

**T10/00-191r0**

---

Accredited Standards Committee, NCITS, Information Technology  
 NCITS Secretariat, Information Technology Industry Council (ITI)  
 1250 Eye St. NW, Suite 200, Washington, DC 20005  
 Telephone 202-737-8888; Fax 202-638-4922; Email: ncits@itic.org

Date: March 16, 2000

Project: **1228-D**

Ref. Docs: [T10/00-143r1](#) NCITS No votes and comments on BSR NCITS.333:20xx  
[T10/00-157r0](#) Minutes of T10 Plenary Meeting #36

Reply to: John Lohmeyer, T10 Chairman

Phone: 719-533-7560

Email: lohmeier@t10.org

---

To: Deborah Donovan  
 NCITS Secretariat

From: John Lohmeyer, T10 Chairman  
 lohmeier@t10.org

Subject: T10's Response to the Negative Votes and Comments received for final approval of BSR  
 NCITS.333:20xx, Multi-Media Commands - 2 (MMC-2)

---

The T10 Technical Committee has considered the comments attached negative ballots at NCITS on final approval of BSR NCITS.333:20xx. These comments are documented in [T10/00-143r1](#). T10 voted to not accept these comments because the *"nomenclature for disks of the format known as +RW must contain the prefix, "DVD" in order to avoid confusion about the purpose of the format within this standard"*. The relevant portion of the minutes ([T10/00-157r0](#)) is below:

*8.6 Multimedia Command Set - 2 (MMC-2) Status {Project 1228-D} [McFerrin]*

*John Lohmeyer reported that the NCITS letter ballot on MMC-2 resulted in two negative votes. The votes arose from a reference to "DVD+RW" that was described as an "obsolete reference" that Hitachi suggested should be changed to "+RW". John Lohmeyer reported on the following recommendation from the MMC Working Group:*

*By a vote of 5:1:0 the MMC working group recommends that T10 respectfully decline to make any changes in the DVD+RW references in BSR NCITS.333-200x (MMC-2). The nomenclature for disks of the format known as +RW must contain the prefix, "DVD" in order to avoid confusion about the purpose of the format within this standard.*

*Han Zou explained that the DVD+RW reference is obsolete and expressed concern that the MMC Working Group recommendation fails to address the obsolete nature of the reference. He further noted that the description in the current MMC-2 is for a 3.0 GB DVD+RW, which has become an obsolete concept.*

*Gary Robinson noted that changing the document both delays processing the standard and perhaps substantially so because the references are not fully established. He further suggested that the ISO processing of MMC-2 would be a more appropriate forum for resolving the references issues.*

*Bill McFerrin moved that T10 accept the MMC working group recommendation that the nomenclature for discs of the format known as +RW must contain the prefix, "DVD", in order to avoid confusion about the purpose of the format within this standard and that T10 recommend that BSR NCITS.333-200x (MMC-2) not be changed*

as suggested by the NCITS negatives. Mark Evans seconded the motion.

The group discussed the relationship between ANSI standards and other non-accredited standards.

On a roll call vote, the motion passed on a vote of 23:2:6:9=40. The details of the vote are as follows:

Organization	Voter	Yes	No	Abs	NP
Adaptec, Inc.	Mr. Lawrence J. Lamers	1			
Advansys					1
AMP, Inc.	Mr. Charles Brill	1			
Amphenol Interconnect	Mr. Bill Mable	1			
Ancot Corp.					1
Berg Electronics	Mr. Douglas Wagner	1			
BREA Technologies, Inc.	Mr. Bill Galloway	1			
Circuit Assembly Corp.	Mr. Dennis Lang	1			
CMD Technology	Mr. Edward Haske	1			
Compaq Computer Corp.	Mr. Robert C. Elliott	1			
Crossroads Systems, Inc.	Mr. Neil Wanamaker	1			
Dallas Semiconductor					1
Dell Computer	Mr. William Dawkins			1	
ENDL Texas	Mr. Ralph O. Weber	1			
Fujitsu	Mr. Eugene Lew			1	
General Dynamics	Mr. Nathan Hastad	1			
Hewlett Packard Co.	Mr. Steve Jerman	1			
Hitachi Cable Manchester, Inc	Mr. Zane Daggett			1	
Honda Connectors					1
IBM Corp.	Mr. George O. Penokie			1	
Iomega Corp.	Mr. Tim Bradshaw	1			
KnowledgeTek, Inc.					1
Linfinity Micro	Mr. Louis Grantham	1			
LSI Logic Corp.	Mr. John Lohmeyer			1	IV
Madison Cable Corp.					1
Maxtor Corp.	Mr. Pete McLean	1			
Molex Inc.	Mr. Jay Neer	1			
NSTOR					1
Ophidian Designs	Mr. Edward A. Gardner	1			IV
Panasonic Technologies, Inc	Mr. Han Zou		1		
Philips Electronics	Mr. William P. McFerrin	1			
QLogic Corp.					1
Quantum Corp.	Mr. Mark Evans	1			
Seagate Technology	Mr. Gene Milligan			1	IV
Storage Technology Corp.	Mr. Erich Oetting	1			
Sun Microsystems Computer Co	Mr. Robert N. Snively	1			
Texas Instruments	Mr. Paul D. Aloisi	1			
Toshiba America Elec. Comp.	Mr. Tasuku Kasebayashi		1		
UNISYS Corporation	Mr. Kenneth J. Hallam	1			
Western Digital Corporation					1
	Totals:	23	2	6	9 = 40

IV - Individual Vote

John Lohmeyer, George Penokie, Gene Milligan, and Zane Daggett stated that they cast votes of abstain based on the fact that they were not materially affected by the outcome of the vote. Bill Dawkins and Tomas Kulesza stated that they cast votes of abstain based on lack of expertise regarding the subject.

John Lohmeyer took an action item to communicate to NCITS the T10 recommendation that BSR NCITS.333-200x not be changed.

Please take the necessary steps to forward this response to NCITS and to continue the processing of BSR NCITS.333:20xx.