages for the specific initiator. The result is that mode pages get reset for all initiators; thereby, crashing any backup application that is currently executing. Given that PLOGI is below the SCSI command layer, device reservations do not provide any protection against this problem. 2) It is also debatable as to whether saved mode pages would retain adequate information to restore the device. Specifically, the "Block Length" directly affects both the recording format and the SCSI command semantics on tape drives. "Block Length" is part of the Mode Parameter Header and does not appear in any mode pages. The "Save Pages" bit in the mode select CDB is only specified to save mode "pages" which are reported as "savable". Therefore, parameters appearing outside of the mode pages won't be saved, except through some vendor-specific extension. Suggested solution: The problem of shared mode pages was already addressed for PRLI/PRLO through FCP-2 Rev 7, Table 4 footnote 12 and Table 6. If this same solution were applied to the
 columns for "Failed Discovery after LIP", "Failed Discovery after OLS" and "LOGO/PLOGI" the problem should be essentially solved without any need for treating sequential devices differently than non-sequential devices. Ronald F. Silletti IBM Corporation