

Due to the tragic events within the US, a large number of people who expected to attend this meeting were not able to be present. Sony, Ricoh, and Philips were represented. We had no formal MMC WG meeting.

Those who were present reviewed the change requests from Pioneer. This was distributed as a collection of PDF files representing changes to the Mt Fuji 5 specification. The following are our comments.

ATAPI.PDF

Request: Add following text to new sub-clause near 4.1.4

INQUIRY, REQUEST SENSE, GET EVENT/STATUS NOTIFICATION, and GET CONFIGURATION commands shall not terminate with CHECK CONDITION status when a unit attention condition exists within the logical unit.

MMC WG discussion:

We believe that MMC3 intends this behavior, but does not specify it clearly. A change shall be made in MMC3.

CLOSEZ.PDF

Request: Add following text to CLOSE TRACK/SESSION Command description

Class 1 event is optionally generated for READY to NOT READY transition during IMMEDIATE execution of BLANK, CLOSE TRACK/SESSION and FORMAT commands.

Class 1 event is mandatory upon return to READY.

Discussion at the WG:

1. The cases surrounding IMMEDIATE executed commands are covered by Device Busy (class 6) events. We prefer to make Device Busy event reporting mandatory. If that is the case, then class 1 events become redundant. We would like to consider making class 1 events obsolete.

2. This represents a technical change to MMC3, so we believe that MMC3 should not be changed.

DASHRW1.PDF

This file contains technical details about DVD-RW that are not important to the host. MMC3 does not contain the original text, so no change can be made.

DASHRW2.PDF

This file contains technical details about DVD-RW that are not important to the host. MMC3 does not contain the original text, so no change can be made.

DASHRW3.PDF

The description of format type 00 requires that the host use only the values returned from the READ FORMAT CAPACITIES command. We think that the requested change is to be applicable only to DVD-RW. The change should be modified specifically for application only to DVD-RW. This would be a technical change, so should be delayed until MMC4.

FEATURES.PDF

Delayed feature reporting is a serious technical change. We believe that it should be coupled with making Device Busy event reporting mandatory. This change shall not be considered until MMC4.

FORMAT.PDF

This seems to be only editorial. We can do this in MMC3.

GETCONFIG1.PDF

This is already in MMC3.

GETCONFIG2.PDF, GETVCONFIG3.PDF, and GETCONFIG4.PDF

These requests are tied to the Delayed feature reporting. This change shall not be considered until MMC4.

GETEVENT.PDF

MMC3 needs a description that is equivalent to this. We may wish to include an implementer's note in order to be as clear as possible.

GETPERF.PDF

Bytes per second should be Kilo-bytes per second.
This error has made its way into MMC3 and shall be corrected.

MODE.PDF

This is a nice editorial change to mode page 2Ah. We are not aware of any implementers that have understood it differently. We see no problem with putting this change into MMC3.

TSTREADY.PDF

We do not understand why this is good. We need more discussion.

WRITE.PDF

More precise discussion of this behavior is desirable. We each wish to study this description for correctness. Certainly we want this in MMC4. We must discuss MMC3 changes with respect to this request.