

Minutes: MMC3/RMC Working Group - May 16 & 17 2000, 9:00 AM - 5:00 PM T10/00-243r0

Sheraton Nashua Hotel  
11 Tara Boulevard  
Nashua, NH 03062

T10 Meeting week  
Hosted by: Hitachi Cable

Agenda:

- 1.0 Opening Remarks  
Bill McFerrin called the meeting was called to order at 9AM on May 16.  
The NCITS meeting rules  
were recited.
  
- 2.0 Introductions  
Attendance was quite light. We presume that this is due to a  
combination of things: the May  
location of the T10 meeting and the concurrent Fuji meeting in  
Seattle. We might also presume  
that the recent release of MMC2 has caused a temporary loss of  
interest.  
  
Attendees at this meeting were:  
Bill McFerrin, Chair, representing Philips Electronics, NA  
Ron Roberts, representing Adaptec, Inc.  
Henry Gabrielski, representing Microsoft Corp.
  
- 3.0 Document Distribution  
None. See point 6.
  
- 4.0 Call for Patents  
Called. None answered.
  
- 5.0 Approval of Agenda  
Done.
  
- 6.0 Old Business
  - 6.1 MMC3 draft review  
Ron Roberts reported that he has received no new draft version  
of Mt Fuji 5, so no new  
edits are available for MMC3. Tabled until July.
  
- 7.0 New Business
  - 7.1 Liaison Reports
    - 7.1.1 Mt Rainier Liaison Report  
Bill McFerrin, the Mt Rainier liaison, had a prepared  
presentation that overviewed  
the Mt Rainier (MR) initiative. MR simply provides a  
simple method of drive implemented  
defect management on CD-RW discs. MMC must be  
involved in order to provide support the  
new media format. Prior to the July MMC meeting,  
Philips and Sony, licensors of CD  
technology, will provide all licensees with an Orange  
Book revision which details the  
format. Some details will be made public for the

purpose of command set standardization.

- 7.1.2 Call for volunteers for OSJ Report  
It was noted that, in the past, command set changes and additions have been proposed in working groups authorized by the OSJ (Optical Storage group, Japan).

To all readers: The MMC is formally requesting liaison from the OSJ, specifically to keep the MMC up to date on action in the OSJ.

- 7.1.3 Call for volunteers for Mt Fuji Report  
MMC does not have a formal arrangement for liaison from the Mt Fuji group.  
To all readers: The MMC is formally requesting liaison from the Mt Fuji group, specifically to keep the MMC up to date on action in the Mt Fuji group.

- 7.2 Announcement: Tabling RMC until MMC3 Completion  
Bill McFerrin proposed that RMC discussions are to be deferred until MMC3 has been forwarded for public review. The schedule for MMC3 is simply: forward for public review before the end of 2000. We do not wish do delay MMC3 with RMC diversions. Each member of the group present was in favor of the proposal.

- 7.3 Discussion: CD-R/RW Device Compliance with MMC2 and MMC3  
There has been much background discussion of MMC2 as it applies to CD-RW drives.

Henry Gabrielski complained that many ATAPI drives are not compliant with ATA4/5. Clearer appendices describing implementation on specific interfaces will be helpful, but no precise solution to Henry's problem was proposed. We expect further discussion.

Henry Gabrielski pointed out that he has not yet seen any CD-RW drive which is 100% compliant with MMC2. Ron Roberts admitted to the same knowledge.

After some discussion, it was decided to avoid further problems by adjusting MMC3 to more closely match actual implementations and the genuine need. We have the following proposals on which the MMC would like to have comments:

- 7.3.1 First, the Get Configuration Command came under attack...  
Proposal #1A: Obsolete the Get Configuration Command  
Ron Roberts would like to obsolete the Get Configuration Command and replace it with expanded information from the Read Disc Information Command, Mode Page 2Ah, and any other commands needed

to cover the loss.

Proposal #1B: Obsolete all profiles  
 Bill McFerrin asked: Is it possible for two different devices to have identical, current feature lists while having a different, current profile. Henry Gabrielski pointed out that this is indeed possible because many Features are not precise. After some discussion, it was decided that differentiation was intended via Profile. We can remove profiles by adding a "Media Type" feature:

```

Byte 0, 1:   Feature Code (proposal: 0080h)
Byte 2:     bits 7, 6 = Reserved
            bits 5 - 2 = Feature Revision (0000b)
            bit 1      = Persistent bit = 1
            bit 0      = Current bit = 1
Byte 3:     Additional length (4)
Byte 4:     Reserved
Byte 5:     Reserved
Byte 6, 7:  Media Type code
            y00xh = No medium present
            001xh = Read-only CD medium
            002xh = Write-Once CD medium
            003xh = Rewritable CD Medium
  
```

```

101xh = Read only DVD medium
102xh = Write-once DVD medium
  
```

```

103xh = Rewritable DVD Medium
  
```

```

Bits 7-4 of byte 6 (y) defines medium class
(CD=0, DVD=1, others?)
Bits 3-0 of byte 7 (x) are reserved for
sub-typing.
  
```

Open Question: If profiles are removed, how does a drive make know what to make?

Proposal #2:  
 Henry Gabrielski requested that all audio class commands be obsoleted. This is desirable for reasons of cost and complexity, but the idea may be difficult to sell. The commands:

```

Play Audio (10)
Play Audio (12)
Play Audio MSF
Play CD
Pause/Resume
Stop Play/Scan
Scan
Read Sub-channel
  
```

Note: Some of the above are already obsoleted. Bill McFerrin suggested that we can obsolete the commands, but keep their descriptions in future MMC documents in order to avoid new use of the op codes.

Proposal #3: Make the newest form of Read TOC/PMA/ATIP (i.e. Read CD-TEXT info) mandatory. Bill McFerrin disagreed. Reading the R-W sub-channel raw is more common.

Proposal #4: Make Send Cue Sheet obsolete. Henry believes that writing DAO in raw-only mode has the greatest flexibility. Bill McFerrin supports this position: sending a large cue sheet and then expecting that the two parties stay in sync during with varying block sizes is indeed worrying.

More change requests are expected during the next 2 months leading up to the next MMC meeting. All interested parties are requested to come forward with any and all proposals.

8.0 Review of Action Items  
Bill McFerrin to send requests for liaisons.  
Bill McFerrin to post minutes to MMC and ATAPI reflectors.

9.0 Future Meeting Schedule  
Next meeting is in Colorado Springs, Colorado:

Antler's Adams Mark Hotel  
4 South Cascade Avenue  
Colorado Springs, Colorado 80903  
Tel: (719) 473-5600, Fax: (719) 389-0259  
See www.tl0.org for more details.

The times are 9AM - 5PM (US Mountain Time), July 11 and 12.

10.0 Adjournment  
The meeting was adjourned early due to light attendance.

If you have questions please contact:

Bill McFerrin  
bmcFerrin@aol.com or bill.mcferrin@cddedge.com  
Tel: 720-320-0790

\*\*\*\*\*  
\*\*\*\*\*