To: T10 Technical Committee  
From: Rob Elliott, Compaq Computer Corporation (Robert.Elliott@compaq.com)  
Date: 12 July 2000  
Subject: Resolution of SES Amendment 1 (sesar0) letter ballot comments

Four letter ballot comments were received for the T10 ballot on SES Amendment 1 revision 0 (sesar00.pdf) ending 12 July 2000. All comments were from Gene Milligan of Seagate. The resolutions were agreed to in the CAP Working Group meeting on 12 July 2000 and incorporated in revision 1 (sesar01).

In addition to Gene’s comments, a few editorial changes were made: NCITS.305:2000 was changed to NCITS.305:1998, a redundant “SCSI” was removed from the title, “pages” was changed to “page”

Note 1
<<in Table A.2 “Configuration page, using sub-enclosure identifiers,” change the “Bytes” column entry or the First sub-enclosure descriptor PRODUCT REVISION LABEL from “(8 bytes)” to “(4 bytes)”>>

This change is either wrong or misleading. Change it to “in Table A.2 “Configuration page, using sub-enclosure identifiers,” change the “Bytes” column entry for the First sub-enclosure descriptor PRODUCT REVISION LABEL from “44-47” to “44-51”.

Resolution: Added “sub-enclosure descriptor labeled” to clarify which rows are being modified and reordered the words.

New wording: On page 68, in Table A.2 “Configuration page, using sub-enclosure identifiers,” for the sub-enclosure descriptor labeled “First sub-enclosure descriptor,” change the “Bytes” column entry for PRODUCT REVISION LABEL from “(8 bytes)” to “(4 bytes)” and change the entry for VENDOR SPECIFIC ENCLOSURE INFORMATION from “(p – 40 bytes)” to “(p – 36 bytes).”

For the sub-enclosure descriptor labeled “Last sub-enclosure descriptor,” change the “Bytes” column entry for PRODUCT REVISION LABEL from “(8 bytes)” to “(4 bytes)” and change the entry for VENDOR SPECIFIC ENCLOSURE INFORMATION from “(p – 40 bytes)” to “(p – 36 bytes).”

Note 2
<<in Table 18 “Format of OVERALL DESCRIPTOR and ELEMENT DESCRIPTOR,” swap “LSB” and “MSB” for bytes 2 and 3 (DESCRIPTOR LENGTH) so “MSB” is in byte 2 and “LSB” is in byte 3.>>

This change is either wrong or incomplete depending upon your view. Change the description in Table 18, Format of OVERALL DESCRIPTOR and ELEMENT DESCRIPTOR, of the DESCRIPTOR LENGTH field such that byte 2, bit 7 is “(MSB)” and byte 3, bit 0 is “LSB”.

Even better would be a replacement table.

Resolution: Added “labels” and deleted some text.

New wording: On page 32, in Table 18 “Format of OVERALL DESCRIPTOR and ELEMENT DESCRIPTOR,” swap the “LSB” and “MSB” labels in bytes 2 and 3 (DESCRIPTOR LENGTH).
**Note 3**
Also change <<and change the entry for VENDOR SPECIFIC ENCLOSURE INFORMATION from “(p – 40 bytes)” to “(p – 36 bytes).”>> to “and change the entry for VENDOR SPECIFIC ENCLOSURE INFORMATION from “48-(m+11)” to “52-(m+11)”.

**Resolution:** Rejected. This was a misunderstanding based on Note 1.

**Note 4**
In addition Table A.2 in the Byte column seems to use an arbitrary mixture of the Byte Number and the number of bytes. This seems to add to the confusion.

Again a replacement table would be even better.

**Resolution:** Rejected. Other tables in SES use this format. Only technical issues are being addressed in this amendment. Future versions of SES may benefit from changing the numbering scheme.