

01-167R1: MMC3R09 Comment Resolution from T10 Letter Ballot 01-112r0

Date: 8 November 2001
To: T10 Membership
From: W. P. McFerrin, Technical Editor MMC-3
Subject: Comment Resolution - T10 Letter Ballot 01-112r0

T10 members reviewed MMC3R09 during a letter balloting. Specific resolution and replies are attached to each of the comments received from the membership. Review of the comments and the responses began at the May 2001 and July 2001 meetings. Initial results of those meetings are in the document, 01-167r0. Additional consideration has been given to the ballot comments as well as other comments from other areas resulting in minor revisions MMC3R10A - MMC3R10G. Some ballot comments were originally rejected and have consequently been accepted. Some comments were incorrectly labeled "rejected", when in fact, the comment was accepted, but an alternate solution was selected.

Comments attached to No ballot from Mr. Ralph O. Weber of
ENDL Texas:

ENDL 001, Global
There is no consistent capitalization of "command". Sometimes it is "MUTILATE DISK Command" other times it is "MUTILATE DISK command". The correct capitalization is the latter and "MUTILATE DISK Command" should be changed throughout.

Accepted:
See MMC3R10CC.PDF.

ENDL 002, Global
Starting on PDF page 26 the titles on all of the even numbered PDF pages have revision 7 instead of revision 9.

Accepted:
See MMC3R10CC.PDF.

ENDL 003, Global
On PDF Page 55, what is "7/27/00", perhaps July 27, 2000? I cannot find a description of this notation in the conventions sub-clause (3.2). The notation or several variants of it appear to be sufficiently similar to common usage date notation that I suggest that a single notation be adopted such that it is well differentiated from date notation. Last, but by no means least, I suspect that the numbers 7, 27, and 00 are in fact hexadecimal numbers and should be 7h, 27h, and 00h, respectively, according to the conventions described in 3.2. Warning, this notation is extremely common, this is a big problem.

Accepted:
See MMC3R10CC.PDF.

ENDL 004
Global
On PDF Page 239, where do I find the number code value for "DOES NOT"? Never use all capital letters for emphasis.

Accepted:
See MMC3R10CC.PDF.

ENDL 005

Global

Please bring all sub-clause headings to the left margin or indent the body text for the sub-clause as much as the heading. It is very difficult to follow the text flow when the heading is indented and the body is not. One example of an indented heading is "6.1.22.2.1. General Case for CD" on PDF Page 320. Many more examples were noted on pages subsequent to PDF Page 320.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 006

Global

On PDF Page 443, 'behaviour' is spelled 'behavior'. Run the entire document through a spelling checker.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 007

PDF Page 25

Change 'command mapping and delivery vehicle' to 'transport protocol'.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 008

PDF Page 25

Bullet 3) near the bottom of the page seems to be an objective of the SCSI Architecture not of MMC-3.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 009

PDF Page 25

Why is the list on PDF page 25 numbered? There appears to be no ordering constraints so the nominal SCSI style would be to letter the list entries.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 010

PDF Page 25

The revision number in the lined title is 7 not 9.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 011

PDF Page 28

There appears to be more than one acronym in clause 3, so having the plural "acronyms" in the title would seem appropriate.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 012

PDF Page 28

Most acronym definitions use the format "TLA (Three Letter Acronym) - an acronym consisting of three letters." ADIP, ATIP, bcd, RPC, and possibly others fail to follow this style. Since they seem to be in the minority, they should be changed.

Rejected:

The MMC WG has actually created no acronyms. Consequently we have no control over either the length or content. Most of the acronyms defined within clause 3 are taken from referenced documents. Some of those documents are not formal, public standards, but are generally accepted as de facto standards. We must not cause confusion by using acronyms that are different from the listed references.

ENDL 013

PDF Page 29

Are CPPM and CPRM not acronyms for something? They certainly are unlikely to be English words that have no vowels.

Accepted:

Definitions have been included in clause 3 of MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 014

PDF Page 29

The definition of EAN explains where EANs are allocated, but not what EANs are. This does not seem appropriate for a glossary.

Accepted:

The MCN has two sources for allocation: EAN and UPC. MCN is now defined and references both EAN and UPC. EAN references MCN. UPC references MCN. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 015

PDF Page 30

Is EFM an acronym for something? It's not listed in the glossary.

Accepted:

A definition has been included in clause 3 of MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 016

PDF Page 31

Is MRW an acronym for something? It's not listed in the glossary.

Accepted:

A definition has been included in clause 3 of MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 017

PDF Page 32

The entry for UPC names the controlling authority for the entity but says nothing about what a UPC is. A description of UPC seems to be appropriate for a glossary.

Accepted:

The MCN has two sources for allocation: EAN and UPC. MCN is now defined and references both EAN and UPC. EAN references MCN. UPC references MCN. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 018

PDF Page 34

The first three sentences in the last paragraph on PDF page 10 describe data in the MODE SENSE Block Descriptor. Then the last two sentences say that the Block Descriptor is illegal in ATAPI and obsolete in SCSI. Generally, when SCSI standards identify an obsolete field they do not describe the field. The description is limited to something like "The contents of the Mode Sense block descriptor field are obsolete in MMC-3, described in previous versions of this standard."

Accepted:

The description is not correct. We have made non-zero values for Block Descriptor Length obsolete. That allows the use of SCSI-2 defined Block Descriptors without blatant violation of MMC-1, 2 or 3.

ENDL 019

PDF Page 37

"The subsequent execution of a REQUEST SENSE command shall return the deferred error sense information." This statement is not true for Fibre Channel devices and is unlikely to be true for FireWire devices. Many newer protocols return sense data with the CHECK CONDITION status using a mechanism called "autosense". Recommend rewording the sentence to something along the lines of "The sense data associated with the CHECK CONDITION status shall contain the deferred error sense information."

Accepted:

Rewording has been done in all located cases. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 020

PDF Page 38

UNIT ATTENTION is a sense key, not a status. The phrase "UNIT ATTENTION status conditions" needs to be change to either "unit attention conditions" or "sense data with an UNIT ATTENTION sense key". There are three instances of misuse of UNIT ATTENTION in the second paragraph on this page.

Accepted:

Rewording has been done in all located cases. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 021

PDF Page 55

Change "CHECK CONDITION STATUS" to "CHECK CONDITION status". This error appears once on this page, once on PDF page 57, and twice on PDF page 439.

Accepted:

Rewording has been done in all located cases. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 022

PDF Page 55

Change "CHECK CONDITION Status" to "CHECK CONDITION status". I found approximately 42 occurrences of this error.

Accepted:

Rewording has been done in all located cases. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 023

PDF Page 55

What is "WRITE PROTECTED 1"?

Accepted:

This is a typing error. Correction has been done MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 024

PDF Page 55

ASC is not an acronym in clause 3 and is not defined as an acronym in a referenced standard (e.g., SPC-2). Replace "ASC" with "additional sense code". This error occurs once on each of the following PDF pages 55, 151, 182, and 205.

Non-issue:

A definition for ASC has been put into clause 3 of MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 025

PDF Page 55

Change "NO ADDITIONAL SENSE DATA" to "NO ADDITIONAL SENSE INFORMATION".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 026

PDF Page 57

Why is there no line at the bottom of Table 20? Is this due to the table continuation on a second Page?

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 027

PDF Page 57

For better readability, change "A target responding to a PLAY AUDIO(10) command that has a transfer length of zero, with CHECK CONDITION STATUS, and setting the sense key to ILLEGAL REQUEST does not support audio play operations." to "A target that responds to a PLAY AUDIO(10) command containing a transfer length of zero with CHECK CONDITION status and a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST does not support audio play operations."

Rejected:

We prefer the wording that we have.

ENDL 028

PDF Page 65

In the line that begins with AHOOR, AMIN ..., why is the = text not on the same line as the variables?

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 029

PDF Page 66

To better use SCSI terms, change "Some Commands are allowed to generate a NOT READY check condition, and others are not." to "Some commands are allowed to generate a CHECK CONDITION status with a NOT READY sense key and others are not."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 030

PDF Page 70

The ISO/T10 format for 37856 is 37 865.

Accepted:

This is a new format to those who are familiar with ANSI standards, but we expect that confusion will diminish as ISO-ization continues.

ENDL 031

PDF Page 70

The ISO/T10 format for 2048 is 2 048

Accepted:

This is a new format to those who are familiar with ANSI standards, but we expect that confusion will diminish as ISO-ization continues.

ENDL 032

PDF Page 95

Change "sense code ILLEGAL REQUEST" to "sense key ILLEGAL REQUEST".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 033

PDF Page 98

"sense key" should not be capitalized except in titles and table column headings. I found approximately 6 instances of capitalization errors for "sense key" including the one at the bottom of this page.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 034

PDF Page 98

"additional sense code" should not be capitalized except in titles and table column headings.

Non-issue:

The newly defined ASC acronym takes care of this. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 035

PDF Page 98

Replace the entire content of 4.6.1.1 with "Devices that support changing sides shall report a unit attention condition with an additional sense code of NOT READY TO READY, MEDIUM MAY HAVE CHANGED only for changes that involve movement of a Disc in/out of the Logical Unit. Changes of side shall not generate unit attention conditions." N.B. the changes correct wording for the use of "unit attention" and "additional sense code" and move the word "only" closer to the phrase to which it applies.

Rejected:

Some information was lost in the re-wording.

Accepted:

The unit attention usage error has been corrected. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 036

PDF Page 99

In Figure 38, change "'... an "UNIT ATTENTION" ...'" to "... a unit attention condition ..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 037

PDF Page 106

The ISO/T10 format for 65,530 is 65 530

Accepted:

This is a new format to those who are familiar with ANSI standards, but we expect that confusion will diminish as ISO-ization continues.

ENDL 038

PDF Page 113

In the first paragraph after table 57, "PREVENT/ALLOW" should be "PREVENT/ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 039

PDF Page 117

Most other mode pages are described as the "xyz mode page" but the "Read/Write Error Recovery mode page" is referred to almost universally as the "Read/Write Error Recovery page". I think "page" should be changed to "mode page". The first four occurrences of several occurrences of this problem can be found in the last two paragraphs on PDF Page 117.

Accepted:

We shall use mode page naming as is found in SPC-2 rev 18.

ENDL 040

PDF Page 130

A line should be added at the bottom of table 86.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 041

PDF Page 131

The line at the bottom of table 89 should be a thick line as is the case for all (well most all) other tables.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 042

PDF Page 131

In table 89, "Clause" should be "Sub-Clause"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 043

PDF Page 132

In table 93 "Clause" needs to be changed to "Reference" since SBC is not a clause or a sub-clause.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 044

PDF Page 133

In table 95 "Clause" needs to be changed to "Reference" since SBC is not a clause or a sub-clause.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 045

PDF Page 135

Since it is impossible to assign a non standard usage to the comma, "CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE." must be changed to "CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE." Likewise, "CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." must be changed to "CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 046

PDF Page 135

In table 98 "Sub-Clause" needs to be changed to "Reference" since SPC(sic) is not a clause or a sub-clause.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 047

PDF Page 135

In Table 98 (2Fh op code), "SPC" should be changed to "SBC" since SBC defines the VERIFY (10) command not SPC.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 048

PDF Page 141

In table 108, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 049

PDF Page 143

Why are there no sub-clause references in tables 112 and 113?

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 050

PDF Page 145

Why are there no Sub-Clause references in table 115?

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 051

PDF Page 146

In table 117 "Clause" needs to be changed to "Reference" since SPC(sic) is not a clause or a sub-clause.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 052

PDF Page 146

In Table 117 (1Bh op code), "SPC" should be changed to "SBC" since SBC defines the START/STOP UNIT command not SPC.

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 053

PDF Page 146

In table 118, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause".

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 054

PDF Page 147

In table 120, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause".

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 055

PDF Page 148

In table 122, "Clause" needs to be changed to "Reference" since SBC is not a clause or a sub-clause.

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 056

PDF Page 148

In table 123, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause".

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 057

PDF Page 150

In table 125, "Clause" needs to be changed to "Reference" since SPC is not a clause or a sub-clause.

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 058

PDF Page 152

In table 129, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause".

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 059

PDF Page 153

In table 131, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause".

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 060

PDF Page 156

In table 134, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause".

Accepted:

See *MMC3R10C.PDF*.

ENDL 061

PDF Page 157

In table 136, change "Clause" to "Sub-Clause".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 062

PDF Page 175

In the second paragraph after table 158 and in table 159, several numbers are not in ISO/T10 format.

Accepted:

This is a new format to those who are familiar with ANSI standards, but we expect that confusion will diminish as ISO-ization continues.

ENDL 063

PDF Page 178

Lines should be added to the bottom of the first page and each continuation page for table 161.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 064

PDF Page 182

The following sentence has two verbs not joined by an 'and': "If any parameters have values incompatible with the current medium, the Logical Unit shall generate a CHECK CONDITION status, a sense code of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an ASC of ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK shall occur when a write is attempted."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 065

PDF Page 183

There should be a line at the bottom of table 163.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 066

PDF Page 183

Change "..CHECK CONDITION Status, ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 067

PDF Page 184

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL REQUEST, ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 068

PDF Page 186

There is a "Notes:" with no notes following it.

Rejected:

Notes are clearly present.

ENDL 069

PDF Page 193

In table 175, change "FAILURE PREDICTION THRESHOLD - Predicted Logical Unit Failure" to "LOGICAL UNIT FAILURE PREDICTION THRESHOLD EXCEEDED" and "FAILURE PREDICTION THRESHOLD EXCEEDED - Predicted Media Failure" to " MEDIA FAILURE PREDICTION THRESHOLD EXCEEDED".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 070

PDF Page 195

There should be a line at the bottom of table 177.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 071

PDF Page 196

What is a "BUFFER OVERFLOW error"? There is no additional sense code for this.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 072

PDF Page 200

Mode Page Code 2Ch is supposed to be Vendor Specific.

Accepted:

We wish to apply for a mode page number assignment.

ENDL 073

PDF Page 201

In table 182 "Clause" needs to be changed to "Reference" since SBC is not a clause or a sub-clause.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 074

PDF Page 202

In table 182 there are missing cross-reference markers for the READ HEADER and READ MASTER CUE commands.

Accepted:

READ HEADER and READ MASTER CUE commands were made obsolete in MMC-2. All descriptions and references should have been removed in MMC-3. A search and delete was performed in production of MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 075

PDF Page 202

There should be a line at the bottom of the second page on table 182.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 076

PDF Page 205

In "...INQUIRY` GET CONFIGURATION, GET EVENT/STATUS NOTIFICATION, V and REQUEST SENSE are among the commands..." it appears that "INQUIRY" and "V" are commands. I suspect that these are typos.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 077

PDF Page 205

Change "...NOT READY error (Sense Key 2)." to "...NOT READY sense key." Alternatively, change all instances where sense keys are mentioned by name to include values (but I think this change is less work).

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 078

PDF Page 205

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, NO MORE TRACK RESERVATIONS ARE ALLOWED." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of NO MORE TRACK RESERVATIONS ALLOWED." N.B. The word "ARE" has been dropped from the additional sense code name.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 079

PDF Page 205

Change CONDITION Status, INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 080

PDF Page 205

Change "...sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, and an ASC of OPERATION IN PROGRESS" to "... additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OPERATION IN PROGRESS"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 081

PDF Page 205

Change "ANSI NCITS 301, SPC" to "ANSI X3.301:1997, SPC"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 082

PDF Page 208

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status and set sense data to ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID FIELD IN CDB..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and set sense key to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code to INVALID FIELD IN CDB..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 083

PDF Page 208

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, sense code of SESSION FIXATION ERROR - INCOMPLETE TRACK IN SESSION." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of SESSION FIXATION ERROR - INCOMPLETE TRACK IN SESSION."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 084

PDF Page 208

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, sense code EMPTY OR PARTIALLY WRITTEN RESERVED TRACK." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of EMPTY OR PARTIALLY WRITTEN RESERVED TRACK."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 085

PDF Page 208

Change "... CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "... CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 086

PDF Page 209

Change "...return NOT READY status with CHECK CONDITION Status, sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OPERATION IN PROGRESS..." to "...return CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of NOT READY and an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OPERATION IN PROGRESS..."

Accepted:

Corrections have been performed. Please see MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 087

PDF Page 209

Change "...return NOT READY status with CHECK CONDITION Status, an additional sense code of ..." to "...return CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of NOT READY and an additional sense code of..."

Accepted:

Corrections have been performed. Please see MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 088

PDF Page 209

Change "See ANSI NCITS 301 standard." to "See the ANSI X3.301:1997 SPC standard."

Accepted:

Corrections have been performed. Please see MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 089

PDF Page 209

Since neither 'NOT READY' nor 'READY' is used as a sense key name, change "Closing a Track or Session shall cause a Class 1 Event when the command is issued if the Logical Unit becomes NOT READY. A Class 1 Event shall occur if the medium returns to READY or if the medium becomes un-writable." to "Closing a Track or Session shall cause a Class 1 Event when the command is issued if the Logical Unit becomes not ready. A Class 1 Event shall occur if the medium returns to ready or if the medium becomes un-writable."

Accepted:

Rewritten for compatibility with similar text in SBC. See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 090

PDF Page 210

In two places, change "...a CHECK CONDITION and set sense to ILLEGAL REQUEST, COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR." to "...a CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 091

PDF Page 210

Change "WRITE PARAMETERS mode page" to "Write Parameters Mode Page" or "Write Parameters mode page". All caps for "WRITE PARAMETERS" is wrong. I've found three occurrences on this page, plus two more occurrences on PDF Page 214 and a last occurrence on PDF Page 402.

Accepted:

We shall use mode page naming as is found in SPC-2 rev 18. But note: The Write Parameters Mode Page is not documented in SPC-2 rev 18.

ENDL 092

PDF Page 211

In "...ANSI NCITS 301 SPC-2..." 301 is the X3 (not NCITS) number for SPC, not for SPC-2. SPC-2 does not have an NCITS number yet.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 093

PDF Page 212

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, 5/26/00 INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of INVALID REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 094

PDF Page 212

Change "...Sense Key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the Sense Code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST." to "...sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 095

PDF Page 213

There should be a line at the bottom of table 196.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 096

PDF Page 215

Change "...Write Parameter Mode Page." to "...Write Parameters Mode Page."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 097

PDF Page 215

Delete the double quotes surrounding READ FORMAT CAPACITIES Command (and make Command all lower case).

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 098

PDF Page 215

Concerning "on page 6.1.20." 6.1.20 doesn't look like a page number to me.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 099

PDF Page 216

In the first paragraph on the page, "The sense key shall be set to MEDIUM ERROR and the additional sense code & qualifier set to ZONED FORMATTING FAILED DUE TO SPARE LINKING,..." the word 'shall' seems to be in a small point size. Also, change the text to "The sense key shall be set to MEDIUM ERROR and the additional sense code set to ZONED FORMATTING FAILED DUE TO SPARE LINKING,..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 100

PDF Page 216

Change "6.1.20.." to "6.1.20."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 101

PDF Page 217

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, 5/26/00 INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 102

PDF Page 218

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status and set sense data to ILLEGAL REQUEST, COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and set the sense key to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 103

PDF Page 218

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status and set sense data to NOT READY, LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and the set sense key to NOT READY with an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 104

PDF Page 218

Why does the 2nd paragraph of 6.1.3.15.1 use "Logical unit" while the 3rd paragraph use "Logical Unit"? Most places use "Logical Unit" but there are a few that use "Logical unit". All instances of "Logical unit" should be changed to "Logical Unit".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 105

PDF Page 218

Change "...GOOD status and sense data shall be set to NO SENSE, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..." to "...GOOD status and the sense key shall be set to NO SENSE with an additional sense code of FORMAT IN PROGRESS..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 106

PDF Page 219

Change "...GOOD status and sense data shall be set to NO SENSE, NO ADDITIONAL SENSE, NO ADDITIONAL SENSE QUALIFIER, and SKSV shall be cleared to zero." to "...GOOD status and the sense key shall be set to NO SENSE with an additional sense code of NO ADDITIONAL SENSE INFORMATION and SKSV bit shall be set to zero."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 107

PDF Page 219

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status and set sense data to NOT READY, LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and set the sense key to NOT READY with an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 108

PDF Page 220

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status and set sense data to ILLEGAL REQUEST, COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and set the sense key to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 109

PDF Page 221

CONDITION status and set sense data to NOT READY, LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and set the sense key to NOT READY with an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 110

PDF Page 222

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status and set sense data to NOT READY, LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and set the sense key to NOT READY with an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 111

PDF Page 222

Change "...GOOD status and sense data shall be set to NO SENSE, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..." to "...GOOD status and the sense key shall be set to NO SENSE with an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, FORMAT IN PROGRESS..." N.B. the additional sense code text has been changed to match the text in SPC-2.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 112

PDF Page 222

Change "...GOOD status and sense data shall be set to NO SENSE, NO ADDITIONAL SENSE, NO ADDITIONAL SENSE QUALIFIER, and SKSV shall be cleared to zero." to "...GOOD status and the sense key shall be set to NO SENSE with an additional sense code of NO ADDITIONAL SENSE INFORMATION and SKSV bit shall be set to zero."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 113

PDF Page 225

In the 2nd paragraph on the page there are three instances of 65,536 that are not in the ISO format of 65 536.

Accepted:

This is a new format to those who are familiar with ANSI standards, but we expect that confusion will diminish as ISO-ization continues.

ENDL 114

PDF Page 226

In the 1st paragraph after table 207 there is a 65,530 that is not in the ISO format of 65 530.

Accepted:

This is a new format to those who are familiar with ANSI standards, but we expect that confusion will diminish as ISO-ization continues.

ENDL 115

PDF Page 233

In "...reset (issued from a Sleep state)." the word 'state' is in a small point size for no apparent reason.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 116

PDF Page 238

Change "a UNIT ATTENTION condition" to "a unit attention condition".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 117

PDF Page 238

Change "(Logical Units should not return CHECK CONDITION Status, INSUFFICIENT TIME FOR OPERATION." to "Logical Units should not return CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INSUFFICIENT TIME FOR OPERATION." N.B. Leading parenthesis is removed since it has no close parenthesis.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 118

PDF Page 238

Change "...CHECK CONDITION, sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, additional sense key set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID FIELD IN CDB.".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 119

PDF Page 239

Change "...CHECK CONDITION, sense key to ILLEGAL REQUEST, additional sense code to INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 120

PDF Page 242

There is no line at the bottom of table 241.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 121

PDF Page 243

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, 5/24/00 INVALID FIELD IN CDB.." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 122

PDF Page 244

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 123

PDF Page 245

Immediately following Table 248, "Unusable Area" is not a sentence, sub-clause heading, or list preamble.

Accepted:

Deleted sentence fragment.

ENDL 124

PDF Page 248

Change "...CHECK CONDITION being reported to the Initiator with Sense key ILLEGAL REQUEST, Sense Code INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 125

PDF Page 248

Twice in the second to the last paragraph on the page, change "...Sense Key ILLEGAL REQUEST, Sense Code INVALID FIELD IN CDB..." to "...with a CHECK CONDITION status, a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 126

PDF Page 248

Change "...with a Sense Key NOT READY and Sense Code 3Ah MEDIUM NOT PRESENT." to "...with a CHECK CONDITION status, a sense key of NOT READY, and an additional sense code of MEDIUM NOT PRESENT."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 127

PDF Page 249

Change "A UNIT ATTENTION Condition..." to "An unit attention condition..."

Rejected:

Even WORD thinks you are wrong.

ENDL 128

PDF Page 251.

In "The Current LBA value..." the word "Current" is in a small point size.

Accepted:

Corrected to Arial font.

ENDL 129

PDF Page 252

In "The Length of Slot Tables field.." the word phrase 'Length of Slot Tables' is in a small point size.

Accepted:

Corrected to Arial font.

ENDL 130

PDF Page 253

Twice in the second paragraph after Table 263, change "...CHECK CONDITION status, COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 131

PDF Page 254

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS OUT OF RANGE." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and an additional sense code of LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS OUT OF RANGE."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 132

PDF Page 254

In the phrase "...The sense key shall be set..." the word 'shall' is in a small point size.

Accepted:

Corrected to Arial font.

ENDL 133

PDF Page 254

Change "The Sense Key..." to "The sense key..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 134

PDF Page 257

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 135

PDF Page 257

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS OUT OF RANGE. If the address is not within an audio track the command shall be terminated with CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK or INCOMPATIBLE MEDIUM INSTALLED." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS OUT OF RANGE. If the address is not within an audio track the command shall be terminated with CHECK CONDITION status with and additional sense code of ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK or INCOMPATIBLE MEDIUM INSTALLED."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 136

PDF Page 258

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, ILLEGAL REQUEST, READ OF SCRAMBLED SECTOR WITHOUT AUTHENTICATION." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of READ OF SCRAMBLED SECTOR WITHOUT AUTHENTICATION."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 137

PDF Page 259

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status, a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 138

PDF Page 262

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 139

PDF Page 264

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status and a sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 140

PDF Page 265

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 141

PDF Page 267

Change "...non-recoverable error generated READ ERROR - LOSS OF STREAMING." to "...non-recoverable error generated with an additional sense code of READ ERROR - LOSS OF STREAMING."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 142

PDF Page 270

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK or INCOMPATIBLE MEDIUM INSTALLED." to "...CHECK CONDITION status, and an additional sense code of ILLEGAL MODE FOR THIS TRACK or INCOMPATIBLE MEDIUM INSTALLED."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 143

PDF Page 271

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL REQUEST." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and a sense key ILLEGAL REQUEST."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 144

PDF Page 275

Change "...return NOT READY status with CHECK CONDITION Status, LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OPERATION IN PROGRESS." to "...return CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of NOT READY and an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OPERATION IN PROGRESS."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 145

PDF Page 277

The following text appears to be a footnote in Table 296: "(1) When a disc is in DVD-RW restricted overwrite mode and the last session is Intermediate state, this status code is returned." Table footnotes must appear as footer rows in the table itself, not outside the table border.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 146

PDF Page 279

Change "FF/FF/FF/FF" to "FFh/FFh/FFh/FFh" in two occurrences on this page.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 147

PDF Page 281

CONDITION status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 148

PDF Page 283

Change "..with an INVALID FIELD IN CDB error." to "..with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 149

PDF Page 285

There is no line at the bottom of table 309.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 150

PDF Page 285

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, sense code INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 151

PDF Page 286

Table 312 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents. This is in violation of T10 and ISO style requirements.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 152

PDF Page 286

Table 313 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 153

PDF Page 287

Table 314 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 154

PDF Page 288

Tables 315 and 316 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 155

PDF Page 290

Table 318 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 156

PDF Page 290

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status." to "...CHECK CONDITION status."

ENDL 157

PDF Page 291

Tables 319 and 320 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 158

PDF Page 291

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status." to "...CHECK CONDITION status."

ENDL 159

PDF Page 292

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

ENDL 160

PDF Page 292

table 322 is on a different page than the table.

Accepted:

Changed caption style.

ENDL 161

PDF Page 292

Table 321 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 162

PDF Page 293

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION Status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

ENDL 163

PDF Page 293

Table 323 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 164

PDF Page 294

Tables 324 and 325 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 165

PDF Page 295

Table 326 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 166

PDF Page 297

Table 327 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 167

PDF Page 298

In the phrase "The Media Specific field shall return information..." the word 'shall' is in bold and italics type. Change it to plain text to conform with the overall document style and with the requirements of ANSI and ISO.

Accepted:

Corrected to Arial font.

ENDL 168

PDF Page 300

Table 333 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 169

PDF Page 301

Table 334 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 170

PDF Page 302

Table 335 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 171

PDF Page 304

Table 339 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 172

PDF Page 306

In table 343, the left column heading appears to be "E Byt e".

Accepted:

Column size was a bit small.

ENDL 173

PDF Page 310

There are two unresolved cross-references in the paragraph following table 349.

Accepted:

Caused by READ HEADER removal after obsolescence. Need new tables for READ SUB-CHANNEL to replace non-existent READ HEADER tables.

ENDL 174

PDF Page 316

In table 361, change the left column title from "Error" to "Error or Additional Sense Code".

Accepted:

Clearer

ENDL 175

PDF Page 318

Change "...with an INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 176

PDF Page 318

Change "...shall report CANNOT READ MEDIUM - ICOMPATIBLE FORMAT." to "...shall report an additional sense code of CANNOT READ MEDIUM - INCOMPATIBLE FORMAT." Note: INCOMPATIBLE is misspelled.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 177

PDF Page 319

Table 364 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 178

PDF Page 320

Table 365 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 179

PDF Page 323

Table 367 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 180

PDF Page 325

Table 368 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 181

PDF Page 328

Table 373 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 182

PDF Page 330

Table 374 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents and lacks a line at the bottom of the table.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 183

PDF Page 331

Why is "Highest Usable CLV Recording Speed (see Table 377)- valid only when A1 = 1." after table 376 while all the other lines like it before the table?.

Accepted:

The A1 bit name is now A1 Valid (same for A2 and A3).

ENDL 184

PDF Page 332

Change "...an INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 184 1/2

PDF Page 332

Table 378 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 185

PDF Page 333

In table 379, change the left column title from "Error" to "Error or Additional Sense Code".

Accepted:

Clearer

ENDL 186

PDF Page 334

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, sense code of UNABLE TO RECOVER TABLE-OF-CONTENTS." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and an additional sense code of UNABLE TO RECOVER TABLE-OF-CONTENTS."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 187

PDF Page 334

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, sense code L-EC UNCORRECTABLE ERROR." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and an additional sense code L-EC UNCORRECTABLE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 188

PDF Page 334

Change "...return NOT READY status with CHECK CONDITION Status, LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OPERATION IN PROGRESS." to "...return CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of NOT READY and an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, OPERATION IN PROGRESS."

ENDL 189

PDF Page 335

There is no line at the bottom of table 382.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 190

PDF Page 336

Change "...a CHECK CONDITION status to be presented." to "...a CHECK CONDITION status to be returned."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 191

PDF Page 338

Table 384 has a jagged border on its header lines and no line at the bottom of the table.

Accepted:

Most challenging

ENDL 192

PDF Page 344

Table 393 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 193

PDF Page 345

Tables 394 and 395 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 194

PDF Page 345

Change "...additional sense code & qualifier..." to "...additional sense code...".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 195

PDF Page 346

Table 396 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 196

PDF Page 346

Change "...COPY PROTECTION KEY EXCHANGE FAILURE and the additional sense code qualifier shall be set to KEY NOT PRESENT." to "...COPY PROTECTION KEY EXCHANGE FAILURE - KEY NOT PRESENT."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 197

PDF Page 346

Change "...additional sense code & qualifier..." to "...additional sense code...".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 198

PDF Page 347

Tables 397 and 398 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 199

PDF Page 348

Table 401 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 200

PDF Page 349

In the phrase "...reservation of disc space for a track." the word 'track' is in a small point size.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 201

PDF Page 349

In table 404 row 1, change "CHECK CONDITION status is returned and sense is set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR" to "CHECK CONDITION status is returned and the sense key is set to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 202

PDF Page 349

In table 404 row 4, change "...and sense is set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...and the sense key is set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 203

PDF Page 350

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL REQUEST, COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with the sense key set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 204

PDF Page 350

In the phrase, "...less than three, the command shall be terminated..." the word 'shall' is in a small point size.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 205

PDF Page 350

Change "NO MORE RESERVATION IS ALLOWED." to "NO MORE TRACK RESERVATIONS ALLOWED."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 206

PDF Page 350

Change "RMA/PMA IS FULL." to "RMA/PMA IS ALMOST FULL."

Rejected:

Full is correct.

ENDL 207

PDF Page 354

Change "...then CHECK CONDITION status is returned and sense key is set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR." to "...then CHECK CONDITION status is returned and the sense key is set to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of COMMAND SEQUENCE ERROR."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 208

PDF Page 362

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, CANNOT READ MEDIUM - INCOMPATIBLE FORMAT." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and the additional sense code set to CANNOT READ MEDIUM - INCOMPATIBLE FORMAT."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 209

PDF Page 362

There is no line at the bottom of table 428.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 210

PDF Page 363

Tables 429 and 430 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 211

PDF Page 364

The note immediately preceding 6.1.30.3 is not indented in the same way that other notes in this standard are indented.

Accepted:

It looks much nicer now.

ENDL 212

PDF Page 365

Table 433 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 213

PDF Page 366

Tables 434 and 435 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 214

PDF Page 368

In the phrase "...Immediate (IMMED) bit.." the acronym 'IMMED' should be in a san-sarif font so that it matches the use of IMMED in the last sentence of the paragraph.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 215

PDF Page 369

In the sentence "Operational Request Code field contains the actual requested operation." the word 'code' is in a small point size.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 216

PDF Page 371

Tables 444 and 445 do not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the tables' contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 217

PDF Page 371

Change "...additional sense code & qualifier..." to "...additional sense code..."

ENDL 218

PDF Page 372

SPC-2 calls ASC/ASCQ 6Fh/05h "DRIVE REGION MUST BE PERMANENT/REGION RESET COUNT ERROR" not "LOGICAL UNIT REGION MUST BE PERMANENT/REGION RESET COUNT ERROR". Note: if it is decided to change MMC-3 to match SPC-2, then a global search and replace is required.

Accept:

We replaced all cases of drive with Logical Unit some time ago, but this one should not have changed.

ENDL 219

PDF Page 372

Table 446 does not have an unbroken border surrounding all of the table's contents.

Rejected:

Excluded text is not a part of the table.

ENDL 220

PDF Page 372

In the phrase "Preferred Logical Unit Regional Code is sent to the DVD Logical Unit..." the words "Preferred Logical Unit Regional Code" are in a small point size and a sarif font.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 221

PDF Page 375

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID FIELD IN CDB..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 222

PDF Page 379

There is no line at the bottom of table 457.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 223

PDF Page 379

Change "...CHECK CONDITION Status, INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN PARAMETER LIST."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 224

PDF Page 379

Change "...Read/Write Error Recovery page." to "...Read/Write Error Recovery mode page."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 225

PDF Page 385

Change "...the status shall be set to CHECK CONDITION, ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE." to "...the command shall be terminated with a CHECK CONDITION status, the sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST and the additional sense code set to INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 226

PDF Page 386

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID ADDRESS FOR WRITE."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 227

PDF Page 386

Change "...CHECK CONDITION status, ILLEGAL COMMAND, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...CHECK CONDITION status with a sense key of ILLEGAL COMMAND and additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 228

PDF Page 386

Change "...not cause a NOT READY condition..." to "...not cause a not ready condition..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 229

PDF Page 386

Change "CHECK CONDITION Status, LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, LONG WRITE IN PROGRESS may exist..." to "A CHECK CONDITION status with an additional sense code of LOGICAL UNIT NOT READY, LONG WRITE IN PROGRESS may be returned..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 230

PDF Page 386

Change "...and sense data shall be set to 05/30/10, ILLEGAL REQUEST, MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED." to "...and the sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of CANNOT WRITE MEDIUM - UNKNOWN FORMAT." N.B. additional sense code MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED [30h/10h] is not specified in SPC-2.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 231

PDF Page 387

Change "...and sense data shall be set to 05/30/10, ILLEGAL REQUEST, MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED." to "...and the sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of CANNOT WRITE MEDIUM - UNKNOWN FORMAT." N.B. additional sense code MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED [30h/10h] is not specified in SPC-2.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 232

PDF Page 387

Twice on this page, change "...terminate the Command with CHECK CONDITION Status, ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID FIELD IN CDB." to "...terminate the command with CHECK CONDITION status, a sense key of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 233

PDF Page 389

Change "...READ/WRITE ERROR RECOVERY PAGE." to "...Read/Write Error Recovery mode Page."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 234

PDF Page 389

Change "...VERIFY ERROR RECOVERY PAGE." to "...Verify Error Recovery mode page."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 235

PDF Page 389

Change "...and sense data shall be set to 05/30/10, ILLEGAL REQUEST, MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED." to "...and the sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of CANNOT WRITE MEDIUM - UNKNOWN FORMAT." N.B. additional sense code MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED [30h/10h] is not specified in SPC-2.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 236

PDF Page 391

The bottom area of every table in Annex A is not rendered correctly on first pages, continuation Pages, and last pages of the tables.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 237

PDF Page 391

The text introducing table A.1 should include a description of what the Type column means, what values may be found in that column and what they tell the reader.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 238

PDF Page 392

Tables A.1 and A.2 contain several instances where sense key B is shown as b. Hexadecimal values are never shown in lower case, even if the trailing h has been replaced with a table note.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 239

PDF Page 394

Additional sense code MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED is not listed in SPC-2.

Accepted:

How much does that cost?

ENDL 240

PDF Page 395

Change "ERASE FAILURE - Incomplete erase operation detected" to "ERASE FAILURE - INCOMPLETE ERASE OPERATION DETECTED"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 241

PDF Page 395

Change "FAILURE PREDICTION THRESHOLD EXCEEDED - Predicted Media Failure" to " MEDIA FAILURE PREDICTION THRESHOLD EXCEEDED"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 242

PDF Page 395

Change "FAILURE PREDICTION THRESHOLD EXCEEDED - Predicted Spare Area Exhaustion" to "SPARE AREA EXHAUSTION PREDICTION THRESHOLD EXCEEDED"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 243

PDF Page 396

Change "LOGICAL UNIT REGION MUST BE PERMANENT/REGION RESET COUNT ERROR" to "DRIVE REGION MUST BE PERMANENT/REGION RESET COUNT ERROR"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 244

PDF Page 401

Additional sense code MEDIUM NOT FORMATTED is not listed in SPC-2.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 245

PDF Page 409

Replace the sentence currently in D.2.4 with: "FCP devices always use autosense to report the sense data associated with a CHECK CONDITION status in an FCP_RSP_IU. This replaces the most common but not the only use of the REQUEST COMMAND."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 246

PDF Page 410

In the phrase, "specified in the SCSI Standard." there is an unnecessary line feed between 'the' and 'SCSI'.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 247

PDF Page 418

In the table F.3 comments column, why are some entries centered and others left justified? BTW it looks like left justified would read better in all cases.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 248

PDF Page 419

In table G.1, the description of the EXTENDED COPY command must refer to SPC-2 instead of SPC since the EXTENDED COPY command is not described in SPC.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 249

PDF Page 419

The bottom of table G.1 is not rendered correctly.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 250

PDF Page 422

Change ... "a UNIT ATTENTION is ..." to "... an unit attention condition is ..." and "... the UNIT ATTENTION ..." to "... the unit attention condition ...".

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 251

PDF Page 422

In the second and third paragraphs of H.4, change "... UNIT ATTENTION conditions." to "... unit attention conditions."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 253

PDF Page 422

Change "... clears the UNIT ATTENTION." to "... clears the unit attention condition."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 253

PDF Page 422

Change "... UNIT ATTENTION reporting ..." to "... unit attention condition reporting ..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 254

PDF Page 424

In table I.1, "PREVENT/ALLOW MEDIUM" should be "PREVENT/ALLOW MEDIUM REMOVAL"

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 255

PDF Page 424

In Table I.1 change the column heading "Sub-clause" to "Reference" since SPC and SBC are not sub-clauses.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 256

PDF Page 425

The reference for START/STOP UNIT should be SBC not SPC.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 257

PDF Page 425

The reference for VERIFY should be SBC not SPC and the command name should be VERIFY(10) not VERIFY.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 258

PDF Page 426

The reference for START/STOP UNIT should be SBC not SPC.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 259

PDF Page 426

The bottom of table I.2 is not rendered correctly.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

ENDL 260

PDF Page 426

The reference for VERIFY should be SBC not SPC and the command name should be VERIFY(10) not VERIFY.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 261

PDF Page 431

The tables in Annex K do not have titles and several are not centered on the page.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 262

PDF Page 431

The ISO format for 337812 is 337 812. This is only one of several numbers that are not formatted according to the ISO rules.

Accepted:

This is a new format to those who are familiar with ANSI standards, but we expect that confusion will diminish as ISO-ization continues.

ENDL 263

PDF Page 439

Change "...and set sense to ILLEGAL REQUEST, INVALID FIELD IN CDB..." to "...and set the sense key to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of INVALID FIELD IN CDB..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 264

PDF Page 439

Twice in K.1.5, change "...CHECK CONDITION STATUS and sense shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST, LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS OUT OF RANGE..." to "...CHECK CONDITION status and the sense key shall be set to ILLEGAL REQUEST with an additional sense code of LOGICAL BLOCK ADDRESS OUT OF RANGE..."

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

ENDL 265

PDF Page 444

Why is there a blank page at the end of the dpANS?

Accepted:

Deleted extra form feed.

Comments attached to No ballot from Mr. Robert C. Elliott of Compaq
Computer Corp.

The comments were annotations to the MMC3R9.PDF file. Although the
reviewer's job is made simpler via this method, a formal response to
this sort of document is cumbersome at best. Luckily, virtually all
comments reflected improper word usage with respect to their use in
formal standards documents. The MMC WG has chosen to accept nearly
every comment and change the text as suggested. Acceptance of the
comment means that the WG has accepted that the text was incorrect.
Suggested wording was not always followed 100%.

The small number of rejected comments follow.

Comment 1:

Sub-clause 2.1.1, approved references, ATA/ATAPI-4 should be ATA/ATAPI-5.

Rejected:

Actually, ATA/ATAPI-5 has not yet been assigned a ANSI document number, so ATA/ATAPI-4 is still the correct document under "approved references". We should list ATA/ATAPI-5 as a "reference under development".

Comment 2:

Add definitions for MSB and LSB.

Rejected:

Using other T10 documents as guidelines (specifically SPC-2), we have determined that MSB and LSB actually belong in the Acronyms sub-clause.

Comment 3:

After table 9 (PDF page 47), the text defining the meaning of the mode byte should be organized as a separate table.

Rejected:

This particular text is clear and causes no confusion.

Comment 4:

Sub-clause "Persistent Bit" PDF page 106: "shall indicate" appears twice in this paragraph. Change to "indicates".

Rejected:

These are mandatory requirements associated with the two possible settings of the Persistent bit.

Comment 5:

PDF Page 124: change "shall indicate" to "indicates".

Rejected:

The LU is required to provide a correct indication for the initiator. The "shall" is correctly present.

Comment 6:

PDF page 111, change "must" to "shall".

Accepted with alternate solution:

The statement forces behavior upon the initiator. We are defining mandatory behavior for the LU, so we may only give strong recommendations to the initiator - "should".

Comment 7:

PDF page 147: change "will contain" to "contains".

Accepted with alternate solution:

This specifies mandatory behavior. So the change is "shall contain".

Comment 8:

PDF page 196: comments on wording with respect to the description of CD-DA Stream is Accurate bit.

Page 197: comments on wording with respect to Lock State and Prevent Jumper.

Accepted with alternate solution:

The wording of the description was deemed inadequate, so much of the text was changed. The spirit of the comment was followed.

Comment 9:

Comment about Rotation Control field (PDF page 199) being 3 bits with definition for only two bits.

Accepted with alternate solution:

The field is only 2 bits, but the name between the two tables varies slightly. The naming has been corrected.

Comments attached to No ballot from Mr. Peter Johansson of
Congruent Software, Inc.:

Page number references, when used, are to the page number that appears
in the footer, NOT to the internal page number within the PDF file.

1. References to Serial Bus should be regularized throughout. I suggest
adopting the term "IEEE 1394" and, in the normative references clause,
explain that this precise phrase "shall be understood as a reference to
IEEE Std 1394-1995 as amended by IEEE Std 1394a-2000." Note the proper
form for IEEE citations.

Accepted:
Corrected in MMC3R10C.PDF.

2. Strike IEEE P1394a from the "references under development" section.

Accepted:
Corrected in MMC3R10C.PDF.

3. A bibliographic reference to draft standard IEEE P1394b should be
added. It would be worth noting that devices that use the extensions in
IEEE P1394b may be compliant with MMC-3 i.e., no future changes in MMC
are anticipated as a consequence of the eventual approval of IEEE
P1394b as a standard.

Accepted:
Corrected in MMC3R10C.PDF.

4. Delete definition 3.1.4, algorithm type. It's so generic as to lose
its usefulness.

Accepted:
Corrected in MMC3R10C.PDF.

5. Definition 3.1.37, "de-icing" should not be capitalized. It is used
(properly) elsewhere without capitals.

Accepted with alternate solution:
Capitalized appears to be correct.

6. Is the definition of 3.1.58, "format", so particular to MMC that it
merits inclusion? Take it out.

Accepted with alternate solution:
We did, however, expand the definition to be MMC relevant.

7. Definition 3.1.118, "track relative logical address", is nowhere
referenced in the document. Delete it.

Accepted:
Corrected in MMC3R10C.PDF.

8. On page 36, Acrobat reported an internal PDF error and was unable to
display some information. I have no way of knowing if critical parts of
the document have escaped review.

Non-problem:
**This is one of several problems presented by the use of PDF Writer
rather than Acrobat Distiller.**

9 On page 251, the capitalization of "command packet" is inconsistent with its use elsewhere.

Accepted:

Corrected.

10. On page 269, it is difficult to decipher table 323. Is this meant to be one table or two? The byte numbering resets to zero in the middle.

Accepted:

See MMC3R10C.PDF.

11. The draft standard is marred throughout by numerous errors in its typography: incomplete or truncated figures and tables, omissions of header information that may or may not be intentional, etc., etc. Because I am not as familiar with the technical material as might be, it is difficult for me to assess the cumulative affect of these errors in presentation. It's my opinion, though, that a subsequent letter ballot is warranted after their correction.

Accepted:

Most of the problems come from a poor rendering of the document by an incorrect use of Acrobat.

Comments attached to Yes ballot from Mr. Paul D. Aloisi of Texas Instruments:

Tables in Annex A and G appear to be cut off by the text below the table.

Non-problem:

PDF Writer makes the file look this way when a WORD frame surrounds a table. In the future, only Distiller will be used.

Comments attached to Yes C ballot from Mr. Tasuku Kasebayashi of
Toshiba America Elec. Comp.:

The DVD Media does not include DVD+RW according to Mt.Fuji5
specification. So the following correction is needed.

4.5. DVD Model (Page46 of the mmc3r09 document)

Please change:

"The DVD Model is the description for the DVD Media (DVD-ROM,DVD-R/-
RW,DVD-RAM, and DVD+RW)."

to:

"The DVD Model is the description for the DVD Media (DVD-ROM, DVD-R,
DVD-RW, DVD-RAM) and DVD+RW."

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

Additional Comments:

Comments received by e-mail from Mr. Dirk Erickson of Dell.

I have a question on an inconsistency I found in MMC-3. MMC-3 has a new sentence added to the GESN command stating that "any pending unit attention condition for which a corresponding event is reported shall not be cleared for the target". Appendix H (H.3) still states "implementation simply requires recording an even whenever a UNIT ATTENTION is generated, and having the GET EVENT/STATUS NOTIFICATION command clear the UNIT ATTENTION when the command completes." These sentences seem to conflict.

Accepted:

Annex is wrong. The change is in the final version of MMC3R10C.PDF.

Additional Comments:
Comments received by e-mail from Kohda-san of Pioneer

[Comment #1]

Figure 32 - Data Structure of Disc Lead-in Area on Page 60

Some parts of the Figure 32 are incorrect.

This Figure was correct in MMC3 Rev 7. (Page 59)

But the Figure was redrawn when Rev 8 was published due to update of DVD+RW Lead-in structure and many mistakes got mixed with the Figure. These editorial mistakes are still remaining in Rev 9.

The Figure 32 should be corrected to match the Figure 32 in Rev 7 except DVD+RW Lead-in structure.

1. The media name is wrong. (first row, second column)

Current description is:

DVD-R/-RW for General Use, ver 2.0

The correct media name is:

DVD-RW, DVD-R for General ver 2.0

2. Field name is wrong (fifth row, second column)

Current description is:

-R/-RW Physical format information Zone

The correct field name is:

R/RW-Physical format information Zone

3. Reference Code Zone size for DVD-RW, DVD-R for General ver 2.0 is wrong (sixth row, second column)

Reference Code Zone size for DVD-RW, DVD-R for General ver 2.0 is 2 ECC blocks.

The addresses 2F000h and 2F010h should be assigned to Reference Code Zone.

4. Buffer Zone 1 size for DVD-RW, DVD-R for General ver 2.0 is wrong (seventh row, second column)

Buffer Zone 1 size for DVD-RW, DVD-R for General ver 2.0 is 1 ECC block.

Only the address 2F020h should be assigned to Buffer Zone 1.

5. Reference Code Zone size for DVD-RAM is wrong

Reference Code Zone size for DVD-RAM is 1 ECC block.

Only the address 2F000h should be assigned to Reference Code Zone.

6. Asterisks "*" are missing. (Asterisks identify Embossed areas.)

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

[Comment #2]

4.5.5.7 DVD-R/-RW-Physical format information Zone on Page 65

This caption was correct in MMC3 Rev 7.on Page 63.

The caption was changed incorrectly for Rev 8.

This caption should be corrected to match the caption in MMC3 Rev 7.

à 4.5.5.7 R/RW-Physical format information Zone.[Comment #3]

4.5.5.7 DVD-R/-RW-Physical format information Zone on Page 65, 1 st paragraph

There is an editorial mistake. "DVD-R/RW" should be "DVD-RW"
The R/RW- Physical format information Zone is defined only for DVD- R/
RW and DVD-R for General Ver.2.0 media. The
R/RW- Physical format information Zone contains 192 ECC blocks. Each
R/RW- Physical format information consists of 16
sectors and is repeated 192 times.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

[Comment #4]

Table 38 DVD-R/RW Physical format information Zone on Page 65

This Table caption is incorrect.

This should be "Table 38 R/RW -Physical format information Zone"

[Comment #5]

Table 39 - Data Area Allocation field in -R/-RW-Physical format information on Page 65

This Table caption was correct in MMC3 Rev 7 on Page 64.

The caption was changed incorrectly for Rev 8.

This caption should be corrected to match the caption in MMC3 Rev 7.

à Table 39 - Data Area Allocation field in R/RW-Physical format information

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

[Comment #6]

Table 40 - Unique Part of Physical Format Information in -R/-RW-Physical format information

This Table caption was correct in MMC3 Rev 7 on Page 64.

The caption was changed incorrectly for Rev 8.

This caption should be corrected to match the caption in MMC3 Rev 7.

à Table 40 - Unique Part of Physical Format Information in R/RW - Physical format information

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

[Comment #7]

4.6.1.2 Attention Conditions for Sided Discs on page 74, 1st paragraph

There is a typo.

The correct sense code is "NOT READY TO READY CHANGE, MEDIUM MAY HAVE CHANGED".

Devices that support changing sides shall only report UNIT ATTENTION with sense code NOT READY TO READY,MEDIUM MAY HAVE CHANGED for changes that involve movement of a Disc in/out of the Logical Unit. Changes of side shall not generate UNIT ATTENTION Conditions..

[Comment #8]

Table 188 - Session and Track Bits Definitions on page 184 (Session =1, Track = 0)

There is a typo. "DVD-RO" should be "DVD-ROM"

If a DVD+RW background format is in progress, the format operation shall be stopped and the disc shall be structured for removal according to the DVD+RW 4.7 Gbytes Basic Formats Specifications for the specific purpose of providing DVD-RO compatibility. In general, this means that a [partial] lead-in shall be written, a [temporary] lead-out shall be appended and all unrecorded gaps between lead-in and lead-out shall be format written.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

[Comment #9]

6.1.3.13 Formatting on Format Type = 15h (DVD-RW Quick) on page 193

There is incorrect description.

The Disc Status field of Format 3 RMD shall be set to 13h when the DVD-RW Quick format operation is completed. "12h" should be "13h"

This format operation is always available. If a disc is to be formatted that is blanked, new intermediate state session is created at the beginning of the disc and the recording mode is changed to restricted overwrite

mode. The number of track in the created session is one after this operation. The Disc Status field of Format 3 RMD shall be set to 12h when the operation is completed.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

[Comment #10]

6.1.18. READ DISC INFORMATION Command on Page 254

MRW status field in the Disc Information Block (Table 298) was renamed to BG Format Status. But descriptions of "MRW status" are still remaining in section 6.1.18, on page 254.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

[Comment #11]

6.1.39. WRITE (10) Command on Page 362

There is a typo. "SYNCHRONOUS CACHE" should be "SYNCHRONIZE CACHE"

While writing is occurring, the Logical Unit may not be able to process all SCSI commands. The following is a list of commands that shall function during writing without causing a SYNCHRONOUS CACHE.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10CC.PDF.

Additional Comments:

Comments received by e-mail from Mr. Henry Gabryjelski of Microsoft.

1. The Mt. Fuji document includes the SMART Feature. This feature is not represented in the MMC3R9 document.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

2. In the model section of MMC3R9, the DVD+RW Feature is mentioned, but I do not find a description.

Rejected:

Look again, the DVD+RW Feature description is present in MMC3R09.PDF.

Additional Comments:

Comments received by e-mail from Mr. Masaetsu Takahashi of Ricoh.

The latest revision (March) of Mt Fuji 5 reflects the correct version of the ATIP descriptor format for high speed CD-RW media. Please make MMC3 consistent.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.

Additional Comments:

Comments received from Mr. Bill McFerrin representing Philips.

The MRW Mode Page Code is documented as the vendor unique code, 2Ch. T10 has assigned 03h as a permanent code. This should be corrected in MMC3. Please add a note recommending that both codes be recognized as valid by both initiators and logical units.

Accepted:

A change appears in MMC3R10C.PDF.