To: T10 Technical Committee
From: Rob Elliott, Compaq Computer Corporation (Robert.Elliott@compaq.com)
Date: 27 July 2001
Subject: SPC-3 Letting persistent reservations ignore target ports

Revision History
Revision 0 (5 March 2001) first revision. Not complete, but as presented in CAP working group.
Revision 1 (17 April 2001). Removed mode page option; use a bit in the CDB. Removed target port group relationship. Add PR IN report capability.
Revision 2 (26 June 2001). New approach: let target port be ignored if the initiator port name is world wide unique.
Revision 3 (27 July 2001). Incorporated input from July CAP WG. Added set capability to preserve forward/backwards compatibility. Added persist through power loss requirement. Added length field to report capabilities parameter data.

Related Documents
T10/spc2r19 – SCSI Primary Commands revision 19 (by Ralph Weber)
T10/00-182r0 - SAM-2 device and port names (by Jim Hafner)

Overview
SPC-2 requires that logical units remember the target port through which a reservation was made in addition to the initiator port that originated the reservation. An application client wishing to make a reservation needs to run the PERSISTENT RESERVE command through each target port that can route commands to the logical unit.
In many cases, the logical unit doesn’t care which target port the reservation came through. It just wants to distinguish between initiators. Requiring reservation commands for each port burdens the application client with issuing extra commands and burdens the logical unit with extra non-volatile storage.

The reason for this rule is that the target ports may be in different SCSI domains, so they cannot rely on the initiator port identifier alone to truly identify the initiator. If both domains were on parallel SCSI busses, for example, both initiators would likely appear as ID 7.

On many fabrics, however, the initiator port is identified not only by an initiator port identifier but also an initiator port name. The initiator port name may be required to be world wide unique. When this is true, the worry about different SCSI domains disappears.

This proposal clarifies when the logical unit uses the initiator port identifier and initiator port name in reservations and when the target port must be included. It adds a PR IN service action to report compliance with this new standard or behavior compatible with previous standards.

**Suggested Changes**
Text is from SPC-2 revision 19.

**5.5.1 Reservations overview**
Reservations may be used to allow a device server to execute commands from a selected set of initiators. The device server shall reject commands from initiators outside the selected set of initiators by uniquely identifying initiators using protocol specific mechanisms.
5.5.3.1 Overview of the Persistent Reservations management method

The PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT and PERSISTENT RESERVE IN commands provide the basic mechanism for dynamic contention resolution in multiple initiator systems using multiple port targets. Before a persistent reservation may be established, an initiator shall register with a device server using a reservation key. Reservation keys are necessary to allow:

a) authentication of subsequent PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT commands;
b) identification of other initiators that are registered;
c) identification of the reservation key(s) that have an associated reservation;
d) preemption of a persistent reservation from a failing or uncooperative initiator; and
e) multiple initiators to participate in a reservation.

The reservation key provides a method for the application client to associate a protocol-independent identifier with an initiator on a specific port of a device server. The reservation key is used in the PERSISTENT RESERVE IN command to identify which initiators are registered and which initiator, if any, holds the reservation. The reservation key is used in the PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT command; to register an initiator, to verify the initiator issuing the PERSISTENT RESERVATION OUT command is registered, and to specify which initiator’s registration or persistent reservation to preempt.

Reservation key values may be used by application clients to identify initiators, using application specific methods that are outside the scope of this standard. This standard provides the ability to register no more than one key per initiator/logical unit pair. Multiple initiators may use the same key for a logical unit. An initiator may establish registrations for multiple logical units in a SCSI device using any combination of unique or duplicate keys. These rules provide the ability for an application client to preempt multiple initiators with a single PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT command, but they do not provide the ability for the application client to uniquely identify the initiators using the PERSISTENT RESERVE commands.

5.5.3.x Initiator identifying information

On protocols where initiator port names are required, the initiator identifying information includes the initiator port name and may include the relative port identifier of the target port. All device servers shall default to including the relative port identifier. Device servers which are capable of ignoring the relative port identifier shall support the IGNORE TARGET PORT CAPABLE and IGNORING TARGET PORT bits in the REPORT CAPABILITIES service action of PERSISTENT RESERVE IN and the IGNORE TARGET PORT bit in the SET CAPABILITIES service action of PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT.

On protocols where initiator port names are not required, the initiator identifying information includes both the initiator port identifier and the relative port identifier of the target port.

NOTE nn: The device server may use any internal representation of the relative port identifier. The identifier is not visible to application clients.

5.5.3.2 Preserving persistent reservations

The application client may request activation of the persist through power loss device server capability to preserve the persistent reservation and registration keys across power cycles by setting the APTPL bit to one in PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT parameter data sent with a REGISTER, or a REGISTER AND IGNORE EXISTING KEY service action.

After the application client enables the persist through power loss capability the device server shall preserve all current and future registrations and persistent reservations associated with the logical unit to which the REGISTER or the REGISTER AND IGNORE EXISTING KEY service action was addressed until an application client disables the persist through power loss capability.
The APTPL value from the most recent successfully completed REGISTER or REGISTER AND IGNORE EXISTING KEY service action from any application client shall determine the logical unit's behavior in the event of a power loss.

The device server shall preserve the following information for each registration across any reset, and if the persist through power loss capability is enabled, across any power cycle:

a) Initiator identifying information (see 5.5.3.x); and
b) reservation key; and
c) when supported by the protocol, the initiator port's world wide identification.

The device server shall preserve the following reservation information across any reset, and if the persist through power loss capability is enabled, across any power cycle:

a) Initiator identifying information (see 5.5.3.x); and
b) reservation key; and
c) scope; and
d) type; and
e) when supported by the protocol, the initiator port's world wide identification.

For those protocols for which the initiator port's world wide identification is available to the device server the initiator port's world wide identification shall be used to determine if the initiator identifier has changed. This determination shall be made at any time the target detects that the configuration of the system may have changed. If the initiator identifier changed, the device server shall assign the new initiator identifier to the existing registration and reservation of the initiator port having the same world wide identification.

5.5.3.4 Registering

In response to a PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT with a REGISTER or a REGISTER AND IGNORE EXISTING KEY service action the device server shall perform a registration by doing the following as an uninterrupted series of actions:

a) Process the registration request regardless of any persistent reservations;
b) process the APTPL bit;
c) ignore the contents of the SCOPE and TYPE fields;
d) map the reservation key to the registering initiator using the initiator identification and, if available, the initiator port's world wide identification identifying information (see 5.5.3.x);
e) register the reservation key without changing any a persistent reservation that may exist; and
f) retain the reservation key and associated information.

5.6 Multiple port and multiple initiator behavior

SAM-2 specifies the behavior of logical units being accessed by more than one initiator. Additional service delivery target ports provide alternate service delivery paths through which the device server may be reached and may also provide connectivity for additional initiators. An alternate path may be used to improve the availability of devices in the presence of certain types of failures and to improve the performance of devices whose other paths may be busy.

If a SCSI target device has more than one service delivery target port, the arbitration and connection management among the service delivery target ports is vendor specific. If one service delivery target port is being used by an initiator, accesses attempted through other service delivery target port(s) may:
a) receive a status of BUSY; or
b) be accepted as if the other service delivery target port(s) were not in use.

The device server shall indicate the presence of multiple target ports by setting the MULTIP bit to 1 in its standard INQUIRY data.
For the purposes of handling reservations, other initiators are defined as all initiators on the same service delivery port except the initiator holding the reservation and all initiators on all other service delivery ports that do not share the same initiator identifying information.

Only the following operations allow an initiator to interact with the tasks of another initiator, regardless of the service delivery port:

a) the PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT with PREEMPT service action preempts persistent reservations for other initiators (see 5.5.3.6.3);
b) the PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT with PREEMPT AND ABORT service action preempts persistent reservations and all tasks for other initiators (see 5.5.3.6.4);
c) the PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT with CLEAR service action releases persistent reservations and removes reservation keys for all initiators (see 5.5.3.6.5);
d) the TARGET RESET task management function releases reservations established by the reserve/release method and removes all tasks for all initiators and for all initiators (see SAM-2). Persistent reservations remain unmodified;
e) the LOGICAL UNIT RESET task management function releases reservations established by the reserve/release method and removes all tasks for all initiators for the addressed logical unit and any logical units issuing from it in a hierarchical addressing structure (see SAM-2). Persistent reservations remain unmodified; and
f) the CLEAR TASK SET task management function removes all tasks for all initiators for the selected logical unit for all initiators. Most other logical unit states remain unmodified, including MODE SELECT parameters, reservations, and ACA (see SAM-2).

[Editor's note: just making d) e) and f) use the same order above]

7.10.2 PERSISTENT RESERVE IN service actions

7.10.2.1 Summary of PERSISTENT RESERVE IN service actions
The service action codes for the PERSISTENT RESERVE IN command are defined in table 67.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00h</td>
<td>READ KEYS</td>
<td>Reads all registered Reservation Keys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01h</td>
<td>READ RESERVATION</td>
<td>Reads the current persistent reservations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02h</td>
<td>REPORT CAPABILITIES</td>
<td>Returns capability information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02h-03h – 1Fh</td>
<td>Reserved</td>
<td>Reserved</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7.10.2.2 Report Capabilities
The REPORT CAPABILITIES service action requests that the device server return a parameter page indicating capability for various persistent reservation features.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Byte</th>
<th>Bit</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>(MSB)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LENGTH (0004h)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reserved</td>
<td>ELEMENT SCOPE CAPABLE</td>
<td>APPTPL CAPABLE</td>
<td>IGNORE TARGET PORT CAPABLE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reserved</td>
<td>PTPL</td>
<td>IGNORING TARGET PORT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The LENGTH field specifies the length in bytes of the parameter data. If the ALLOCATION LENGTH field in the CDB is too small to transfer all of the parameter data, the length shall not be adjusted to reflect the truncation.
An IGNORE TARGET PORT CAPABLE bit of one indicates that the target port is capable of omitting the relative target port identifier in the initiator identifying information. An IGNORE TARGET PORT CAPABLE bit of zero indicates that the target port always includes the relative target port identifier in the initiator identifying information.

An APTPL CAPABLE bit of one indicates that the device server supports the APTPL bit in the PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT command. An APTPL CAPABLE bit of zero indicates that the device server does not support the APTPL bit in the PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT command.

An ELEMENT SCOPE CAPABLE bit of one indicates that the device server supports a SCOPE value of ELEMENT_SCOPE in the persistent reservation commands. An ELEMENT SCOPE CAPABLE bit of zero indicates that the device server does not support a SCOPE value of ELEMENT_SCOPE in the persistent reservation commands.

An IGNORING TARGET PORT bit of one indicates that the target port is not including the relative target port identifier in the initiator identifying information. An IGNORING TARGET PORT bit of zero indicates that the target port is including the relative target port identifier in the initiator identifying information. This capability is controlled with the SET CAPABILITIES service action of PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT (7.11.4).

A PTPL bit of one indicates that the last PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT command processed had its APTPL bit set to one (see 7.11.3). A PTPL bit of zero indicates that the last PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT command processed had its APTPL bit set to zero (see 7.11.3).

7.11.2 PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT Service Actions
When processing the PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT service actions, the device server shall increment the generation value as specified in 7.10.3.

The PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT command service actions are defined in table 74.

### Table 74 — PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT service action codes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>GENERATION field incremented (see 7.10.3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00h</td>
<td>REGISTER</td>
<td>&lt;as is&gt;</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01h</td>
<td>RESERVE</td>
<td>&lt;as is&gt;</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02h</td>
<td>RELEASE</td>
<td>&lt;as is&gt;</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03h</td>
<td>CLEAR</td>
<td>&lt;as is&gt;</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04h</td>
<td>PREEMPT</td>
<td>&lt;as is&gt;</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05h</td>
<td>PREEMPT AND ABORT</td>
<td>&lt;as is&gt;</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06h</td>
<td>REGISTER AND IGNORE EXISTING KEY</td>
<td>&lt;as is&gt;</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07h</td>
<td>SET CAPABILITIES</td>
<td>Set persistent reservation capabilities</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>078h – 1Fh</td>
<td>Reserved Reserved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The parameter list values for each service action except for SET CAPABILITIES are specified in 7.11.3. The parameter list values for SET CAPABILITIES are described in 7.11.4.

7.11.3 PERSISTENT RESERVE OUT parameter list

7.11.4 Set Capabilities
The SET CAPABILITIES service action requests that the device server enable or disable support for various persistent reservation features.
An IGNORE TARGET PORT bit of one indicates that the target port shall not include the relative target port identifier in the initiator identifying information. An IGNORE TARGET PORT bit of zero indicates that the target port shall include the relative target port identifier in the initiator identifying information. The IGNORE TARGET PORT bit shall be preserved through power loss.

If a change in the IGNORE TARGET PORT bit is requested when any registrations or reservations are being stored in the logical unit, the device server shall create a CHECK CONDITION with a sense code of ILLEGAL REQUEST and an additional sense code of REGISTRATIONS PRESENT.

[Editor’s note: assign ASCQ for ILLEGAL REQUEST/REGISTRATIONS PRESENT]